

# CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, March 8, 2017

## Opening:

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on March 8, 2017 in Palm Desert, California by Committee Chairman Nick Hill.

## CPDPC Members Present:

Craig Armstrong	Nick Hill	Kevin Olsen*
Franco Bernardi*	Link Leavens	Etienne Rabe
Bob Felts, Jr.	Mark McBroom	Kevin Severns
John Gless	George McEwen	Brian Specht
Gus Gunderson	James McFarlane	Keith Watkins

## CPDPC Members Absent:

Jim Gorden

## CDFA Staff:

Ruben Arias	Victoria Hornbaker	Colleen Murphy*
Jason Chan	Amber Hoyt*	Paul Martinez*
Melinda DeHerrera	Margarete Krick	Dana Richmond
Sean Farnum	Luci Kumagai*	Debby Tanouye
Tina Galindo	Jason Leathers*	Scosha Wright
John Goergen*	Magally Luque-Williams	Bob Wynn

## Guests:

Jill Barnier*	Subhas Hajeri*	Courtney Pond*
Erin Betts*	Linda Haque	Sylvie Robillard*
John Blasius*	Marilyn Kinoshita*	Margo Sanchez*
Chris Boisseran*	Brett Kirkpatrick*	Gary Schulz
Brett Chandler*	John Konda	Teresa Siles
Delia Cioc	Ellen Kragh*	Rayne Thompson*
James Cranney*	Cynthia LeVesque*	Spencer Walse*
Aaron Dillon*	Harry Loulcatous	Helene Wright
Rick Dunn*	Canh Nguyen*	Priscilla Yeaney*
Enrico Ferro	Pat Nolan*	Darl Young
Rob Foster	Bill Osterlein*	Judy Zaninovich
John Gless	Curtis Pate	Sandra Zwaal*

\* Participated via Webinar

**Opening Comments:**

Nick Hill welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online and stated that there is a quorum for the meeting.

**Public Comment:**

Linda Haque, a small independent grower, gave a public comment regarding the removal of HLB positive trees in San Gabriel and Cerritos areas. Linda suggested looking into a way to have citrus trees removed within a certain proximity to an HLB positive find. Link Leavens thanked Linda for her comments. Victoria discussed law suits that have happened in Florida because trees were removed that were not positive. This is not something that CDFA has the authority to do at this time. CCM has discussed implementing a tree removal program but CDFA cannot participate at a state level. Linda would like to see a variety community leaders involved.

Craig presented a guest from Texas, Dennis Hallbrooke, who is large citrus grower in Texas and a member of Texas Citrus Pest Prevention Committee. Dennis stated that HLB in Texas has been confined for the most part in areas where it was originally discovered. A voluntary ACP program was established in 2009. Texas is having success in reducing ACP populations and populations have decreased every year. Texas does their treatment sprays at night because ACP does not fly at night at treatments have shown to be more successful that way.

**COMMITTEE BUSINESS & UPDATES**

Nick Hill reviewed the consent agenda which contained the minutes from the Committee meeting that took place on January 11, 2017.

- Motion:** To approve the consent agenda as presented.
- First: Bob Felts, Jr.
- Second: John Gless
- Motion Passes: All in favor

**FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

**a. 2015/2016 Budget**

James reviewed the 2015/2016 budget and sub-budgets with the Committee. To date \$18,397,146 in assessment revenue has been received. The total projected assessment revenue for fiscal year 2015/2016 is \$17,406,000 which has been exceeded. Through January 31, 2017 there has been \$19,320,872 in expenditures to the assessment budget, leaving a balance remaining of \$92,487. The CRRP budget amount is \$12,444,701 with \$12,579,493 expended so far which has exceeded the budget by \$134,792. The urban treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$702,189. The central valley survey and treatment sub-budget is over spent by \$3,118,785 bringing the total spent to \$6,092,264 due rapidly increasing ACP finds in the central valley. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2015/2016 authority is \$15,624,418 and 99 percent has been spent as of January 31, 2017 leaving the remaining balance at \$193,387. It was stated that the spending authority will be 100 percent spent by March or at the latest, April. There are currently no updates to accessing additional authority but it is still in the works.

