

**CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM - JOINT  
OPERATIONS AND SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING**

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, December 14, 2016

**Opening:**

The joint Operations and Science Subcommittee meeting was called to order at 9:00 a.m. on December 14, 2016 in Visalia, California by Operations Subcommittee Chair Jim Gorden.

**Committee Members Present:**

Richard Bennett	Jim Gorden	Kevin Olsen
John Gless*	Link Leavens*	Etienne Rabe

**Committee Members Absent:**

Kevin Severns

**CRB Staff:**

Rick Dunn	Cynthia LeVesque*	Gary Schulz
Melinda Klein*		

**Interested Parties:**

Jill Barnier	Victoria Hornbaker	Sylvie Robillard
Erin Betts	Brett Kirkpatrick*	Cressida Silvers*
Dan Dreyer	Shirley Kirkpatrick*	Debby Tanouye
Enrico Ferro*	John Krist*	Carla Thomas*
Sean Farnum	Luci Kumagai*	Rayne Thompson
Art Gilbert	Zak Lafiette*	Dan Wiley*
Beth Grafton-Cardwell	Leslie Leavens*	Scosha Wright
John Goergen	Magally Luque-Williams*	Judy Zaninovich*
Subhas Hajeri	Curtis Pate*	Sandra Zwaal*

**\* Participated via telephone/WebEx**

**Opening Comments**

Jim Gorden welcomed the Subcommittee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online. It was noted that there was a quorum for the Operations meeting. Jim announced that a new Subcommittee member, Keith Watkins, has been appointed to the Operations Subcommittee. CDFA staff is working on finalizing all of Keith's paperwork to make him an official CPDPC member.

**Approval of Minutes**

Jim Gorden reviewed the minutes from the October 13, 2016 Operations Subcommittee meeting.

**Motion:** To approve the minutes from the October 13, 2016 Operations Subcommittee meeting.

First: Richard Bennett

Second: Jim Gorden

Motion Passes: All in favor

### **ACP Response Protocol**

Debby presented a strategic plan to combat the establishment of HLB in California. She reviewed some concerns that CDFA has which include:

- ACP is being found in new counties and is being found more frequently in counties where ACP has been already detected for example: Kern, Tulare, Fresno and Santa Clara.
- The cost of urban treatment is not sustainable. Are the treatments effective and if so, how long are they effective for?
- In the attempt to prevent the establishment of HLB, is the Committee, Industry, and CDFA too focused on trying to kill any HLB-infected ACP at any cost?
- What are the things that CDFA needs to do to develop a strategic plan that will prevent the establishment of HLB in California?

Some options that have developed are to discontinue areawide urban treatment and trapping in Southern California. Some things to consider for this option is what the risk may be. The savings by not treating in Southern California needs to be determined. It also needs to be identified what other options are available to prevent the establishment of HLB for example, biocontrol and more ACP collection for HLB testing. Debby stated that the HLB risk-based survey is critical to the strategic plan. The focus needs to remain on ACP collection and symptomatic plant tissue. CDFA needs to prioritize and focus on other HLB surveys such as cluster surveys around Dr. Bartels sites. An analysis of population dynamics around Hacienda Heights, San Gabriel and Bakersfield will help determine if CDFA needs to continue with the urban treatments. The path forward is to provide a report at the Operations Subcommittee meeting in January and to make a decision on whether to continue treating in Santa Clara and move to more HLB survey in Santa Clara County.

Victoria presented a map from 2015 that shows all of the inconclusive results which have a ct-value of 39 and below. The inconclusive sites are spread all throughout Southern California with only one in Ventura and two in Imperial. Most of the inconclusive sites are in Los Angeles, Orange, San Bernardino, Riverside and San Diego. The Subcommittee would like to see an updated map with the inconclusive results from 2016.

Sean Farnum gave an update on the HLB survey in Santa Clara County. Cycle 1 did not include many STR grids for Santa Clara. Sean presented a map of the new selection chosen. This selection was chosen because the grids are both high risk and located in data poor areas. More grids may be added if the current grids are finished before Dr. Gottwald produces another cycle. In 2014, there were 16 ACP detections and 3,906 parcels treated. In 2015 there were 9 ACP finds with a total of 2,041 parcels treated and in 2016 there have been 99 ACP detections and 13,923 parcels to be treated. 5,129 parcels are currently pending treatment and the ACP population continues to increase. There was discussion that followed the presentation regarding the budget.

