

CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, November 8, 2023

Committee Members Present:

Craig Armstrong	Aaron Dillon*	Etienne Rabe
Kevin Ball	John C. Gless	Rod Radtke
Franco Bernardi*	Jim Gorden*	Roger Smith*
Brad Carmen*	Mark McBroom	Keith Watkins

Committee Members Absent:

Bob Felts Jr.	Jared Plumlee
---------------	---------------

California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) Staff:

Ravneet Behla*	Luci Kumagai*	Phong, David
Fernando Berber	Zack McCormack*	Rathkiry Siv*
Kiana Dao*	Jana Miscevic*	Michael Soltero*
Ariana De La Torre*	David Morgan*	ThuyVy Truong*
Paul Figueroa	Alex Muñiz	Fabian Velasco*
David Gutierrez	Deborah Nardo	Nilan Watmore*
Victoria Hornbaker	Raymond Niem*	Jason Wu*
Sarah Kraft*		

Guests:

Price Adams	Kevin Gallego*	Sandra Olkowski*
Victor Ariaza*	Dhiraj Gautam*	Gabe Olmos*
Chris Aramouni	Sandipa Gautam*	Margaret O'Neill*
Tony Atchley*	Ariana Gehrig*	Curtis Pate
Michael Bliss*	Peter Gomez*	Abby Peltzer*
David Borchard*	Michelle Haase*	Nelson Perez*
Mike Cardney*	Rachel Johnson*	Hnayeli Sarabia
Bodil Cass	Fatemeh Khodadadi*	Tom Schott
Marty Coert*	Melinda Klein*	Cressida Silvers*
Casey Creamer	Robert Krueger*	Rayne Thompson*
Daniel Delgado*	Jessica Leslie	David Tomlinson*
Natalie DeAngelo*	Jasmine Lopez*	Steven Triplett*
John Demshki*	WeiQi Luo*	Greta Varien*
Jolene Dessert*	Marcy Martin	Jacob Villagomez*
Erik Downs	Peggy Mauk*	Judy Zaninovich*
Rick Dunn*	Kurt Metheny*	George Zhang*
John Eliot*	Ivan Milosavljevic	Sandra Zwaal*
Lisa Finke*	Mia Neunzig*	

**Attended the meeting virtually.*

Opening Comments

Mark McBroom called the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) meeting to order at 9:06 a.m. Mark McBroom welcomed the committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online. There was a quorum for the meeting.

Public Comments

Ruben Arroyo, Riverside County Agriculture Commissioner, announced his upcoming retirement in February 2024. He stated his concerns regarding fruit flies throughout California.

Victoria Hornbaker introduced Deborah Nardo, the new Supervising Environmental Scientist for the Camarillo office in the Central District of the California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Division (CPDPD). Victoria also welcomed Dr. Bodil Cass, who recently joined the University of California, Riverside.

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

The consent agenda contained the following items:

1. Minutes from the August 9, 2023 Committee meeting.

Motion: To approve the consent agenda as presented.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Etienne Rabe

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

Ventura County Vacancy

One candidate has submitted his name for election to fill the Ventura member vacancy. His resume was submitted to the Committee for review.

Motion: To elect Kurt Metheny to fill the Ventura member vacancy on the CPDPC.

First: Craig Armstrong

Second: Kevin Ball

Motion Carries: (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, Franco Bernardi, Aaron Dillon, John C. Gless, Mark McBroom, Etienne Rabe, Rod Radtke, and Keith Watkins) and 2 abstentions (Jim Gorden and Roger Smith).

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Review 2022/23 Budget Expenditures and Revenue

Keith Watkins reported that expenditures increased by \$3,090,518 in June 2023, with notable increases in huanglongbing (HLB) treatment in Southern and Central California, tree removal, and in state administrative costs. This brings the year-to-date total

expenditures to \$36,239,404 by the end of June, approximately \$200,000 higher than the previous year.

Keith reported that 2022-23 fiscal year (FY) revenue increased by approximately \$315,304 in September 2023 bringing the total revenue received to \$13,021,243 for October 2022 to September 2023. Revenue received for October 2023 was \$415,540.

2023/2024 Budget Review

Keith reported that expenditures in July 2023 was \$1,453,244, which is comparable to expenditures incurred at this same time the previous fiscal year. Expenditures increased by \$2,401,530 in August 2023 and by \$2,425,519 in September, coming to \$6,280,293 in total expenditures year-to-date. For the FY 2023-24 Clean Citrus Nursery Stock Program, the current fund balance is \$255,036 with \$7,883 revenue received, \$5,871 total expenditures, and \$10,014 reimbursements received to date for July 2023 to September 2023, for a current balance of \$267,062.

OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Laboratory Update

Lucita Kumagai presented the laboratory update for the huanglongbing testing program from the Plant Pest Diagnostics Center. She reported that as of October 2023, the lab has received an average of 6,700 plant samples per month and should reach an approximate total of 80,000 plant samples in 2023. The lab also received an average of 850 ACP samples per month, which is significantly lower in comparison to the monthly averages of previous years. However, the number of ACP samples did increase from 348 samples received in September 2023 to 1,290 samples received in October 2023. As of October 2023, a total of 75,124 combined plant and ACP samples were received and tested for HLB. As of November 3, 2023, there were 4,506 total reported HLB positive sites, 6,790 total detected HLB positive trees, and 759 total detected *Candidatus Liberibacter asiaticus* (CLAs) positive ACP samples with 70 percent of all HLB positive trees having been detected in Orange County.

HLB Risk-based Survey

David Phong presented data for 2023 Risk Survey Cycle 2. Cycle 2 2023 began in August 2023 and is 22 percent complete with 5 of the 34 allocated counties completed. 2,287 properties were visited and 284 properties sampled generating 104 entomology and 208 plant samples.

Southern California Sentinel Survey

David Phong presented a summary of the four survey types (commodity survey, sentinel survey, multi pest survey, and HLB delimitation survey). David recommended that by discontinuing sentinel surveys, CDFA will retain year-round survey coverage and may then focus resources on broader and more intensive surveys throughout Southern California, such as commodity and multi-pest (risk) survey.

Motion: To conclude the Southern California sentinel grove survey, with staff presenting a hybrid sentinel survey model at the next full CPDPC meeting.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Jim Gorden

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

CDFA Operational Update

David Gutierrez presented the operational update including ACP and HLB delimitation survey and treatment areas for the Southern, Central, and Northern Districts.

Southern District

To date in 2023, a total of 2,460 HLB positive trees have been detected in Southern California with the majority of detections found in Orange County. An adult CLas positive ACP was detected in a residential grove in Valley Center, San Diego County. CDFA staff have conducted perimeter survey of the find-site and adjacent groves with more than 225 plant samples and 77 insect samples submitted to the lab and pending confirmation. Delimitation survey of the 250-meter area is still ongoing. Seven public meetings were held to conduct delimitation survey in different areas of Los Angeles, Orange, Riverside, San Bernardino, and San Diego Counties. A total of 937 trees were removed during the months of August 2023 through October 2023 with 535 cumulative trees still pending removal in these counties.

Central District

On October 17, 2023, one ACP detection was confirmed on a residential property in Fresno County. Treatment for this area was completed on November 2, 2023. On October 19, 2023, one ACP detection was confirmed on a residential property in Kern County. Treatment for this area completed on October 24, 2024 with one additional residential detection confirmed October 31, 2024. *Tamarixia* releases were conducted in Fresno and Kern Counties near the recent detections and the Santa Paula HLB delimitation boundary. Multi-pest survey and citrus commodity survey are ongoing.

Northern District

There have been no new treatments in Santa Clara County since December 2022. Since the last meeting, no changes have been made to the delimitation trapping areas in San Joaquin and Sonoma Counties. The delimitation traps have been set up for nearly one year and will be converted to detection traps between December 2023 and January 2024. There were 8 ACP detections confirmed on residential properties in Santa Clara County within the existing delimitation area. Detection trapping is ongoing in Placer, San Joaquin, and Stanislaus Counties. *Tamarixia* releases are ongoing in San Jose, Santa Clara County, with an average of 6,000 insects released per month.

Ventura County Detections

Jennifer Willems presented an update regarding recent HLB positive trees detected in Santa Paula, Ventura County. On September 19, 2023, one CLas positive ACP was confirmed on a residential property in Santa Paula. Since the initial detection, five additional CLas positive ACP samples have been confirmed. On September 27, 2023, one HLB positive tree was detected on a residential property with commercial citrus within 1 mile of the treatment boundary. As of November 3, 2023, 48 total HLB positive trees have been detected. CDFA staff have removed 25 of the HLB positive trees with the remaining trees located on 29 properties. Due to subsequent detections, the HLB

delimitation and treatment area has expanded four times and the 5-mile HLB quarantine boundary has expanded once.