## **b. Variance Analysis Review 2015/2016**

Year to date the ending variance for the assessment budget is -0.48 percent. There have been 99.52 percent of projected expenditures spent for fiscal year 2015/2016 so far.

## **c. 2016/2017 Budget**

James presented the 2016/2017 assessment budget to the Committee with projected expenditures totaling at \$25,655,331. As of January 31, 2017 there has been \$4,169,799 in assessment revenue received with an estimated outstanding balance to be received of \$13,860,201. Through January 31, 2017 there has been \$4,677,352 in expenditures to the assessment budget, leaving a balance remaining of \$21,381,602. The urban treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$3,384,204 and \$1,261,274 expended so far. The central valley survey and treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$4,500,203 and \$966,645 expended so far. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures. The CHRP budget amount is significantly less than 2015/2016 with a budget balance of \$9,760,231. As of January 31, 2017 there has been \$2,235,800 expended so far leaving a remaining balance available of \$7,524,431. James announced that the HLB Response sub-budget has increased since the last CPDPC meeting in January due to the motion that was passed approving the new budgets for Cerritos, Placer and Solano Counties. Placer and Solano Counties now have their own sub-budgets for survey and treatment.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2016/2017 authority is \$16,038,903 and 56 percent has been spent as of January 31, 2017 leaving the remaining balance at \$7,110,227. If the Committee continues to spend funds at the same rate they have been, the spending authority will be exceeded by April 2017. There are currently no updates to accessing the additional authority but Victoria stated that it is in the works.

James presented budget projections for ACP survey and treatment in Yolo and Alameda counties. The total projected budget for both counties is \$97,961. Victoria stated that there is not a substantial amount of commercial acreage in the two counties however there are some production nurseries and risk factors for HLB. Debby stated that costs can go down from what is presented and proposed if treatments are approved to be reduced. A few Committee members were not in support of spending funds on noncommercial citrus areas. Victoria stated that it is important to reduce ACP in smaller areas such as Alameda County, to prevent the spread of ACP into larger areas. Craig suggested only doing HLB testing and HLB survey in these areas instead of focusing on ACP trapping. Debby stated ongoing trapping will be cheaper than HLB surveying and trapping is also important because it keeps staff informed of where ACP is located. Nick Hill stated that the Committee made a motion to implement this at the last meeting however the Committee would like to see these individual budgets continued to be brought to them so that they would pick which counties should have treatment and trapping because of the limited budget.

**Motion:** To not approve Yolo and Alameda County budgets.

First: Craig Armstrong

Second: Mark McBroom

Motion Passes: The motion passed with 6 yays and 8 nays

**d. Variance Analysis Review 2016/2017**

Year to date the ending variance for the assessment budget is 22.34 percent. There have been 17.95 percent of projected expenditures spent for fiscal year 2016/2017 so far.

**e. Budget Task Force Update**

James gave an update on behalf of the Budget Task Force. There have currently been two meetings held so far. James briefly reviewed the draft Budget Task Force letter to the Science Advisory Panel asking them to weigh in on the urban treatment program, biocontrol, HLB survey and ACP trapping. It was asked at the last Budget Task Force meeting to revise the draft letter to ask more specific questions. CDFA staff is going to work with NST to identify what their highest priorities are to try and save some funding by cutting back low priority activities. The Budget Task Force is also looking into how much money is being spent with CRB to see if their budget can be cut back as well. After the draft is revised it will then be presented to the Committee for approval.

**EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

**a. Committee and Subcommittee Vacancies**

Victoria reported that there is currently a vacancy on the Committee as a Kern County grower since Richard Bennett has resigned. The deadline for applicants to apply is April 15, 2017. Jim Gorden has resigned as the Operations Subcommittee Chairman but will remain a member of the Subcommittee however there is also a vacancy on the Operations and Outreach Subcommittees due to Richard resigning. Sylvie Robillard, Fresno County Grower Liaison has expressed interest in becoming an Outreach Subcommittee member. It was suggested that Keith Watkins be moved to the Kern County grower position on the Committee. Victoria told the Committee that Keith could apply for the Kern County position on the Committee and if he was appointed, then she would post a vacancy for the position that Keith was previously in.

