

**CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM  
COMMITTEE MEETING**

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, January 08, 2014

**Opening:**

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on January 08, 2014 in Visalia, California by Committee Chair Nick Hill.

**CPDPC Members Present:**

Craig Armstrong	Gus Gunderson	James McFarlane
Richard Bennett	Nick Hill	Kevin Olsen
Dan Dreyer	Link Leavens	Kevin Severns
Bob Felts, Jr.	Mark McBroom	Brian Specht
John Gless	George McEwen	

**CPDPC Members Absent:**

Steve Birdsall	Jim Gorden	Etienne Rabe
Earl Rutz		

**CDFA Staff:**

Jason Chan*	Victoria Hornbaker	Steve Patton
Nick Condos*	Luci Kumagai	Mike Pitcairn
Casey Estep*	Danny Lee*	Debby Tanouye
Tina Galindo	Magally Luque-Williams	Jay Van Rein
Art Gilbert	Steve Lyle	Scosha Wright
Adrian Gonzales	Susan McCarthy*	Bob Wynn*
Craig Hanes	Colleen Murphy-Vierra	Jaccie Vang*

**Guests:**

Bill Abel	Ken Keck	MaryLou Polek
Tuben Amyo	Marilyn Kinoshita	Sylvie Robillard
Bob Atkins	Shirley Kirkpatrick	Greg Simmons
Bob Baker	Brett Kirkpatrick*	Roger Smith
Pat Baker	Ellen Kragh*	Zea Sonnabend*
Jill Barrier	John Krist*	Jeff Steen
Brett Chandler*	Leslie Leavens*	Teresa Stiles
Vic Corkins	Neil Lerma	Paul Story
Melissa Cregan	Cynthia LeVesque	Brian Taylor*
Rick Dunn*	Mark Lipson*	Connie Valenzuela*
John Eliot	Cory Lunde*	Helene Wright
Enrico Ferro*	Asif Maan	Les Wright
Allen Harthorn*	Scott Mabs	Gwendolyn Wyard

Michael Hennessey  
Nancy Holland  
Alyssa Houtby

Leonard Massey\*  
Joel Nelsen  
Carlos Ortiz\*

Judy Zaninovich\*  
Bob Zuckerman\*

**\* Participated via telephone**

**Opening Comments:**

Chairman, Nick Hill, welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online.

**Public Comment:**

Jeff Steen, organic grower in Tulare County, provided a comment regarding the HLB detection program. He explained that the current HLB detection program is a two prong effort; looking for the disease in plant tissue and also in ACP. He stated that looking for the disease based on visual symptomology of plant tissue is not a good method due to the latency period of the disease manifesting symptoms in the plant. He also mentioned that in a diseased orchard, known to be 100 percent infected with HLB, that depending on the time of year only 10 to 60 percent of the psyllids sampled were positive for HLB. He noted that neither of the current sampling efforts are very sensitive and he likened finding HLB in California to finding a “needle in a haystack” and recommended that the Committee work focus some resources on early detection technologies.

Lupe Guzman, organic grower in Ventura and Tulare Counties, reported that he has been under the Ventura quarantine area for the last two and one half years and has been compliant with the quarantine requirements. He mentioned that he is now also under the Tulare County quarantine and because of the proximity of finds to his property he is also within the mandatory treatment area. He would like to urge the Committee and CDFA to work toward finding an organic alternative for organic citrus falling within mandatory treatment areas.

Chairman Nick Hill thanked both commenter’s, reminding them that the Committee and CDFA are following the proper protocols, are working with Dr. Grafton-Cardwell, UC extension and the USDA to look into organic options and are participating with CRB on looking into early detection technologies.

**COMMITTEE BUISNESS & UPDATES**

Chairman Hill reviewed the minutes from the last Committee meeting which took place on November 13, 2013. No corrections were identified.

**Motion:** Approval of the minutes from the November 13, 2013 CPDPC meeting, as presented.

First: George McEwen

Second: Gus Gunderson

Motion Passes: All in favor

**FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Finance Subcommittee Chair James McFarlane provided a summary of the Subcommittee meeting that was held on December 19, 2013 in Visalia, California.

James reviewed the 12/13 fiscal year budgets for both the AB 281 funds and CHRP funds. He went over each display, and reminded the Committee that there is a lag time for invoices to be received by CDFA and billed to the program. The Finance Subcommittee had discussed developing a template to track the accruals on a monthly basis however due to the lag in the CDFA accounting system, the variances would be inaccurate.

