

# CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, November 18, 2020

## Committee Members Present:

Craig Armstrong	John Gless	Dr. Etienne Rabe
Kevin Ball	John C. Gless	Gregorio Rundini
Brad Carmen	Jim Gorden	Roger Smith
Aaron Dillon	Mark McBroom	Keith Watkins
Bob Felts, Jr.	James McFarlane	

## Committee Members Absent:

Ed Civerolo	Nick Hill
-------------	-----------

## CDFA Staff:

Fidan Aghayarova	Victoria Hornbaker	Alex Muniz
Jonathan Babineau	Karla Huerta	Colleen Murphy
Karina Chu	Laura Irons	Keith Okasaki
Kiana Dao	Mathew Jian	Lea Pereira
Gilbert Escobedo	Anmol Joshi	David Phong
Ryan Fong	Juan Koponen	Michael Soltero
Tina Galindo	Daniel Lee	ThuyVy Truong
David Gutierrez	Magally Luque-Williams	Claudia Vazquez
Amelia Hicks	Zachary McCormack	Jennifer Willems

## CRB Staff:

Holly Deniston-Sheets	Melinda Klein	Qijun Xiang
Rick Dunn	Marcy Martin	

## Guests:

Price Adams	Subhas Hajeri	Monique Rivera
Bob Atkins	Charles Hills	Helena Roberts
Shannon Black	Eugene Kandarian	Sylvie Robillard
Teri Blaser	Jonathan Kaplan	Cressida Silvers
Chad Cox	Jessica Leslie	Krista Smith
Casey Creamer	Kody Leverett	Michelle Thorn
Natalie DeAngelo	Glorimar Marrero	Tyler Tkachuk
Joe Deviney	Dr. Neil McRoberts	Karen Westerman
Michelle Duong	Mia Neunzig	David Wirta
Lisa Finke	Margaret O'Neill	Helene Wright
Paul Frankel	Curtis Pate	Judy Zaninovich
Sara Garcia Figuera	Drew Raymond	Sandra Zwaal

## Opening Comments:

The Committee meeting was called to order via webinar at 10:00 a.m. Jim Gorden welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating online. He stated that there was a quorum for the meeting.

**Public Comments:**

Mark McBroom recommended that the board recognize Kevin Severns for his work and commitment on the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) as one of the longest-serving board members. Victoria Hornbaker added that Nuffer Smith Tucker (NST) is working on a certificate to commemorate his service.

**Motion:** To recommend recognizing Kevin Severns for his work on the CPDPC.

**First:** Mark McBroom

**Second:** Craig Armstrong

**Motion carries:** Motion passed unanimously.

**APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

**Motion:** To recommend approving the September 16, 2020 consent agenda as presented.

**First:** Keith Watkins

**Second:** John Gless

**Motion carries:** Motion passed unanimously.

**FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT****Review of 2019/2020 Budget Expenditures and Revenue**

Bob Felts, Jr. stated that the program expended \$24,339,566 through November 2020. The remaining yearly balance is projected to be \$16,147,579. Projected expenditures for the year total \$30,046,438. Revenues were \$355,000 in October. Total revenues for Fiscal Year (FY) 19/20 are \$18,425,358. Fi\$Cal is closed through June 2020 but still has a considerable lag in expenditures because July-September has not closed.

**2020/2021 Budget**

Mr. Felts, Jr. stated that expenditures for FY 20/21 are less than \$500,000. The FY 20/21 approved budget is slightly over \$42,000,000. Projected activities in Kern County totaling \$1,600,000 are expected to affect the budget line items. Revenues are expected to total over \$16,000,000.

**EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT**

Ms. Hornbaker stated that the FY 20/21 Calendar for quarterly CPDPC meetings will be uploaded to the CDFA website.

**OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT****Optimal Timeline for Delimitation and Costs**

Anmol Joshi stated that the optimum timeline for Huanglongbing (HLB)-positive trees was adjusted to reflect the 130 average properties in the 250-meter residential buffer in Orange and Los Angeles Counties. Using this new average, treatment will take a week rather than five weeks. The optimum timeline for *Candidatus Liberibacter asiaticus* (CLas)-positive Asian citrus psyllid (ACP) was adjusted to reflect one week for confirmation rather than two weeks for HLB. The optimum timeline for ACP identification was adjusted to reflect 310 properties in the 400-meter residential buffer. Using this new average, treatment will take one and a half weeks. These optimal timelines may be interrupted by slow resident response, unfavorable weather conditions, expansion of quarantine, availability of treatment trucks and COVID-19.

