

# CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, July 12, 2017

## **Opening:**

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on July 12, 2017 in Visalia, California by Committee Chairman Nick Hill.

## **CPDPC Members Present:**

Craig Armstrong*	Nick Hill	Etienne Rabe
Franco Bernardi	Link Leavens	Kevin Severns
Bob Felts, Jr.	Mark McBroom*	Brian Specht*
Jim Gorden	James McFarlane	Keith Watkins
Gus Gunderson	Kevin Olsen	

## **CPDPC Members Absent:**

John Gless	George McEwen
------------	---------------

## **CDFA Staff:**

Stephen Brown*	Amber Hoyt	Leandro Ramos
Jason Chan	Luci Kumagai*	Duane Schnabel*
Tina Galindo	Jason Leathers*	Nawal Sharma*
Art Gilbert	Magally Luque-Williams*	Debby Tanouye
Adrian Gonzales	Paul Martinez*	Scosha Wright
Victoria Hornbaker	David Morgan*	Bob Wynn

## **Guests:**

Bob Atkins	Linda Khuu*	Gary Schulz
Rebekah Ban	Brett Kirkpatrick*	Teresa Siles
Marc Bancroft	Melinda Klein	Cressida Silvers*
Erin Betts	Ellen Kragh*	Stephanie Stark *
Teri Blaser	Fabian Magana*	Carla Thomas*
Meghan Cordell*	Neil McRoberts	Tom Tucker*
Dan Dreyer*	Tom Mulholland*	Spencer Walse*
Lauren Droogh	Joel Nelsen	Karen Westerman*
Rick Dunn	Katie Nieri	Judy Zaninovich
Enrico Ferro*	Curtis Pate	Sandra Zwaal*
Carmen Haines*	Sylvie Robillard	
Subhas Hajeri*	Margo Sanchez*	

\* Participated via Webinar

**Opening Comments:**

Nick Hill welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online and stated that there is a quorum for the meeting. Leandro Ramos, Citrus Program Manager introduced himself to the Committee and announced that he is happy to be working with everyone.

**Public Comment:**

There were no public comments made.

**COMMITTEE BUSINESS & UPDATES**

Nick Hill reviewed the consent agenda which contained the minutes from the Committee meeting that took place on May 10, 2017.

**Motion:** To approve the corrected consent agenda which included the May 10, 2017 Committee meeting minutes and the Committee member term renewals for Link Leavens, Franco Bernardi, Keith Watkins, and Mark McBroom.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Bob Felts, Jr.

Motion Passes: All in favor

**FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

**a. 2016/2017 Budget**

James presented the 2016/2017 assessment budget to the Committee with projected expenditures totaling at \$25,655,331. As of May 31, 2017 there has been \$13,145,327 in assessment revenue received with an estimated outstanding balance to be received of \$4,854,673. Through May 31, 2017 there has been \$10,885,354 in expenditures to the assessment budget, leaving a balance remaining of \$15,009,928. The urban treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$2,405,319 and \$2,240,158 expended so far. The central valley survey and treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$3,312,548 and \$2,154,300 expended so far. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures.

Through May 31, 2017 there has been \$78,056 in expenditures to the TASC Grant with a remaining balance of \$346,944 which was transferred to CHRP, leaving the ending balance for the TASC Grant at zero. The TASC Grant will also not be renewed for fiscal year 2017/2018.

The CHRP budget amount is significantly less than 2015/2016 with a budget balance of \$5,615,061. As of May 31, 2017 there has been \$5,609,953 expended so far leaving a remaining balance available of \$5,108, however the program is expecting \$4,145,170 in additional funding from CHRP. Joel Nelsen reported that the Committee can expect an additional \$2.3 million for CHRP for fiscal year 2016/2017.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2016/2017 authority is \$25,662,293 and 62 percent has been spent as of May 31, 2017 leaving the remaining balance at \$9,660,027.

