

**CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION  
COMMITTEE MEETING**

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, May 13, 2020

The regular meeting of the Full Committee was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on May 13, 2020 by Chairman Jim Gorden via webinar.

**Committee Members Present:**

Craig Armstrong	John Gless	James McFarlane
Kevin Ball	John C. Gless	Etienne Rabe
Brad Carmen	Jim Gorden	Kevin Severns
Ed Civerolo	Nick Hill	Roger Smith
Aaron Dillon	Mark McBroom	Keith Watkins
Bob Felts, Jr.		

**Committee Members Absent:**

**CDFA Staff:**

Jonathan Babineau	Victoria Hornbaker	Alex Muniz
Carl Baum	Gavin Iacono	Keith Okasaki
Katie Filippini	Anmol Joshi	Lea Pereira
Paul Figueroa	Sara Khalid	Lydia Rodriguez
Ryan Fong	Luci Kumagai	Nawal Sharma
Alisha Garcia	Magally Luque-Williams	Michael Soltero
David Gutierrez	Zachary McCormick	Claudia Vazquez
Amelia Hicks	Dr. David Morgan	Jennifer Willems

**CRB Staff:**

Holly Deniston-Sheets	Marcy Martin	Dr. Melinda Klein
Rick Dunn		

**Guests:**

Price Adams	Anna-Liisa Fabritius	Dr. Neil McRoberts
Bob Atkins	Enrico Ferro	Bill Neese
Jill Barnier	Lisa Finke	Le Nguyen
Teri Blaser	Michael Frantz	Curtis Pate
Chris Burd	Sara Garcia-Figuera	Sylvie Robillard
Dan Cannon	Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell	Cressida Silvers
Casey Creamer	Alyssa Houtby	Robert Warren
Shawn Davis	Craig Kaprielian	David Wirta
Natalie DeAngelo	Ellen Kragh	Helene Wright
Pradip Desai	Jessica Leslie	Judy Zaninovich
Craig Elder	Brianna McGuire	Sandra Zwaal
Wendy Elder		

**Opening Comments:**

Jim Gorden welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online. He stated that there was a quorum for the meeting.

**APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

Jim stated that the Consent Agenda consists of the meeting minutes from the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) meeting on March 11, 2020 and the CPDPC interim meeting on April 10, 2020.

**Motion:** To recommend approving the consent agenda as presented.

**First:** John Gless

**Second:** Keith Watkins

**Motion carries:** Motion passed unanimously.

**FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT****Request for Financial Analyst**

Victoria stated that the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Division (CPDPD) put together a Request for Proposal for the financial analyst, which requires two control agencies to give clearance to move ahead.

**Improved Accounting Processes**

Carl Baum stated that CPDPD has transitioned to a manual tracking system. Invoices, contracts, purchase orders and salaries are logged and tracked in real time and are reconciled with the Financial Information System for California (FI\$Cal) after the month closes.

**Review 2018/2019 Budget Expenditures**

Bob Felts, Jr. stated that September 2019 was closed as of the May 2020 Finance Subcommittee meeting with a total of 29,864,000 expended. He added that \$800,000 in redirects were posted by Pest Detection/Emergency Projects (PDEP) for a total of \$30,664,000 with a remaining balance of \$9,400,000. Victoria Hornbaker added that underspending may be because of the delay in hiring Citrus staff and lingering charges from the Plant Division. Further expenditures can be added to Fiscal Year (FY) 2019-20 as previous year expenditures. Bob added that the program used all Federal Citrus Health Response Program (CHRP) and State general funds, leaving a large carryover to the Agriculture fund.

**Review 2019/2020 Budget Expenditures and Revenue**

Bob Felts, Jr. stated that CPDPD expended nearly \$10,000,000 in April 2020 and \$17,400,000 in May. He noted that \$9,700,000 was expended at this time last FY. Asian citrus psyllid (ACP) Southern Treatment and Southern Survey line items are overspent due to salary expenses placed in the wrong budget lines. Victoria added that during the PDEP and CPDPD separation the division picked those buckets as a landing point for salaries. Going forward, all salaries will hit a single code before being sent out to the appropriate budget lines.

