

CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, March 14, 2018

Opening:

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on March 14, 2018 in San Bernardino, California by Committee Chairman Jim Gorden.

CPDPC Members Present:

Ed Civerolo	Jim Gorden	George McEwen	Roger Smith
Aaron Dillon	Nick Hill	James McFarlane	Brian Specht
Bob Felts, Jr.	Link Leavens	Etienne Rabe	Keith Watkins
John Gless	Mark McBroom	Kevin Severns*	

CPDPC Members Absent:

Craig Armstrong

CDFR Staff:

Stephen Brown*	Tina Galindo	Magally Luque-Williams	Courtney Pond*
Nick Condos	Adrian Gonzales	Colleen Murphy	Maegan Salinas
Cassandra Davis	Victoria Hornbaker	Keith Okasaki*	Scosha Wright
Paul Figueroa	Sara Khalid	Mike Pitcarin	Bob Wynn

Guests:

Price Adams	Ted Grether	Mareen Lyall	Teresa Siles
Bob Atkins	Linda Haque	Warren Lyall	Cressida Silvers*
Jill Barnier*	Geoff Hollenbeck*	Robert Martin*	Kin Sodnoc*
Brett Chandler*	Karen Jeter	Brianna McGuirge	Albert Stroberg*
Roger Clow*	Brett Kirkpatrick*	Edwin Moscoso*	Carla Thomas
Casey Creamer	Melinda Klein	Joel Nelsen	Dan Willey*
Rick Dunn	Ellen Kragh*	Maggie O'Neil	Qijun Xiang
Enrico Ferro	Leslie Leavens*	Sylvie Robillard*	Judy Zaninovich*
Sara Garcia-Figuera	Karen Lowerison*	Gary Schulz	Sandra Zwaal

* Participated via Webinar

Opening Comments:

Jim Gorden welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online and stated that there is a quorum for the meeting. He acknowledged that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

Public Comment:

Chairman of the San Diego County Pest Control District (PCD), Warren Lyall, announced that the PCD is in the process of getting itself organized. Warren thanked the Committee for their support with the grant that was authorized in 2017. Warren hopes to have the PCD online and working by the end of 2018.

Joel Nelsen with California Citrus Mutual (CCM) introduced CCM's new Executive Vice President, Casey Creamer to the Committee.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS & UPDATES

Jim Gorden reviewed the consent agenda which contained the minutes from the Committee meetings that took place on January 10, 2018 and February 22, 2018.

Motion: To approve the consent agenda with one correction, to add Gary Schulz in attendance at the February 22, 2018 Committee meeting.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Ed Civerolo

Motion Passes: All in favor

FINANCE REPORT & DISCUSSION

2016/2017 Budget Close-out

James presented the 2016/2017 assessment budget to the Committee with projected expenditures totaling at \$25,655,331. As of January 31, 2018, there has been \$16,741,946, in assessment revenue received with an estimated outstanding balance to be received of \$178,054. Through January 31, 2018 there has been \$20,475,258 in expenditures to the assessment budget, leaving a balance remaining of \$6,555,274.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2016/2017 authority is \$25,662,293 and 76 percent has been spent as of January 31, 2018 leaving the remaining balance at \$6,037,963.

The CHRP budget amount is \$12,144,701. So far, \$11,661,138 has been spent, with a balance remaining of \$483,563. 17:24

The statewide survey sub-budget has been overspent by \$274,477 with \$2,274,746 expended so far. The urban treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$1,022,205 and \$3,623,273 expended so far. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures.

Variance Analysis Review

Year to date the ending variance for the assessment budget is 78.81 percent. There have been 75.75 percent of projected expenditures spent for fiscal year 2016/2017 so far.

2017/2018 Budget Review

James also presented the 2017/2018 assessment budget to the Committee with projected expenditures totaling at \$38,245,682. As of January 31, 2018, there has been \$3,092,619, in assessment revenue received with an estimated outstanding balance to be received of \$13,377,381. Through January 31, 2018 there has been \$3,080,416 in expenditures to the assessment budget, leaving a balance remaining of \$38,245,682.

The statewide survey sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$3,072,802 and \$516,066 expended so far. The Southern California treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$5,011,011 and \$398,788 expended so far. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2017/2018 authority is \$24,152,150 and 41 percent has been spent as of January 31, 2018 leaving the remaining balance at \$14,332,930.

