

**CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION
COMMITTEE MEETING**

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, March 11, 2020

The regular meeting of the Full Committee was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on March 11, 2020 in Ontario, California by Chairman Jim Gorden.

Committee Members Present:

Kevin Ball	John Gless	Dr. Etienne Rabe
Brad Carmen	John C. Gless	Kevin Severns*
Ed Civerolo	Jim Gorden	Keith Watkins
Bob Felts, Jr.	Nick Hill	

Committee Members Present but Not Voting:

Craig Armstrong*	Mark McBroom*	Roger Smith*
Aaron Dillon*		

Committee Members Absent:

James McFarlane

CDFA Staff:

Jonathan Babineau*	Victoria Hornbaker	Keith Okasaki*
Carl Baum*	Gavin Iacono*	Mandy Patterson*
Brian Bishop	Sara Khalid*	Lea Pereira*
Ryan Fong	Ray Leclerc*	David Phong*
Tina Galindo*	Magally Luque-Williams*	Nawal Sharma*
Alisha Garcia*	Zachary McCormack*	Michael Soltero
David Gutierrez	Alex Muniz*	Jennifer Willems
Amelia Hicks	Dayna Napolillo*	

CRB Staff:

Holly Deniston-Sheets	Rick Dunn	Dr. Melinda Klein
-----------------------	-----------	-------------------

Guests:

Price Adams	Gauff Hathcock	Harrison Reynolds*
Ruben Arroyo	Dave Hozen*	Sylvie Robillard*
Teri Blaser*	Julia Inestroza*	Jason Schwartze
Sandy Cleland	Ellen Kragh*	Cressida Silvers*
Casey Creamer	Jessica Leslie*	Lisa Whittaker*
Natalie DeAngelo*	Jasmine Lopez	Bobbie Willhite
Daniell Delgado	Karen Lowerison*	David Wirta*
Benigno Estrada	John Maddock	Helene Wright
Sara Garcia-Figuera	Marcia Manmar	Judy Zaninovich*
Amelia Gonzales*	Maggie O'Neill	Sandra Zwaal
Subhas Hajeri*		

* Participated via Webinar

Opening Comments:

Jim Gorden welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online. He stated that there was a quorum for the meeting.

Public Comment:

Dave Hozen stated that part of the newly expanded Huanglongbing (HLB) zone in San Bernardino has no packinghouse available, requiring growers to wet wash or field clean and spray and move. He requested the Committee find a way to work with growers to successfully harvest. Victoria suggested that growers recommend new alternatives to disinfest fruit of ACP to CDFA for consideration. She added that the California Department of Agriculture (CDFA) will look to streamline the process with more outreach to growers in the San Bernardino and Riverside area. Keith Okasaki explained that wet wash in the field or two mitigations, pre-harvest and field cleaning, is required when moving out of an HLB zone. Grate cleaning is only allowed for moving fruit from an ACP quarantine zone at this time. It was suggested to form a library of field cleaning mitigation machines that could be moved around to help growers. Victoria stated that Evergreen was revoked due to lack of use, but Ethyl formate registration is in progress, and will be a viable option to fumigate in the field and move fruit.

John Maddock requested clarification if nurseries can add to existing citrus groves of container trees on the same property in the event of a disease quarantine. Keith explained that CDFA may be able to work with nurseries and growers not to destroy trees if they are in the ground, since concern with nursery stock is that it can be moved. Victoria added that a regulatory framework for in-ground trees has been discussed.

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

Jim stated that the Consent Agenda consists of the meeting minutes from the January 15, 2020 Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee meeting.

Motion: To recommend approving the consent agenda as presented.

First: John Gless

Second: Keith Watkins

Motion carries: Motion passed unanimously.