### **b. Variance Analysis Review 2016/2017**

Year to date the ending variance for the assessment budget is -23.90 percent. There have been 42.04 percent of projected expenditures spent for fiscal year 2016/2017 so far. James introduced a new line item on the 2016/2017 Variance Analysis document. The new line item is modified straight line projection which CDFA staff has developed in order to estimate where we will land instead of expecting to spend the entire budget.

### **c. Draft 2017/2018 Budget Discussion**

There was a question asked regarding what the timing is for receiving general fund allocation of \$10 million. It was also asked if there was going to be a strategic plan developed to decide where the money will be spent. Victoria stated that the \$10 million is a one year appropriation on the state's fiscal year. The money can be spent and/or encumbered fiscal year 2016/2017 and that would give the Committee two additional years to liquidate the funds. There are also no restrictions on what the money can be spent on. The Committee thanked CCM and Secretary Ross for their diligent work on this allocation.

Victoria stated that the Committee has received \$9.6 million in emergency authority in May 2017 to bridge the gap between the \$16 million in existing authority and the Committee's budget of \$25 million. The \$9.6 million is a one-time allocation as well and cannot be spent beyond the 2017/2018 fiscal year. Victoria has developed a concept for a budget change proposal for \$5 million in additional authority which would take the Committee from \$16 million to \$21 million for fiscal year 2018/2019 and 2019/2020.

The Committee suggested simplifying the budget. Victoria stated that the Finance Subcommittee has been discussing combining all survey treatment together in one line item to help simplify the Assessment Funds budget.

### **d. Budget Task Force Update**

James reported that the Budget Task Force has developed a letter that was sent to the Science Advisory Panel (SAP) from the Budget Task Force on May 2, 2017. The letter includes concerns regarding urban treatment, biocontrol, HLB survey and diagnostics, HLB response, and ACP trapping. The SAP has responded and that response letter was sent out to the Committee for their review. The next Budget Task Force meeting is scheduled on August 18, 2017. Nick Hill asked that all of the Committee members revise the SAP recommendations so that the Committee is prepared when it comes to setting the budget at the September 13, 2017 Committee meeting. Nick Hill also mentioned that he would like the Committee to have an interim Committee finance meeting held before September 13, 2017.

## **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

### **a. Full Committee Public Member Vacancy**

Leandro Ramos reported that there is currently a vacancy on the Committee as a Public Member. Leandro stated that there are three applicants for the Public Member vacancy on the Committee. The applicant's resumes and letters of interest were placed in the Committee's binders for review.

**Motion:** To appoint Edwin Civerolo to fill the Public Member vacancy on the Committee.

First: Etienne Rabe

Second: Franco Bernardi

Motion Passes: All in favor

#### **b. Outreach Subcommittee Member Vacancy**

Leandro announced that there is also a vacancy on the Outreach Subcommittee. Victoria stated that attendance and member participation is crucial for these Subcommittee meetings. Nick Hill asked if any of the Committee members were interested in becoming a member on the Outreach Subcommittee. If none of the Committee members volunteer by the next full Committee meeting, Nick Hill will appoint someone. It was asked that CDFA staff send out Outlook meeting invitations as a reminder for when the Subcommittee meetings are held.

#### **c. Approve Meeting Calendars**

Leandro presented the 2017 – 2018 Committee and Subcommittee calendars. Victoria stated that she sent the calendars to CRB, CCM, Sunkist and CISAC for review to avoid meeting conflicts. There were a few minor corrections to the Subcommittee meeting dates.