**Motion:** To appoint Keith Watkins as the new Chairman of the Operations Subcommittee.

First: Bob Felts, Jr.

Second: John Gless

Motion Passes: All in favor

**b. Regional ACP Management**

Bob Atkins was not in attendance and Victoria gave a brief update on his behalf, noting that his complete report is in the Committee member’s binders for review. It was asked if there was a date that the regional quarantines would come into effect. Victoria stated that there is currently no date that the regional quarantines would come into place however CDFA is in the process of preparing the economic analysis, which is required by the regular rule-making process. San Diego County citrus growers are looking to establish a Pest Control District. The County is on board and there is over a 75 percent grower participation rate for that effort.

**Motion:** To allocate \$25,000 to San Diego in order to have a Pest Control District formed.

First: Craig Armstrong

Second: Mark McBroom  
Motion Passes: All in favor

**c. Update on Bulk Citrus Safeguarding and Enforcement**

Victoria stated that CDFA had begun to implement the motion that was made by the Committee to enforce safeguarding on all citrus loads being moved regardless of destination or origin and this was finalized by CDFA on December 2, 2016. New compliance agreements were implemented to facilitate movement. There has been a lot of concern by the juicers and haulers that they would not be ready before the deadline. CDFA had decided to announce that they would be suspending enforcement on tarping indefinitely. The Committee is very concerned with how this process has been handled. It was asked when CDFA would be ready to enforce and Victoria stated that CDFA is ready to enforce now. Packing houses were turning away fruit because growers were not under compliance. This was brought to CDFA's attention and CDFA decided to give growers more time for enforcement. There was discussion quarantine areas and tarping.

**Motion:** To approve of an implementation date of April 3, 2017 for the enforcement of the bulk citrus safeguarding.

First: George McEwen

Second: Link Leavens

Motion Passes: All in favor

**d. Discuss Activities along the US/Mexico International Border**

Mark McBroom stated that US Customs and Border protection and USDA are doing an excellent job at the border trying to protect US agriculture however there is nothing stopping psyllids from crossing the border. Mark would like to see the Committee develop a plan to use the resources we have to stop the possible spread of HLB from Mexico. Magally Luque-Williams gave an update on the visual survey that is currently ongoing along the Mexico border. Cycle 1 is complete in both Imperial and San Diego Counties. In Imperial County there have been 268 sites surveyed, 10 sites with ACP samples and 193 sites with plant samples taken. In San Diego there has been 148 sites surveyed, 12 ACP samples and 95 sites with plant samples taken. This survey will be done four times per year, one each season. The second cycle will begin in March or April 2017. Debby stated that the risk based survey is done in those areas as well.

**e. Mandatory Areawide – Recap of Legal Analysis**

Victoria reported that she ~~has~~ developed a legal referral, -which asked if CDFA had the authority to implement mandatory areawide treatment and what the obstacles would be if mandatory areawide treatment was implemented. Mandatory areawide treatment is something that CDFA can enforce however there are a few obstacles such as CEQA compliance. Any pesticide product that would be used as a part of the mandatory areawide would have to be analyzed and would have to become a part of the environmental impact report. Enforcement would be the next obstacle. It was suggested to move forward with the mandatory areawide treatment and the Committee will deal with the issues as they occur.

**f. Strategic Planning Proposal**

Teresa Siles with NST presented a PowerPoint regarding strategic planning and why NST believes that strategic planning is important and effective. NST would like to conduct one-on-one interviews with each CPDPC member as well as conduct an email survey. NST would also

like to facilitate a strategic planning workshop and hold a post-planning session council. Teresa reviewed some key areas that will benefit CPDPC. Nick Hill suggested that the Finance and Operations Subcommittee look further into this and come up with some recommendations.

## **OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Keith Watkins gave a brief overview of the discussions that were had at the Operations Subcommittee meeting that was held on February 15, 2017.

### **a. Kern County ACP Update**

Kern County Grower Liaison Judy Zaninovich gave an update on the status of ACP in Kern County. Judy presented several maps of the ACP populations in Kern, Delano, and Bakersfield. Treatments seem to be working in reducing ACP populations. Judy also reported that the Kern County Pest Control District initiated a pilot program to remove citrus trees in residential areas close to commercial production areas with ACP finds. Approximately 250 trees have been removed so far in Edison, Mettler, Meridian and Arvin.

