

CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, September 13, 2017

Opening:

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on September 13, 2017 in San Bernardino, California by Committee Chairman Nick Hill.

CPDPC Members Present:

Craig Armstrong	Jim Gorden	George McEwen	Kevin Severns
Ed Civerolo	Nick Hill	James McFarlane	Brian Specht*
Bob Felts, Jr.	Link Leavens*	Kevin Olsen*	Keith Watkins
John Gless	Mark McBroom	Etienne Rabe	

CPDPC Members Absent:

Franco Bernardi

CDFA Staff:

Stephen Brown*	Tina Galindo	Jason Leathers	Leandro Ramos
Jason Chan	Adrian Gonzales	Magally Luque-Williams	Debby Tanouye
Melinda DeHererra	Victoria Hornbaker	Paul Martinez*	Scosha Wright
Paul Figueroa	Sara Khalid	Mike Pitcairn	Bob Wynn*

Guests:

Bob Atkins	Jeff Croy	Melinda Klein	Margo Sanchez
Bruce Babcock	Aaron Dillon*	Ellen Kragh*	Gary Schulz
Rebekah Ban	Rick Dunn	John Krist*	Cressida Silvers*
Joe Barcinas	Enrico Ferro	Allen Lampman	Stephanie Stark*
Jill Barnier	John Gless	Warren Lyall	Rayne Thompson*
Seth Birenbaum	Carmen Haines	Pete Marcum	Alan Washburn
Bob Blakely	Subhas Hajeri*	Tom Mulholland*	Steve Wellington
Teri Blaser*	Linda Haque	Katie Nieri	Karen Westerman*
Chris Boisseronc	Chuck Hills	Pat Nolan*	Jack Williams*
Peter Buoye	Geoff Hollenbeck*	Sandy Olkowski*	Pricilla Yeane*
Teresa Buoye	Scott Hudson	Curtis Pate	Judy Zaninovich*
Gayle Covey	Brett Kirkpatrick*	Sylvie Robillard*	Sandra Zwaal

* Participated via Webinar

Opening Comments:

Nick Hill welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online and stated that there is a quorum for the meeting. He acknowledged that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

Public Comment:

Linda Haque, a Ventura County citrus grower urged the Committee not to discontinue the residential buffer treatments because it is essential to keep the treatments to suppress ACP. Backyard citrus is the biggest area of concern for growers and the industry.

Warren Lyall, San Diego County citrus grower and Chairman of the San Diego County Pest Control District also gave a public comment regarding the buffer treatments. Warren also urged that the treatments continue and stated that he would be disappointed if they were stopped.

Scott Hudson, Chairman of the San Bernardino County Farm Bureau Task Force gave a public comment as well. Scott along with other members of the Task Force would be disappointed if the residential spraying was stopped because it would have an immense negative impact to the growers.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS & UPDATES

Nick Hill reviewed the consent agenda which contained the minutes from the Committee meetings that took place on July 12, 2017 and August 24, 2017.

Motion: To approve the consent agenda which included the July 12, 2017 and August 24, 2017 Committee meeting minutes.

First: Mark McBroom

Second: John Gless

Motion Passes: All in favor

DISCUSSION ON REQUIREMENTS FOR BULK CITRUS MOVEMENT

Mark McBroom stated that the fruit cleaning process is very expensive. It also has a harmful impact on the immature fruit. Mark asked that the fruit cleaning not be a mandatory requirement for moving fruit out of an HLB quarantine zone. Mark stated that the spray and move option would be the most preferred option when moving fruit out of a quarantine zone. Mark also stated that HLB quarantine zones should be established when a positive ACP is detected. Nick Hill stated that Spenser Walse with USDA is getting good results with the fumigation testing that he has been working on which will be much easier than the fruit cleaning option. Mark stated that the fumigation could be expensive as well. There was further discussion regarding fruit cleaning and what has and has not been effective so far. Between the fumigation and the fruit wash, Nick is confident that there will be a high ACP mortality rate.

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

2016/2017 Budget

James presented the 2016/2017 assessment budget to the Committee with projected expenditures totaling at \$25,655,331. As of July 31, 2017 there has been \$15,389,180 in assessment revenue received with an estimated outstanding balance to be received of \$1,890,820. Through July 31, 2017 there has been \$14,145,185 in expenditures to the assessment budget, leaving a balance remaining of \$11,750,098. The urban treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$1,951,650 and \$2,693,827 expended so far. The central valley survey and treatment sub-budget

has a remaining budget balance of \$2,891,633 and \$2,575,215 expended so far. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures.