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**Review 2018/2019 Budget Expenditures and Revenue**

Bob Felts, Jr. stated there has been significant lag time on financial data in the Financial Information System for California (FI\$Cal). Mandy explained that there is no way to avoid the lag, since it is reliant on the State Controller's Office (SCO), Department of Finance and the FI\$Cal program. She stated that Fiscal Year (FY) 2018/19 is closed out and FY 2019/20 is ready to begin closing out months this week. It is difficult to get SCO to approve a month to close out until every single item is accounted for. Victoria added that the state fiscal year runs July 1 to June 30, but the Citrus Division is aligned with the federal FY, which runs from October 1 to September 30. Part of the lag in giving the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) final numbers is that there are still three months that are not closed in the federal system. Mandy explained that closing a month in FI\$Cal can take one to two weeks depending on issues with control agencies. She believes that the division will be able to close within 30 days

after the month's end in the future. She explained that the division is running month to month, but Accounts Payable, Accounts Receivable and other units within CDFFA are running as if the division is closed. This causes numbers to fluctuate and allocations and distributed administrative charges aren't available, but basic expenditures still exist.

Bob stated that total expenditures for FY 2018/19 are \$25,200,000 with July, August and September 2019 not closed, compared to \$35,000,000 total expenditures historically. He expects that there are more expenses than are currently shown, including invoicing and hourly expenditures that need to be redirected from Pest Detection/Emergency Projects (PDEP) to Citrus Division. Ryan Fong suggested that personnel expenditures need to be redirected to the General fund. Victoria added that the Citrus Division is doing its mid-year projections, stalling Ryan on the federal billing and moving expenditures from the Food and Agriculture fund to the General fund. There is \$11,600,000 in the General fund for expenditures and the Citrus Division has identified \$11,200,000 in expenditures that need to be moved from PDEP and the Ag fund. She anticipates fully expending the Federal Trust and General funds. She added that this will be completed on Citrus Division's end by the end of the month. Bob stated that the Fund Condition Statement is typically reported on once a year after the close of the state FY in June. He noted that if the \$11,200,000 in Ag fund expenditures is redirected to the General fund, he expects a much greater carry-in from assessments. He stated that total closed out revenue of FY 2018/19 is \$18,467,587, greater than the budget projection.

Victoria stated that Citrus Division is implementing a way to manually track expenditures. Charges would hit the clearing account and then be manually redirected to individual line items. This would allow the Citrus Division to keep track of many expenditures hitting the clearing account each month with a salary report. The Committee could see the large bucket items quickly, with Citrus Division filling in smaller bucket items the next month. She added that with June 2019 closed, the Citrus Division can request an updated Fund Condition Statement to show carry-in for the Agriculture fund for the state FY. Carl Baum added that with funds in Citrus Division's clearing account rather than PDEP's, the Citrus Division will be able to give the Committee expenditure totals much more quickly.

Review 2019/2020 Budget Expenditures and Revenue

Bob stated that expenditures through February are \$7,772,576, with a budget balance of \$32,714,569 remaining. He stated that expenditures are slightly behind compared to last year, but there are months that are not closed out. Ryan added that this report uses manual tracking for the first few months rather than FISCal. Bob stated that the program received \$1,564,881 in January, \$1,851,806 in February in February, for a total to date of \$5,200,064. This is on track for revenue compared to the five-year average, with a remaining projected balance of \$12,200,000 in revenue.

A review of the proposed Citrus Division manual tracking was requested to better enable the CPDPC to understand the budget. Victoria explained that CDFFA has its own internal audit department and there are independent auditors available, but she requested the CPDPC let Citrus Division move everything off PDEP and Pest Exclusion (PE) and have a full year running the budget prior to an audit. She explained that Citrus Division will fully take over from PDEP and PE after July 1, 2020, and any audit before then will only reflect the growing pains of becoming a

new division. Bob suggested holding a Finance Subcommittee meeting on the subject. Victoria stated that the Citrus Division will prepare a request for a proposal for a financial analyst.