### **b. Treatment Updates**

Tina gave an update regarding areawide treatment in Southern California. In Imperial the grove areawide treatment began on February 20, 2017 and the border areawide treatment began February 26, 2017. Treatment was stopped in partial areas on Riverside on December 14, 2016 due to limited staff because of the increasing Med Fly finds. Treatment began on March 6, 2017 around the UCR and Hemet areas in Riverside. San Bernardino did not meet 90 percent of treatment so treatment is not happening currently. Ventura areawide is 60 percent complete and treatment was stopped in Camarillo, Oxnard, Ventura, and Ojai but began again on February 8, 2017. Santa Barbara areawide is 40 percent complete and treatment began on February 8, 2017. In San Diego areawide treatment is 100 percent complete. The San Gabriel core 800 meter area is complete. Hacienda Heights and La Puente are almost complete and are just waiting on foliar treatment.

### **c. HLB Survey Updates**

#### Hacienda Heights

There are currently 100 traps placed in the core square mile in Hacienda Heights. In November there were 69 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 133 ACP samples collected. In December there were 13 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 18 ACP samples collected. In February there were 2 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 5 ACP samples collected. Cycles 1 through 6 of the cluster survey is complete as of December 15, 2016. There have been 391 sites visited, 68 plant samples collected, 298 ACP samples collected and 68 sites negative for ACP and plant samples. The 800 meter core survey in Cerritos is complete as well.

#### San Gabriel

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in San Gabriel. In November there were 38 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 69 ACP collected. In December there were 15 traps with ACP samples and 20 ACP collected. In February there was one trap with ACP and one ACP collected. Cycle 3 is currently in progress and began on September 7, 2016 and 2,421 sites have been visited with 268 plant samples collected and 1,992 ACP samples collected. There have been 306 sites negative for ACP.

## Cerritos

Areas 1 and 2 for the HLB 800 meter core survey in Cerritos are complete. Area 3 is still in progress with 35 properties visited so far, 24 plant samples collected and 18 ACP samples collected.

CDFA has also conducted other HLB sampling and resampling in Los Angeles County such as the Levaeu Lab Leaf Swab, inconclusive resampling, dog sample sites, Slupsky resample, CRB transect sites and low Ct resamples.

## **Revised ACP Response Plan**

Debby reviewed the revised CDFA response protocol to ACP with the Committee. The goal of the revised action plan is for HLB prevention and eradication as well as to suppress ACP. The Committee and CDFA also need to reduce costs somehow. The response protocol has been broken down by counties.

Northern California includes all counties north of Santa Barbara and the Tehachapi Mountains (excluding Kern, Kings, Tulare, Madera and Fresno Counties). Debby proposed that for the response to the collection of one or more ACP, the trapping density will be 25 traps per square mile in a 1.5 mile radius to form a nine square mile delimitation area around all find sites. Traps will be serviced every two weeks for the first month and if no additional ACP are detected the traps will be serviced monthly for two years. Visual survey will be done on all host trees on properties within a 50 meter radius. All host trees within a 50 meter radius of the tree with the initial ACP detection will be treated. At some point an ACP population may become so entrenched that the cost for treatment will be prohibitive. In this case, treatment will be terminated when ACP have been detected scattered over 10 or more sites in at least six of the delimitation trapping grids within six months, if established populations have been found at three or more sites in at least three delimitation trapping grids within six months, if one find site property refuses treatment, if the cost of treatment exceeds available funds and if treatment ceases in Fresno, Kern, Kings, Madera or Tulare counties. Actions taken to replace treatment includes trapping at the rate of 100 traps per square mile in all delimitation areas will continue until ACP can be easily collected without a trap find to locate a population. Visual survey will be conducted to collect ACP specimens at properties with large numbers of ACP trapped. Biocontrol will be released as appropriate and the detection of HLB will trigger the HLB protocol.