Bob stated that the CPDPD had received \$7,900,000 in assessment revenue through April 2020, which increased to \$9,963,281 in May. This is on track with the five-year average of \$9,947,000 with an outstanding balance of \$7,400,000 from projected revenue. He added that CPDPD

received an additional \$2,000,000 in CHRP funds, totaling just over \$14,000,000.

Carl stated that the fund condition statement has been presented to the Finance Subcommittee and the Executive Committee. It is still being adjusted, with a major move of expenditures from Agriculture funds to FY 2018-19 General funds due to a onetime increase to \$12,500,000. He added that FY 2018-19 ended with \$25,546,775, becoming the starting point for cash on hand for FY 2019-20 together with \$17,010,000 in estimated assessment revenue. With the approved budget of \$16,700,000 and spending all CHRP and General funds, FY 2019-20 should end on June 30, 2020 with a balance of \$24,733,100.

## **EXECUTIVE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Filling Grower Vacancy on the Committee**

Victoria stated that Gregorio Rundini has requested to join the Committee as the Ventura grower representative.

**Motion:** To recommend appointing Gregorio Rundini on the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee as the Ventura grower representative.

**First:** Nick Hill

**Second:** Mark McBroom

**Motion carries:** Motion passed unanimously.

### **COVID-19 Impacts to Citrus Program Activities**

David Gutierrez stated that CPDPD is practicing social distancing by staggering staff in field offices and teleworking. CPDPD has held four virtual public meetings, with the fifth meeting set on May 20, 2020 for Los Angeles County. He added that CPDPD is continuing treatment activities by appointment. He explained that the budget letter released by the Finance Department directed CPDPD to be careful with expenditures. Victoria added that the governor's May revise will come out tomorrow.

## **OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Update on Regulatory Working Groups**

Amelia Hicks explained that they are preparing an agenda prior to the meeting. The working group will look at how ACP populations have increased and the potential of moving ACP into areas with lower ACP populations.

## **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 1 – Find and Eradicate Huanglongbing (HLB) Regulations and ACP Suppression**

### **HLB Risk Based Survey Update**

Magally stated that in Cycle 1 of 2020, work has begun in Fresno, Imperial, Los Angeles, Orange, Riverside, San Bernardino, Tulare and San Diego Counties with Kings County already complete. She stated that some high-density areas in Riverside, San Diego and Orange Counties are difficult to complete due to COVID-19 restrictions. She proposed to survey an additional 945 properties in 30 Section Township Ranges (STRs) in San Fernando Valley Area. Magally stated that she has four high risk survey staff in Kern, two staff in Fresno, 17 in Los Angeles, five in Orange, five in Riverside, four in San Bernardino, 12 in San Diego and eight in Tulare Counties for a total of 57 staff. She estimated that 94 staff would be needed to

do a full statewide survey.

### **Southern California HLB Survey Update**

Anmol Joshi noted that most active delimitation areas are in Orange County. Staff are leaving notices for residents to book appointments for survey and treatment and will be sending out a second wave of notices. He stated that the 75 areas in Anaheim are 44 percent complete, the 24 areas in City of Orange are 67 percent complete, the 12 areas in Tustin are 83 percent complete, the six areas in Huntington Beach are 32 percent complete and the 35 areas in Santa Ana are 29 percent complete. The 47 areas in Garden Grove are 27 percent complete, the 19 areas in Westminster are 33 percent complete, San Bernardino is 34 percent complete, the five areas in Montclair are 77 percent complete and the three areas in Colton are 97 percent complete. He added that CPDPD staff took 178 quadrant samples in Orange County during April 2020. Staff removed 22 HLB-positive trees with 12 trees pending in Orange County, two trees were removed with three trees pending in Los Angeles County, one tree pending in Riverside County and one tree removed in San Bernardino County. As of May 1, 2020, there were 1,892 HLB-positive trees and 299 positive ACP detected across 1,365 properties. He stated that the Citrus Research Board (CRB) tissue and seasonality sampling project took samples from six non-positive sites, one HLB positive tree in Orange County and one HLB positive tree in Los Angeles County. San Diego County border high risk survey is complete and Imperial County is 74 percent complete. The risk based border survey is 74 percent complete in Imperial County and 100 percent complete in San Diego County.

