

**CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM  
COMMITTEE MEETING**

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, November 12, 2014

**Opening:**

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on November 12, 2014 in Ventura, California by Committee Chairman Nick Hill.

**CPDPC Members Present:**

Craig Armstrong	Nick Hill	Kevin Olsen
Richard Bennett	Link Leavens	Etienne Rabe
Bob Felts, Jr.	Scott Mabs	Kevin Severns
John Gless*	Mark McBroom*	Brian Specht*
Jim Gorden	George McEwen	
Gus Gunderson	James McFarlane	

**CPDPC Members Absent:**

**CDFA Staff:**

Stephen Brown*	Victoria Hornbaker	Mike Pitcairn
Jason Chan	Magally Luque-Williams	Duane Schnabel*
Sean Farnum	Paul Martinez	Debby Tanouye
Tina Galindo	Susan McCarthy*	Austin Webster
Art Gilbert	David Morgan*	Scosha Wright
Adrian Gonzales	Colleen Murphy-Vierra	Bob Wynn

**Guests:**

Bob Atkins	Linda Haque	Katie Nieri
Jill Barnier*	Brett Kirkpatrick	Carlos Ortiz*
Marjie Bartels	Shirley Kirkpatrick*	Sylvie Robillard
Lisa Brenneis	Ellen Kragh	Jim Sebesta
Brett Chandler	John Krist	Cressida Silvers*
David Coert	Cynthia LeVesque*	Mike Sullivan
Vic Corkins	Glenn Miller	Karen Suslow*
Dan Dreyer	John Morgan*	Anthony Vazquez
Rick Dunn*	Steven Murata	Dan Willey*
Roger Essick	Joel Nelsen	Helene Wright

**\* Participated via telephone**

**Opening Comments:**

Chairman, Nick Hill, welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online and stated there is a quorum for the meeting.

**Public Comment:**

Margie Bartels certified organic grower with Bartels Ranch in Ventura County expressed her concern with CDFA’s current treatment protocols. She feels that growers are not receiving enough information in regards to ACP finds and treatments. She is also concerned with area-wide treatment as she feels it is unnecessary in Bardsdale, where there has been very good biological control. She feels that repeated pesticide sprays in orchards where no evidence of ACP has been found will do more harm than good.

Mark McBroom expressed his concern in regards to the amount of ACP being found. Since ACP has established a population in Southern California, the Committee should move their focus toward finding HLB and developing protocols for if and when HLB is found.

Craig Armstrong announced that there is currently a 90 to 98 percent grower participation rate for the area-wide treatments in the Coachella Valley. The pest control district is taking treatment into their own hands and completing the treatments, however two to three weeks after treatment, the groves are completely infested again. He stressed that there needs to be a new plan implemented.

**COMMITTEE BUSINESS & UPDATES**

Nick Hill reviewed the minutes from the Committee meeting that took place on September 3, 2014.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes from the September 3, 2014 Committee meeting as presented.

First: Gus Gunderson

Second: Jim Gorden

Motion Passes: All in favor

**FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

**a. 2013/2014 Budget and Assessments**

James McFarlane reviewed the 2013/2014 budgets and revenues. To date the program has received \$13,010,338 in assessment revenues with an estimated balance remaining to be received of \$23,252. The program has expended \$7,418,145, leaving an available balance of \$4,599,834. The projected reserve balance is \$8,542,506.

The CHRP budget is \$9,624,859 due to the remaining balance of \$6,803,332 being transferred in on August 1, 2014. The CHRP expenditures to date are \$7,163,991, leaving a remaining balance of \$2,460,868.

James reported on the other budgets, stating that the TASC grant current cycle is complete and the budget has been zeroed out. The Citrus Commodity budget has a balance remaining to be expended of \$16,972. The HLB MAC funds of \$46,000 are available to the program for

biocontrol activities which most will be rolled over into the 2014/2015 fiscal year budget. There was a question regarding Schedule A under the other financing sources line item. The \$1,032,186 was transferred in represents a combination of things: \$245,000 from recovery funds and unclaimed gas tax, \$640,000 for the Central Valley new area contingency, and \$145,000 for San Luis Obispo new area contingency.

**b. Variance Analysis Review**

James reported that the variance analysis is still a work in progress however staffing is doing a good job working on the lags. The projected expenditures for the current month were \$805,464 and the actual expenditures were \$1,215,279 which is about 51 more than projected. As of September 2014, 62 percent of the budget is spent for fiscal year 2013/2014. The program will keep refining the projections and it is hopeful that over time the variance will be reduced.