James presented a statement of reserve that displays the projected fund balance as well as the available fund balance. The full projected fund balance is \$9,074,3882 with a reserve of \$10,000,000 leaving a negative balance of \$925,618 for available projected funds. The modified projection is \$10,104,834 with a reserve of \$10,000,000 leaving a projected balance available of \$104,834.

James reviewed the Statement of Budgets and Expenditures by Strategy. As of January 31, 2018, Strategy one is to quickly detect and eradicate diseased trees which takes up 58.31 percent of the budget totaling \$24,097,988 with a total current balance remaining of \$20,185,344. Strategy two is to control movement of psyllids around the state and enforce regulations which takes up 13.01 percent of the budget totaling \$5,377,560 with a total current balance remaining of \$5,227,896. Strategy three is to suppress psyllid populations which takes up 19.72 percent of the budget totaling \$8,151,346 with a total current balance remaining of \$6,826,861. Strategy four is to improve data technology, analysis and sharing which takes up 0.91 percent of the budget totaling \$376,145 with a total current balance remaining of \$376,145. Strategy five is outreach and collaboration which takes up 4.90 percent of the budget totaling \$2,023,298 with a total current balance remaining of \$1,929,047. Administration takes up 3.15 percent of the budget totaling \$1,299,750 with a remaining balance of \$862,219.

James also presented a detailed breakdown of the budget by group, strategy, region, project and activity and gave some detail regarding what activities are going on within CDFA as well as projected activities and costs. James stated that in February, CHRP received it's first \$4.25 million in grant money which will show up on the next finance report.

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Committee and Subcommittee Vacancies

Victoria announced that there have been three applicants for the costal vacancy.

Motion: To appoint Ted Grether to fill the Costal Grower vacancy on the Committee

First: Link Leavens

Second: George McEwen

Motion Passes: All in favor

Jim Gorden appointed Aaron Dillon to serve on the Operations Subcommittee to take his position as he will be leaving the Subcommittee. Jim Gorden also appointed Nick Hill to fill the vacancy on the Outreach Subcommittee.

Executive Officer Rotation

Nick Condos stated that he met with the Executive Committee as well as the Glassy-Winged Sharpshooter program to brainstorm and discuss how other Committees run. Nick wanted to put the concept of Executive Officer rotation up for consideration. There was discussion about the Executive Officer rotation and how the rotation would work exactly. Jim stated that he would

like the Committee to take this into consideration and have a solid proposal put together to be discussed at a later point in time.

Nick Condos stated that for \$399,000, CDFA's lab could process 38,000 more plant samples per year, maximizing the lab capacity. This would allow CDFA to convert 8 seasonal employees to permanent employees as well as adding two additional permanent employees. This would allow staff to maximize use of the hoods to do the extractions. Nick also discussed ACP detection work which stands at \$7.4 million for fiscal year 2017/2018. Nick stated that ACP treatments are no longer affordable with the higher priority items. It was asked what the Committee can do to increase the budget and it was stated that increasing the citrus assessment is an option. Mark McBroom stated that having CDFA treat if the growers reach 90 the percent threshold is a great incentive and would not like to see the treatments end.

Motion: to reallocate \$399,000 to increase the CDFA laboratory capacity

First: John Gless

Second: Mark McBroom

Motion Passes: All in favor

It was stated that the Subcommittees need to be reviewing recommendations, like reallocating money, before the full Committee meetings. The members do not have time to discuss or break things down at the full Committee meeting. There needs to be a different protocol in place.

Strategic Plan Scenario 1 Action Plan

Teresa Siles presented the scenario one action plan to the Committee which is essentially the scenario one strategic plan document laid out into tactics. Each strategy has its own section on the document. Every activity in the document is owned by a Subcommittee. It was asked of the Subcommittee chairmen believe that the activities listed belong with their Subcommittee. Nick Condos suggested that the Committee and Subcommittee chairmen have a conference call to go over the document in more detail. It was asked if a deadline needs to be established to keep the Committee on track. Nick Condos stated that deadlines will be established once the conference call is held to go over the document in more detail.