**Motion:** To accept the Committee and corrected Subcommittee calendars.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: James McFarlane

Motion Passes: All in favor

#### **d. Regional ACP Management**

Bob Atkins gave a brief update on regional ACP management noting that the Grower Liaisons are having a meeting with Nuffer, Smith, Tucker (NST) on August 20, 2017 to discuss areawide management and GIS improvements. Bob thanked Dan Dreyer and John Blasius for their service and welcomed Teri Blaser as the new Northern Tulare Grower Liaison. Bob stated that Sandra Zwaal has filled the San Bernardino County Grower Liaison position. Bob mentioned that several counties are working on developing Pest Control Districts and also on preparing to remove abandoned and neglected orchards. San Diego's Pest Control District's board is in place and has met already. San Bernardino county growers continue to work on forming a Pest Control District. He stated that San Diego County has three vendors lined up and ready to take care of any neglected and abandoned groves that need to be abated. San Bernardino and Imperial County currently have no known neglected orchards. Orange County is currently working on the neglected orchards that have been identified there through the Agricultural Commissioner's office. The Tulare County Agricultural Commissioner and the Board of Supervisors Representative in Tulare are working to take care of the neglected orchards there.

#### **e. County Bulk Citrus Enforcement Contracts**

Duane Schnabel stated that CDFA is enforcing safeguarding on all citrus loads being moved regardless of destination or origin. CDFA staff has been working with the counties to get cooperative agreements in place. CDFA staff has gone through three iterations for the scope of work and finally arrived at an agreeable scope of work in April 2017. There are cooperative agreements in place with 16 counties which total \$1.57 million and were prorated for 5 months to run May 1, 2017 through September 30, 2017. CDFA staff is going back to the counties with a solicitation for a work plan for the next cooperative agreement cycle which is proposed at 9

months from October 1, 2017 to June 30, 2017 to align with the state fiscal year. It was asked if there has been any enforcement action taken so far. Duane stated that some counties have been turned to district attorney action. It was also asked if these cases are eligible to be prosecuted civil administratively and some are eligible; it depends on the county.

#### **f. Compliance Agreements**

To date CDFA has 11,700 compliance agreements for the ACP/HLB program which includes growers, packers, processors, haulers as well as retail and production nurseries. Compliance agreements are continuing to be signed almost weekly as quarantine areas expand, particularly with retail nurseries. CDFA also continues to sign compliance agreements with green waste facilities. CDFA has developed a standardized inspection checklist that has been sent out to the counties so that each county in the program uses the same set of standards when doing inspections. A matrix is also being developed so that the same enforcement actions take place in each county. There was enforcement work done which included vehicle inspections on May 17 – 18, 2017 on interstate 10 in Desert Hills, on interstate 5 near the grapevine on May 25 – 26, 2017 and interstate 5 in Cascade on May 22 – 23, 2017. State Route 55 at cash creek had vehicle inspections on May 15 – 16, 2017 and there was also a roadside commercial vehicle inspection at State Route 65 in Tulare on May 4, 2017. Similar enforcement inspections were also done in January 2017 and all were in cooperation with CHP. There were several violations issued as a results of the inspections which were turned over to the county.

It was asked why the labor contractors are no longer required to fill out compliance agreements. Duane stated that CDFA stopped issuing compliance agreements to labor contractors approximately 4 years ago because most of them were under compliance already as a hauler or a grower. If there are strictly harvesters and they do not move the fruit themselves then CDFA is not enforcing compliance agreements on them.

The Committee asked for an update on the regional quarantine zones. Victoria stated that there was a draft that was developed and routed internally and CDFA's legal office had some revisions for staff which are currently being made. Stephen Brown stated that once the revisions requested by the legal office are complete, the Committee could set a quarantine enforcement date so that industry would know when the regional quarantine zones would go into effect.

### **OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Keith Watkins gave a brief overview of the discussions that were had at the Operations Subcommittee meeting that was held on July 5, 2017