Mr. Joshi explained that it costs a vendor \$520 to remove a medium-sized tree, compared to \$755 for CPDPD to remove the tree in Orange County. Vendors can remove up to six trees per day, possess commercial grade tools, accept responsibility for any damage to the property, and pay for disposal fees. CPDPD requires a minimum of 6 personnel, only uses basic tools, is liable for any property damage and pay for disposal fees. Personnel must be pulled from other activities such as risk survey, areawide buffer treatments, etc. CPDPD would also have to pay more to remove larger trees or multiple trees compared to vendors.

Mr. Joshi stated that Southern District expenditures in FY 19/20 were \$378,067 for areawide buffer treatments, \$1,780,777 for HLB delimitation survey and \$3,148,341 for HLB delimitation treatments and tree removals.

### **Buffer and ACP Response Treatment Areas**

Keith Watkins stated that the Operations Subcommittee recommended that the Committee vote on reducing residential areawide buffer treatment from 400 meters to 250 meters.

**Motion:** To recommend reducing residential areawide buffer treatment from 400 to 250 meters.

**First:** Roger Smith

**Second:** Aaron Dillon

**Motion carries:** Motion passed unanimously.

### **Desert Areawide Treatment Protocol**

Mr. Watkins stated that the desert areawide treatment should remain at 800 meters as previously exempted. Dr. Monique Rivera stated that the gap in time was recommended by Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell because of the lag time before the insecticide reaches the new growth during flush. The Operations Subcommittee recommended that Imperial County should continue the existing treatment protocol.

### **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 1 – Find and Eradicate HLB**

#### **CDFA Operational Update**

##### *Southern District*

David Gutierrez stated that delimitation survey and treatment continues in Orange, Los Angeles and Riverside Counties along with retreatments. The winter areawide treatment will begin in December and continue through spring. 65 trees tested HLB-positive in September and October 2020. The risk-based survey Cycle 2 is 35-45 percent complete and will be finished by the end of January 2021. The border buffer treatment is 100 percent complete in San Diego and 50 percent complete in Imperial counties.

##### *Central District*

Mr. Gutierrez stated that there have been 42 commercial ACP find sites and 45 non-commercial find sites in Kern County. *Tamarixia radiata* have been released and the ACP Detector Canines team worked with California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) in Kern County. One ACP was detected at a Tulare County packing house. Regulatory staff have been monitoring incoming loads and checking traps.

### *Northern District*

HLB risk survey Cycle 2 survey began in September in Alameda, Sacramento and Santa Clara counties. Treatment in Santa Clara County is ongoing and ceasing treatment is under consideration. Three counties (San Joaquin, Placer and Stanislaus Counties) are engaged in year-round trapping; five counties are engaged in CDFA winter trapping; and 15 counties are engaged in county winter trapping.

## **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 2 – Control ACP movement and Enforce Regulations CDFA Regulatory Update**

### *Notice of Violation (NOV) and Notice of Proposed Action (NOPA) Tracking*

Keith Okasaki stated that Riverside County issued four NOV's to transporters, San Diego County issued two NOV's to growers, and Tulare issued 48 NOV's and 37 NOPAs to transporters for the July through September 2020 period. He noted that these numbers are gathered with invoices which are still coming in, so the numbers presented are likely lower than they should be. Counties have performed 214 grower inspections, 839 transporter inspections, 121 packer inspections. CDFA staff have conducted fruit seller inspections.

### *Procedure for Hauling Culls*

Mr. Okasaki stated that culls and rots are regulated as they may not have gone through the packing process and don't meet the exemption requirements. Notifications will go out to packers and haulers. Shells from juiced fruits are not regulated but are considered green waste and can move within the quarantine zone.