PEIR Litigation Update

The Superior Court has asked CDFA to decertify the PEIR and put an injunction on all chemical treatment activities supplied by CDFA or CDFA's contractors. The injunction takes effect March 14, 2018. Nick Condos stated that CDFA has appealed the initial ruling against the PEIR. The petitioners have 15 days to reply and the appeals court has 90 days to make a decision. The goal is to continue with the chemical treatment activities by seeking alternative forms of CEQA compliance.

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Strategic Priority 1 – Find and Eradicate HLB

Nick Condos stated there have been 509 HLB positive trees and the CDFA lab is still operating at maximum capacity. There was a two-week period that the lab was unable to accept samples because they were at maximum capacity. The Central California Tristeza Agency is still accepting ACP samples as well as the University of Arizona. There are currently 700 refusals for either treatment or survey. It needs to be decided if warrants should be served on all 700

properties which would be a very large workload. There is hyper focused outreach being done in areas of the refusal properties. It was asked if CDFA is removing all citrus trees on the property of the positive tree detection. Nick stated that CDFA is only legally allowed to remove a PCR confirmed HLB positive tree however if the homeowner requests that all of their trees be removed then CDFA will do so. Nick stated that CDFA is working on getting a contractor in place to help with the increase in tree removals.

Strategic Priority 2 – Control ACP Movement and Enforce Regulations

Keith Okasaki with CDFA gave a regulatory activity update. A mailing was sent out to all nurseries located in zones 2 and 3 in January 2018. March 2, 2018 was the deadline to get a compliance agreement in place. Approximately 100 nurseries have been signed up to date. There are approximately 125 that still need to get a compliance agreement in place. CDFA staff is making it a priority to follow up with these nurseries over the next few weeks. A reminder letter was sent out on February 21, 2018 regarding bulk citrus compliance agreements. Approximately 4,300 of the 6,800 compliance agreements have been updated. CDFA staff is continuing to work with the counties to ensure the regulations are being enforced.

Strategic Priority 3 – ACP Control/Suppression

Regional ACP Management

Bob Atkins gave an update regarding ACP management. Bob stated that the San Diego Grower Liaison position is currently vacant. The deadline for applicants is March 30, 2018. Psyllid counts in the Central Valley have remained low. Most counties are finishing up winter treatments and the grower liaisons are in the process of determining which counties have met the 90 percent threshold. There was discussion regarding more outreach, especially in Southern California, to the smaller packing houses regarding compliance with tarping.

Trapping Working Group Overview

Colleen gave an update regarding the current trap counts in San Joaquin valley which totals at 63,436 traps. She also went over the existing delimitation trapping protocols and the proposed delimitation trapping protocols which includes reducing the trapping grid and removing traps after one year with no ACP detections as well as reducing the trapping grid to 4 square miles. This should save approximately 581 personnel hours per month. The new delimitation trapping will trigger implementation of new delimitation trap arrays at a density of 50 traps per square mile in a 4-square mile grid and removed after a one-year period. Detection traps will only be placed in urban areas and distributed at a density of 16 traps per square mile and serviced once a month. Colleen also proposed to relocate any CPDPC grove traps placed within 80 meters of active GWSS traps to eliminate duplicative trapping. There was discussion regarding different technology other than the human eye to scan these traps for psyllids. It was stated that currently, there is no technology available that is capable of scanning the traps better than the human eye.

Motion: To adopt the ACP trapping efficiency recommendations.

First: Nick Hill

Second: Etienne Rabe

Motion Passes: All in favor

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Sara Khalid gave a SitStat GIS report that CDFA staff have been working on and discussed how CDFA staff will be using the SitStat data to develop an application. The SitStat report is a monthly report that CDFA staff distributes with HLB information. The goal is to create a GIS application to include components of the SitStat report. Updates will be made through a dashboard feature and data will be cumulative. This will improve data sharing and create uniform data throughout divisions. The data includes core trapping, cluster surveys, treatment, outreach, biocontrol activities, grower liaison updates and EDT data. CDFA anticipates having the application ready in approximately 6 months. Sara Khalid also stated that CDFA is in the process of routing two MOU's; one that includes CDFA, CRB and UC Davis and another that includes CDFA, CRB and UC Riverside. Nick Condos stated that CDFA entered into an agreement with the Hemet Pest Control District (PCD) to provide them with information on citrus trees on private residences within 400 meters of commercial groves. CDFA buffer treatments may not be conducted in the future and the Hemet PCD would like to evaluate the cost to complete the buffer treatments.