He stated that seven staff are deployed to delimitation survey, 19 staff for delimitation treatments, 37 for high risk survey, one for quadrant survey, six for border survey, two for CRB survey, one for tree removal and 5 for commodity survey.

### **HLB Diagnostic Update**

Lucita Kumagai stated that the lab's maximum sample capacity is 10,000 per month. The lab was used to 68 percent of capacity in January, 77 percent in February, 46 percent in March and 34 percent in April. She added that January and February are consistent with last year's monthly average, while March and April are low due to COVID-19. She explained that the CRB lab's maximum sample capacity is 8,000 samples per month. The lab used 32 percent of its capacity in January, 29 percent in February, 10 percent in March and 33 percent in April. This is consistent with last year's monthly average in January, February and April, with March being low due to COVID-19. Samples are up to 30,797 in 2020 with 43 percent of capacity. Magally added that ACP populations are down compared to previous years, resulting in fewer samples.

Lucita stated that there have been 1,368 positive site detections, 1,892 positive trees and 299 positive ACP. 95 percent of positive tree finds are response samples and five percent are from risk survey, while positive ACP finds are 50 percent response samples and 50 percent risk survey. She stated that 73.5 percent of tree detections are found in Orange County, 24.6 percent in Los Angeles County, 1.4 percent in Riverside County and 0.5 percent in San Bernardino County. She added that the most recent detections were four trees in Garden Grove, four trees in the city of Orange, eight trees and two ACP positive finds in Santa Ana and one tree in Whittier.

### **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 2 – Control ACP Movement and Enforce Regulations**

### **Regulatory Activity Update**

Keith Okasaki stated that counties reported a total of 480 grower inspections, 5,466 transporter inspections, 495 packer inspections, 99 fruit seller inspections, 424 Notice of Violations (NOVs) issues and 33 Notice of Proposed Actions (NOPAs) issued from July 2019 through February 2020. He added that NOVs and NOPAs are mostly transporter violations. CPDPD will be sending staff to assist county inspectors and increase regulatory presence.

Keith Okasaki stated that if a nursery is within five miles of an HLB detection, a hold is placed on the plants. The nursery will have the option to build a California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA)-approved structure, including a two-year hold, inspections every 30 days and testing every six months, or the option to destroy the stock. He explained that there is no mechanism for replenishing nursery stock inventory which may see black-market demand for citrus. He proposed a systems approach for nurseries to be able to receive new plants to sell within the HLB quarantine from a United States Department of Agriculture (USDA)-approved facility. The nursery must clear the two-year hold, sell all original nursery stock, give 72-hour shipment notice to CDFA, tag each tree upon arrival and maintain compliance. He explained that this will result in increased inventory within the HLB quarantine and continuity of supply but will require additional 30-day inspections.

**Motion:** To recommend approving the proposal for nurseries in the HLB quarantine area with CDFA-approved insect resistant screenhouses to be able to receive nursery stock from a USDA-approved insect resistant screenhouse, after selling all nursery stock previously held for two years, giving 72-hour notice to CDFA, tagging each tree upon arrival and maintaining a compliance agreement.

**First:** Etienne Rabe

**Second:** Roger Smith

**Motion carries:** Motion passed unanimously.

Keith Okasaki presented a proposal for newly quarantined nurseries to plant outdoor stock on site or adjacent by signing a hold notice for all plant parts except fruit and an HLB quarantine grower compliance agreement. This will result in fewer trees destroyed but will require CDFA staff to conduct inspections to verify the planted trees conform to normal practices. There was concern that urban nurseries would lack the knowledge and large plots of land necessary to become commercial growers. It was noted that CDFA staff would be performing the inspections and would be able to gauge the nursery's suitability.

**Motion:** To recommend approving the proposal for nurseries to be able to plant outdoor stock on site or on an adjacent site to create a commercial grove when an area moves into a HLB quarantine, facilitated by signing a hold notice for all plant parts except fruit and an HLB quarantine grower compliance agreement.

