

**CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM
OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING**

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, January 4, 2017

Opening:

The regular meeting of the Operations Subcommittee was called to order at 9:00 a.m. on January 4, 2016 in Visalia, California by Subcommittee Chair Jim Gorden.

Committee Members Present:

Richard Bennett	Link Leavens*	Keith Watkins
Jim Gorden	Kevin Severns	

Committee Members Absent:

John Gless

CRB Staff:

Rick Dunn	Cynthia LeVesque*	Gary Schulz
Melinda Klein		

Interested Parties:

Bob Atkins	John Goergen	Courtney Pond*
Lynette Bankston*	Beth Grafton-Cardwell*	Dana Richmond
Erin Betts	Victoria Hornbaker	Debby Tanouye
Dan Dreyer	Alyssa Houtby	Carla Thomas*
Sean Farnum	Brett Kirkpatrick*	Scosha Wright*
Enrico Ferro*	Jason Leathers*	Sandra Zwaal*
Art Gilbert	Curtis Pate*	Judy Zaninovich

*** Participated via telephone/WebEx**

Opening Comments

Jim Gorden welcomed the Subcommittee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online. It was noted that there was a quorum for the meeting.

Approval of Minutes

Jim Gorden reviewed the minutes from the December 14, 2016 Operations Subcommittee meeting.

Motion: To approve the minutes from the December 14, 2016 Operations Subcommittee meeting with one correction, to fix the spelling of an attendees name.

First: Richard Bennett

Second: Keith Watkins

Motion Passes: All in favor

Discussion on the Analysis of ACP Treatment Cost and Efficacy

Debby Tanouye stated that CDFA staff in Sacramento have collected the trapping and treatment data for the San Gabriel HLB core area from the CDFA field offices and have compared that data with the PDR database. With all of the data that was collected from the last 15 months, staff put together an ACP population analysis of the San Gabriel area. The trap information is used to make CDFA staff aware when an ACP population is establishing so that staff can treat the area. John Goergen, Sean Farnum and Dana Richmond are working on this data to find out over time if the treatments are successful. John stated that there are 100 traps in placed in the core square mile in San Gabriel that are serviced monthly. There has been 1,552 trap servicings as of December 1, 2016. John reviewed some data with the Subcommittee which included treatment data, the percentage of traps found with ACP, total ACP counts since July 2015, and average ACP counts per detection. It was asked if the Subcommittee would like to shift the timing of the treatments based off of the data to coincide with spikes in ACP populations however John stated that he does not feel comfortable making a conclusion based off only 15 months of this data. It was stated that the Glassy-winged Sharpshooter program has an app to collect all of their data. Debby stated that CDFA IT staff has been working getting a similar app for citrus. It was asked if there is any other material that staff can treat with and Victoria stated that in the Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) all that has been analyzed is merit and tempo. Staff is currently looking at a spinosad with an oil which needs to be reviewed by the contractor to be included in the PEIR. Victoria suggested having Beth Grafton-Cardwell review the list of chemicals that have been analyzed under the PEIR and see if any chemicals listed in the PEIR has utility as a homeowner treatment that way some of the analysis will already be done.

Sean gave a presentation regarding Santa Clara county census and risk. Sean presented the Subcommittee with the total population in Santa Clara as well as the total Asian population and the total tract population. The average Asian population in Santa Clara is 33 percent however the total Asian population in the ACP detection area is 41 percent. He also presented a map of the Gottwald risk survey sites in Santa Clara County in addition to areas that staff has surveyed. The map showed that there were large areas with Asian populations that are not being surveyed.

Sean also gave a presentation regarding the Los Angeles County census and risk and provided the total population information for Los Angeles as well as the total Asian population and the total HLB detection area populations. The total Asian population in Los Angeles County is 14 percent. San Gabriel has a 65 percent Asian population, Hacienda Heights has a 27 percent Asian population, La Puente has an 8 percent Asian population and Cerritos has a 60 percent Asian population. It was stated that the new HLB quarantine area in Cerritos goes into a small part of Orange County. There was discussion about including the Hispanic and Hmong population into the risk data.

