

## ***California Department of Food & Agriculture***

### **Minutes**

of the Meeting of the Pierce's Disease and Glassy-winged Sharpshooter Board  
and Pierce's Disease Advisory Task Force  
Held on Tuesday, November 14<sup>th</sup>, 2023.

Physical Location:

Trinchero Family Estates Building  
501 Hopkins Road, Davis, California, 95616 and via  
Web-conference and Teleconference.

### **PD/GWSS BOARD**

Members Present: Jeff Bitter\*, William Drayton, Rich Hammond\*, John "JD"  
Harkey\*, Randy Heinzen\*, Kendall Hoxsey-Onysko\*, Trey Irwin,  
Aaron Lange\*, Jim Ledbetter, Dominic Rossini, Dave Teuschler

Members Absent: Greg Coleman, Bill Hammond, Steve McIntyre, Seth Schwebs

### **PD ADVISORY TASK FORCE**

Members Present: Ruben Arroyo\*, Chris Bowland\*, Tracy Cleveland\*, Casey Creamer\*,  
Glenn Fankhauser, Kris Lowe\*, Martin Mochizuki, Todd Sanders\*, Beth Stone-Smith\*, Judy  
Zaninovich\*

Members Absent: None

### **OTHER ATTENDEES**

Camilla Ables\*, Chasika Bandna, Ozgur Batuman\*, Elizabeth Cieniewicz\*, Noelle  
Cremers, Joseph Damiano, Leah Gayagas\*, Mark Harrington\*, Matthew Kaiser,  
Humesh Kumar\*, Giancarlo LaGiusa, Mamadou Lamine\*, Jason Leathers\*, Betty  
Lee\*, Mike Miller\*, David Morgan\*, Dylan Morris, Warren Nichols\*, Stacie Oswalt,  
Michelle Pham, Donat Posta, Wenping Qiu\*, Ted Reiger\*, Stuart Reitz, Nichole  
Shorter, Youngsoo Son\*, Tom Turpen, Sean Veling, Myrna Villegas

\*Denotes attendance via web conference or teleconference.

-----

### **CALL TO ORDER**

PD/GWSS Board Chairperson Will Drayton and PD Advisory Task Force Chairperson  
Judy Zaninovich called the joint meeting to order at 10:00 AM.

### **ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS**

PDCP Statewide Coordinator Joseph Damiano conducted the roll call for the PD/GWSS  
Board (Board) and the PD Advisory Task Force (Task Force). Quorums were present for  
both the Board and the Task Force.

### **WELCOME AND OPENING REMARKS**

William Drayton and Judy Zaninovich thanked everyone for joining and thanked  
Foundation Plant Services (FPS) for hosting the meeting.

### **PD/GWSS BOARD AND ADVISORY TASK FORCE MEMBERSHIP UPDATE**

Joseph Damiano officially welcomed the newest addition to the PD/GWSS Task Force,

Casey Creamer of California Citrus Mutual. Casey provided a brief introduction and his intention to further integrate PDCP activities with huanglongbing (HLB) and Asian citrus psyllid (ACP) programs.

### **PUBLIC COMMENT**

No public comment.

### **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

William Drayton asked the Board for a motion to approve the minutes from the joint Board and Task Force meeting held on June 26, 2023.

- It was moved, seconded, and passed by the Board to approve the minutes from the joint Board and Task Force meeting held on June 26, 2023.

#### **Details of Board Vote**

Motion: Dominic Rossini    Second: Trey Irwin

In Favor: Bitter, Drayton, Rich Hammond, Harkey, Heinzen, Hoxsey-Onysko, Irwin, Ledbetter, Rossini, Teuschler

Against: None

Abstain: Aaron Lange

Absent: Coleman, Hammond, McIntyre, Schwebs

Judy Zaninovich asked the Task Force for a motion to approve the minutes from the joint Board and Task Force meeting held on June 26, 2023.

- It was moved, seconded, and passed by the Task Force to approve the minutes from the joint Board and Task Force meeting held on June 26, 2023.

#### **Details of Task Force Vote**

Motion: Martin Mochizuki    Second: Glenn Fankhauser

In Favor: Arroyo, Bowland, Fankhauser, Lowe, Mochizuki, Stone-Smith, Zaninovich

Against: None

Abstain: Casey Creamer

Absent: Cleveland\*\*, Sanders\*\*

\*\*Not present for this action item.

### **NEXT MEETINGS**

The next Board and Task Force meeting was set for Monday, January 22, 2024, at CDFA Headquarters and will begin at 1:00 PM. Future meetings in calendar year 2024 were planned to be set at that meeting.