**First:** John Gless

**Second:** John C. Gless

**Motion carries:** 13 yays (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, Brad Carmen, Ed Civerolo, Aaron Dillon, Bob Felts, Jr., John Gless, John C. Gless, Nick Hill, James McFarlane, Etienne Rabe, Kevin Severns and Keith Watkins), 2 nays (Jim Gorden and Roger Smith) and 1 abstention (Mark McBroom)

### **Discuss Revoking QC Permit 1486**

Keith Okasaki stated that Quarantine Commodity (QC) 1486 was revoked effective April 13, 2020. There have been concerns from growers and packers that were affected, and many are looking to change to the grate-cleaning method. It was suggested that Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell did not believe there was currently an organic alternative to spray and move. Keith is leading a working group that will hopefully find options for organic growers. It was suggested that revoking QC Permit 1486 created an unintended consequence by diverting noncompliant growers to other areas where it is easier to ship.

### **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 3 –ACP Control/Suppression**

#### **Regional ACP Management**

Bob Atkins stated that area wide treatments have maintained status quo. He requested guidance from the Committee on the issue of small growers of 25+ trees. He explained that these small growers in management areas take up the Grower Liaison's time to keep buffer treatments on track. He noted that Pest Control Districts have the authority of the Food and Agricultural Code to apply assessments and encourage participation.

#### **Biocontrol**

Dr. David Morgan stated that production and releases have slowed due to COVID-19, the cool spring and losing staff in January. The program is getting used to working inside the COVID-19 system and will be hiring seasonal staff. He hopes that CRB's field cages can ramp up production to make up the difference. He stated that the program did April releases in the Los Angeles area, along the border and around Salton Sea where ACP have begun to accumulate. He added that it is difficult to get to the Biocontrol monitoring sites, but that there are not many ACP to monitor. He expects that, like last year, there will be very low ACP numbers in 2020.

#### **Central Valley Trapping and Treatment Update**

Jennifer Willems stated that the Citrus Commodity survey has progressed, and the risk-based survey Cycle 1 2020 is progressing somewhat slowly. She noted that Nuffer Smith Tucker (NST) has placed Facebook ads to target areas for survey. She stated that traps were deployed and surveyed in Fresno, Madera and San Luis Obispo Counties and are on track for April. County trapping is continuing in Fresno, Kern, Kings, Madera, Merced, Monterey, San Benito, San Luis Obispo, Santa Barbara, Tulare and Ventura Counties. She stated that 10,051 grove traps have been serviced and 509 ACP have been trapped as of March 20, 2020. Ventura area wide treatment will start again in August.

#### **Southern California Trapping and Treatment Update**

Anmol explained that CDFA staff are only treating HLB detection areas by appointment. He stated that Santa Ana area 37 is 59 percent complete, area 35 is 46 percent complete, area 71 is 41 percent complete, area 72 is 29 percent complete, area 73 is 57 percent complete, area 76 is 21 percent complete and Garden Grove 47 is 20 percent complete. The partial re-treatments of area 57 is 43 percent complete and area 38 is 18 percent complete. Second notices requesting residents to set appointments will be going out shortly.

Anmol explained that virtual public meetings have been held for Orange, San Bernardino,

Riverside and Los Angeles Counties. Pending HLB treatment areas include four areas in Santa Ana, one in Tustin, seven in City of Orange, two in Westminster and two in Garden Grove which will be covered by a public meeting webinar in the first week of June.

### **Northern California Trapping and Treatment Update**

Amelia Hicks stated there were no new detections or active treatment areas in the Northern District. 881 delimitation traps were removed in five counties from November 2019 to March 2020 and 423 traps remain in San Jose until October 2020. Winter ACP trapping is ending and will begin again in November. She stated that CPDPD is contracted with 18 counties for trapping with the greatest number of ACP detection traps in Sacramento County down to 51 traps in Lake County. CDFA maintains detection traps in Marin, San Francisco, Santa Clara, Yolo and Yuba.

### **SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

#### **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 4 – Improve Data Technology, Analysis and Sharing**

Dr. Etienne Rabe stated that Ethyl Formate has been formalized and should be submitted to the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) next week. EPA has 19 months to respond.