CDFA Regulatory and County Agreement Update

Keith Okasaki presented the regulatory county monthly activity report for October 2022 through September 2023. Counties were able to increase the number of inspections conducted compared to the previous year. The new agreement period began in October 2023 and includes inspections of farm labor contractors as a reimbursable activity.

HLB Mitigation Discussion

Keith presented three proposals for reducing the mitigation requirements for growers in an HLB quarantine area. The three proposals include reducing the following mitigation requirements 1) within contiguous HLB quarantine zones, 2) to non-contiguous HLB quarantine zones, and 3) out of an HLB quarantine zone).

Motion: To remove the mitigation requirement to move fruit from a grove to processor in a contiguous HLB quarantine area.

First: Dr. Etienne Rabe

Second: Kevin Ball

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

Motion: To reduce the requirement for two mitigations to one mitigation to move fruit from an HLB quarantine to a non-contiguous HLB quarantine for processing.

First: Dr. Etienne Rabe

Second: Mark McBroom

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

Motion: To reduce the requirement for two mitigations to one mitigation to move fruit from an HLB quarantine for processing outside the HLB quarantine but within the same county.

First: Dr. Etienne Rabe

Second: John C. Gless

Motion Carries: The motion passed with 7 yays (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, John C. Gless, Jim Gorden, Mark McBroom, Etienne Rabe, and Rod Radke) and two nays (Aaron Dillon and Keith Watkins).

Biocontrol Update

Grace Radabaugh reported that a total of 1,951,170 *Tamarixia* have been released in 2023 with the majority of those releases occurring in HLB detection areas, along the border, on trade routes, and in new ACP detection areas.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Ethyl Formate Registration

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that the registrant has responded to the deficiency letter and is waiting for review by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency.

Sweet Orange Scab Regulation Update

Keith reported that the sweet orange scab (SOS) interior quarantine became effective on October 2, 2023. CDFA established 5-mile SOS quarantines in the Calipatria and Winterhaven areas of Imperial County, the Santa Ana area of Orange County, the Pomona, San Gabriel, and Whittier areas of Los Angeles and San Bernardino Counties, and the Riverside and Blythe areas of Riverside County.

Risk Based Survey Working Group Recommendation

Dr. Ram Uckoo and Keith presented the recommendation proposed by the Risk-Based Survey Working Group and supported by the Science Subcommittee. The working group proposed focusing residential survey efforts within 1,500 meters of commercial citrus greater than 5 acres, which allows staff to survey all grids within this proposed area approximately every 2 years.

Motion: To prioritize Southern California residential survey in areas within 1,500 meters of commercial citrus greater than 5 acres.

First: Dr. Etienne Rabe

Second: Keith Watkins

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

Regulatory Working Group Update

Keith provided an update from the regulatory working group. The Science Advisory Panel (SAP) recommended CDFA convene a regulatory working group to evaluate quarantine requirements. Keith provided an update from that working group. He stated that discussions were held regarding:

1. HLB quarantine mitigations – Nothing further to report.
2. Exit strategy to lift an ACP quarantine – Removing an area from quarantine requires USDA concurrence. CDFA submitted regulatory packages to USDA in 2016 and 2019 to remove areas from quarantine. The packages cited the program's comprehensive pest report and negative trap and survey data. USDA denied the requests.
3. Requirement to safeguard fruit in transit – Keith presented data showing ACP detections along corridors within 1 and 2 miles from citrus highways in the non-generally infested area, before and after 4/1/2017 when the safeguarding requirement was implemented. Significantly fewer ACP have been detected along corridors since safeguarding was required showing the safeguarding is effective.
4. Reviewing and validating greenhouse breach policies – The working group, with the California Risk Assessment Team, created a greenhouse breach risk model guide. The guide will be made available to nurseries to know what regulatory implications may be expected in a breach event.

OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Price Adams reported that Nuffer, Smith, Tucker (NST) assembled a Crisis Management Team to help facilitate key messages and press release development regarding the recent HLB positive detections in Ventura County. Media outreach was also conducted to notify residential homeowners of the new detections, the potential impacts for the citrus industry, and the current state of ACP and HLB in California. NST has also been proactive regarding outreach in Kern County and has implemented the placement of an op-ed in the Bakersfield Californian, bylined by Keith Watkins, English and Spanish radio advertising, billboard placement in South Bakersfield, a Valley Ag Voices Advertorial and half-page advertisement, and a Univision Central Valley interview. Hyperlocal outreach was conducted in the city of Los Angeles, encouraging residents to cooperate with agricultural officials and to be vigilant when inspecting their trees for HLB. NST and CDFA staffed a booth at the Ventura County Fair Citrus Day Celebration. Multicultural outreach was conducted during Hispanic Heritage Month with a campaign of radio advertising, editorial placement, a Press Day interview with CDFA's Alex Muñiz, and advertorial content development on ACP and HLB. Following the recommendation from the SAP, NST has been developing an "HLB in a Grove" guide video that will provide a high-level overview of regulatory requirements in the event of a positive plant sample in a grove. Attendees from over 25 different organizations attended Spanish-language "Train-the-Trainer" workshops in Santa Paula and Exeter. Information and shareable content was distributed to 344 elected officials via email. A Citrus Hero award was also presented to Buena Park city officials and staff. NST also garnered over 100 engagements with elected officials at the California League of Cities Conference after sending out a pre-conference eBlast to 62 cities and 565 individual contacts. NST will also have a presence at the upcoming California State Association of Counties in Oakland from November 14-16.

California Citrus Mutual (CCM) Report

Casey Creamer reported that Federal Citrus Health Response Program (CHRP) funding must move through appropriations and that the agricultural bill did not pass this process. The Senate has passed their version of the bill, but the House has not. After expiring on September 30, 2023, the farm bill has been delayed. CHRP funding has received a one-year extension with an additional \$25,000,000. Casey continues to work with the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) to perform reallocation of CHRP agreements so that more funding comes to California. At the state level, a modified bill to ban imidacloprid was supported by the Department of Pesticide Regulation (DPR). While imidacloprid is still being used in the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Program (CPDPP) and commercial growers can continue to use imidacloprid when responding to a federally actionable pest, like ACP.

Citrus Research Board (CRB) Report

Marcy Martin reported that CRB has been working to allocate HLB MAC funding in the promotion of citrus research and trials field (CRaFT) projects. They have signed up 13 new field sites and additional mitigation as part of the CRaFT. She also stated that the

application window for additional multi-year funding will be opening soon. Additionally, Marcy noted that registration for the International Research Conference on HLB, held on March 26-29, 2024 in Riverside, California, is now open.

Citrus Pest Detection Program (CPDP) Report

Dr. Subhas Hajeri reported that the CPDP plans to deploy a total of 4,800 traps throughout 2,400 locations in the Central Valley. He will be working with David Phong to review data and reduce redundancy of trap deployments. As part of the Joint Powers Agreement for the Central California Tristeza Eradication Agency and the CPDP, the agency has been rebranded as the Alliance of Pest Control Districts to better align with the implementation of multi-pest survey and regional cooperation and coordination efforts.

OTHER ITEMS, CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT

Fruit Fly Update

Erik Downs, Riverside County Deputy Agricultural Commissioner provided an update on the Oriental fruit fly (OFF) quarantine in Riverside and San Bernardino Counties to invited citrus growers. Victoria noted that CPDPD staff are assisting in the response to the OFF quarantine and to the other invasive fruit fly quarantine areas, including Tau fly and Mediterranean fruit fly in Los Angeles County and Queensland fruit fly in Ventura County.

Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) Update

Victoria reported that Plant Division, Peirce's Disease Control Board and the CPDPD are meeting regularly with the contractor that is revising the PEIR and making progress. Workshops will be held with other agencies to move the draft PEIR along.

Citrus Yellow Vein Clearing Virus (CYVCV) Update

Victoria reported that the California CYVCV working group and the USDA cross functional working group have agreed on the regulatory framework for CYVCV. The regulatory framework was shared and the Committee recommended initiating the regular rule making process.

Motion: To authorize CDFA to initiate the rulemaking process for a CYVCV quarantine to be presented to the CPDPC at the next meeting.

First: Kevin Ball

Second: Rod Radtke

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

HLB Prevalence and Positivity Rate

Dr. Weiqi Luo presented a report covering the estimated prevalence and positivity rate of HLB in Southern California. Under the assumption of there being approximately 100 trees per acre, that would result in a total of 6,050,032 residential trees and 6,310,100 commercial trees in Southern California with the distribution of these trees being concentrated near the coastal areas of Los Angeles, Orange, and San Diego Counties.

HLB has been detected in residential areas across 5 counties in Southern California (Riverside, San Bernardino, Orange, Los Angeles, and San Diego Counties) at a rate that has increased substantially from 2012 to 2022.

The meeting adjourned at 2:22 p.m. The next meeting will be on February 21, 2023 in Ventura, California.