James presented two variance tracking options to the Committee. The first option would be to stay with the cash basis reporting system that is currently in place and ask CDFA staff to build a cash basis budget which reflects similar lag time. The second option would be to add CDFA staff and transition to an accrual type system in which all invoices will be reviewed and recorded prior to being entered into the CDFA accounting system. The second option would be more costly and time consuming, but would mean more up to date numbers for the Committee.

There was discussion about why an accrual system would require additional funds. CDFA staff explained that an accrual system would require additional data entry, and more time because invoices would be tracked as they come in on a separate spreadsheet rather than using the CDFA accounting system. The finance subcommittee has discussed doing some trials to give the Committee an idea of what the variance analysis will look like using the current CDFA accounting system. Chairman Hill suggested that the Finance Subcommittee present the trial cash based variance analysis at the next CPDPC.

A question was raised as to the inclusion of the Citrus Commodity Survey on the CPDPC financial reports as the survey's funds are not administered by the CPDPC. Victoria Hornbaker explained that she was asked to include all funds for citrus regardless of funding source to give a full view of the amount of money being spent on citrus on an annual basis. The Citrus Commodity Survey is funded by USDA and has been in place for several years. The Citrus Commodity Survey is a survey of 25 percent of commercial citrus, in which staff look for pests and diseases that are not present in California

## **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

### **a. Freeze Impact**

Chairman Hill discussed the freeze and noted that it is too early to determine the entire impact. He poled Committee members from the different regions of the state to get a feel for the extent of the impact. Craig Armstrong from the Coachella Valley area of Riverside County reported that there was very little damage in lemons, but one grove showed close to 40% damage. Mark McBroom noted that he did not have fruit damage in any of his Imperial County groves, but that he had some leaf burn. John Gless from Riverside County reported no freeze damage. Gus Gunderson from Ventura County noted that there was very little damage. Link Leavens expressed that Monterey County lemons are showing 10 to 15 percent damage. Kevin Severns and Kevin Olsen reported that there is potential of 10 to 30 percent freeze damage to oranges, both navel and Valencia, but noted that damage areas are scattered. George McEwen reported that his groves in Exeter have done well so far. The Committee discussed the potential impact to revenues; Bob Felts asked if CDFA was monitoring field juice and what is going in the bins. Joel Nelsen reminded the Committee that the assessments are projected based on tree crop, not juice.

### **b. Sweet Orange Scab Update**

Nick Condos, CDFA Plant Health Director presented information about the recent sweet orange scab (SOS) finds. On October 10<sup>th</sup> SOS was found in Winterhaven in Imperial County. The finds were the result of an intensified citrus commodity survey. When the initial find was confirmed by USDA the Department communicated with the County Agricultural Commissioner, USDA and industry representatives to develop a plan of action. The original plan was to propose a 5-mile quarantine area around Winterhaven. The feeling was that with the vast amount of space separating Winterhaven from other citrus producing areas 5-mile quarantine would be sufficient; however the statewide citrus commodity survey was not complete at that point. Subsequent SOS finds were confirmed in Blythe (Riverside County) and on the campus of CalPoly Pomona (Los Angeles County). Two additional finds were also confirmed in Calipatria (Imperial County). At this point the smallest quarantine area that can be proposed is Imperial, Riverside and Los Angeles (entire) counties. Nick reminded the Committee that in every other state where SOS has been found, nothing less than a full state quarantine has been considered. Once an SOS find is confirmed, a targeted survey of all citrus nurseries and 50 meters around each nursery must be completed, Nick provided an estimate for the targeted survey which would cost approximately \$380,000 dollars, take about 2 months to complete and would involve redirecting staff from high risk HLB survey. The lab will also be impacted with 45,000 to 48,000 additional samples, each one costing approximately \$35 dollars. The lab capacity also creates a challenge as other samples must be processed as well. This may create a lag in processing time. Additional regulatory resources would be required to quarantine the 3 counties. Nick estimated the amount required to implement and maintain a 3 county SOS quarantine would be \$1.2 million annually. Another item to consider is that the CDFA would have to pursue the quarantine with regular rule making and to that the CDFA would have to seek CEQA compliance for the quarantine activities. This will most likely be a lengthy process. Nick provide an alternate option which would be to not quarantine the Counties with SOS finds, but rather quarantine the entire state.