#### **Data Analysis and Tactical Operations Center (DATOC) Update**

Dr. Neil McRoberts stated that the Science Subcommittee recommended a proposal to reduce delimitation area from 400 meters to 250 meters. He stated that DATOC found that HLB-positive trees distribution has stabilized, with 95 percent of all HLB-positive trees within 230 meters of another HLB-positive tree. He added that after randomizing detections 500 times, finding 95 percent of trees stayed between 210 and 270 meters. He stated that a 400-meter radius captures 97.5 percent of all known positives, and a 250-meter radius captures 95 percent while reducing workload by 61 percent. He explained that 40 percent of survey labor found 95 percent of all trees. 86.6 percent of all *Candidatus Liberibacter asiaticus*-positive ACP samples were found within 250 meters. He estimated that reducing delimitation zone size to 300 meters would save \$20,980 per find and reducing zone size to 250 meters would save \$29,220. He believed that the savings could be used to make up for the five percent of missed infections.

**Motion:** To recommend changing the delimitation and treatment area surrounding an HLB-positive detection from 400 meters to 250 meters

**First:** Keith Watkins

**Second:** Ed Civerolo

**Motion carries:** The motion carries unanimously.

It was suggested to bring recommendations for the additional resources to the Operations Subcommittee.

### **OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

#### **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 5 –Outreach and CPDPC**

#### **Outreach Update**

Price Adams stated that NST is focusing on securing proactive earned media: articles in the Santa Ana and San Diego regions, homeowner mailers in Redlands and Loma Linda and paid Facebook ads in Central Valley. They created a new website landing page to support online public meetings, held an outreach meeting together with CPDPD on May 4, 2020 and distributed

a field crew best practices training video. She added that there will be an online meeting with the City of Corona on May 14, 2020 to brief officials on the quarantine. NST will be doing paid media outreach, outreach to gleaners and releasing postcards, summer infographics and videos.

Mark McBroom stated that the AB5 bill was passed to give contracted employees like Uber drivers the same rights as regular employees, affecting the Grower Liaison contractors as a side effect. Victoria explained that CDFA Legal determined that Grower Liaison contracts must be terminated, or the state compensated as if Grower Liaisons were state employees, including workers compensation and unemployment benefits. The Grower Liaison contracts must be amended and reviewed by the Department of General Services (DGS). Bob Atkins suggested that Grower Liaisons do work outside the usual activities of CDFA, qualifying them for contractor status. Victoria will request a legal analysis.

**Motion:** To recommend the Outreach and Executive Subcommittees discuss the AB5 impact to the Grower Liaison contracts to develop a path forward.

**First:** Etienne Rabe

**Second:** Craig Armstrong

**Motion carries:** 15 yays (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, Brad Carmen, Ed Civerolo, Aaron Dillon, John Gless, John C. Gless, Jim Gorden, Nick Hill, Mark McBroom, James McFarlane, Etienne Rabe, Kevin Severns, Roger Smith and Keith Watkins) and one nay (Bob Felts, Jr.)

### **USDA Update**

Helene Wright stated that \$2,000,000 has been added to the cooperative agreement; a total of \$14,200,000 for the program. She added that exports to Australia are permitted if the packinghouse is under compliance. She stated there were no updates from Mexico since the positive ACP find at the nursery two miles from the border which has been treated and *Tamarixia* released. It was noted that shipments of *Tamarixia* sent to Tijuana had been stopped but should resume in a few weeks.

### **CALIFORNIA CITRUS MUTUAL (CCM) REPORT**

Casey Creamer stated that the CCM website has undergone renovations. He stated that the state budget will be released tomorrow. The governor announced a \$54,000,000,000 deficit so budget cuts should be expected. CCM has requested to continue the \$14,000,000 federal appropriations funds into next FY.

### **Recap of Action Items from this Meeting**

**ACTION ITEM:** Continue to monitor until Department of Finance provides a Finance Analyst or allows CPDPD to contract one.

**ACTION ITEM:** Provide an analysis for the freed-up resources from shrinking the delimitation zone and how they will be re-utilized.

**ACTION ITEM:** Report from the Executive Committee and Outreach Subcommittee on the future of Grower Liaisons.

**ACTION ITEM:** Report from the Regulatory Working Group at the next CPDPC meeting.

**ACTION ITEM:** Executive Committee review of Citrus Division staffing, office and vehicle needs.

**CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 2:37 p.m. The next meeting will be held by webinar on July 15, 2020 at 10:00 a.m.