Discussion on ACP Response Protocol

Debby reviewed the treatment and delimitation survey costs with the Subcommittee. The total cost of treatment and survey in 2015 was \$8,084,325. The total cost of treatment in survey in 2016 was \$12,384,098. After two months in 2017, the estimated total of treatment and survey would be \$1,429,730 which is significantly high compared to past years. Debby stated that Santa

Clara is a high risk County with limited commercial citrus and one packing house. The situation is similar to Los Angeles and Orange County where CDFA staff stopped treatment to lower costs. CDFA staff will continue to detect ACP. The total estimated cost after stopping treatment will drop down to approximately \$161,029 a year versus 2015 where \$861,319 was spent in Santa Clara. Debby stated that staff has continued to put a lot of resources in Santa Clara County and it would be beneficial to contribute some of those resources and time into other counties. Debby has proposed to stop the treatments in Santa Clara County and increase HLB surveys as well as increase the release of biocontrol agents. Dr. Bartels is currently on vacation however he will provide CDFA with an analysis hopefully before the full CPDPC meeting on January 11, 2017. Debby stated that main issue is that the budget that was approved exceeds CDFA's budget authority and the program cannot continue to operate and outspend the authority. There was also discussion about areawide treatment participation and how the participation rate in many counties is declining. Victoria stated that CDFA is going to have Neil McRoberts look at this data and weigh in on the analysis from an epidemiological perspective.

There was a question asked regarding treatment and trapping in Bakersfield. Debby stated that all of the Central Valley has been treated which cost approximately \$4.2 million in treatment and approximately \$1.8 for Survey in the Central Valley survey and the bulk of the \$4.2 million was spent in Bakersfield. It was reported that there is a lower ACP population in Bakersfield today than there was a year ago which means that the treatment and trapping was effective. There was discussion that followed regarding 800 meter treatments, buffer treatments and areawide buffer treatments.

Victoria stated that the Committee has a \$25.6 million budget that was approved in September and only \$16.6 million in authority. CDFA will not know until March if the additional authority will be approved. The authority will be exceeded by March at the spending rate that the Committee is currently at. There needs to be some type of plan implemented to scale back activities to make sure that the Committee stays within the authority. Beth suggested getting the EDT's in place so that staff will know where the true high risk places are because staff is waiting too long on getting data results from Dr. Bartels and Dr. Gottwald..

Debby presented two proposals for consideration:

- To cease the areawide buffer treatments and to reduce the response to ACP to treating find sites and adjacent properties. The trade-off would be additional HLB survey and biocontrol releases in the areawide buffer.
 - Most of the Subcommittee members supported the concept as a jumping off point for discussion, there was discussion about raising the bar from 75 percent of acreage to some higher number to trigger the buffer treatment, or mandatory areawide, but there was also concern that impact the Major growing region and there would not be any mandatory treatments.
- To cease treatments in Santa Clara and increase HLB survey and conduct biocontrol releases.
 - There was agreement from the Subcommittee members with this proposal.

Update and Discussion on Bulk Citrus Movement Mitigations

Beth stated that the goal of the Regional Quarantine working group is to come up with some kind of mitigation for fruit that is moving between major regions to ensure that HLB infected ACP is not being spread. The proposed solution from the Science Advisory Panel (SAP) was to wet wash the fruit which can cause damage to the fruit, making this solution an unsatisfactory substitute for spray and move. The working group is trying to come up with alternative methods. In terms of wet options the working group has discussed truck drenching as a feasible option. Beth stated that she and other staff ran a trial in which they looked at the proposed 1x and 8x rate of Evergreen.. The experiment was done with and without rinse. Once the truck was drenched there were dead psyllids in mostly the centers throughout the bins however most of the psyllids in the corners of the bins survived because the treatment did not hit them directly. After the fruit was moved it was off loaded and was stored at room temperature for three days. The fruit was then evaluated for phytotoxicity and unfortunately all treatments have severe phytotoxicity. Instead of conducting another drench study, staff has decided to take a step back and do laboratory studies such as dipping fruit in different treatments to discover more cause and effects. The fruit was also sent to a DPL laboratory in Fresno to have an analysis done on the pyrethrum and what kind of residue the fruit had. There will be some more information to provide within the next couple of weeks. Another alternative to wet wash and truck drench that that working group has discussed was fumigant however the fumigants are causing the phytotoxicity to unwaxed fruit. Staff is working on a way to distribute the fogs though the bins more effectively.

Victoria stated that there is a grower meeting in Tulare on January 9, 2017 to give more information to growers on the tarping requirements.

The meeting was adjourned at 11:50 a.m. The next Operations meeting will be held on February 15, 2017 at 9:00 a.m. in Visalia, California.