### **c. Science Advisory Panel Preliminary Report**

Jason Leathers reported that the ACP/HLB Ad-Hoc Science Advisory Panel (SAP) met in person on December 3 – 4, 2013 to answer a set of questions that had been vetted through the CPDPC. The SAP answered the questions presented to them and made several additional recommendations. The SAP recommended that the current Tulare County quarantine should be expanded as the pattern of ACP finds indicates an established population or populations. The SAP was concerned about the current HLB quarantine and also recommended training HLB survey crews at frequent intervals, taking more HLB samples and conducting the risk based survey at the right time of the year. The SAP felt that validating the sensitivity of non PCR methods of HLB detection is a priority. The Risk based survey should be expanded to commercial citrus and the Hacienda Heights area. There was concern that fruit leaving from Southern California and Coastal California moving into the SJV needs greater cleaning. Jason also went over what was recommended for area-wide treatments as well as urban areas and organic treatments. The SAP also developed a matrix for nursery stock movement. The SAP has created a draft report that is currently circulating through the panel members. Once the SAP has reviewed the draft, the CDFA will review it and it will be routed to Secretary Ross. Once the Secretary has reviewed the SAP report it will be shared with the CPDPC.

### **d. Regional ACP Management (Grower Liaisons)**

Craig Hanes reported that interviews for the Statewide Coordinator and the Tulare II Grower Liaison were held on January 7<sup>th</sup>, the candidates were all very qualified. The Executive Committee will be making a final decision on both positions in the next week and hope to have the Statewide Coordinator in place by February 1<sup>st</sup>. He also reported that the San Bernardino and Santa Barbara Grower Liaisons have been selected and are in the process of being placed. There will be several Grower Liaison meetings later in the month.

## **ORGANIC CITRUS UPDATE**

### **a. National Organic Program**

Mark Lipson presented a PowerPoint and introduced himself to the Committee. Mark is the Organic Policy Advisor for the Secretary of Agriculture serves in the Marketing and Regulatory programs at USDA. He gave an overview of the programs and their duties. He first introduced The National Organic Program which works to implement the federal Foods Production Act, manages regulations, and has oversight of agents who are third parties to the department and producers which are audited regularly by UDSA. He then discussed the Compliance and Enforcement Program which handles labeling and certification. Lastly, he talked about the National Organic Standards Board. Mark explained the organic certification process and introduced the California State Organic Program to the Committee and discussed their duties as well. There is a USDA strategic plan objective for organic growth. The emphasis has been on trade, rural development, and science and education.

### **b. Review of Organic Protocol Data**

Scott Mabs, CEO of homegrown organic farms represents a number of organic citrus growers, including growers that have been in ACP find areas and eradication zones. Organics have grown significantly due to consumers requests, but if things continue as they are, there will be no organic citrus in the future. Growers spend extra money to have organic industry and if ACP is detected, they will have to spray and will no longer be organic. There needs to be a solution that will work. Scott gave an update regarding organic research that has been conducted and was happy to report that several organic insecticides look very promising. There is a way to control ACP organically and treatment frequency is very important to the success of organic options. Scott urged the Committee to put together a subcommittee or working group to organic treatment protocols. He would like to see several options presented to the Committee at the next meeting.

## **CITRUS NURSERY UPDATE**

Roger Smith with TreeSource presented information about some of the challenges that are facing the nursery industry. He mentioned that there are three nurserymen that sit on this Committee but each of them has different priorities, based on their business. He mentioned that it might appear the fruit & nursery are cross purposes of each other, but they should be working together. TreeSource has adjusted their operation to move everything under protective structures, which has been very costly and has caused them to reduce their production by approximately 40 percent. Roger invited the Committee members to see how his nursery is run and he closed his talk with the statement that without changes and regulations the nursery industry will be stuck not being able to ship nursery stock.

## **CDFA REPORTS**

### **a. Treatment and Trapping Update**

Tina Galindo reported on the activities in Southern California stating that crews are currently working in Ventura County. Treatment crews are finishing up in Santa Paula. There was a recent detection in Ojai in a residential tree; crews will start treating the Ojai area. The first area-wide treatments in Riverside and in San Bernardino Counties were completed. ACP detections have increased in the Calexico area in Imperial County. Treatment began there on January 06, 2014. In San Diego County, there were new detections in Otay Mesa and San Ysidro with public meetings pending in those areas. Crews are retreating Hacienda Heights HLB quarantine area with foliar a treatment.