Colleen stated that CDFA staff are currently working on a mobile/desktop application that would essentially replace the paper trap books that field staff are currently using and will allow field staff to collect data electronically and give staff at CDFA headquarters the ability to access the information sooner. CDFA's Information Technology department (IT) is holding a series of scoping meetings regarding establishment of the application. It was stated that this will be a process improvement of the Gottwald survey.

Brianna McGuire, staff researcher with Dr. Neil McRoberts lab in UC Davis presented a presentation on defining tree exposure to HLB in Southern California. Brianna discussed the scope of the data which she received from CDFA, pre-definitions of exposure, her work towards a definition of exposure based on the psyllid path, time and distance and future steps. It was suggested to delegate Brianna's presentation to the Science Subcommittee for further review.

Dr. Karen Jetter gave an update on the overview of the economic risk analysis of ACP/HLB management in Southern California. The objectives are to identify the least-costly method of surveying for ACP/HLB in urban areas of Southern California and to estimate the expected cost of ACP/HLB management in urban areas. Karen reviewed known costs versus unknown costs as well as key costs and probabilities (the spread of HLB). The model works by estimating the known costs for a specific risk survey protocol scenario, plus the costs of a scenario for managing a known HLB infestation, estimates the expected costs of detecting an infestation of HLB and having to incur new delimitation costs, and estimates the expected costs of not detecting an existing infestation of HLB and HLB spreading. The two outputs will be the total cost overtime as well as the estimated time that it will take for HLB to spread to a commercial orchard. There are two considerations, artificial versus natural spread. Current infestations have very different risks of natural spread to commercial groves. Karen also discussed some scenario suggestions regarding the budget and handed out a budget document to the Committee.

Motion: to approve the budget for the economic risk analysis of ACP/HLB management in Southern California

First: Mark McBroom

Second: George McEwen

Motion Passes: All in favor

Etienne asked that in the future, fund requests like these should go through the Subcommittees first before the full Committee.

Sara Garcia-Figuera provided a presentation regarding the bulk citrus regional movement risk evaluation. The objective of the project is to estimate the risk of introducing CLAs or CLAs-infected ACPs when moving bulk citrus between the regional quarantine zones. DATOC selected a panel of risk factors based on the criteria for defining the quarantine zones and the APHIS PPQ guidelines for Pest Risk Analysis. Scores were combined using a program called DEXi for multi-attribute decision making. The program allowed the DATOC to combine all the scores and a risk matrix was generated which includes 7 risk zones. To conclude her presentation, Sara stated that the current evaluation does not support a change in the regulation, as the risk is high for most of the likely combinations: either the likelihood of CLAs positive ACP on the fruit at the zone of origin is high or the damage potential at the zone of destination is high. Some sensitivity analysis was done to look at possible scenarios and packing at the zone of origin could reduce risk. The model is flexible enough to accommodate refinements if there is interest in developing a working group.

Colleen Murphy with CDFA provided a presentation on Cost Benefit analysis which included maps from San Gabriel, Pico Rivera and Anaheim with positive HLB detections. The maps also included the number of samples collected at risk survey sites.

Carla Thomas noted that Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell is currently analyzing ACP count data from the MAC sampling project.

OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Price Adams gave a brief outreach update. Price noted that NST has been running billboards as well as targeted Facebook ads in the Anaheim area. Door hangers in multiple languages were also distributed. NST and other volunteers staffed a booth at the World Ag Expo in Tulare which had a great turn out. There have been multiple citrus insider alerts regarding the ACP quarantine and the compliance process. NST is in the process of redesigning the citrus insider website. NST is also supporting the train-the-trainer events in March and April 2018.

CRB REPORT

Gary Schulz stated that the RFP's went out on March 13, 2018 and was distributed to over 500 different researchers and research institutions. The CRB lab is hoping to regain NPPLAP accreditation in late April 2018. The CRB lab in Riverside has been helping with CDFA's lab capacity and has been processing ACP samples.

CLOSING COMMENTS & ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 3:32 p.m. The next Committee meeting will be held in Ventura, California on May 9, 2018 at 10:00am.