

CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, April 12, 2022

Committee Members Present:

Craig Armstrong	John C. Gless	Rod Radtke
Kevin Ball*	Jim Gorden*	Gregorio Rundini
Brad Carmen	Mark McBroom	Roger Smith
Aaron Dillon	Jared Plumlee*	Keith Watkins
Bob Felts Jr.	Dr. Etienne Rabe	

Committee Members Absent:

Franco Bernardi	John J. Gless	Roger Smith
-----------------	---------------	-------------

California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) Staff:

Fernando Berber	Sara Khalid*	Briana Russell*
Karina Chu*	Lucita Kumagai*	Michael Soltero*
Kiana Dao*	Magally Luque-Williams*	Heather Scheck*
Paul Figueroa*	Zachary McCormack*	Patty Tran*
Alisha Garcia*	Dr. David Morgan*	ThuyVy Truong*
David Gutierrez	Keith Okasaki*	Nilan Watmore
Victoria Hornbaker	Lea Pereira*	Jason Wu*
Laura Irons*		

Guests:

Price Adams*	Dr. Subhas Hajeri*	Mia Neunzig*
Teri Blaser*	Jason Kilian*	Sandra Olkowski*
Michael Bliss*	Melinda Klein	Margaret O'Neill*
Sam Botkin	Lee Dinh*	Paige Shewmaker*
Casey Creamer	Jessica Leslie*	Cressida Silvers*
Natalie DeAngelo*	Jasmine Lopez*	Leigh Sitler*
Rick Dunn	Weiqi Luo*	Jacob Villagomez*
Lisa Finke*	Marcy Martin	Helene Wright*
Ariana Gehrig*	Joey Mayorquin*	Sandra Zwaal*

**Attended the meeting virtually.*

Opening Comments

Mark McBroom called the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) meeting to order at 9:01 a.m. Mark McBroom welcomed the committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online. There was a quorum for the meeting.

Public Comments

There were no public comments.

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

The Consent agenda contained minutes from the November 9, 2022 Committee meeting and the December 1, 2022 and December 2, 2022 Committee meeting.

Motion: To approve the consent agenda as presented.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: John C. Gless

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

Mark McBroom introduced Imperial County Agricultural Commissioner Carlos Ortiz, who, prior to his retirement in March 2023, advocated for the citrus industry, partnered with the California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) and the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) in the removal of Huanglongbing (HLB) in the Mexicali Valley area.

Motion: To present a certificate of appreciation to Carlos Ortiz, Imperial County Agricultural Commissioner.

First: Dr. Etienne Rabe

Second: Craig Armstrong

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

Dr. Etienne Rabi announced that he is stepping down from his role as Vice Chairman of the CPDPC. Elections were held to back fill the Vice Chair position on the Executive Committee and Keith Watkins was nominated to fill the vacancy.

Motion: To appoint Keith Watkins as the CPDPC Vice Chairman.

First: Dr. Etienne Rabe

Second: John C. Gless

Motion Carries: The motion passed with 11 yays (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, Brad Carmen, Bob Felts, Jr., John C. Gless, Mark McBroom, Jared Plumlee, Dr. Etienne Rabe, Gregorio Rundini, Jared Plumlee, and Rod Radtke) and 2 abstentions (Aaron Dillon and Keith Watkins).

With Keith Watkins elected as Vice Chairman of the Committee, Keith announced he would be stepping down from his role as Secretary and Treasurer for the Committee.

Elections were held to back fill the Secretary/Treasurer position on the Executive Committee and Dr. Etienne Rabe was nominated to fill the vacancy.

Motion: To appoint Dr. Etienne Rabe as the CPDPC Secretary/Treasurer.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Bob Felts Jr.

Motion Carries: The motion passed with 12 yays (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, Brad Carmen, Aaron Dillon, Bob Felts, Jr., John C. Gless, Mark McBroom, Jared Plumlee, Rod Radtke, Gregorio Rundini, and Keith Watkins) and 1 abstention (Dr. Etienne Rabe).