Art Gilbert reported that there have been five new finds in the Richgrove area of Tulare County. Delimitation traps have been placed for all of the finds and the area is being looked at very intensively. These finds are all associated with organic citrus that has not been treated yet. In addition to these finds, two more finds were confirmed at separate juice plants in Tulare County, the program is assessing the finds to determine if they are regulatory incidents.

### **b. Commercial Grove Trapping Update**

Art Gilbert presented a PowerPoint on commercial grove trapping. In several areas, the program has transitioned from trapping to psyllid collection. In northern San Diego County there are a total of 1,098 ACP collection sites (many of which are repeats). There have been 4,698 adult psyllids collected, and 2,607 nymphs collected as of January 02, 2014. There were also a few suggestions made to improve the trapping in San Joaquin Valley. Art suggested several efficiencies including changing the trap placement technique, relocating traps closer to human activity, filling in voids with additional traps, reducing trap numbers and extending the trapping cycle, etc. The SAP has suggested CDFA change the survey from every three months to every six months as well as keeping nymphs and adults in the same vile, and limiting the survey of every tree to two minutes.

### **c. HLB Survey**

Magally Luque-Williams reviewed the HLB survey, discussing the efficiencies that have been implemented since the visit with Dr. Gottwald on December 4<sup>th</sup>. The program has made several adjustments to the survey, which will allow staff to cover more ground in less time. The survey staff will not be counting psyllids, but collecting what they see and pooling adult psyllids from all trees on each property. They will only be collecting symptomatic plant tissue and will no longer be drawing maps of the property. These efficiencies will allow the staff to complete the 1<sup>st</sup> cycle started in 2012 this February. The survey will be done in two cycles per year allowing for staff to see more trees and to see trees during different times of the year.

Tina gave an update on the Hacienda Heights protocol that was recommended and approved by the Committee. She reminded the Committee that the Hacienda Heights area is divided into three

zones. In Zone 1 plant tissue is collected from every host plant (100%) within a minimum of 400 meters, every other month or 6 times per year for 2 years and staff will collect both adult psyllids and nymphs if present. In Zone 2, which is 400-800 meters, staff will survey and collect a tissue sample from 100% of the host plants by combining 4 host plants in one PCR sample. The survey will be conducted every 4 months and if psyllids are present they will be collected (both adults and nymphs). In Zone 3, 800 meters to 1.2 kilometers staff will survey 50% of the host plants twice per year. They will collect plant samples by pooling 4 host plants per sample, at a frequency of twice per year. If present, collect psyllids (both adults and nymphs). Tina reported that Dr. Gottwald felt that we are over sampling and that he will prepare an alternate survey protocol for the Hacienda Heights area.

MaryLou Polek discussed the studies being conducted at the UC Davis Containment facility to validate the early detection techniques. There is good preliminary data that supports the various protocols being tested. The Committee discussed the alternate sampling techniques that are being studied and made a recommendation to fund additional research.

**Motion:** To fund high throughput analysis of haunglongbing samples by the University of California (UC), Davis in the amount \$165,000.

First: Richard Bennett

Second: Mark McBroom

Motion Passes: All in favor

#### **d. Regulatory Program Update**

Victoria reported that for FY 2013/2014, the CRRP funding for regulatory activities is approximately \$1.25 million. CDFA is going to reevaluate that amount and see if one or two CASS employees can return, specifically in the Central Valley and possibly one or two CASS employees in Southern California as well. There will be more information forthcoming at the next CPDPC meeting in March.

### **OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Operations Subcommittee Chair Jim Gorden was not present therefore Link Leavens provided a summary on Jim's behalf for the Subcommittee meeting that was held on December 11, 2013 in Visalia, California.

#### **a. Biocontrol Program Update**

Mike Pitcairn provided a PowerPoint presentation to the Committee. There were a total of 238,000 Tamarixia released in 2013. Mike also went over the amount of Tamarixia released by County. The existing protocol was that Tamarixia were not released unless there were living ACP found on the tree which is why some Counties had fewer releases than others. However, the program is shifting to a new protocol for 2014 called a grid-based release in which we will not need to check if ACP is on the tree. There were a total of 645 sites visited in 2013, 499 of which were new sites. Releases occurred at 524 sites. Tamarixia activity was identified at 81 sites (adult wasps or ACP nymphs with exit holes). Mike gave updates on the greenhouse production for Mt. Rubidoux, the harvest of the second generation has begun there and there is currently 120 cages now operating, with the intent to add 200 additional cages. The greenhouses at Cal Poly Pomona are pending approval to begin construction.