Through July 31, 2017 there has been \$78,056 in expenditures to the TASC Grant with a remaining balance of \$346,944 which was transferred to CHRP, leaving the ending balance for the TASC Grant at zero. The TASC Grant will also not be renewed for fiscal year 2017/2018.

The budget balance for CHRP was increased by \$2,384,470 bringing the total budget to \$12,144,701. As of July 31, 2017 there has been \$7,956,375 expended so far leaving a remaining balance available of \$4,188,325.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2016/2017 authority is \$25,662,293 and 74 percent has been spent as of July 31, 2017 leaving the remaining balance at \$6,751,821.

James presented a document which showed the projection of expenditures for HLB response which includes the statewide risk-based survey, HLB Los Angeles response, HLB Orange response and HLB Riverside response. The total projected expenditures creates an overage of \$1,135,250. It was asked where the \$1,135,250 will be transferred from.

Motion: To transfer \$1,135,250 to fund HLB response activities from underspent line items in the budget.

First: James McFarlane

Second: Craig Armstrong

Motion Passes: The motion passed with 12 yays; Craig Armstrong, Bob Felts, Jr. John Gless, Jim Gorden, Nick Hill, Link Leavens, George McEwen, James McFarlane, Kevin Olsen, Kevin Severns, Brian Specht and Keith Watkins and three abstentions; Mark McBroom, Ed Civerolo and Dr. Etienne Rabe.

Variance Analysis Review 2016/2017

Year to date the ending variance for the assessment budget is -27.83 percent. There have been 54.62 percent of projected expenditures spent for fiscal year 2016/2017 so far. James introduced a new line item on the 2016/2017 Variance Analysis document. The new line item is the modified straight line projection which CDFR staff has developed in order to estimate where we will land instead of expecting to spend the entire budget. The projection as of July 31, 2017 is \$22,703,507.

Proposed 2017/2018 Budgets

James presented a comparison of scenarios for the CHRP and CPDPC budget projections. The full budget projection is \$42,755,913. With the buffer treatment reduction the projection is \$40,928,938. With the buffer treatment and Northern California survey reduction, the projection is \$39,815,818. James also presented projection summaries of the full budget for fiscal year 2017/2018 compared to fiscal year 2016/2017. There was a summary of the full budget, the budget with buffer treatment reductions and a projection summary of the buffer treatment reduction as well as the Northern California survey reduction. It was stated that these budget projections are all based on the \$.09 assessment rate. Some Committee members stated that they were disappointed in the outcome of the budget projections based on the time spent discussing the budgets at the interim CPDPC meeting. It was stated that there should be a strategic plan in

place before voting on a budget. Since the Committee fiscal year starts October 1, 2017 there needs to be a budget in place before then. The strategic planning process will hopefully be done by November 1, 2017. The budget can be changed and the Committee and revisit the budget at the November 8, 2017 Committee meeting however there needs to be a budget approved before October 1, 2017. It was stated that the Committee knows that they will receive approximately \$12 million from CHRP and \$10 million from the State.

Victoria stated that the reserve should stay at what the Committee comes into for fiscal year 2017/2018 which will be approximately \$7 million. It was stated that an additional \$5 million to \$7 million in reserves as a part of fiscal year 2017/2018's projected budget and it would be a good idea for the Committee to have money to allocate if there is an emergency. It was also stated that the budget should be increased due to the increase in HLB finds. The Committee and CDFA need to stop the spread of HLB before it is too late. To get the budget to \$40 million and have a \$5 million contingency, the Committee will need to work down the work plan and program elements. Victoria asked if this is something that could be discussed during strategic planning. There was further discussion regarding the budget and the money in reserve.

Motion: To set the budget at \$16,470,000 in assessments, \$10,000,000 in general fund and \$14,144,701 for CHRP with the understanding that the budgets will be modified through the strategic planning process

First: Bob Felts, Jr.

Second: Craig Armstrong

Motion passes: The motion passed with 12 yays; Craig Armstrong, Ed Civerolo, Bob Felts, Jr., John Gless, Jim Gorden, Nick Hill, Link Leavens, Mark McBroom, George McEwen, James McFarlane, Kevin Severns and Brian Specht and three nays; Kevin Olsen, Dr. Etienne Rabe, and Keith Watkins .

