

CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, May 10, 2017

Opening:

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on May 10, 2017 in Ventura, California by Committee Chairman Nick Hill.

CPDPC Members Present:

Craig Armstrong*	Nick Hill	Etienne Rabe
Bob Felts, Jr.	Link Leavens	Kevin Severns
John Gless*	George McEwen	Brian Specht*
Jim Gorden	James McFarlane	Keith Watkins
Gus Gunderson	Kevin Olsen	

CPDPC Members Absent:

Franco Bernardi	Mark McBroom
-----------------	--------------

C DFA Staff:

Jason Chan	Victoria Hornbaker	Heather Shack
Melinda DeHerrera	Luci Kumagai*	Michael Soltero
Sean Farnum	Jason Leathers*	Debby Tanouye
Tina Galindo	Magally Luque-Williams*	Scosha Wright
Art Gilbert	Paul Martinez *	Bob Wynn
Jon Goergen	Colleen Murphy*	
Adrian Gonzales	Courtney Pond	

Guests:

Ruben Arroyo	Aaron Dillon	Subhas Hajeri*	Otto Rieger*
Bob Atkins		Linda Haque	Sylvie Robillard*
Jill Barnier		Melinda Klein	Cressida Silvers*
Marjie Bartels		Debbie Larmon	Rayne Thompson*
Alliren Carmichael		Neil McRoberts*	Ed Williams
Rick Dunn		Pat Nolan*	Judy Zaninovich*
Beth Grafton-Cardwell*		Curtis Pate*	Sandra Zwaal*

* Participated via Webinar

Opening Comments:

Nick Hill welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online and stated that there is a quorum for the meeting.

Public Comment:

There were no public comments made.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS & UPDATES

Nick Hill reviewed the consent agenda which contained the minutes from the Committee meeting that took place on March 8, 2017.

Motion: To approve the consent agenda as presented.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Kevin Severns

Motion Passes: All in favor

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

a. 2015/2016 Budget

James reviewed the 2015/2016 budget and sub-budgets with the Committee. To date \$18,401,521 in assessment revenue has been received. The total projected assessment revenue for fiscal year 2015/2016 is \$17,406,000 which has been exceeded. It was asked why the assessment revenue is so much higher than projected and Victoria stated that it could be due to late and interest fees that some vendors are required to pay. It was asked if and when the Committee could request an audit. Victoria stated that the Committee would have to pay for an audit however CDEA is looking to hire a Staff Services Analyst to take on the assessments and internal paper audits will then be conducted. Through February 28, 2017 there has been \$19,500,870 in expenditures to the assessment budget, which is overspent by \$87,510, but this shortage is offset by an overage in CHRP. The CHRP budget amount is \$12,444,701 with \$12,357,858 expended, leaving a balance of \$86,843. The urban treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$699,437. The central valley survey and treatment sub-budget is over spent by \$3,119,646 bringing the total spent to \$6,093,125. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2015/2016 authority is \$15,624,418 and 99 percent has been spent as of February 28, 2017 leaving the remaining balance at \$148,350.

b. Variance Analysis Review 2015/2016

Year to date the ending variance for the assessment budget is 0.45 percent. There have been 100.45 percent of projected expenditures spent for fiscal year 2015/2016 so far.

c. 2016/2017 Budget

James presented the 2016/2017 assessment budget to the Committee with projected expenditures totaling at \$25,655,331. As of March 31, 2017 there has been \$7,884,242 in assessment revenue received with an estimated outstanding balance to be received of \$10,115,758. Through March 31, 2017 there has been \$7,351,815 in expenditures to the assessment budget, leaving a balance remaining of \$18,802,123. The urban treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$2,920,223 and \$1,725,254 expended so far. The central valley survey and treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$3,919,411 and \$1,547,437 expended so far. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures. The CHRP budget amount is significantly less than 2015/2016 with a budget balance of \$9,760,231. As of March 31, 2017 there has been \$4,032,207 expended so far leaving a remaining balance available of \$5,728,024.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2016/2017 authority is \$16,038,903 and 79 percent has been spent as of March 31, 2017 leaving the remaining balance at \$3,314,183. There are currently no updates to accessing the additional authority however it is in the works. CDFA staff stated that they are accessing temporary authority from other programs to hold the program over until the additional authority is approved.

James presented two sub-budget projections for the Committee's approval: HLB in Anaheim totaling at \$412,754 and HLB in La Habra totaling at \$302,590. It was asked to what extent the regulatory dollars are being spent for the CPDPP. Joel stated that CDFA receives general fund dollars for regulatory enforcement. Joel is concerned that the industry has been obligated to pay for its own regulatory activities however CDFA should provide some sort of regulatory support. Victoria stated that no general fund money has been spent on the previous programs that she has worked for either, for example Pink Bollworm. Bob Wynn stated that CDFA receives general fund money to help with programs that support multiple commodities as opposed to single commodity programs. It was suggested that the Committee and CDFA look at the budget to see where funds could be reallocated instead of having to increase the budget.