#### **a. Treatment Updates**

Tina gave an update regarding areawide treatment in Southern California. In Imperial the grove areawide treatment began on February 20, 2017 and the border areawide treatment began February 26, 2017. The border areawide treatment is 56 percent complete and Merit application will begin September 2017. Treatment began on March 6, 2017 around the UCR and Hemet areas in Riverside and was completed on April 5, 2017. Merit and Tempo applications will begin in August 2017. San Bernardino and San Diego are also 100 percent complete. Merit and Tempo will begin in San Bernardino in August 2017. The San Diego border areawide Merit and Tempo treatment will begin in mid-July 2017. Ventura areawide is 100 percent complete and Merit and Tempo treatment will begin in August 2017. Santa Barbara areawide is 100 percent complete and Merit and Tempo treatment will begin in September 2017. San Gabriel is 10 percent

complete. The positive ACP detection in Rosemead caused an expansion treatment which began July 5, 2017. Merit and Tempo treatment will begin at the end of July 2017. Hacienda Heights is 100 percent complete and Merit and Tempo treatment will begin in October 2017. Merit and Tempo treatment will begin in July 2017 for Cerritos and La Puente.

## **b. HLB Survey Updates**

### Hacienda Heights

There are currently 100 traps placed in the core square mile in Hacienda Heights. In April there were 14 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 18 ACP samples collected. In May there were 37 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 106 ACP samples collected. Year to date cycles 1 through 3 of the cluster survey are complete. Cycle 4 began on July 6, 2017 and is currently ongoing. So far there have been 4 sites visited, 3 plant samples collected, 1 ACP sample collected and 1 site negative for ACP.

### San Gabriel

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in San Gabriel. In April there were 9 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 12 ACP collected. In May there were 9 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 12 ACP collected. There was an HLB detection in Rosemead and CDFA staff are currently treating the property. For the delimitation survey, there have been 442 properties surveyed from which 225 plant samples were collected and 205 ACP samples collected. There were 117 properties that had no hosts. Treatment began on July 5, 2017. Cycle 2 is currently in progress and began on May 17, 2017 and 472 sites have been visited so far with 71 plant samples collected and 344 ACP samples collected. There have been 82 sites negative for ACP.

### Cerritos

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in Cerritos. In April there were 26 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 71 ACP collected. In May there were 31 traps with ACP samples and 136 ACP collected. In June there were 37 traps with ACP and 148 ACP collected.

### La Puente

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in La Puente. In April there were 42 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 94 ACP collected. In May there were 8 traps with an estimated 88 ACP samples collected.

CDFA has also conducted other HLB sampling and resampling in Los Angeles County such as the Levaeu Lab Leaf Swab, inconclusive resampling, dog sample sites, Slupsky resample, CRB transect sites and low Ct resamples. There was discussion regarding resampling inconclusive trees and it was asked if any of the inconclusive trees have become positive trees which they have not. There was also discussion about the EDTs and the detector dogs. It was stated that there was a positive tree found in San Gabriel that one of the detector dogs did not sit at.

### Summary of HLB Detections

Magally Luque-Williams gave an update on the summary of the HLB detections. In Los Angeles County there have been 59 positive HLB trees. Two positive HLB trees and one positive ACP were detected in Hacienda Heights. One HLB positive tree and one positive ACP were detected in La Puente. There have been 55 HLB positive trees and 4 positive ACP detected in San Gabriel and Rosemead. In Cerritos there have been two HLB positive trees detected and one positive

ACP. In Orange County there have been a total of 14 positive trees. In La Habra there was one positive HLB tree detected. There was one HLB positive tree detected in Fullerton as well. There have been 12 HLB positive trees and eight positive ACP in Anaheim.

#### Orange County Delimitation Survey

Magally also reviewed the Orange County 800 meter delimitation surveys which include Anaheim, Fullerton and La Habra. For Anaheim there are 6,550 properties in the 800 meter area, 5,226 properties have been surveyed with 2,485 plant samples and 1,939 ACP samples have been collected. 2,872 properties were no-host. In La Habra there are 1,281 properties in the 800 meter area, 1,262 properties have been surveyed with 488 plant samples and 264 ACP samples have been collected. 776 properties were no-host.

Additional projects that CDFA staff are working on include an HLB situation report which will be a monthly update. Staff are also putting together a small working group to collect data from HLB positive tree history. The data includes information which on history of surveying and sampling dates as well as the type of surveys, treatment dates and Ct values.

