

CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, November 8, 2017

Opening:

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on November 8, 2017 in Ventura, California by Committee Chairman Nick Hill.

CPDPC Members Present:

Craig Armstrong*	Jim Gorden	George McEwen	Kevin Severns
Ed Civerolo	Nick Hill	James McFarlane	Brian Specht*
Bob Felts, Jr.	Link Leavens	Etienne Rabe	Keith Watkins

CPDPC Members Absent:

Franco Bernardi	John Gless	Mark McBroom
-----------------	------------	--------------

C DFA Staff:

Jason Chan	Victoria Hornbaker	Magally Luque-Williams	Bob Wynn
Nick Condos	Amber Hoyt	Paul Martinez*	
Tina Galindo	Sara Khalid	David Morgan*	
Adrian Gonzales	Luci Kumagai*	Debby Tanouye	

Guests:

Bob Atkins	Dave Hozen*	Sandy Olwaski	Cressida Silvers
Jill Bariner	Brett Kirkpatrick*	Curtis Pate*	Rayne Thompson*
Erin Betts*	Melinda Klein	Sylvie Robillard	Dan Willey*
Teri Blaser	Ellen Kragh*	Kelly Salinas	Jack Williams*
Rick Dunn	Debbie Larmon*	Margo Sanchez*	Helene Wright
Henry Gonzales	Neil McRoberts*	Gary Schulz	Judy Zaninovich*
Linda Haque	Tracy Monkene	Teresa Siles	Sandra Zwaal*
Alyssa Houtby	Joel Nelsen	Tiffany Silveira	

* Participated via Webinar

Opening Comments:

Nick Hill welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online and stated that there is a quorum for the meeting. He acknowledged that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

Public Comment:

There were no public comments.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS & UPDATES

Nick Hill reviewed the consent agenda which contained the minutes from the Committee meeting that took place on September 13, 2017.

Motion: To approve the consent agenda which included the September 13, 2017 Committee meeting minutes.
First: Keith Watkins
Second: Jim Gorden
Motion Passes: All in favor

STRATEGIC PLANNING UPDATE

Teresa Siles with NST gave an update on where NST and CDFA is currently at with the strategic planning process as well as next steps. NST has already conducted interviews and sent out electronic surveys. NST has also provided the strategic planning update for Committee review and input. The next steps are to have several sub-group meetings to discuss and focus on specific issues. NST and CDFA will then draft a plan for the Committee to review for input. Teresa also reviewed the principles for decision making with the Committee. Nick Condos discussed the scenario planning for sub-groups. Nick hopes to have a draft strategic plan by the January 10, 2018 Committee meeting.

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION 1835

2016/2017 Budget

James presented the 2016/2017 assessment budget to the Committee with projected expenditures totaling at \$25,655,331. As of September 30, 2017, there has been \$16,295,155 in assessment revenue received with an estimated outstanding balance to be received of \$624,845. The total projected assessment revenue has been revised from \$18,000,000 to \$16,920,000 because the growers were not producing the amount of fruit as projected. Through September 30, 2017 there has been \$16,645,813 in expenditures to the assessment budget, leaving a balance remaining of \$10,384,719. The urban treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$1,857,317 and \$2,788,160 expended so far. The central valley survey and treatment sub-budget has a remaining budget balance of \$2,732,395 and \$2,734,453 expended so far. These two sub-budgets have the highest expenditures.

Through September 30, 2017 there has been \$78,056 in expenditures to the TASC Grant with a remaining balance of \$346,944 which was transferred to CHRP, leaving the ending balance for the TASC Grant at zero. The TASC Grant will also not be renewed for fiscal year 2017/2018.

The total budget balance for CHRP is \$12,144,701. As of September 30, 2017, there has been \$9,680,182 expended so far leaving a remaining balance available of \$2,464,519.

James presented the spending authority tracking spreadsheet. The 2016/2017 authority is \$25,662,293 and 75 percent has been spent as of September 30, 2017 leaving the remaining balance at \$6,473,694.

James presented a document which showed the projection of expenditures for HLB response which includes the statewide risk-based survey, HLB Los Angeles response, HLB Orange response and HLB Riverside response. The total projected expenditures creates an overage of \$1,135,250. It was asked where the \$1,135,250 will be transferred from.

Variance Analysis Review 2016/2017

Year to date the ending variance for the assessment budget is -32.71 percent. There have been 61.58 percent of projected expenditures spent for fiscal year 2016/2017 so far. James introduced a new line item on the 2016/2017 Variance Analysis document. The new line item is the modified straight line projection which CDFA staff has developed in order to estimate where we will land instead of expecting to spend the entire budget. The projection as of September 30, 2017 is \$22,534,520.

2017/2018 Budget Review

There is no activity to yet report for 2017/2018. James presented a projection summary for 2017/2017 with a total budget projection of \$41,084,701.