Motion: To approve \$715,344 for the HLB response budget for Anaheim and La Habra
Second: Kevin Severns
Motion Passes: All in favor

d. Variance Analysis Review 2016/2017

Year to date the ending variance for the assessment budget is -28.68 percent. There have been 34.56 percent of projected expenditures spent for fiscal year 2016/2017 so far.

e. Budget Task Force Update

James gave an update on behalf of the Budget Task Force which last met on May 5, 2017. The Budget Task force has recommended that voluntary budget reductions be made. James presented an outreach budget reduction document from NST totaling \$40,000 in reductions. CRB has also put together a budget reduction document totaling \$974,000 in reductions. James presented a letter that was sent to the Science Advisory Panel (SAP) from the Budget Task Force on May 2, 2017. The letter contained background information and questions for the SAP. The letter includes concerns regarding urban treatment, biocontrol, HLB survey and diagnostics, HLB response, and ACP trapping. Victoria stated that there will be a SAP webinar held on May 31, 2017 that is open to the public. It was stated that nursery enforcement and tree removal are two of the most important things right now. There needs to be some creative and critical thinking done.

Motion: To reduce the Nuffer, Smith, Tucker Outreach budget by \$40,000
First: James McFarlane
Second: Gus Gunderson
Motion Passes: All in favor

Motion: To reduce the Citrus Research Board budget by \$974,000
First: Keith Watkins
Second: Kevin Severns
Motion Passes: All in favor

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

a. Committee and Subcommittee Vacancies

Victoria reported that there is currently a vacancy on the Committee as a Kern County grower since Richard Bennett has resigned. Victoria stated that there are two applicants for the Kern County grower vacancy on the Committee. The applicant's resumes and letters of interest were placed in the Committee's binders for review. Chairman Hill stated that it would be appropriate to move Keith Watkins into the Kern County grower vacancy and have the public member position vacant.

Motion: To fill the Kern County Grower vacancy with applicant, Keith Watkins, creating a vacancy for a public member position

First: Bob Felts, Jr.

Second: Jim Gorden

Motion Passes: The motion passed with 12 yays; Craig Armstrong, Bob Felts, Jr., Nick Hill, Gus Gunderson, Link Leavens, Jim Gorden, James McFarlane , Dr. Etienne Rabe, Kevin Olsen, Kevin Severns, George McEwen, and Brian Specht and one abstention; Keith Watkins.

Victoria stated that she will reach out to Zac Green to see if he is interested in joining the Operations Subcommittee since he does not qualify for the public member vacancy due to being a citrus grower in Kern County. Melinda Klein is interested in becoming a member of the Science Subcommittee and the Committee is supportive of placing her on the Subcommittee.

b. Regional ACP Management

Bob Atkins gave a brief update on regional ACP management noting that ACP detections have been minimal so far this year. He also noted that San Diego County has formed their Pest Control District. San Bernardino County is in the process of forming their Pest Control District. It was asked why there were such low psyllid populations this year and Jason Leathers stated that it might have something to do with the wet weather this year.

c. County Bulk Citrus Enforcement Contracts

Victoria stated that CDFA had begun to implement the motion that was made by the Committee to enforce safeguarding on all citrus loads being moved regardless of destination or origin and this was finalized by CDFA on December 2, 2016. CDFA staff is actively implementing enforcement and has partnered with CHP. Counties will begin enforcing once the work plans are in place. Bob Wynn and Victoria are going to be meeting with the counties on May 24, 2017 to develop the projected work plans. CDFA will share the work plans with the Budget Task Force and the Finance Subcommittee so that they have a good understanding of what the enforcement activities will include as well as and what they can anticipate the enforcement activities to cost for fiscal year 2017/2018.

d. Retail Nurseries and HLB Quarantines

Aaron Dillon presented information on a pilot program to determine parameters for citrus nursery stock at retail nurseries in HLB quarantine areas. Aaron gave some background information on the pilot program. He showed some examples of black market citrus; someone in Anaheim had posted their orange tree for sale on craigslist which happens to be in the middle of

the quarantine zone in which is alarming. The basic components of the pilot program are to start with clean stock produced in an approved structure, treat the trees with systemic and foliar chemical application as close to shipping as possible, to establish a reasonable time limit for the stock to remain at retail for 90 to 120 days from treatment, develop a system to train retail nursery staff to manage citrus nursery stock within legal limits and develop point of sale messaging to clarify quarantine boundaries. Aaron would like to find three retail garden centers in an ACP quarantine area to participate in the program and determine if ACP life stages establish on the trees during the 90 to 120 day eligibility period. The pilot program is important because it can help prevent the dangerous sale of unregulated, illegally produced nursery stock. It will encourage stores in ACP areas to treat their stock as if they were in an HLB quarantine zone and it will develop a reasonable plan before there are more HLB quarantines and larger areas become impacted. It was stated the pilot program is a positive move and the Committee is supportive of the program.