John Goergen presented a draft research proposal on analyzing the impact of urban treatments on ACP population dynamics. The main question is does the treatment program in Hacienda Heights and San Gabriel limit the population of ACP in those areas. John reviewed how staff determines if the treatments are working and he also reviewed the uncertainties that staff have due to location inaccuracy, geocoding, a real unit of analysis and accounting for natural seasonal variation. It was suggested for CDFA staff to start only looking at traps with no visual survey and start with the San Gabriel area to see what comes from that.

The Subcommittee stated that looking at the level of risk and the amount of success the program is seeing is really important at this point. Debby stated that CDFA staff will put together some of the criteria and preliminary analysis however staff will not be able to provide three different levels of the budget and what activities each budget can cover by the January 11, 2017 CPDPC meeting due to time constraints. Subcommittee chairman Jim Gorden stated that the Subcommittee will devote some time at the January 4, 2017 Operations meeting to discuss this further and hopefully come up with a recommendation to bring to full Committee on January 11, 2017.

#### **Update and Discussion on Bulk Citrus Movement Mitigations**

Beth stated that the industry is looking for a way to disinfest bulk citrus of ACP. The current performance standard gives the option for preharvest insecticide treatment or field cleaning. The current standard may not be effective, as ACP is being found at packing houses, juice plants and along highways. The proposed solution from the Science Advisory Panel (SAP) was to wet wash the fruit which can cause damage to the fruit, making this solution an unsatisfactory substitute for spray and move. There has been discussion regarding what else could be done to disinfest the fruit before it is shipped. Beth, Joe Morse and Spenser Walse are testing the bin drench for viability and efficacy and will report back to the subcommittee with more information after the bin drench testing. They would like to see experimentation be done because the proposed options may not work like the industry hopes. Beth discussed in detail, the dry options and wet options. Etienne discussed how important it is having other options other than wet wash. Victoria gave an update on where CDFA is right now with the wet wash process and performance standard. As the industry moves forward with the phase in, phase out, the spray and move would drop off as an option and the options remaining would be wet wash and field clean. As new options become available they will be added onto the performance standard. It was asked the definition of phase in and phase out. Victoria stated that this would have to go through the regular rulemaking process which can take up to a year and at some point during that time there will no longer be a spray and move option. If viable options come available during that time they can be added to the performance standard. Nothing has been submitted to Office of Administrative Law yet but CDFA staff is currently working on mitigations and the regional quarantine.

#### **Update and Discussion Voluntary Residential Tree Removal Options**

Etienne reported that the Kern County Pest Control District chairman Dennis Johnson has recently asked homeowners around his packing house to voluntarily remove their trees in exchange for \$100. Dennis brought the idea to the Pest Control District as an option to look at. Victoria stated that CDFA will not be involved in a project like this because it sets a precedent for other projects that CDFA does in which CDFA does not compensate. The focus of the pilot

program will be areas near commercial citrus. There was discussion about revising the MOU between CDFA, CPDPC and CCTA to add the tree removal option to the MOU. Victoria stated that this is something that CDFA cannot do because CDFA can only remove PCR positive HLB trees and because the pilot program is not a CPDPC activity. Victoria stated that the CDFA legal staff will look further into this and she will report back to the Committee.

### **Regional ACP Update**

Bob Atkins was not in attendance. The ACP Regional Update was included in packets for the Subcommittee to review.

### **HLB Survey Activities**

#### **Hacienda Heights**

There are currently 100 traps placed in the core square mile in Hacienda Heights. In September there were 59 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 417 ACP samples collected. In October there were 78 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 906 ACP samples collected. In November there were 69 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 133 ACP samples collected. The Hacienda Heights core survey is complete. 100 percent of the plants in the 800 meter area from the HLB find were sampled. There were a total of 1,590 properties visited, 969 plant samples collected, 132 ACP samples collected and 645 sites negative for ACP and/or plant samples. Cycle 6 is currently in progress and began on November 2, 2016. So far there have been 211 sites visited, 38 plant samples collected, 170 ACP samples collected and 28 sites negative for ACP and plant samples. Cycles 1 through 5 are complete.

#### **San Gabriel**

There are 100 traps placed in the core square mile in San Gabriel. In September there were 32 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 95 ACP collected. In October there were 36 traps with ACP and 70 ACP collected. In November there were 38 traps with ACP samples and an estimated 69 ACP samples collected. The San Gabriel core survey is complete. 100 percent of the plants in the 800 meter area from the HLB find were sampled. There were a total of 4,495 properties visited, 2,983 plant samples collected, 835 ACP samples collected and 1,577 sites negative for ACP and/or plant samples. Cycle 3 is currently in progress and began on September 7, 2016 and 2,231 sites have been visited with 257 plant samples collected and 1,842 ACP samples collected. There have been 269 sites negative for ACP. CDFA staff has been conducting an intensive resampling all of the remaining trees at the HLB find sites and two more positive HLB trees resulted from that resample bringing the total to 28 positive HLB trees at 20 properties.