EXECUTIVE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Update on Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Division Progress

Victoria stated that Citrus Division has picked a location for the Sacramento headquarters. Citrus Division will share that site with Inspection Services to defray costs and will run North California and Bay Area field operations from that location. Department of General Services (DGS) will begin negotiations for that site in June. She stated that the Citrus Division has three regions: Northern, Central and Southern districts. The Northern region has one office; the Central region has four offices (Fresno, Visalia, Shafter, and looking for a Camarillo office) and the Ventura County Agricultural Commissioner is loaning desk space to a few Citrus Division staff; the Southern California region shares existing offices with PDEP (Commerce and Lincoln Heights), one office in Cerritos, two offices in Riverside (one paid for by the Cooperative Agricultural Support Services), and doing and a co-relocation with PDEP in San Diego to combine two offices into one. Citrus Division also has desk space in Coachella Valley.

Victoria stated that the Senior Environmental Scientists (SEs) are hired. Vacancies have been posted for Environmental Scientists (ESs) and Pest Prevention Assistants (PPAs). She stated that authority for 161 staff is reflected in organizational chart, with four transferred Agricultural Technician IIs removed due to being seasonals. She explained that Nick Condos requested Citrus Division take on regulatory work since they hired many existing regulatory staff, and Plant Health will transfer two staff paid for in the 2017 Budget Change Proposal (BCP) for Citrus work. She stated that currently Citrus Division has seasonals working on behalf of the program, and the Environmental Program Manager Is (EPM Is) and SEs are working to transfer 52 seasonals working in the Southern California region and three or four regulatory staff in Visalia in addition to the two regulatory staff from PE. All grants for citrus work have been transferred from PDEP to Citrus Division. Victoria explained that all PDEP staff working on behalf of Citrus Division will be transferred by April 1, 2020. She thanked PDEP for its assistance both before and during the transition.

Dr. Etienne Rabe stated that the Committee has never investigated Citrus Division's organizational chart thoroughly. He stated that the State budget office has approved 161 positions. He recommended freezing the Citrus Division's permanent positions at 161, and for any additional positions be approved by the Committee. Victoria clarified that the organizational chart was drafted to include 206 positions in October 2019 and refined to 226 positions in the November CPDPC meeting, based on commercial citrus acreage in the valley and the central coast. Victoria explained that Citrus Division's authority does not extend to hire any additional permanent staff. She explained that PDEP had done a FY 2017-18 BCP to transfer seasonals to permanent staff. Citrus Division only received 103 staff from PDEP in addition to the ask in the BCP of an additional 61 positions, rather than the expected 165 due to misunderstandings between the previous PDEP branch chief and EPM I's. Hiring additional permanent staff would require another BCP. It was suggested to revisit the strategic plan to confirm that the current staffing concerns aligns with the overall strategic plan.

Motion: To recommend freezing the number of permanent positions for the Citrus Pest and Disease

Prevention Division (CPDPD) to the number of positions on the current Organizational Chart (166, which includes 61 from the 2018 Budget Change Proposal, 101 being moved from Pest Detection Emergency Projects Branch in Plant Health and Pest Prevention Services Division (PHPPS) and the four existing citrus employees) plus the two positions being moved to the CPDPD from the Pest Exclusion Branch in PHPPS for a total of 168 permanent staff. Any need for additional staff will be presented to the Committee for consideration prior to seeking authority through the Governor's Budget.

First: Etienne Rabe

Second: John C. Gless

Motion carries: Motion passed unanimously.

OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 1 – Find and Eradicate HLB Regulations and ACP Suppression HLB Risk Based Survey Update

Magally Luque-Williams stated that 16 counties are completed for Cycle 1 2019, with surveyors visiting 48,317 properties and collecting 11,916 entomology samples and 8,303 plant samples. Orange County will be completed this week to complete the cycle. She added that the next cycle will start next Monday and will include Monterey County, an estimated 1,150 square miles to survey.

Magally noted that risk survey is short staffed: a few staff in Imperial and San Diego County, two staff in Riverside County and ten staff in Orange County, and staff will be hired to help in Ventura County. She explained that there are four PPA positions still to fill in Orange County, with hiring difficulties due to low pay. She noted that 14 staff are allocated to Orange County, but risk survey requires 11 and delimitation requires 20 or more staff. She added that field staff include ES field leads, PPAs and seasonals. Victoria added that once the 52 seasonals are brought over on April 1, 2020, Citrus Division will see if more seasonals are needed to cover the necessary work.