**c. 2014/2015 Budget and Assessments**

James reviewed the 2014/2015 CHRP budget and sub-budgets with the Committee. The projected CHRP budget amount is the same amount as last year, \$9,624,859. The total projected expenditures for Santa Clara County are \$396,533 and the total projected expenditures for San Joaquin County is \$659,621. There are currently no line items included in the assessment funds for Santa Clara and San Joaquin Counties so it was suggested to create sub-budgets for the two and move to utilize new area contingency funds to cover the costs. There was discussion about implementing a new path forward since there has been frequent finds in new areas.

**Motion:** To approve using \$1,056,154 of the new area contingency funds to fund ACP detection and treatment activities based on finds in San Joaquin and Santa Clara Counties.

First: Kevin Olsen

Second: Jim Gorden

Motion Passes: All in favor

**d. Assessment Collection**

Victoria reported that staff is currently working on switching over the assessment collection from Inspection Services to Plant Division to avoid credit card fees. Additional staff will not be needed to take on the work load. 20 percent of a current Staff Services Analyst position and 10 percent of an Office Technician's time will be used to complete the assessment collections.

**SWEET ORANGE SCAB REGULATORY UPDATES**

Duane Schnabel, CDFA's Chief of Pest Exclusion Branch gave some regulatory updates regarding Sweet Orange Scab (SOS). CDFA has used their statutory authority to create a 5 mile radius around SOS detection sites in order to satisfy the trading partners. There have been detections in Riverside, San Bernardino, and Imperial Counties. CDFA staff have investigated and determined how many regulated entities are within the 5 mile radius of the detection sites which include 12 retail and production nurseries, 6 grove managers, 9 growers and 2 transporters. There are 9 packing facilities under compliance agreements approved by USDA to receive and transport fruit. An advisory containing this information was sent out on October 7, 2014. The next issue is counties receiving fruit from SOS quarantine areas that are not processed because there are no processing facilities within the four, five mile quarantine areas. Tulare

County has declined to receive fruit from non-treated areas, leaving Riverside and Imperial Counties to take the fruit. CDFA is conducting ongoing SOS survey work. CDFA's nursery program is also doing survey work at the production nurseries. There was discussion regarding the PDR's not being accurate. Duane stated that the PDR's have been corrected and the maps that are out are based upon the corrections. CDFA has requested for USDA to not include Riverside, and CDFA will come up with a response depending on USDA's decision.

## **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

### **a. Committee and Subcommittee Vacancies**

Chairman Hill introduced and welcomed new committee member Scott Mabs who has also been appointed as a member of the Operations Subcommittee. There were two applicants to fill prior member Dan Dreyer's position.

**Motion:** It was recommended by blind ballot vote that Franco Bernardi be appointed as a new member of the CPDPC to replace previous member Dan Dreyer. Franco was also recommended for appointment as Chairman of the CPDPC Outreach Subcommittee. The motion was passed by a vote of 10 to 6.

### **b. Review of New Area Finds**

Victoria reported that there were new psyllid finds in Santa Clara and San Joaquin Counties on glassy-winged sharpshooter (GWSS) traps. ACP trapping is not done in areas where there is less than 1,000 acres of citrus. GWSS traps are removed October 31, 2014 and are not placed back into the areas until May 2015 which causes an issue. It is being proposed to keep 5 traps per square mile out in the urban areas through the winter. CDFA is working with the counties to get budgets for this activity. The budget will be sent out to the Committee when it is received. There was concern from a few committee members to move forward with the trapping without a budget. Debby stated that the counties are to submit a budget for the trapping by mid-November and CDFA staff will get a projected budget to the Committee via conference call which will be held on November 24, 2014.

### **c. Regional ACP Management**

Bob Atkins, the Grower Liaison Coordinator gave several updates. The Ad Hoc GIS Committee has finalized all reports and maps and hopes to have them posted to an FTP site very soon. The Ventura County grower liaison position is vacant and posted on the CASS website. The San Diego and Imperial County grower liaison positions are vacant as well; however those contracts are being processed directly through CDFA and close on November 18 and 19. There have been applicants for all three of the vacancies. The grower liaison for San Bernardino is working on area wide treatment however there have been some issues with a few packing houses and the coordination of treatments in the San Bernardino area. Neglected and abandon orchards are continuing to be worked on and CACASA is supportive of developing templates for abatement action for use by all counties. There was discussion that followed regarding treatment and the effectiveness of treatment.