The next Biocontrol task force meeting is scheduled for January 14, 2014. Mark Hoddle has submitted a report detailing the results of safety testing for *Diaphorocyrtus*, which is currently under review at USDA.

Greg Simmons reported that there was an article in the *Citrograph* and encouraged everyone to review that. He is currently working with Arizona as well as it is important to work with states that are boarder California. He is also working with FAR and reminded the Committee that FAR insectaries are rearing ACP and *Tamarixia*.

#### **b. Laboratory Updates**

Luci gave an update on behalf of the CDFA laboratory. There were a total of 45,844 (plant and ACP samples) tested in 2013. About 73 percent of the plant samples came from the Hacienda Heights area, 8 percent from high risk areas, and 19 percent from quarantine areas, border stations, and other miscellaneous areas. Before the holiday break lab staff met with Dr. Slupsky's lab and worked to prep 600 samples that they selected for the study, most from zone 1 and 2 in the Hacienda Heights area. CDFA's lab has been in contact with Dr. Slupsky's lab on monthly basis to ensure they have the samples they need.

Cynthia LeVesque reported that CRB's lab has tested 15,517 ACP samples since March of 2013 all of which were negative for HLB. There were 2,646 nursery samples tested which were negative for HLB as well. Cynthia reviewed the current staff which is supported through CPDPC's budget.

#### **OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Outreach Subcommittee Chair Kevin Olsen provided a summary of the Subcommittee meetings that were held on December 11, 2013 in Visalia, California.

**Motion:** To approve the appointment of the CPDPC Outreach Subcommittee. The Subcommittee will consist of 10 members: Chairman Kevin Olsen, Vice Chairman Dan Dreyer, Gus Gunderson, Aaron Dillon, Steve Birdsall, Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell, George McEwen, Kevin Severns, Mark McBroom, and Shirley Kirkpatrick.

First: Craig Armstrong

Second: John Gless

Motion Passes: All in favor

#### **2012/13 Outreach Activities**

Alyssa Houtby with California Citrus Mutual (CCM) and Teresa Siles with Nuffer, Smith and Tucker (NST) introduced themselves to the Committee. They have been proactive in putting together a budget in case it is needed for the freeze. Bob Atkins discussed that CRB has encouraged the removal of trees in Hacienda Heights are and they have voluntary removed those. Bob Atkins encourages the Committee to implement voluntary tree removal outreach. There is a contract in place now with NST and CCM is a subcontractor. Steve Lyle, CDFA's public information's officer and Jay Van Ryan introduced themselves to the Committee as well.



Teresa gave the Committee a recap report on the outreach that has been done for FY 2013. Discussed were English and Spanish media relations, the Asian media events, media trainings, public service announcements, radio news releases, packing house outreach, and grower website and newsletters, and the outcomes of all of those. The Committee was very pleased with the activities that NST has participated in.

#### **REPORT FROM CHRP COUNCIL**

Joel Nelsen gave an update on the CHRP council and reported that the CCM Citrus Showcase will be held on March 6<sup>th</sup>. He also reported that senior USDA staff will be in visiting on January 23<sup>rd</sup> to discuss the formation of a Multiagency Cooperative and additional federal funds that will support research projects.

#### **CRB REPORT**

Ken Keck gave the Committee an update on the CRB staff report. Brian Taylor with CRB has been in contact with Dr. Gottwald in regards to the transect survey and is working on improving that. There will be samples for Dr. Slupsky as well as the other innovative early detection methods.

#### **OTHER ITEMS**

Victoria reported on the “warning letter” based on the PCA’s recommendations in Santa Barbara that stated that all citrus on the central coast is in bloom all year. She spoke to staff in Santa Barbara and asked them to make warning letters language as specific as possible for each instance rather than making vague statements and they stated they would speak with their staff to have the language reflect specific incidents and specific timing. Victoria has also reached out to DPR in regards to the labeling. DPR is in the process of sending out letters to pesticide registrants to initiate the submission of revised labels. She will follow up by attending the upcoming Pest Risk Evaluation Committee meeting later this month.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:00pm. The next meeting will be held in Ontario, California on March 12, 2014 at 10:00 a.m.