Set AB 281 Assessment Rate

The Committee would not like to support an increase in the assessment rate at this time and would like the assessment to remain at \$.09 per carton which will bring in approximately \$16 million. Victoria stated that Jason Chan revised the crop estimate based on the September navel forecast which is down significantly according to NASS however with the assessments at \$.09 center par carton, the Committee should being in approximately \$16,470,000 which would be close what the Committee has for budget option 2. It was asked if there was still \$8 million in reserves of the assessment funds that are not being utilized and if that is the case then the Committee is in the ballpark with the \$.09 assessment rate. Nick Hill stated that the Committee is in the ballpark with the \$.09 assessment rate.

Motion: To keep the current assessment rate at \$.09 per carton.

First: Bob Felts, Jr.

Second: Craig Armstrong

Motion Passes: The motion passed with 13 yays; Craig Armstrong, Bob Felts, Jr., John Gless, Nick Hill, Link Leavens, Mark McBroom, George McEwen, James McFarlane, Kevin Olsen, Dr. Etienne Rabe, Kevin Severns, Brian Specht and Keith Watkins and one nay; Jim Gorden and one abstention; Ed Civerolo.

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Full Committee Costal Member Vacancy

Leandro Ramos reported that there is currently a vacancy on the Committee for a Costal Member. Leandro stated that there have not been any applicants for the vacancy and the filing date for the vacancy will need to be extended.

Outreach Subcommittee Member Vacancy

Outreach Chairman Gus Gunderson has resigned from the Committee therefore there will need to be a new Chairman appointed. Mark McBroom stated that he would step up to be the new Outreach Subcommittee Chairman. Leandro also announced that there is a vacancy on the Outreach Subcommittee. Victoria stated that attendance and member participation is crucial for these Subcommittee meetings. The Outreach Subcommittee meetings have also been narrowed down to only four times a year. Nick Hill asked if any of the Committee members were interested in becoming a member on the Outreach Subcommittee. If the Committee members do not volunteer by the next full Committee meeting, Nick Hill will appoint someone.

Regional ACP Management

Bob Atkins gave a brief update on regional ACP management noting that the elected officials in Redlands and Arlington Heights are becoming involved due to the HLB finds in Riverside, thanks to members of CPDPC, NST, CCM and the Grower Liaisons. San Bernardino County continues to work on forming their citrus pest control district. He stated that San Diego County has three vendors lined up and ready to take care of any neglected and abandoned groves that need to be abated. San Bernardino and Imperial County currently have no known neglected orchards. Orange County is currently working on the neglected orchards that have been identified by the Agricultural Commissioner's office. The Tulare County Agricultural Commissioner and the Board of Supervisors Representative in Tulare are working to take care of the neglected orchards there. There is an EDT Task Force meeting being held on September 14, 2017.

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Treatment Updates

Tina gave an update regarding areawide treatment in Southern California. In Imperial the grove areawide treatment began on February 20, 2017 and the border areawide treatment began February 26, 2017 and was completed on June 14, 2017. The Merit application will begin September 18, 2017. Treatment began on March 6, 2017 around the UCR and Hemet areas in Riverside and was completed on April 5, 2017. Merit and Tempo applications began on August 7, 2017 and are ongoing. San Bernardino and San Diego are also 100 percent complete. Merit and Tempo treatments began in San Bernardino on August 15, 2017 and are ongoing. The San Diego border areawide Merit and Tempo treatment will begin September 18, 2017. The grove areawide Tempo treatment is complete. Ventura areawide is 100 percent complete and Merit and Tempo treatment began on August 8, 2017 and is ongoing. Santa Barbara areawide is 100 percent complete and Merit and Tempo treatment will begin after the public meeting on September 19, 2017. San Gabriel is 50 percent complete and Merit and Tempo treatment began

on July 24, 2017. Hacienda Heights is 100 percent complete and Merit and Tempo treatment will begin in October 2017. Merit and Tempo treatment will begin in August 14, 2017 for Cerritos and La Puente.

HLB Survey Updates

Hacienda Heights

There are currently 100 traps placed in the core square mile in Hacienda Heights. In May there were 37 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 106 ACP samples collected. In July there were 22 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 77 ACP samples collected. In August there were 28 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 73 ACP samples collected.