#### **Risk-Based Survey**

Cycle 1 is complete in Alameda, Butte, Colusa, Contra Costa, Del Norte, Glenn, Humboldt, Imperial, Kern, Kings, Lake, Marin, Madera, Mendocino, Merced, Orange San Benito, San Francisco, San Luis Obispo, San Mateo, Santa Barbara, Santa Clara, Shasta, Sonoma, Trinity, Tulare, Ventura and Yuba counties. Cycle 1 should be complete by the end of December 2016 and is still ongoing in Fresno, Kern, Los Angeles, Mariposa, Placer, Riverside, Sacramento, San Bernardino, San Diego, San Joaquin, Stanislaus and Monterey counties. A total number of 29,285 survey sites have been complete out of a proposed number of 45,085 sites. There were a

total number of 10,626 sites with ACP samples, 6,885 sites with plant samples and 14,681 sites negative for ACP and plant samples. Cycle 2 is currently in development and CDFA staff is trying to schedule a conference call with Dr. Gottwald to revise the San Gabriel cluster survey.

### **Sacramento Laboratory Activities**

Eighteen trees in the San Gabriel HLB quarantine zone have tested positive for HLB in 2016. All the infected trees have been removed. During the month of November, the lab received a total of 6,456 ACP and 3,867 plant samples, for a grand total of 10,323 samples for the month. The 2016 total samples through November are 117,782 samples. Yearly HLB sample totals from 2008 to 2016 show a cumulative total of 400,911 samples over the course of nine years (2008-2016) in which 35% of the total are plant and 65% are ACP. CDFA staff has gone out to any site where an HLB positive tree was detected and any remaining citrus tree is being resampled. It was stated that twelve leaves are taken from each eight sections of each tree being sampled.

### **CRB Laboratory Updates**

Cynthia LeVesque gave an update on projects in progress for CRB. The CRB lab remodel is still in progress. CRB staff has prepared documents required for USDA recertification and are waiting for revised plans from the contactor before submitting the paperwork. CRB has hired a lab manager and a quality manager. CRB is also shipping materials used in the Texas 2 study to Davis for use in the California 1 and 1B studies.

### **Biocontrol Update**

Jim Gorden gave a brief update on behalf of David Morgan. As of November 30, 2016 the program has released 1,710,510 *Tamarixia* and 196,356 *Diaphorencyrtus* in residential areas of Southern California. The program has begun *Tamarixia* releases at 23 locations in the Bakersfield area to see if we can achieve establishment. It was suggested since there has not been an additional ACP find in Placer County, that instead of releasing wasps there, to release them in Santa Clara County where there are high ACP populations. The wasps would likely have a higher success rate in Santa Clara versus Placer County where the temperature is much cooler at this time of the season. Victoria stated that the question would need to be presented to the Biocontrol Task Force. The next Biocontrol Task Force meeting will be held on January 10, 2017.

### **Data Management**

Rick Dunn gave several updates. Rick has continued to assist with the statewide citrus layer maintenance. There have been major updates on the citrus layer for Riverside and Fresno counties and Tulare County is underway. Staff has continued to maintain the public access to ACP detections, psyllid management areas (PMA) and the biocontrol activity web map. Staff continues to support commercial grove trapping, HLB detection overview maps, PDR 800M maps, biocontrol working group activity maps and CPDPC trapping and sampling progress maps. New grove trapping and areawide grove trapping close-up maps have been developed and are now in use. Rick and Matt Stuemky have continued to provide preliminary GIS and practical support for Dr. Neil McRoberts California 1 and 1B proposals. The grower liaison requested time-lapse map products are in development.

Victoria gave an update regarding her new position as Branch Chief of the Integrated Pest Control (IPC) branch. The liaison duties will move under IPC and a new Citrus Program Manager will be hired in January 2017. Victoria will work very closely with the new Program Manager to get them trained until they are ready to manage the program on their own. The Executive Committee will have input on the duty statement for the Program Manager and a member from the Executive Committee will be sitting in on the hiring panel to ensure that CDFA hires the right candidate for the job.

The meeting was adjourned at 12:10 p.m. The next Operations meeting will be held on January 4, 2017 at 9:00 a.m. in Visalia, California.