e. Renew MOU between CCTEA and CPDPC

Jill Barnier stated that there are no changes to the MOU it just needs to be renewed. Jill stated that CCTEA has established a PCR lab and has received a permit from CDFA which will allow CCTEA to conduct HLB testing.

Motion: To renew the MOU between CCTEA and CPDPC
First: George McEwen
Second: Kevin Severns
Motion Passes: All in favor

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Keith Watkins gave a brief overview of the discussions that were had at the Operations Subcommittee meeting that was held on April 12, 2017.

a. Treatment Updates

Tina gave an update regarding areawide treatment in Southern California. In Imperial the grove areawide treatment began on February 20, 2017 and the border areawide treatment began February 26, 2017. The border areawide treatment is 56 percent complete. Treatment began on March 6, 2017 around the UCR and Hemet areas in Riverside and is now 100 percent complete. San Bernardino, San Diego and Santa Barbara are also 100 percent complete. Ventura areawide is 80 percent complete. San Gabriel is 90 percent complete and tempo applications began on March 20, 2017. Hacienda Heights is 95 percent complete and so far there have been no refusals. Cerritos and La Puente have pending public meetings for foliar treatment.

b. HLB Survey Updates

Hacienda Heights

There are currently 100 traps placed in the core square mile in Hacienda Heights. In January there were 13 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 18 ACP samples collected. In February there were 2 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 5 ACP samples collected. In March there were no traps with ACP samples and no samples collected. Cycles 1 through 6 of the cluster survey are complete as of December 15, 2016. In cycle 6 there were 391 sites visited, 68 plant samples collected, 298 ACP samples collected and 68 sites negative for ACP and plant samples.

San Gabriel

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in San Gabriel. In January there were 15 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 20 ACP collected. In February there was 1 trap with an ACP sample and 1 ACP collected. In March there was also 1 trap with ACP and 1 ACP collected. Cycle 3 is currently in progress and began on September 7, 2016 and 2,421 sites have been visited with 268 plant samples collected and 1,992 ACP samples collected. There have been 306 sites negative for ACP.

Cerritos

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in Cerritos. In February there were 31 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 92 ACP collected. In March there were 16 traps with ACP samples and 41 ACP collected. In April there were 33 traps with ACP and 98 ACP collected.

La Puente

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in La Puente. In February there were 4 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 5 ACP collected. In March there was 1 trap with an ACP sample and one ACP collected.

CDFA has also conducted other HLB sampling and resampling in Los Angeles County such as the Levaeu Lab Leaf Swab, inconclusive resampling, dog sample sites, Slupsky resample, CRB transect sites and low Ct resamples. There was discussion regarding resampling inconclusive trees and it was asked if any of the inconclusive trees have become positive trees. There was also discussion about the EDTs and the detector dogs.

Risk Survey

Magally Luque-Williams mentioned that her team has been collaborating with Carla Thomas on the CA 1 study. They are conducting sampling in commercial citrus groves in Riverside, Orange, Imperial and San Diego and a total of 29 samples have been collected so far.

CDFA staff is also conducting a border ACP collection survey. Imperial is 23 percent complete with 43 sites surveyed, 3 sites with ACP samples collected and 19 sites with plant samples collected. San Diego is 80 percent complete with 100 sites surveyed, 3 sites with ACP samples collected and one site with a plant samples collected.

CDFA staff received the data to create the risk based survey on April 7, 2017 and they data selected includes 45 counties, 2,658 STRs and 161,410 sites to survey. Cycle 1 began in late April and there have been 2,178 sites surveyed so far with 743 ACP samples taken, 451 plant samples taken and 1,207 sites negative for ACP. CDFA staff has implemented a supplemental survey as they waited for data from Dr. Gottwald. The counties that were surveyed include Fresno, Orange, Riverside, San Bernardino and San Diego. Fresno and Orange counties are 100 percent complete.

Orange County Delimitation Survey

Debby also reviewed the Orange County 800 meter delimitation surveys. Including Anaheim and La Habra. For Anaheim there are 1,844 properties in the 800 meter area, 1,668 properties have been surveyed with 1,084 plant samples and 891 ACP samples have been collected. 624 properties were no-host. In La Habra there are 1,281 properties in the 800 meter area, 1,198 properties have been surveyed with 463 plant samples and 257 ACP samples have been collected. 764 properties were no-host.