### **d. ACP/HLB Work Plan and Action Plan**

Victoria reviewed the action and work plan with the Committee. There is a pie chart included in the work plan that shows the distribution of where funding goes. Victoria asked that the

Committee endorse the work plan and stated that the work plan is a live document that will be changed as the Committee implements changes and recommendations. The Committee requested time to review the action and work plans. They will revisit them at the next meeting.

### **OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Operations Subcommittee Chair Jim Gorden provided a summary of the Subcommittee meeting that was held on November 5, 2014 in Visalia, California. Jim stated that the Operations Subcommittee recommended removing traps in Escondido, Ramona and Rancho Santa Fe areas in San Diego County where there are high levels of ACP. The areas will instead be surveyed for HLB, with collection of psyllids and plant samples for HLB testing. Art Gilbert stated that western Riverside and San Bernardino have gone to psyllid collection for HLB testing rather than running traps, collecting twice a year from various sites. The amount of psyllid on the traps are increasing therefore visual surveying and HLB testing would be more ideal.

**Motion:** To replace ACP trapping in the Ramona, Escondido, Rancho Santa Fe and Borrego Springs areas of San Diego County with ACP collection for HLB analysis.

First: Jim Gorden

Second: Richard Bennett

Motion Passes: All in favor

Victoria presented the 2014/2015 revised Operations budget to the Committee and stated that when CRB put their initial grant proposal through to CDFA, they anticipated on being able to move away from tech support however they could not get out of that contract. They now need to increase the contract amount from \$1,487,481 by \$70,906 to continue to pay for tech support. The Committee would like to make a decision on the revised CRB budget at the next Committee meeting to have time to look over the budget further and make a decision.

#### **a. HLB Survey Updates**

Jim announced that the HLB surveying in Los Angeles and San Diego Counties has been completed. CDFA is no longer doing the zone surveying, they are moving to a risk-based survey. USDA and Dr. Gottwald have been in collaboration with CDFA in implementing a new survey starting November 2014 which involves less sampling and surveying being completed twice a year. CDFA staff continues to survey traps within 800 meters of the find site in Hacienda Heights. All psyllids found and tested have come back negative for HLB. Debby spoke further on implementing the risk-based survey in California as well as what is being done in Mexico. She noted that all survey samples in California are sent to the CDFA lab. In Mexico, the surveying occurs during treatment and staff collects live ACP and submits the psyllids to USDA's lab. If there are symptoms of HLB, it is reported to the Mexico Department of Food and Agriculture and they will collect plant tissue.

#### **b. Treatment Updates**

Tina Galindo gave several treatment updates. CDFA staff has completed treatment in Hacienda Heights. There have been 158 ACP finds in Ventura County since September. Oxnard, Simi Valley, Ventura, Camarillo, Fillmore, Somas, Oak View, and Ojai are all 100 percent complete. Santa Paula is 90 percent complete. The time has come to start planning for area wide treatment in Santa Paula going east toward Fillmore. Treatment started in Santa Clara and San Jose on

October 15, 2014 and that area was expanded November 12, 2014. Area wide treatment is being conducted in San Bernardino County and is currently 95 percent complete. In Riverside, two areas are being treated in Hemet. One area is 100 percent complete and the other is 68 percent complete with Coachella pending. In San Diego treatment is being done along the border. Calexico is 100 percent complete; San Ysidro is 60 percent complete with Calexico pending. There was a question in regards to treatment refusals and the refusals are at about 5 percent.

Debby presented a power point concerning ongoing border activities in California and in Mexico. CDFA is currently trapping 2 miles along the border with 25 traps per square mile. Tijuana traps 2 miles along the border as well however Tecati and Mexicali trap 1 mile along the border. There are 400 meter treatments around detection sites within 2 miles of the border and repeat find sites are dealt with on a case by case basis. In Mexico treatment is done 200 meters around detection sites except where Tamarixia have been released. Repeat find sites in Mexico and treated 4 times a year with foliar and twice a year with soil treatment. Mark McBroom started that looking for HLB should be the committee's main concern because at this point, treatment is not going to lower psyllid numbers with the current level of infestation in Southern California. Chairman Hill stated that the Committee cannot continue to spend funds on all the treatment and trapping that has been ongoing, there needs to be a change made. One option is to take away trapping and switch to HLB surveying only. There will be a plan presented moving forward at the next full Committee meeting for the members to vote on.