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Nick Hill stated that he recently traveled to Washington D.C. to attend the Citrus Sector Meeting as well as the HLB MAC planning session. The MAC meeting went over a couple of projects that are in the works and there was a lot of discussion about the dog teams, the effectiveness of biocontrol and Early Detection Technologies (EDT). The Citrus Sector Meeting provided a chance for Arizona, Texas, California and Florida to get together to discuss the risks and concerns of each state.

Coastal and Nursery Committee Member Vacancies

Victoria Hornbaker stated that the two Committee vacancies were issued on October 31, 2017 however there were no qualified applicants therefore the deadline was extended to November 30, 2017. The vacancies will be addressed again at the January 10, 2018 Committee meeting.

Regional ACP Management

Bob Atkins gave an update on regional ACP management noting that the Grower Liaisons are currently analyzing the fall flush treatments to see how much participation there was. There has been a lot of activity in various counties in forming new pest control districts (PCD) noting that Hemet has just formed a PCD and San Bernardino has voted for a PCD. San Joaquin Valley's PCD has met to discuss how they might best coordinate efforts trying to have a balance between local and statewide control and effectiveness. Nick Hill stated that there was a memorandum sent out by CCM regarding taking a look at certain aspects of CPDPP and the Grower Liaisons were one aspect mentioned. Nick Hill would like to discuss the memorandum in further detail to see how the Committee members feel about the work that the Grower Liaisons are currently doing. It was stated that the Grower Liaisons need to do a better job of communicating with the PCA's and growers that they work with. It was also stated that the Committee needs to continue to evaluate and improve to ensure that the program is as effective as possible. There was discussion regarding the Grower Liaisons at the most current Operations Subcommittee meeting and it was noted that there is a lack of communication regarding what work the Grower Liaisons are doing exactly. Bob Atkins stated that he would like to know where the Committee would like to see improvement when it comes to the Grower Liaisons. It was asked if the Committee is getting their monies worth when it comes to the level of service that the Committee gets when it comes to the Grower Liaisons. It was also stated that the Grower Liaisons should not be billing the Committee to do any other work than what their scope of work has laid out. Bob Atkins presented the scopes of work for the Grower Liaisons which is included in the contracts that the Committee bid on. Bob also presented a detailed PowerPoint which provided information on

what the Grower Liaisons do on a normal basis to give the Committee a better understanding of their specific job duties. Bob stated that the Grower Liaisons invoices are thoroughly reviewed and there is no double billing or conflicts of interest. Bob asked that if any of the Committee members have concerns to contact him or the Grower Liaisons directly so that he or the liaisons can work on these concerns as they arise. Bob and the liaisons need to know what they aren't doing correctly and what steps to take to improve. Joel Nelsen stated that the PowerPoint that was presented is accurate when it comes to the scope of work, but the concern is whether the work is getting done. Victoria suggested some additional reporting from the liaisons which include more numbers on growers that they work with monthly or numbers of meetings attended etc. Victoria also stated that the last fiscal year that they were a third under spent on their budget and both Victoria and Bob both monitor the invoices closely. Nick Condos stated that a lot of these concerns will be addressed through Strategic Planning. Nick Condos is going to investigate the role of the liaisons in the overall program. Nick also stated that CDFA is looking at all options to get the regular rulemaking done as soon as possible.

OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Operations Subcommittee Chairman Keith Watkins stated that there are reports in the member's binders which include ACP treatment updates, HLB survey updates, CDFA laboratory updates and Biocontrol updates. The reports were also posted on the CPDPC FTP site in advance, so the Committee had access to view the reports prior to the meeting. Keith asked for any questions or comments regarding the reports. It was asked if the Ct values below 40 in the HLB detection areas are being resampled and what the resample results are. Luci Kumagai with the CDFA lab stated that the below 40 Ct samples are being resampled with RNR primer and 99.9 percent of them have come back negative. If there is a Ct sample below 37 an immediate follow up sample is requested and most of those test negative as well. Luci further explained what RNR primers are for those who are unaware. Luci also stated that there is a revised ACP/HLB USDA work instruction that will be implemented beginning the week of November 13, 2017. There are three major changes in the work instruction which Luci reviewed with the Committee. USDA is currently still working on revising the plant HLB work instruction. The CDFA HLB proficiency test panel is ready to be administered to commercial labs that are permitted to run non-regulatory HLB samples. The California Citrus Trista Eradication Agency (CCTEA) lab is ready to receive the proficiency test in early December 2017. CDFA is also working on getting a contract in place for the pilot project with CCTEA. CDFA continues to work with the University of Arizona lab as well.