## **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 3 – ACP Control/Suppression ACP Detector Canines Update**

Lisa Finke stated that growers have preferred the dog teams to drop flags at alert trees for same-day inspection by company scouts. ACP Detector Canines had 21 non-productive canine alerts across 9,093 perimeter trees in a commercial orchard in Kern County, meaning that no ACP were found by their human handlers at those alerted trees. ACP Detector Canines expects some false alerts during scouting. Working with CDFA in October and November 2020, the ACP Detector Canine team had three productive alerts during a blind search on residential properties, and one on a rural commercial property.

Ms. Finke stated that a canine spends 37 seconds inspecting a tree whereas a CDFA employee spends 15 minutes. Human-canine teams can scout 900 trees per day, costing \$1,475. The Tristeza Agency can scout 500 trees per day at a cost of \$247. ACP sprays average \$150 per acre, with perimeter sprays averaging 1/7<sup>th</sup> to 1/5<sup>th</sup> of that cost. She noted challenges with regulatory restrictions and the use of pseudo-scents in areas north of the Grapevine, lack of ongoing training and the learning curve working with CPDPD. Funding is required to continue the work now that the Multiagency Coordination (MAC) grant is over.

**Motion:** To recommend that the Division seek a contractor to conduct high-throughput screening for Asian citrus psyllid. The Executive Committee will approve a scope of work prior to issuing the request for proposal.

**First:** Dr. Etienne Rabe

**Second:** Roger Smith

**Motion carries:** Motion passed unanimously.

## **Grove Trapping Discussion**

Ms. Hornbaker explained that the Action Plan describes a monthly servicing interval for grove trapping, but that CPDPD is servicing traps biweekly in practice. The Operations Subcommittee recommended that the Action Plan be amended to reflect this.

**Motion:** To recommend amending the Action Plan to reflect the biweekly commercial grove trapping service interval in all areas where biweekly trap servicing is currently occurring.

**First:** John Gless

**Second:** Kevin Ball

**Motion carries:** Motion passed unanimously.

## **Discuss Ceasing Treatment in Santa Clara**

Amelia Hicks stated the topic of discussion at the last two Operations Subcommittee meetings was whether to cease treatments in Santa Clara County. Ms. Hicks reported nine wholesale nurseries are conducting 90-day treatments and are in compliance; there is not much commercial citrus except for one grower but the fruit is kept locally; there are currently 12 trapping delimitation grids, adult ACP detections are scattered across 39 distinct sites in eight (8) of the delimitation grids; and that CPDPD may outspend the existing contract in the area that would require additional funding for activities.

Following this report, members of the board and the Santa Clara County Agricultural Commissioner had a discussion regarding the issue. Dr. Neil McRoberts felt the data was showing that treatments work and that winter weather coupled with treatment would have a synergistic effect on ACP populations. Mr. Watkins reminded everyone this is an urban area without much commercial citrus, thus ceasing treatments would save money. Dr. Etienne Rabe asked for clarification of the action plan and it was determined that the criteria was met to cease treatments. Ms. Hornbaker pointed out that ceasing treatment does not mean ceasing all activities, and that treatment would be replaced with continued trapping, HLB screening, and *Tamarixia radiata* releases. A motion and vote are required to cease treatments.

**Motion:** To recommended implementing the Action Plan clause to cease treatment in the San Jose area of Santa Clara County.

**First:** Dr. Etienne Rabe

**Second:** Mark McBroom

**Motion carries:** Motion passed with 8 yays (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, John Gless, John C. Gless, Mark McBroom, Dr. Etienne Rabe, Gregorio Rundini, and Keith Watkins) and 6 nays (Brad Carmen, Aaron Dillon, Bob Felts, Jr., Jim Gorden, James McFarlane, and Roger Smith).

## **SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Tree Removal and Data Analysis Tactical Operations Center (DATOC) Models**

Dr. Neil McRoberts stated Holly Denison-Sheets is working on running scenarios with agent-based models. Dr. McRoberts added additional work supports early reports and suggests tree removal and delimitation treatment work synergistically to significantly impact ACP populations.

### **Pest Control District (PCD) Involvement Discussion**

Amelia Hicks stated CPDPC met with Imperial PCD, Riverside (Coachella) PCD, and Central California Tristeza Eradication Agency (CCTEA) to provide more details about CPDPC activities in multiple central and southern California counties and to assess PCD's capacity and interest for various activities. Imperial PCD and Coachella PCD are to consult with their boards and administrators and advise what specific activities they can take on.