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Review 2022/23 Budget Expenditures and Revenue

Bob Felts Jr. reported that the year-to-date total through February is \$23,878,067, which is approximately \$1,600,000 higher than the previous year.

Bob reported that 2022-23 FY revenue increased by \$4,291,900 since the January 2023 meeting bringing the total to \$5,846,013, approximately \$145,000 ahead compared to this same time the previous year.

Review Fund Condition Statement

Bob explained that the accuracy of the Fund Condition Statement (FCS) helps to determine an accurate assessment rate as well as to keep a reasonable reserve. After a meeting between Bob, Keith Watkins, Victoria Hornbaker, David Gutierrez, and Carl Baum, it was determined that the one-time \$10,000,000 award from the State General Fund that was earmarked to be allocated to CPDPD operations had been utilized while CPDPD was part of the Plant Division's Pest Detection and Emergency Projects (PDEP) Branch prior to becoming its own division. Victoria reported that the FCS \$11,000,000 credit had included this \$10,000,000 one-time award, however, the \$11,000,000 was an artificial credit for disencumbrances so that the State Financial Services could close the fiscal year. Once the fiscal year was closed, the encumbrances were placed back into the FCS, which created a wash. State Financial Services did not communicate this to Victoria or Carl. Audits have been performed by both the Budget Office and Financial Services of all money expended and received by CPDPD since becoming a division in 2018-19 FY. The audit shows that the \$10,000,000 was spent by PDEP on citrus related operations.

Victoria reported that the contingency treatment contracts in the Northern District area will be cancelled and disencumbered and that six CDFA trucks have been retrofitted with treatment rigs. Hiring has also been halted, which should yield salary savings for the year. Victoria also reminded the Committee that CPDPD received \$250,000 in emergency funds to conduct citrus canker survey in response to nursery stock received from a South Carolina nursery where citrus canker had been found. CPDPD also received \$500,000 in emergency funds for Citrus Yellow Vein Clearing Virus (CYVCV) survey work as well as an additional \$325,000 from in Citrus Health Response Program (CHRP) funding from the Federal Government for CYVCV diagnostic work.

Motion: To reconcile income and expenses for the last five years.

First: Dr. Etienne Rabe

Second: Bob Felts Jr.

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

Mark proposed that the Committee take steps to mitigate spending until all finances are reviewed and the budget is set during the Interim CPDPC meeting in June.

Motion: To hold all grower liaison contracts, potentially canceling unused contracts and disencumbering held funds, holding vacant positions until July 1, potentially cancelling CASS grove trapping contract and moving grove traps to CDFA staff or county agreements, cancelling risk survey in HLB quarantine zone and focusing on the delimitation survey, and cancelling areawide treatments in areas not meeting the minimum threshold for treatment.

First: John C. Gless

Second: Dr. Etienne Rabe

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

Victoria stated that funding for a greenhouse at California Polytechnic State University (Cal Poly) Pomona had been granted in 2015. At the time, Cal Poly was allowing CDFA to use a second greenhouse for rearing plants and not charging rent for either greenhouse. Cal Poly has since started charging CDFA \$600 in monthly rent, resulting in a \$7,200 increase to CPDPD's annual biocontrol expenditures

Discussion ensued on additional funding opportunities, including the opportunity to assess commercial nurseries.

Motion: To look at implementing an assessment on retail nursery trees sold statewide.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Rod Radtke

Motion Carries: The motion passed with 12 yays (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, Brad Carmen, Bob Felts, Jr., John C. Gless, Jim Gorden, Mark McBroom, Jared Plumlee, Dr. Etienne Rabe, Rod Radtke, Gregorio Rundini, and Keith Watkins) and 1 nay (Aaron Dillon).

OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Laboratory Update

Lucita Kumagai presented the laboratory update for the huanglongbing (HLB) testing program from the Plant Pest Diagnostics Center. She reported that in 2022 a total of 71,830 plant and 36,111 ACP samples were processed. For 2023, an average of 5,000 plant samples and 1,600 ACP samples have been tested by CRB for the months of January through March with a combined total of 19,763 samples tested by all different labs. As of March 30, 2023, there are 3,447 total detected HLB positive sites, 4,852 total detected HLB positive trees, and 706 total detected *Candidatus Liberibacter asiaticus*

(CLas). New detections were made for the first time this year in the cities of Brea, Buena Park, Stanton, Midway City, Cypress, and Los Alamitos.

Review CLas Genotyping

Lucita Kumagai presented a review of the methodology used by USDA in CLas isolates genotyping in determining genetic diversity present in the CLas positive population in Southern California. Based on the 169 CLas California isolates characterized in the study, there may be six distinct types of CLas in California. All six CLas types were detected in Los Angeles County and the six CLas types imply multiple introductions of HLB into California.

HLB Risk-based Survey

Nilan Watmore presented data for 2023 Risk Survey cycle 1. Cycle 1 2023 began in February 2023 and is 20 percent complete with 2 of the 34 allocated counties completed and 1,349 properties visited. 591 properties were sampled generating 299 entomology and 411 plant samples. Survey completion and treatment activities were heavily impacted in January through March of 2023 due to inclement weather. In addition, the decision was made to stop Cycle 1 2022 at 96 percent complete with only 47 grids left not completed due to weather related issues.

CDFA Operational Update

David Gutierrez presented the operational update including ACP and HLB delimitation survey and treatment areas for the Southern, Central, and Northern Districts.

Southern District

On January 24, a single HLB positive small lime tree was detected on a residential property in San Diego County. Survey was completed on the find site and adjacent properties surrounding this detection. A total of 15 HLB positive trees were subsequently detected in the neighborhood, which have all been removed. There were no commercial nurseries or groves within the delimitation area. Delimitation survey in the 250-meter area was completed in the first expansion with survey still ongoing in subsequent expansion areas. Delimitation survey and treatments were conducted in Orange, Los Angeles, San Bernardino, and Riverside Counties. A total of 670 HLB positive trees were detected with 337 removed in January through March with 377 trees pending removal. Treatments in San Diego along the 2-mile US/MEXICO border will be completed by mid-April.

Central District

23 total ACP were detected in Kern County, 1 ACP was detected in Madera County, 27 total ACP were detected in Monterey County, 2 total ACP were detected in San Luis Obispo County, and 5 total ACP were detected in Tulare County since the last meeting. The “no-mess” trap comparison trial was completed. Treatment is on-going for all residential detections. Ventura and Santa Barbara County treatments around commercial citrus groves were completed at the end of January. Releases of *Tamarixia radiata* are ongoing in Kern, Monterey, San Luis Obispo, and Santa Barbara Counties.

Northern District

Multi-pest risk survey is ongoing and commodity survey will be beginning. ACP detection trapping is ongoing in Placer, San Joaquin, and Stanislaus Counties. Winter trapping started early November 2022 and will continue through April 2023. ACP delimitation in Santa Clara County is ongoing with 776 traps serviced monthly. ACP delimitation survey in San Joaquin County began following a detection on December 12 with 43 traps now serviced monthly. The first ACP detection in Sonoma County occurred on December 21 with 55 delimitation traps placed and serviced monthly. All delimitation traps in Alameda County have been removed following a year with no detections. ACP treatment was conducted at 36 properties in Santa Clara County in December 2022, 2 properties in San Joaquin County in December 2022, and 4 properties in Sonoma County in January 2023. *Tamarixia* releases are ongoing in San Jose, Santa Clara County, with an average of 6,000 insects released monthly. Risk Cycle 1 2022 completed in March 2023 with 178 square miles surveyed in 24 counties. Risk Cycle 1 2023 will begin in April 2023.