### **APPOINTMENT OF NOMINATION COMMITTEE**

Joseph Damiano reported that a rotation of Board officers was due to occur in January 2024 and requested the establishment of a nomination committee to assist identifying new officer candidates. William Drayton appointed Randy Heinzen and Dominic Rossini to the nomination committee for a recommendation for the next

Treasurer for the Board, which would be discussed at the next meeting.

## **LEGISLATION UPDATES**

Joseph Damiano provided an overview of the program's five-year renewal schedule governed by legislation and a referendum. The legislation is due to be updated in 2024 in the next session, with the next referendum to be held in 2025. In consultation with the CDFA Legislative Office, PDCP staff was providing technical assistance to industry groups who plan to sponsor the legislation next session. The proposed bill language would likely include another five-year extension of the program and would redefine the program's annual report to be posted on the program's website instead of being formally routed to the legislature. Discussion ensued among Board and Task Force members regarding making the program potentially permanent. Noelle Cremers provided additional background on the legislation and referendum. Jeff Bitter and Aaron Lange suggested further discussion with industry groups regarding the bill language.

Matthew Kaiser provided a brief update regarding the recent legislation, SB 544, affecting the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act and how it relates to teleconferencing procedures for Board and Task Force meetings. PDCP staff would work with CDFA's Legal Office to identify the best path forward under the new rules ahead of the next meeting and ensure teleconference access to meetings would continue to be an option.

## **FISCAL UPDATES**

Beth Stone-Smith provided a fiscal update from the USDA regarding federal funding. She started by stating that a continuing resolution or "stop-gap" measure was in place to keep the federal government running through the end of the week and provided additional background information on the effects of continuing resolutions and federal government shutdowns on programs. The CDFA had asked for increased additional funding to cover the PDCP's increased operating expenses but without a federal budget there were no indications about funding levels.

Myrna Villegas provided a program operations fiscal update, outlining PDCP revenues and current and projected expenditures for state FY 2022-23 and 2023-24. For FY2023-24, Board Funds were budgeted for \$2.49 million and Other Funds (which included Federal Funds and CDFA Emergency Funds) were budgeted for \$18.44 million toward program activity, for a total of about \$20.93 million. Villegas explained that county invoices can be delayed which can affect year-to-date expense. Total FY 2022-23 expenses were \$18.37 million.

Matthew Kaiser provided a fiscal update for Board funds for state FY 2022-23 and 2023-24. He reported carryover, assessment and interest revenues, future fiscal year obligations, as well as current and projected expenditure details. No assessment revenue had been reported this year as the assessment payments are not due until January 10, 2024. Pending future adjustments, approximately \$9.8 million was carried over from prior year. The Board was projected to spend about \$6.5 million in the current fiscal year. Future obligations beyond FY 2023-24 included \$450,000 for the outreach contract with Brown-Miller, \$220,000 for third year of the FPS Greenhouse Support project, and \$584,000 for other research projects that have previously been approved. When considering all current future year obligations along with no additional revenue, the projected balance was approximately \$7 million.

Urban Rapid Response Treatment expenses were likely to increase over last year's totals due to the increased treatment activity in Fresno, Madera, Solano, and Tulare Counties. The Contingency for County Backfill expenses in 2022-23 were related to delimitation responses in Contra Costa, Imperial, and Sacramento counties in 2022.

These expenses were approved last year as a means of reimbursing counties for unexpected delimitation activities beyond what they were previously budgeted for. So far, no delimitation responses had been triggered in 2023.

### **RESEARCH PROGRAM UPDATE AND ANNUAL RFP**

Matthew Kaiser provided a research program update. The Board sponsored American Society for Enology and Viticulture (ASEV) conference which took place just after the last meeting was a success. At the event, three Board-funded researchers spoke as well as Research Coordinator Kristin Lowe, and a booth was set up in the exhibit area. The Department of Pesticide Regulation (DPR) hosted a workshop last month about genetic tools for insect and vector pest control that included Peter Atkinson of UC Riverside, who is on the cutting edge of CRISPR gene editing research intended to make GWSS incapable of spreading Pierce's disease.

The annual request for proposals (RFP) for Board sponsored research projects was scheduled to open December 1, 2023, and a draft was distributed with handouts. Some changes were made to scoring priorities based on feedback from the National Academy of Sciences, which Kristin Lowe would discuss later. A new contract for a Research Coordinator will be needed as the current three-year contract is expiring in June 2024, and the process for advertising a new contract will begin soon. Kaiser also reported that travel restrictions from California to other states had been lifted by SB 447.