### **STRATEGIC PRIORITY 4 – Improve Data Technology, Analysis and Sharing Ethyl Formate Registration Update**

Dr. Etienne Rabe stated Dr. Jim Cranney advised him there are no new developments and if the EPA meets its deadline for approval, it would be in January 2022, but could be two years from now.

### **Neonicotinoid Risk Mitigation Update**

Victoria Hornbaker advised CDFA Legal is looking at a proposed risk mitigation document to ensure code sections cited for emergencies align with state emergencies.

### **DATOC Update**

Dr. Neil McRoberts stated the project was successfully renewed for an additional two years. Also, there were two retirements on the expert panel leading to two offers: one to Dr. Robin Choudhury, an epidemiologist from the University of Texas, Rio Grande Valley, and Professor Jonathan Kaplan, an economist at California State University, Sacramento.

### **CalTrap and Citrus Surveyor Update**

Colleen Murphy stated CalTrap is moving forward at a slower pace due to COVID-19 surges, however it has gone through user acceptance, a help desk is being created, and enhancements are being made by the vendor, GeoCortex. Los Angeles County is slated to begin using CalTrap in December 2020 and a rollout to ten counties who agreed to start with CalTrap will occur following training at the end of January 2021.

For Citrus Surveyor, Ms. Murphy stated decisions will be made by County in order to allow for disconnect mode. Collector and Survey123 will be the application used for Citrus Surveyor. The databases are being developed and an application is being used to gather treatment information that will be converted into Citrus Surveyor. Ms. Murphy added CalTrap and Citrus Surveyor are two different entities/types of activities, but they can be used on one mobile unit.

### **OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT STRATEGIC PRIORITY 5 –Outreach and CPDPC Working Group Update**

Mark McBroom stated the Outreach Subcommittee (Outreach) is still working on the grower liaison working group report for the Committee. David Gutierrez added that two surveys were completed (one for industry members and the other for the grower liaisons), and the working group is drafting a document of the responsibilities based on the results of the surveys.

### *Survey Summary*

Price Adams provided an update on the grower liaison and the grower surveys created to understand who and what entity growers and liaisons turn to for information, understand their current perception, gauge sentiment on program efficacy, and learn what is working for each group versus not. The results were encouraging with both groups agreeing the program has been effective, not much is “not working”, and both groups largely utilize the same sources for information. Nuffer, Smith Tucker (NST) is working on addressing issues that were identified, such as not having a clear understanding of the grower liaison roles and expectations. Ms. Price added a document on grower liaison responsibilities will be ready in January 2021 and that NST has a new team member who will focus on building partnerships in various areas of the industry. Ms. Price also updated the Committee on various outreach projects including in-language media, social media outreach in Spanish, and a back-to-basic approach with outreach to the Vietnamese community.

### **United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) Update**

There was no update from USDA. Victoria Hornbaker said the MAC coordinator has stepped down, which will lead to 120 days of acting coordinators.

### **California Citrus Mutual (CCM) Report**

Casey Creamer stated a residential citrus fee is being discussed and that CCM will work with nurseries to ensure the fee is not put on nurseries or commercial growers.

### **Citrus Research Board (CRB) Report**

Marcy Martin stated CRB has finalized its committee roster for the 2020-2021 season and the first committee meeting will likely begin sometime in December 2020.

### **Recap of Action Items from this Meeting**

**ACTION ITEM:** Jennifer Willems and her staff will collect information about repeat find site properties for nymph and adult ACP in Kern County and bring that info to the next operational subcommittee meeting.

**ACTION ITEM:** CDFA will create a RFP for rapid ACP Field Evaluation and Detection for approval at the December 10 Executive subcommittee meeting. CDFA will also propose a budget augmentation for funding this project at the February Full Committee meeting.

**ACTION ITEM:** CDFA will update the ACP Action Plan to maintain trapping at the biweekly interval where it is already occurring.

### **CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 1:21 p.m. The next meeting will be held by webinar on, February 17, 2021, at 9:00 a.m.