#### Risk Survey

Magally Luque-Williams stated that her staff received the data to create the risk based survey on April 7, 2017 and they data selected includes 45 counties, 2,658 STRs and 161,410 sites to survey. Cycle 1 began in late April and there have been 13,773 sites surveyed so far with 3,181 ACP samples taken, 2,099 plant samples taken and 9,067 sites negative for ACP.

CDFA staff is also conducting a border ACP collection survey. Cycle 2 for Imperial is 62 percent complete with 206 sites surveyed, 5 sites with ACP samples collected and 182 sites with plant samples collected. Cycle 3 for San Diego is 31 percent complete with 99 sites surveyed, 4 sites with ACP samples collected and 102 sites with plant samples collected.

Magally mentioned that her team has been collaborating with Carla Thomas on the CA 1 study. They are conducting sampling in commercial citrus groves in Riverside, Orange, Imperial, San Diego, Kern and Tulare and a total of 336 samples have been collected so far

It was asked if the Committee could view Dr. Gottwald's survey maps. Debby's staff will send the maps out to the Committee for review.

#### ACP Grove Sampling Survey

Art Gilbert stated that in Southern California there have been 9,288 collection sites and a total of 21,829 ACP collected as of July 6, 2017. There were 21,045 sites negative for HLB. There are currently 48,844 traps in the central valley. There was a single ACP detection in Orange Cove which is currently pending a public meeting. There were also two ACP detections in Seville which has triggered an 800 meter treatment since the finds were so close together and one trap had two psyllids. There was also an ACP detection in Bakersfield which has been the first psyllid detection there since November 2016.

#### **c. Laboratory Updates**

Luci Kumagai provided an update on the CDFA laboratory. In June, 12 more positive trees were removed, 1 from San Gabriel, 1 from Rosemead, 9 from Anaheim and 1 from Fullerton. Positive ACP's were also detected in three more sites in Anaheim. A total of 4,628 ACP and 6,645 plant

samples have been analyzed in June 2017. The University of Arizona has processed 5,280 ACP samples so far for 2017. Yearly HLB sample totals from 2008 to 2017 have a grand total of 466,471 samples. To date a total of 73 HLB positive trees have been removed: 54 from San Gabriel, 1 from Rosemead, 2 from Hacienda Heights, 2 from Cerritos, 12 from Anaheim, 1 from Fullerton and 1 from La Habra. To date a total of 17 ACP positive psyllids have been detected: 8 from Anaheim, 1 from Fullerton, 3 from San Gabriel, 2 from Cerritos, 1 from Hacienda Heights, 1 from La Puente and 1 from Rosemead. All HLB positive trees have been removed.

Luci stated that HLB sample load is going to continue to increase as staff detects more positive samples. Luci has been in communication with a research lab in woodland that has robotic liquid handlers that may be able to assist with some of the HLB testing. The liquid handlers have a much higher throughput capacity. CDFA staff is going to visit the lab to learn more about the machines and to see how accurate they are. If it is decided that we could like to use these machines in the CDFA lab we will have to go through the validation process with USDA.

#### **d. Biocontrol Update**

Victoria Hornbaker gave a brief update on the biocontrol program. Year to date there have been 1,247,383 *Tamarixia radiata* released and 59,797 *Diaphorencyrtus aligarhensis*. Releases in 2017 have been significantly higher than previous years which is encouraging. Victoria stated that releases have been made mostly along major transportation routes, near the beginning of the grapevine and in the HLB quarantine area. CDFA in collaboration with USDA and CRB has developed the standard operating procedures for private insectaries who are interested in becoming permitted to rear *Tamarixia radiata*. The operating procedures and the permit conditions have been posted to the CDFA website for those who are interested.

#### **SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Spencer Walse gave an update on fumigation trails on loaded trucks under tents. Spencer and Beth are both encouraged by the work and the efficacy they are seeing. He has been conducting commercial scale truck trials for the last 6 to 7 months in collaboration with Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell. They have not yet seen 100 percent control on any of the tests however on several occasions they have received over 95 percent control and expect that to improve and time goes on. Victoria stated that CDFA would need a recommendation from Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell that this is an efficacious application of crop fume so that it can be added to the performance standard. There was further discussion about funding and efficacy data.