### **OUT OF CYCLE ECONOMIC STUDY PROPOSAL**

Matthew Kaiser provided an overview of an out of cycle economic study proposed by Julian Alston with UC Davis titled "Costs of Pierce's disease in the California grape and wine industry and benefits from the Pierce's Disease Control Program and research and development." The proposal would study the impacts of Pierce's disease and the Program on the California grape and wine industry, similar to a project funded by the Board about 10 years ago and also led by Alston. Joseph Damiano felt that it was important to revisit this study as it provided valuable economic insight for industry and other stakeholders regarding Pierce's disease and the Program. Julian Alston recently retired so Rachel Goodhue of UC Davis would also be involved in the work as well since she has extensive experience in the same field of study. The total cost of this new study would be \$74,923 over one year and would take between four and five months to compile and complete the first objectives. Kaiser explained that this proposal was being considered out of cycle as the program felt the information that could be gained would be valuable for time-sensitive outreach efforts.

Randy Heinzen asked what the cost of the original study was in comparison to the current proposal? Kaiser responded that the first project cost about \$249,000 and involved much more in-depth work over multiple years. The current proposal being considered would primarily consist of updating figures using the methods already developed, which is why the cost would be so much less. Additional discussion among members ensued, and Jim Ledbetter stated that in his opinion, \$75,000 was reasonable when considering the original cost of the study, as long as it could be completed on time and within the budget. William Drayton asked the Board for a motion to recommend funding the proposal titled "Costs of Pierce's disease in the California grape and wine industry and benefits from the Pierce's Disease Control Program and research and development" totaling \$74,923.

- It was moved, seconded, and unanimously passed by the Board to recommend funding the proposal titled "Costs of Pierce's disease in the California grape and wine industry and benefits from the Pierce's Disease Control Program and research and development" totaling \$74,923.

### **Details of Board Vote**

Motion: Jim Ledbetter Second: Trey Irwin  
In Favor: Bitter, Drayton, Rich Hammond, Harkey, Heinzen, Hoxsey-Onysko,  
Irwin, Lange, Ledbetter, Rossini, Teuschler  
Against: None  
Abstain: None  
Absent: Coleman, Bill Hammond, McIntyre, Schwebs

### **RESEARCH COORDINATOR AND NAS UPDATE**

Kristin Lowe provided an update and overview regarding the Board's RFP and proposal selection process. The National Academy of Sciences (NAS) committee reviewing virus research and the Board's RFP met between April and May of 2023 before providing the Program with a report of suggested improvements in July. Lowe and Kaiser met with the Committee in August to go over NAS recommendations and both concluded that the study was beneficial to everyone. Recommendations included a more standardized application template, more explicit instructions on content in each section, and more clear instructions about research areas supported such as outreach proposals. The Committee also recommended adding "industry deliverables" section in the proposal which would contain a clear explanation regarding how a proposal would directly benefit the wine and grape industries. The committee also requested that progress reports be submitted at the same time as proposals. Lowe stated that the official report was posted on NAS website for public display, and that their recommendations were being implemented. This committee is scheduled to be in California in early March of 2024 to meet with stakeholders including the Board and Task Force.

### **OUTREACH AND EDUCATION UPDATE**

Nicole Shorter of Brown-Miller Communications provided an update regarding the recent public outreach and communications efforts. Shorter stated the current newsletter has just been published online along with a companion postcard which was mailed out to over 1,200 growers and stakeholders. The email notification has an average open rate of 43% which is high for industry averages. Additional information was posted on various websites including Facebook and LinkedIn. Brown-Miller recently attended the Tree and Vine Expo in Turlock where they sponsored a booth exhibiting information relating to the Board and spotted lantern fly (SLF). Brown-Miller will also be present at the WIN Expo in Santa Rosa in December. The current advertising campaign for SLF awareness is continuing throughout the winter with advertisements in various magazine and print publications.

### **PDCP NURSERY PROGRAM UPDATE**

Warren Nichols, Senior Environmental Scientist with the PDCP, provided an update on the PDCP Nursery Program. In the months of January through September 2023, there were 25,634 nursery stock shipments from regions infested with GWSS into non-infested areas in the state, which is down approximately 3,900 shipments from the previous year. Year to date inspections had revealed only one viable life stage present in these shipments, which resulted in a Notice of Rejection. During outgoing inspections of plant material, county inspectors had found and stopped 48 egg masses, 8 nymphs and 12 adults. During this same time period, there were 6,307 ATP shipments consisting of approximately 1,174,746 plants, significantly less than the same timeframe in 2022, which was 8,093 and 1,600,010, respectively. No regulatory actions had been taken year to date against any ATP nurseries for viable life stages.

Nichols provided an overview of ATP nursery treatment monitoring activities, which includes quality control checks by PDCP staff using water-sensitive paper. These papers are checked to ensure proper pesticide coverage. In 2023 through September, PDCP staff placed water-sensitive paper in shipments at each participating ATP nursery a minimum of once a month. Out of 200 water-sensitive papers inspected only eight indicated the need for retreatment of the shipment.