Santa Clara County Update

Laura Irons presented the Santa Clara County update and reported that delimitation area 1 (Clayton North) remains at 4-square miles with one ACP detection confirmed in December 2022. Since the Committee meeting in November 2022, there have been 105 ACP detections confirmed in delimitation area 2 (Los Arboles). Delimitation trapping has been expanded by 6 square-miles in the northwest and 2-square miles added in the southwest, bringing the total delimitation area for Los Arboles to 32 square-miles. The ACP population has been observed moving both northward and southward along Main Street, Center Road, and Highway 101.

ACP Areawide Buffer Treatment Trapping Schedule

Rick Dunn proposed a reduction in the months when CASS area-wide traps are in use in Southern California. This change will permit the continued collection of ACP trap data and verification just prior to area-wide treatment of groves in the nearby Psyllid Management Areas. This change will reduce the cost of area-wide trapping with CASS staff being redirected to sampling. This should increase both the number of ACP samples collected in commercial groves and insects being tested.

Motion: To implement a reduction in Southern California grove traps per the recommendation by Rick Dunn.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Brad Carmen

Motion Carries: The motion passed with 7 yays (Kevin Ball, Brad Carmen, Aaron Dillon, Bob Felts, Jr., Jim Gorden, Gregorio Rundini, and Keith Watkins), 3 nays (Craig Armstrong, Mark McBroom, and Rod Radtke) and 2 abstentions (John C. Gless and Dr. Etienne Rabe).

CDFA Regulatory and County Agreement Update

Keith Okasaki reported that inspection numbers for this year are similar to the same time in the prior year with fewer notices of violation (NOV) and notices of proposed action (NOPA). The CPDPD Regulatory team will be holding training sessions for the counties at the end of summer to standardize enforcement in preparation for next season. An HLB working group has been looking at quarantine mitigations, reviewing exit strategies for removing counties from ACP quarantine, and reviewing and validating greenhouse breach policies. A nursery working group is looking to determine a systems approach for allowing limited nursery stock within an HLB quarantine.

Biocontrol Update

Dr. David Morgan reported that *Tamarixia* production has been slower this year than the prior year due to colder weather. Biocontrol releases have been conducted in HLB quarantine areas, borders, trade routes, areawide management, and newly established ACP find sites with 84% of releases been conducted in HLB quarantine areas.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Ethyl Formate Registration Update

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that Jim Cranney is reviewing what the United States Environmental Protection Agency is requiring for the ethyl formate registration. There is concern regarding how many treatments will occur in a selected area and if there is risk of pollution or worker safety. It has been suggested that the registrant should appoint agents in different regions to conduct treatments rather than allowing licensed growers and harvesting units to conduct their own treatments. Ethyl formate may be useful in HLB mitigation involving moving fruit from an HLB quarantine area to a packing house as a substitute for spray and move.

Neonicotinoid Risk Mitigation Update

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that the Department of Pesticide Regulation will finalize the neonicotinoid risk mitigation later this year.

Sweet Orange Scab (SOS) Regulation Update

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that CDFA continues to work on establishing an SOS quarantine regulation. Keith Okasaki reported that the 45-day comment period for SOS rulemaking closed on April 10. Dr. Melinda Klein reported that CRB is supporting work on SOS as part of their non-vector core activities, which include fruit-sampling, fungal isolations, and PCR testing. Further research is needed and the results will be reported at the next subcommittee meeting.