#### **c. Biocontrol Program Update**

Jim gave a brief update on the Biocontrol Program. 754,351 Tamarixia have been released through October 24, 2014. The Greenhouse on the Cal Poly campus is still due to begin construction in December, although the University is currently negotiating with the contractor. The environmental assessment for Diaphorocytus has been approved by USDA. Debby spoke further on biocontrol and what is done in California versus Mexico. Along the border in California, biocontrol is limited due to the pesticide applications. In Mexico, biocontrol is implemented one mile along the border around find sites. The biocontrol task force will meet again on December 4, 2014.

#### **d. Laboratory Updates**

Jim gave a brief update on behalf of the CRB and CDFA lab. There have been 21,698 samples ran at the CRB lab in Riverside since January 2014. 2,586 subsamples have been tested since the last Operations Subcommittee meeting. All samples have come back negative for HLB. CRB lab staff has analyzed 141 ACP and 474 plant samples from the UC Davis containment facility. They are also testing high throughput protocol for siRNA and digital PCR. The percent of single samples is down to 13 percent.

The CDFA lab in Sacramento has been testing all of the samples from Hacienda Heights as well as continuing to send samples to Dr. Slupsky at UC Davis. For August, September and October there were 3,548 plant samples and 484 psyllid samples (ACP are from the Hacienda Heights area). Dog teams found HLB positive lime leaves shipped from Florida and Puerto Rico.

## **SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

There has been an Early Detection Technologies (EDT) task force put together involving scientists, growers and advisors and they have come up with some recommendations. Etienne Rabe, Science Subcommittee chair reviewed the early detection task force recommendations with the Committee. He stated that there has been a lot of inconsistent data in regards to the early detection technologies and mistaken positive HLB finds. The task force members have concluded that the results of the early detection technologies are inconsistent and it is not possible to identify the best early detection technology at this moment in time. Charla Hollingsworth with USDA is working with CRB in Florida on digital droplet PCR since it has not yet been optimized. She will also be working on the qPCR to review the existing protocols and determine if they can be improved. Another recommendation is to resample the trees in the Hacienda Heights area with all of the early detection technologies. The CDFA lab is to provide the data from their analysis of Hacienda Heights samples to the task force as well as resample Slupsky's presumptive positives from the San Joaquin Valley. Etienne discussed a trial that the EDT task force would like to conduct in Texas to determine the front runner in the EDT technologies. Etienne asked that the CRB Operations Grant be augmented up to \$100,000 to conduct this validation. Cynthia LeVesque reported that there was a NIFA grant prepared however there was a problem in the submission process and it was not submitted in time so there will be no NIFA funding this year. There will be funding from MAC for the early detection studies but on a smaller scale and unfortunately the funding will not be ready in time for the Texas study.

**Motion:** To amend the CRB Operations Grant, approving funding of up to \$100,000 for the early detection technologies study in Texas.

First: Craig Armstrong

Second: Richard Bennett

Motion Passes: All in favor

There was a comment made by a committee member that would like to see the retesting to start ASAP and not wait for Texas to decide what early detection technology works best. If there is a positive tree, it needs to be found ASAP. There was another comment made, stating that if something were to read positive it cannot be determined to be true without Texas doing this study to confirm that the detection technologies are 100 percent accurate.

## **OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Katie Nieri with NST introduced herself to the Committee and presented a PowerPoint presentation regarding Outreach updates and a recap for 2014. She went over the industry website stating that there have been 5,924 visits this year and 3,186 unique visitors. For the consumer website, there have been 31,492 visits and 28,958 unique visitors. Users can sign up for email updates whenever something is posted concerning their county. NST has met with 40 packing house representatives, presented to 500 farm workers, presented to 75 nursery professionals at the California Citrus Nursery Society's annual conference and has participated in 7 PAPA seminars reaching approximately 1,750 pesticide applicators. NST will continue to be a resource for the area-wide strategies as that unfolds over the coming months. There have been 27,141 residences reached with direct mail campaigns in response to new ACP finds. NST also manages social media sites which helps spread word as well. There has been two PSA's

distributed this year one in English and one in Spanish. There were 3,336 airings and 58.7 million impressions which is very encouraging. In regards to advertising there were 15 newspapers, with circulations totaling 652,000 and 19 radio station advertisements, reaching an estimated 1.7 million.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:00pm. The next meeting will be held in Exeter, California on February 4, 2015 at 10:00am.