Aaron Lange asked for more information about the frequency of GWSS finds at origin nurseries during outgoing inspections. Stacie Oswalt of the PDCP elaborated on more details of the program, the differences between activities at Master Permit and ATP nurseries, and the layers of inspection and treatment that happen at known infested nurseries. Beth Stone-Smith elaborated on the Program's nursery activities including the challenges of inspecting large nurseries and on the effectiveness of chemical treatments at stopping GWSS. Dominic Rossini and William Drayton asked if additional data could be added to the handouts at future meetings regarding GWSS finds that would provide additional context to which Oswalt agreed was a reasonable request.

Jim Ledbetter asked if the source of the GWSS outbreak in Solano County had been determined to which Joseph Damiano responded that it had not. Damiano state that the detections were in a residential area with no nurseries nearby and that he would discuss this further with Solano County to see if a determination could be made. Stone-Smith stated any plants moving from the south of the state to the north, not just commercial nursery shipments, could potentially be a GWSS pathway.

#### **PDCP RAPID RESPONSE AND DELIMITATION UPDATE**

Michelle Pham provided an update regarding the PDCP's rapid response and delimitation activities. Pham started by stating there were not any new delimitations this year probably because of the cooler than average weather California had experienced. Regarding the eradication project in Solano County, Michelle stated that since the initial find, the numbers of finds of GWSS had declined this year relative to last year. Treatments were ongoing though a few residents have been reluctant to allow access and treatments on their property, which had hindered eradication efforts. A public meeting for residents to discuss treatment plans was scheduled for December 6<sup>th</sup>, 2023, and engagement between CDFA, Solano County, and residents would continue. Pham stated that all finds were still within the original proclamation of emergency boundary area and did not appear to be spreading outside the areas of treatment.

#### **AREA-WIDE PROGRAM UPDATE**

Beth Stone-Smith provided an update on area-wide control treatments for GWSS in California. Stone-Smith emphasized that program priorities in light of funding availability have shifted more away from eradicating GWSS and more towards inhibiting the spread of Pierce's disease into grapes. The treatment focus was on locations where there have been GWSS finds that are near grape growing regions, and treatments of organic citrus were being avoided unless it happens to be near areas where grapes are grown. Any GWSS finds in November were likely adults and would remain until spring when the temperature begins to rise and GWSS become more active and start reproducing. The numbers of GWSS overall were down in most of the area-wide counties most likely because of the cool and wet spring which may have hindered GWSS reproduction and movement. Stone-Smith stated that the increase of organic citrus in some counties was making GWSS control challenging. The GWSS finds in Kern County were the highest, but in areas that had not been hotspots in the past. To summarize, Stone-Smith stated that some of the feedback she had heard from growers suggested that GWSS may not be perceived as the high

priority it used to be and emphasized the importance of public outreach to maintain awareness of this pest. A discussion of possible outreach strategies ensued.

### **SPOTTED LANTERNFLY AND EXOTIC FRUIT FLY UPDATE**

Jason Leathers of the CDFA Plant Health and Pest Prevention Services (PHPPS) Division provided an update regarding SLF and exotic fruit fly activities. PHPPS was about 75% finished with the SLF survey of over 300 sites throughout California but has experienced some delays due to the outbreak of exotic fruit flies. So far, they had surveyed 229 sites in 37 counties with no evidence of SLF. This year there were two interceptions of SLF at CDFA border inspection stations and two specimens found on an aircraft coming into California, but all specimens were dead. Pest surveillance was continuing at the Roseville railyards in Placer County, which also planning on removing the tree of heaven that were present on the premises.

Leathers also reported that PHPPS was currently dealing with a severe exotic fruit fly outbreak in California which included over 760 detections of several species of flies in 15 counties. Trapping efforts and treatment projects were ongoing and PHPPS was hoping to avoid any additional quarantines. Leathers stated that grapes were a host for some of the exotic fruit flies and CDFA is working with County Agricultural Commissioners on several eradication and quarantine projects. William Drayton asked if there was any reason for this sudden drastic increase in exotic fruit fly detections. Andrew Cline, Acting Director of PHPPS, and Leathers responded in agreement that the reason for the sudden increase is not yet known but may be in part linked to a variety of different reasons such as international travel and e-commerce. Cline also stated that genetic testing is underway to determine the point of origin of specific pest strains. A discussion ensued regarding details of the cooperative efforts by industry, CDFA, USDA and County Agricultural Commissioners to respond to the unprecedented challenge.

### **OTHER ITEMS**

None.

### **CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT**

Board Chairperson William Drayton and Task Force Chairperson Judy Zaninovich adjourned the meeting at 1:00 PM.

Respectfully submitted on December 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2023, by  
Giancarlo LaGiusa, Associate Governmental Program Analyst  
Pierce's Disease Control Program  
California Department of Food and Agriculture