Additional projects that CDFA staff are working on include an HLB situation report which will be a monthly update. Staff are also putting together a small working group to collect data from HLB positive tree history. The data includes information which on history of surveying and sampling dates as well as the type of surveys, treatment dates and Ct values.

ACP Grove Sampling Survey

Art Gilbert stated that in Southern California there have been 9,337 collection sites and a total of 20,671 ACP collected as of May 9, 2017. There were 20,263 sites negative for HLB. There are currently 47,829 traps in the central valley.

c. Laboratory Updates

Lucita Kumagai provided an update on the CDFA laboratory. In April, eight more positive trees were removed from the San Gabriel core area. The intensive survey of the positive sites is ongoing and has resulted in three additional positive trees. A total of 2,649 ACP and 6,927 plant samples have been received in April 2017. Yearly HLB sample totals from 2008 to 2017 have a grand total of 432,635 samples in which 37 percent of the total is plant samples and 63 percent is ACP samples. To date a total of 56 HLB positive trees have been removed: 42 from San Gabriel, 2 from Hacienda Heights, 3 from Cerritos, 2 from Anaheim and 1 from La Habra. It was asked what the turn-around time is on samples and Luci stated that the turnaround time is usually two weeks. It was stated that the University of Arizona is also helping out with ACP samples.

d. Biocontrol Update

Jim Gorden gave a brief update on the biocontrol program. Year to date there have been 616,132 *Tamarixia radiata* released and 19,038 *Diaphorencyrtus aligarhensis*. Releases in 2017 have been significantly higher than previous years which is encouraging. Jim stated that releases have been made mostly along major transportation routes, near the beginning of the grapevine and in the HLB quarantine area. There are also biocontrol releases being made in Kern County. CDFA in collaboration with USDA and CRB has developed the standard operating procedures for private insectaries who are interested in becoming permitted to rear *Tamarixia radiata*. The operating procedures and the permit conditions have been posted to the CDFA website for those who are interested. There was discussion regarding “suspect” trees and “inconclusive” trees. Victoria stated that an inconclusive tree is not considered a suspect tree and it is important to not get the two confused with one another. There was also discussion about tree removal.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Etienne gave an update on the Science Subcommittee meeting that was held on May 8, 2017. He reported that Neil McRoberts provided an update on CA-1 and CA-1b studies. CA-1 is a baseline survey funded by the MAC to survey 1000 trees from commercial groves from across the State and will be analyzed by multiple EDT's. CA-1b will include additional trees that have known maladies and EDT's will be tested against those trees to see what the results look like. Etienne gave the Committee and update on his behalf of Spencer Walse's fumigation trails on loaded trucks under tents. Spencer and Beth are both encouraged by the work and the efficacy they are seeing. Etienne has asked that Spencer work toward getting better coverage in a faster time, as this would be more beneficial to industry. Victoria stated that the regular rulemaking packet is done and is being routed though CDFA. Once approved by CDFA, it will be send to the Office of Administrative Law and the 45 day comment period will begin. It should be approved by October 1, 2017 or January 1, 2017. Dr. Melinda Klein gave a brief update on the FL-1. They are

getting a hoop house built and are growing plants there and will be testing most of the same EDT's. They will inoculate the trees with CLas positive ACP and then test the EDT's.

OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Outreach Subcommittee Chairman Gus Gunderson stated that the main outreach focus has been in Orange County around the new HLB find sites. NST has been working with the Orange County Agricultural Commissioner and NST had a booth at the La Habra Citrus Fair. NST has targeted Asian markets in the Orange County area as well.

CCM REPORT

Joel Nelsen stated that in addition to the additional funds from the CHRP program CCM was able to get \$2.5 million more for the MAC program for a total of \$7.5 million. All of the news for the BSL3 lab is positive. The bill to increase the Committee's authority has been approved by the senate and is now on the assembly side for review and approval. Since there is an urgency clause in the bill it will become effective once it is approved by the Governor. Alyssa reported on the Abandoned Citrus Tree (ACT) removal program and so far 309 trees and 47 acres have been removed. The MAC program has also provided funding for a voluntary tree removal program in the HLB quarantine zone.

CRB REPORT

Gary Schulz stated that CRB has had a continuation referendum and will have results at the CRB board meeting the third week of May. The Biocontrol Task Force met the beginning of May and is working on a strategic plan.

CLOSING COMMENTS & ADJOURNMENT

There were no closing comments made.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:50 p.m. The next meeting will be held in Visalia, California on July 12, 2017 at 10:00am.