Science Advisory Panel (SAP) Update

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that the science subcommittee met on February 9 and on March 8 to discuss the five issues raised in the SAP report. For commercial risk-based survey, it was suggested that the residential core areas be de-emphasized in favor of border areas and residential-commercial interfaces. Keith Okasaki is working to assemble a subcommittee including Dr. Neil McRoberts, Dr. Weiqi Luo, Dr. Subhas Hajeri, Dr. Melinda Klein, and Rob Clark to discuss these comparisons and findings. For

the no-mess traps, the science subcommittee asked CDFA to compile a data set to date and report the findings on the differing CLas genotypes, which Lucita Kumagai presented. Etienne stated that he would be bringing these findings to the science subcommittee to determine if further research would yield enough benefit to the program to justify costs. For the mess grove sampling, Melinda agreed to review the methodologies currently available that have been funded by CRB and any loopholes in the research that has been done and present the findings to the science subcommittee. For the regulatory review, a regulatory working group led by Brad Carmen met to review HLB regulations, as Keith Okasaki previously reported.

Pest Control District Virtual Meeting

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that a virtual meeting was held in February with all major pest control districts to discuss commercial HLB strategies for each region. Etienne had proposed to the districts the regionalization of HLB mitigation efforts and for commercial sectors to be managed by grower boards in those regions. He requested that CPDPC staff provide a list of potential activities that may be outsourced to the pest control districts and report to the CPDPC any procedures that may be necessary for transferring these activities to the pest control districts.

OUTREACH SUBCOMITTEE REPORT

Price Adams introduced Dinh Lee as their new account coordinator for outreach support. Following recent ACP and HLB detections and quarantine expansions in Rancho Bernardo, San Diego County, Nuffer Smith Tucker (NST) conducted outreach and secured broadcasting from stations in the San Diego area. NST organized a Lunar New Year campaign. NST also conducted outreach to elected officials at the California State Association of Counties Conference, the Chino City Council and City of Buena Park. NST hosted a booth at the California Citrus Mutual Citrus Showcase with local grower liaisons and CDFA staff manning the booth. NST will be attending a Master Garden Summit in April. NST will attend the Citrus Festival at Citrus Historic Park, the National Orange Show in San Bernardino, the Citrus Association of Pest Control Advisors Spring Summit, the California Agricultural Commissioners and Sealers Association annual group meeting in Southern California, and the Southern California Association of Governments annual conference.

USDA Report

Helene Wright reported that the USDA cross-functional working group has two new members; Leo Donovan is the new National Operations Manager and Maria Acevedo Sanchez is the new Policy Manager. In mid-March, Leo visited California and toured the program's many operations and offices. The cross-functional working group is waiting to move forward with regulatory steps for CYVCV until they see results from the CDFA working group.

California Citrus Mutual (CCM) Report

Casey Creamer continues to work with members of the State Legislature to increase in funding for the program. CCM is communicating with Florida regarding how funding is being allocated to different states.

Citrus Research Board (CRB) Report

Marcy Martin reported that the UC system intends to announce the candidate to be the new integrated pest management entomologist. Once the candidate is announced, CRB will be able to determine what research to focus on within the core program. Marcy also reported that the Data Analysis and Tactical Operations Center (DATOC) project ended in September 2022. CRB has recently retained a consultant that will partner with CRB's data management department to review DATOC records and help determine the future of the project. CRB will be using the SAP report as a guide for where to make recommendations regarding future activities and operations.

Citrus Pest Detection Program (CPDP) Report

Dr. Subhas Hajeri reported that the CPDP Technical Advisory (TAC) meeting was held on January 11. CPDP plans to study and collect approximately 45,000 samples for the spring and deploy traps for ACP survey in over 2,000 locations.

OTHER ITEMS, CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT

Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) Update

Victoria stated that CDFA continues to work with the contractor to recertify the PEIR.

CYVCV Update

Victoria Hornbaker reported that a CYVCV cross-functional working group met to discuss many unknowns with California being the first state to encounter the virus. Victoria added that the virus is not known to be a tree-killer, rather it is known to decrease yield and tree vigor. All 578 positive detections in the City of Tulare and 2 positive detections in the rural area of Visalia have been on residential properties. There has been no commercial impact or concrete or observable data outside of anecdotal reports as to the behavior and impacts of the virus.

The meeting adjourned at 12:26 p.m. The next meeting will be on June 28, 2023 in Santa Clarita, California.