It was asked if the work is progressing on the HLB risk-based survey. Magally Luque-Williams gave a brief update on the risk-based survey noting that cycle 1 is almost complete. Debby stated that staff did not anticipate on finding all of the positive HLB trees and having delimitation take up most of staff time. Seasonal staff will be hired to dedicate time strictly to HLB survey. At the September 13, 2017 Committee meeting there was a motion made to transition away from the Gottwald survey to CDFA staff's risk-based survey by September 2018 and it was asked if that change is being monitored. It was suggested that CDFA continue to send out emails regarding new HLB finds instead of the Committee having to check the citrus insider which is updated once a week on Friday. CDFA staff agreed to continue to send out emails to the Committee when there is a new HLB detection.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Dr. Etienne Rabe gave a recap of the Science Subcommittee meeting that was held on November 6, 2017. The call focused on the fogging mitigation option which Dr. Spenser Walse has been working on. In the most recent experiment done there was a very high mortality rate in which only two ACP survived out of 2,000. Etienne provided further details about the experiment. It was discussed at the end of the meeting that the next steps are to get Evergreen and S240/Breakthru registered for pesticide use. Victoria mentioned that any pesticide regulation needs to be handled through the Department of Pesticide Regulation. Etienne also stated that there needs to be a recommendation from the University of California to CDFA that adds these two pesticides to the performance standard in which Beth Grafton-Cardwell does not have an issue recommending. If things go as planned this will expand the mitigation options for bulk citrus movement across regional boundaries in which Nick Condos is working on getting approved.

Motion: That the Evergreen/Breakthru fogging option for ACP control in bulk citrus be added to the performance standards for bulk citrus movement across the regional boundaries upon receiving the necessary recommendation from the University of California as well as satisfactory clearance of the registration and regulatory aspects related to Evergreen and S240/Breakthru. In addition, an outline of the current proposed protocol to be followed in this regard (equipment, fans, nozzles, etc) to be provided by Dr. Spenser Walse. It is also recognized that the current process can be improved and that the industry technical expertise may on-engineer the process to reduce time as well as water volumes per current procedures.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Kevin Severns

Motion Passes: All in favor

It was noted that this will only apply to the ACP quarantine. Etienne stated that he would like to see the Science Subcommittee convene a panel of scientists to review how the program is operating effectively. Etienne would also like to see an efficient action plan developed regarding bulk citrus movement within the HLB quarantine zones. Nick Condos stated that CDFA and USDA have already had preliminary discussions. The scientists will need to work with the Committee and CDFA staff to craft a systems approach that is biologically feasible and works with industry to pitch to USDA.

OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION

Tracy Monkene with NST provided a report on 2016/2017 outreach results. The outreach program is a three-pronged strategy: homeowner outreach, elected official outreach and industry outreach. Tracy reported that NST's media relations efforts secured 101 stories to reach an audience of more than 2.9 million and 1,055 ads reached an audience of more than 11 million. NST has continued to present the PSA which aired in key markets throughout the state to achieve 152 million impressions. An estimated 3,000 conversations with residents took place through community events. NST has also distributed nearly 45,000 pieces of literature throughout the year. NST redesigned the mobile-friendly homeowner website to expand multi-lingual presence and increase reach and effectiveness. The website has attracted more than 61,000 visits and social media resulted in nearly 554,406 impressions. Industry meetings reached an estimated audience of 1,800. NST's current focus is on Anaheim and Pico Rivera due to the increased HLB finds in those areas. It was asked if there are any surveys or pooling done to find out which areas are missing out on outreach. Teresa stated that NST has not done research in terms of who they

are missing but has done research with target audiences to find out what messages resonate best. It was also asked what the level of concern is from the general public regarding HLB and the citrus industry. Tracy stated that there is a form on the Citrus Insider which homeowners can fill out regarding their trees and there is a handful received every single day.

CCM REPORT

Joel Nelsen reported that the White House is extremely sensitive to devastating HLB situation. December 8, 2017 is the drop dead date for the budget and if it doesn't happen then there will be a continuing resolution which means CDFA and USDA will get the same funding that was received last year. If the budget passes CDFA's budget will increase as well as CHRP. The voluntary tree removal program has been implemented in Southern California. \$36,500 has been spent so far removing 1,400 homeowner trees. The construction delay in putting together the BSL3 lab has been overcome and should be ready by mid November 2017. There will be a small open house held in January 2018 for CRB and CPDPC members.

CRB REPORT

Melinda Klein reported that the HLB MAC Committee met and the CRB had a proposal up for consideration to coordinate the citrus breeding program for HLB mitigation. It will be a two-day workshop sometime in February 2018 that received \$52,000 for support. CRB has requested an additional \$60,000 to bring people in at the national level and from across the Country. The workshop was designed for citrus breeders, regulatory officials, and funding organizations to meet face-to-face, collaborate and discuss how to promote and facilitate more efficiently. Melinda went over the expected outcomes from the workshop. It was noted that MAC approved the proposal. A location is to be determined. Gary Schulz stated that Dan Dreyer is the new Chairman of the CRB.

CLOSING COMMENTS & ADJOURNMENT

There were no closing comments made.

The meeting was adjourned at 1:36 p.m. The next meeting will be held in Exeter, California on January 10, 2018 at 10:00am.