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 2 – Control ACP Movement and Enforce Regulations Regulatory Activity Update

Keith Okasaki stated that regulatory quarantine work is moving to Citrus Division with staff available in each region for local assistance. The division will be sending out county cooperative agreements this week or next week. He stated that at the request of the Operations Subcommittee, regulatory will focus on gunnysackers and fruit moving out of HLB area to farmer's markets. He added that they will be reviewing HLB compliance agreements to respond quickly and appropriately to noncompliance. It was noted that there are 226 farmer's markets in Southern California and a lot of movement into Coachella Valley and the Riverside/San Bernardino area. It was suggested to increase or redirect budget for regulatory work. Victoria noted that CDFA staff visit the HLB quarantine area every other week.

Ruben Arroyo stated that Agricultural Commissioners are contracted with CDFA to inspect certified farmer's markets and certified producer certificates twice a year. His staff look to ensure the fruit on table matches their certificate. The initial inspection for a producer acquiring a certificate requires a site visit. He noted that keeping track of citrus sold in different counties can be difficult to verify if the load lists are not correct. To do additional inspections, the contract guidelines will need to be amended to add additional market

inspection. He explained that noncompliance fines fall in line with civil penalties: \$50 to \$5,000. Daniel Delgado stated that Riverside County primarily deals with notifications or paperwork documentation violations. Compliance agreements are indefinite; they are updated primarily when there is a new operator in the county. He stated that they send out inspectors to verify records, and Riverside County has all packinghouses in compliance. Sandy Cleveland, San Bernardino County Deputy Ag Commissioner, stated that in the last three weeks, staff have gone out on complaints of growers harvesting without compliance agreements and peddlers. She explained that recent checks have been paperwork violations, pending Notice of Violations, and one fruit harvested and moved from an HLB quarantine zone, now on hold pending a disposal order. She noted there is a landfill site inside the HLB zone where fruit can be disposed of. She scheduled an inspector to come in on weekends to try to get peddlers. Victoria stated that CDFA is preparing to work with county staff to get agreements in place on July 1, 2020. A staff report of inspection actions can be provided at the Operations Subcommittee and May CPDPC meeting with a Situation Status report once resources allow.

Victoria explained that any truck found with insufficient tarping can be reported and tracked back to the hauler. Nawal Sharma stated that there have been three blitzes at all major California Highway Patrol stations in the last two and a half years, but during those 24-hour inspections there was little movement of citrus fruit, making it ineffective. Victoria added that rural law enforcement groups are not interested in enforcing citrus compliance.

Discussing Revoking QC Permit 1486

Keith Watkins explained that the permit allows the Riverside area to ship fruit into the HLB quarantine zone for packing without mitigation. The Operations Subcommittee recommended to revoke the Quarantine Commodity (QC) 1486 Permit. Victoria explained that without the permit, all ACP fruit moving between ACP regional quarantine zones will require the same mitigations.

Motion: To recommend revoking Quarantine Commodity Permit 1486 no later than April 1, 2020.

First: John Gless

Second: Brad Carmen

Motion carries: Motion passed unanimously.

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 3 – ACP Control/Suppression

Regional ACP Management

Bob Atkins stated that there is a viable San Diego grower liaison candidate, but there is a review of whether the position should be a contract or state employee. He added that numbers of neglected and abandoned orchards in San Bernardino are being updated.

Biocontrol

Dr. David Morgan stated that the Biocontrol program released over 400,000 insects into HLB find areas, along the San Diego and Imperial County border and in Ventura County this month. He noted that citrus flush patterns in Southern California affect future ACP populations. 20 percent of branches had flush this year and last year, down from 50 percent in prior years. He expects population patterns to be like last year.