San Gabriel

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in San Gabriel. In May there were 9 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 12 ACP collected. In July there were 6 traps with ACP samples and 11 ACP collected. In August there were 17 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 60 ACP collected. Cycle 2 is currently in progress and began on May 17, 2017 and 968 sites have been visited so far with 126 plant samples collected and 728 ACP samples collected. There have been 162 sites negative for ACP.

There have been 1,701 properties surveyed in Rosemead and San Gabriel. There have been 1,108 plant samples taken and 608 ACP samples. There were 550 properties with no host. Treatment began on July 24, 2017. In Pico Rivera there have been 396 properties surveyed, 161 plant samples taken and 107 ACP samples taken. There were 185 properties with no host. Treatment began on September 5, 2017.

Cerritos

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in Cerritos. In June there were 37 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 148 ACP collected. In July there were 16 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 76 ACP collected. In August there were 17 traps with ACP and an estimated 57 ACP collected.

La Puente

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in La Puente. In May there were 8 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 88 ACP collected. In July there were 43 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 303 ACP samples collected. In August there were 134 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 134 ACP samples collected.

CDFA has also conducted other HLB sampling and resampling in Los Angeles County such as the Levaeu Lab Leaf Swab, inconclusive resampling, dog sample sites, Slupsky resample, CRB transect sites and low Ct resamples.

Victoria stated that Dr. Gottwald's risk based survey has been useful and CDFA has been able to find HLB positive areas however CDFA has been asking for a revised San Gabriel cluster survey for over a year. CDFA staff has also asked for cluster surveys for Cerritos and La Puente with no response from Dr. Gottwald. Debby has talented staff that could put the risk surveys together. Victoria asked if the Committee was opposed to moving away from the reliance of Dr. Gottwald because he is so busy. It was stated that this may be a good idea and have seen the results already

with CDFA staff with the Anaheim finds. There was further discussion about moving away from Dr. Gottwald's survey work. The Committee would not like to see Dr. Gottwald dropped completely but there needs to be alternative resources developed. Debby stated that her staff could develop something within a couple of months. Victoria stated something that CDFA can do to help with some of the unease is to continue to work with Dr. Gottwald because he is funded this year through the CRB grant. Debby can work with her staff and Dr. Gottwald so that Dr. Gottwald can be more of a consultant rather than have him doing the survey work.

Motion: To transition from Dr. Gottwald's Risk Based Survey to CDFA staff's Risk Survey by September 2018.

First: Mark McBroom

Second: George McEwen

Motion Passes: The motion passed with 11 yays; Craig Armstrong, Bob Felts, Jr., John Gless, Mark McBroom, Nick Hill, Link Leavens, George McEwen, James McFarlane, Kevin Severns, Brian Specht and Keith Watkins and four nays; Ed Civerolo, Jim Gorden, Kevin Olsen, and Dr. Etienne Rabe.

Summary of HLB Detections

Magally Luque-Williams gave an update on the summary of the HLB detections. In Los Angeles County there have been 113 positive HLB trees. Two positive HLB trees and one positive ACP were detected in Hacienda Heights. One positive ACP was detected in La Puente. There have been 60 HLB positive trees and six positive ACP detected in San Gabriel and Rosemead. In Cerritos there have been two HLB positive trees detected and one positive ACP. In Anaheim there have been a total of 41 positive trees and 24 positive ACP detected. In La Habra there was one positive HLB tree detected. There was one HLB positive tree detected in Fullerton as well and one positive ACP. There have been four HLB positive trees and one positive ACP in Pico Rivera bringing the grand total of HLB positive trees to 113 and 35 positive ACP detections.

Orange County Delimitation Survey

Magally also reviewed the Orange County 800 meter delimitation surveys which include Anaheim, Fullerton and La Habra. For Anaheim there are now 14,635 properties in the 800 meter area, 7,456 properties have been surveyed with 3,180 plant samples and 2,260 ACP samples that have been collected. 4,865 properties were no-host. In La Habra there are 1,291 properties in the 800 meter area, 1,262 properties have been surveyed with 489 plant samples and 265 ACP samples that have been collected. 775 properties were no-host. In Fullerton there are 1,892 properties in the 800 meter area, 1,864 properties have been surveyed with 744 plant samples and 300 ACP samples that have been collected. 1,145 properties were no-host.