In Fresno, Kern, Kings, Madera and Tulare Counties, trap densities will be 100 traps per square mile in a 1.5 mile radius to form a nine square mile delimitation area around all find sites and traps will be serviced every two weeks for the first two months. The response to two or more ACP would include 100 traps per square mile and traps will be serviced every two weeks as well. A new detection within an existing delimitation area will trigger weekly servicing. All trees within a 50 meter radius of the tree with the ACP detection will be visually surveyed. In an urban environment, all host trees within a 400 meter radius will be treated and in a commercial groves treatment may expand to include all residences with host trees out to an 800 meter radius if growers are treating. Treatment will be terminated with treatment exceeds available funds or if treatments show limited or no efficacy. Actions to replace treatment include trapping at 100 traps per square mile, visual survey and biocontrol.

Debby reviewed the areawide comparison costs and savings with the Committee and also discussed treatment that is going on along the California-Mexico border. Debby also reviewed some other ways to reduce costs. A map of the maximum HLB grid risk by county was presented

**Motion:** To implement the revised ACP response plan.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: John Gless

Motion Passes: All in favor

**Motion:** To revise the new budgets for ACP response in Yolo and Alameda Counties bases on the new ACP response plan implemented in the last motion. The revised budgets will be sent to the Executive Committee for approval.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: John Gless

Motion Passes: The motion passed with 10 yays, one nay and two abstentions

### Risk Survey

Magally Luque-Williams gave an update on the HLB risk-based survey. Cycle 1 is complete in all 44 counties. There were a total of 33,637 sites with ACP samples and 14,716 sites with plant samples. Cycle 2 data has been requested from Dr. Gottwald. Per the direction of the Operations Subcommittee CDFA is organizing a small working group to develop and implement HLB surveys to supplement the risk-based survey.

### **d. Laboratory Updates**

#### CDFA Laboratory

Lucita Kumagai provided an update on the CDFA laboratory. In February, two more positive trees were removed from the San Gabriel core area. The intensive survey of the positive sites is ongoing and has resulted in three additional positive trees. A total of 2,425 ACP and 4,830 plant samples have been received in February 2017. Yearly HLB sample totals from 2008 to 2017 have a grand total of 426,845 samples in which 35 percent of the total is plant samples and 65 percent is ACP samples. To date a total of 40 HLB positive trees have been removed: 36 from San Gabriel, 2 from Hacienda Heights and 2 from Cerritos.

### **SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Etienne gave an update on the Science Subcommittee meeting that was held on March 6, 2017. Etienne stated that there were few members in attendance and the Subcommittee needs to relook at the participation and membership. Spencer Walse with USDA gave a presentation at the Subcommittee meeting and the Subcommittee thought it would be important for the full Committee to be given the presentation as well.

Spenser stated that the objective is to have “dry” control of ACP in field bins for transportation within CDFA quarantine boundaries. Spenser provided information on different ACP treatment methods including a flooder method, a soak tank, a pressure wash, an evergreen fog and an evergreen drench. So far the evergreen fog has had the best efficacy rate and is the best option opposed to getting the fruit wet. There was a trial demonstration done for the evergreen fog at the Citrus Showcase on March 2, 2017 and there will be two more demonstrations held in Ventura on March 27, 2017 and another held in Riverside on March 29, 2017. The Committee asked how

long it would take to get the evergreen fog testing complete and in the field. Spenser stated that there is technology and equipment available for growers to begin to use immediately.

### **OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

NST has helped put together a scope of work for the RFP for additional industry outreach. Staff is hoping that the RFP will be in place by spring. NST has recently attended the World Agricultural Expo and the CCM Citrus Showcase. Gus Gunderson, Outreach Subcommittee chairman announced that participation in the Outreach Subcommittee meetings has been minimal. Nick Hill expressed how important it is to have all of the members in participation as much as possible.

### **CRB REPORT**

Gary Schulz reported that Richard Bennett has resigned as Chairman from the Citrus Research Board and Jim Gorden is the new Chairman. The RFP on new research went out on March 3, 2017 and will be posted on CRB's website. The post-harvest conference will be held in Oxnard on April 11-12, 2017.

### **CLOSING COMMENTS & ADJOURNMENT**

There were no closing comments made.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:40 p.m. The next meeting will be held in Ventura, California on May 10, 2017 at 10:00am.