Central Valley Trapping and Treatment Update

Jennifer Willems stated that the Citrus Division hired Claudia Vazquez for Fresno and Gavin Iacono for the Shafter and Visalia SESs. The program has taken on citrus commodity survey work from PDEP and will be taking on risk surveys within a week or two.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 4 – Improve Data Technology, Analysis and Sharing

DATOC Update

Etienne stated that Ethyl formate was three months late to submit to the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and will be submitted to the registrant by Friday. He explained that the EPA will have 19 months to review, with Jim Cranney expecting to get it in 12 months or less. Victoria stated that she and Nick Hill will talk to their EPA partner on the Multi-agency Coordination (MAC) to ask about fast tracking the process.

Dr. Neil McRoberts stated that Holly Deniston-Sheets and the Fort Pierce modeling team are working on a cost-benefit analysis for program activities in Southern California. They should have a simulation of what San Gabriel would look like with and without the project using the agent-based model by May. He added that Brianna McGuire reanalyzed data available through December 2019 to define exposure on a neighborhood basis so that tree removals could be switched from a detection basis to a declaration of exposure under the Ag Code. He will be working with Brianna and Holly to produce a short report and recommendation through the Committee. He explained that the data suggests that detection distribution hasn't changed since the 1,000th detection and compacted since the 400-meter recommendation has passed. 95 percent of all detects are within 240-meters of another find. He noted that decreasing pesticide treatments to 240-meters would result in less impact on the ACP population.

OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 5 – Outreach and CPDPC

Outreach Update

Price Adams stated that there were three objectives for Nuffer Smith Tucker's (NST's) telephone research in October 2019: a benchmark of awareness of ACP and HLB, understanding public opinion and willingness to act. She noted that 66 percent of respondents had one or two trees, but three percent of those responses had 25 or more trees, accounting for one third of all trees in the sample. 78 percent of respondents most appreciated citrus for providing food; 34 percent were aware of ACP and HLB prior to the survey. She explained that most respondents, especially Hispanic and Asian Americans, were significantly more likely to allow officials to treat and voluntarily remove their trees after the survey. Owners with 25 or more trees were not moved by the survey messaging. She added that they intend to reframe describing the fruit as misshapen and bitter to incorporate Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell's description of the flavor as gasoline-like.

Price stated that NST has secured 173 unpaid news articles. They initiated hyperlocal outreach in San Bernardino County in response to the Colton detections and to areas just outside the HLB quarantine area. They hosted booths at the San Gabriel New Year Festival, World Ag Expo and CCM Citrus Showcase and collaborated on an informative meeting for nurseries in Escondido. She added that NST sent out 9,000 pieces of collateral material to industry members, elected officials and the public in La Mirada and Norwalk. She explained that NST is working on a

password-protected resource center on CitrusInsider.org for the Committee and other outreach arms. She stated that there will be a grower liaison meeting on March 25, the Highland Citrus Festival on March 30, the California Association of Pest Control Advisers Spring Summit on April 28 and a paid media and advertising plan in April 2020.

CCM REPORT

Casey Creamer stated that the specialty crop block grant from CDFA to voluntarily remove residential trees is running through April 30, 2020. He added that Bayer Crops Science donated funds to push commercial orchards as a last resort, after voluntarily removing abandoned orchards and the county abatement process.

Casey stated that California Citrus Mutual (CCM) put in a request in conjunction with Florida and Texas Citrus Mutuals to maintain the CRRP program that funds \$61,000,000 in citrus preservation activities. He added that the president's budget reflected maintaining the \$61,000,000 budget but also recommended removing the HLB MAC program. CCM put in a request to restore HLB MAC funding. He thanked NST and the Outreach Subcommittee for broadening congressional outreach about HLB beyond traditional citrus districts. He explained that \$5,000,000 is ongoing at the state level, and CCM put in the request and contacted urban legislators for funding. \$36,500,000 of the \$40,000,000 budget is annually spent in residential areas which CCM argued that these pesticide treatments are an urban and residential issue. CCM suggested that they will fund commercial activities and pesticide treatments, and the remaining \$25,000,000 should come from the federal government.

CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT

Victoria stated that the CDFA Director of Administrative Services may cancel public meetings due to COVID-19. Committee and Subcommittee meetings may need to be held as webinar meetings.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:01 p.m. The next meeting will be held by webinar on May 13, 2020 at 10:00 a.m.