There is an 800 meter delimitation survey in Riverside as well. There are 1,393 properties in the 800 meter area, 1,316 properties have been surveyed with 440 plant samples and 94 ACP samples that have been collected. 944 properties were no-host.

Risk Survey

Magally Luque-Williams stated that Cycle 1 began in late April which includes 42 counties of which 24 are 100 percent complete. There have been 36,045 sites surveyed so far with 9,924 ACP samples taken, 4,649 plant samples taken and 22,494 sites negative for ACP.

Cycle 2 is complete in Merced, Monterey, San Benito, San Luis Obispo and Santa Barbara counties. There have been 3,151 sites surveyed so far with 9,924 ACP samples taken, 4,642 plant samples taken and 22,464 sites negative for ACP.

CDFa staff is also conducting a border ACP collection survey. Cycle 3 for Imperial County is 98 percent complete with 266 sites surveyed, 0 sites with ACP samples collected and 265 sites with plant samples collected. Cycle 4 for Imperial is 93 percent complete. Cycle 3 for San Diego is 100 percent complete with 199 sites surveyed, 14 sites with ACP samples collected and 50 sites with plant samples collected. Cycle 4 for San Diego is 40 percent complete.

Magally mentioned that her team has been collaborating with Carla Thomas on the CA 1 study. They are conducting sampling in commercial citrus groves in Riverside, Orange, Imperial, San Diego, Kern, Fresno and Tulare and a total of 668 samples have been collected so far

Laboratory Updates

Victoria Hornbaker provided an update on behalf of Luci Kumagai for the CDFa laboratory. In August, 31 more positive trees were removed, 1 from San Gabriel, 4 from Pico Rivera, 25 from Anaheim and 1 in Riverside. There were 21 positive sites, 10 of which had infected ACP and infected trees, 8 sites with only tree detections and 3 sites with only infected ACP. In the month of August CDFa received a total of 5,557 ACP and 8,263 plant samples. Yearly HLB sample totals from 2008 to 2017 have a grand total of 490,023 samples. To date a total of 11 HLB positive trees have been removed: 59 from San Gabriel, 1 from Rosemead, 2 from Hacienda Heights, 2 from Cerritos, 39 from Anaheim, 1 from Fullerton and 1 from La Habra. To date a total of 37 ACP positive psyllids have been detected: 24 from Anaheim, 1 from Fullerton, 5 from San Gabriel, 2 from Cerritos, 1 from Hacienda Heights, 1 from La Puente, 1 from Rosemead, and 1 from Pico Rivera. All HLB positive trees have been removed. The University of Arizona continues to process ACP samples as well.

Biocontrol Update

Mike Pitcairn gave a brief update on the biocontrol program. Mike stated that the Biocontrol release plans have changed due to the establishment of *Tamarixia radiata*. The new Biocontrol releases are being done in HLB quarantine areas, along borders, along trade routes, in the areawide management areas and where newly established ACP is found. Year to date there have been 1,962,880 *Tamarixia radiata* released and 92,054 *Diaphorencyrtus aligarhensis*. CDFa in collaboration with USDA and CRB has developed the standard operating procedures for private insectaries who are interested in becoming permitted to rear *Tamarixia radiata*. The operating procedures and the permit conditions have been posted to the CDFa website for those who are interested.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that Spencer Walse is working on a data write-up for the fumigation trials he has been working on and that will be given to CDFa and CCM.

OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Katie Nieri with NST reported that NST has doubled the outreach that they had the previous fiscal year. NST was also about to secure another contract with CDFa for an additional two years and an optional third year renewal.

CRB REPORT

Gary Schulz reported that a new lab director for the Riverside lab, Dr. Qijun Xiang, Ph.D. has been hired from Beltsville, Maryland. CRB continues to work on the lab reaccreditation. Gary presented copies of the final report from the HLB external review that was conducted on August 14 – 18, 2017. Gary Schulz introduced Dr. Bruce Babcock to the Committee. Dr. Babcock is the Agricultural Economist for the citrus cluster at UC Riverside. The California Citrus Conference will be held on October 11, 2017 at the Wyndham in Visalia.

CLOSING COMMENTS & ADJOURNMENT

There were no closing comments made.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:35 p.m. The next meeting will be held in Ventura, California on November 8, 2017 at 10:00am.