#### **OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Victoria stated that the Secretary would like to see a strategic plan developed and a 5 year operational plan implemented. NST has developed a PowerPoint presentation on their approach to strategic planning as well as why strategic planning is important. NST recognizes that a lot has been done already been done on the strategic planning front but would like to identify a strategic planning team, one-on-one interviews, conduct an email survey and facilitate a strategic planning workshop. The Committee would like to move forward with a strategic plan and asked the next steps are. It was asked how long a typical strategic planning session would be. Teresa Siles with NST stated that a typical planning session is a day and a half. It was stated that the Committee is continuously dealing with budgets, tarping enforcements, new ACP finds and so on; they seem to get side tracked from what the overall goals of the program is; both short term and long term. This planning session could help get the industry as a whole back on track.

**Motion:** To move forward with strategic planning and having a plan in place by November 1, 2017.

First: Jim Gorden

Second: Etienne Rabe

Motion Passes: All in favor

Gus Gunderson stated that NST had voluntarily cut the Outreach budget by \$40,000 at the last Committee meeting. In order for NST to implement the strategic planning session(s), NST would like to see the \$40,000 put back into the Outreach budget. It was asked if there was a projected cost of how much the strategic planning would be. Teresa stated that \$40,000 would about cover the strategic planning session(s).

**Motion:** To reinstate \$40,000 that was reduced from the Outreach Contract Budget.

First: Jim Gorden

Second: Etienne Rabe

Motion Passes: All in favor

Gus discussed the need for additional outreach funding and recommended that the request for proposal for the new outreach contract be issued with a maximum annual budget of \$1 million. This would be an increase from \$750,000 to \$1 million per year for two years with a maximum contract of \$2 million due to the increasing HLB finds.

**Motion:** To increase the maximum annual budget for the Outreach Contract RFP from \$750,000 to \$1 million per year for two years, with a maximum for the contract of \$2 million.

First: Jim Gorden

Second: Etienne Rabe

Motion Passes: The motion passed with 9 yays; Bob Felts, Jr., Jim Gorden, Gus Gunderson, Nick Hill, Link Leavens, James McFarlane, Etienne Rabe, Kevin Severns, Brian Specht and one nay; Craig Armstrong and one abstention; Kevin Olsen.

Katie Nieri stated that HLB is a priority and NST has been very active in homeowner and elected official outreach. NST has moved from educating the elected officials to activating them therefore several cities within the quarantine zones are actively conducting outreach on NST's behalf.

## **CCM REPORT**

Joel Nelsen reported that CCM has initiated an effort to get homeowners to voluntarily remove their trees. In San Gabriel there were 75 residential homeowners who have volunteered to have their trees removed. Outreach about the tree removal program began in early July and 7 residential homeowners would like to have their trees removed in Anaheim as well. Joel stated that he is traveling to Florida to meet with colleges from the CHRP program because they have agreed that the funds allocated to the various states needs to be modified. California receives approximately 33 percent of the funding which will soon be increased by CHRP. The House of Appropriations has agreed to a budget of \$55 million for the CHRP program which is a significant increase. There was further discussion regarding the tree removal program.

**CRB REPORT**

Gary Schulz introduced Sandra Olkowski who is a new data analyst at CRB and will be working on the DATOC project. The HLB external review will be held at UC Davis on August 14 – 18, 2017. The California Citrus Conference will be held on October 11, 2017 at the Wyndam in Visalia. The conference schedule will be announced within the next 30 days.

**CLOSING COMMENTS & ADJOURNMENT**

There were no closing comments made.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:50 p.m. The next meeting will be an interim Committee meeting to discuss budgets which will be held in Exeter, California on August 24, 2017. The next full Committee meeting will be held in San Bernardino, California on September 13, 2017 at 10:00am.