

CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, August 9, 2023

Committee Members Present:

| | | |
|-----------------|---------------|---------------|
| Kevin Ball* | Bob Felts Jr. | Etienne Rabe* |
| Franco Bernardi | John C. Gless | Rod Radtke |
| Brad Carmen | Jim Gorden | Roger Smith |
| Aaron Dillon | Mark McBroom | Keith Watkins |

Committee Members Absent:

| | | |
|-----------------|------------|---------------|
| Craig Armstrong | John Gless | Jared Plumlee |
|-----------------|------------|---------------|

California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) Staff:

| | | |
|--------------------|----------------|-------------------|
| Carl Baum* | Anmol Joshi | David Phong* |
| Ravneet Behla* | Sarah Kraft* | Michael Soltero* |
| Fernando Berber | Luci Kumagai* | Heather Scheck* |
| Kiana Dao* | Daniel Lee* | Patty Tran* |
| Paul Figueroa* | David Morgan* | Fabian Velasco |
| David Gutierrez | Alex Muñiz* | Nilan Watmore |
| Victoria Hornbaker | Lauren Murphy | Jennifer Willems* |
| Laura Irons* | Keith Okasaki* | Jason Wu* |

Guests:

| | | |
|-------------------|-------------------------|-------------------|
| Price Adams | Jason Kilian* | Margaret O'Neill* |
| Michael Bliss* | Melinda Klein | Curtis Pate* |
| Melissa Cregan* | Mark Lee* | Cressida Silvers* |
| Natalie DeAngelo* | Jessica Leslie* | Leigh Sitler* |
| Daniel Delgado* | Jasmine Lopez* | Jacob Villagomez* |
| Rick Dunn | Karen Lowerison* | Frank Wagoner* |
| Mary Easton* | Weiqi Luo* | Karen Westerman* |
| Lisa Finke | Magally Luque-Williams* | Helene Wright* |
| Michael Frantz* | Marcy Martin | Qijun Xiang* |
| Ariana Gehrig* | Mia Neunzig* | Judy Zaninovich |
| Subhas Hajeri* | Sandra Olkowski* | Sandra Zwaal* |
| Logan Henderson* | | |

**Attended the meeting virtually.*

Opening Comments

Mark McBroom called the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) meeting to order at 9:06 a.m. Mark McBroom welcomed the committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online. There was a quorum for the meeting.

Public Comments

Judy Zaninovich stated that while the glassy-winged sharpshooter (GWSS) is not considered a disease vector for citrus in California, because GWSS tends to collect on young citrus trees, it has been a priority for the Pierce's Disease Control Program to treat all citrus located near grape vineyards. These treatments also help to suppress the spread of Asian citrus psyllid (ACP). Pierce's Disease Program does not currently receive the funding to treat high-population areas where GWSS has been detected. Funding has been level for the past few years although costs continue to increase, thus, there are less acres that can be treated.

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

The consent agenda contained the following items:

1. Minutes from the June 28, 2023 Committee meeting.
2. 2023-2024 CPDPC Committee and Subcommittee meeting calendars.
3. Memorandum of Understanding between the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Division and the Central California Tristeza Eradication Agency.
4. CPDPC member term renewals for Brad Carmen, John C. Gless and Jared Plumlee.

Motion: To approve the consent agenda as presented.

First: Jim Gorden

Second: John C. Gless

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Review 2022/23 Budget Expenditures and Revenue

Bob Felts Jr. reported that expenditures increased by \$3,077,720 in May and \$3,090,518 in June, with an increase in Huanglongbing (HLB) treatment in Southern California of \$777,894 in May and \$718,603 in June and in state administrative costs of \$361,077 in May and \$512,896 in June. This brings the year-to-date total expenditures to \$33,148,887 by the end of May, approximately \$1,000,000 higher than the previous year, and \$36,239,404 by the end of June, approximately \$200,000 higher than the previous year.

Bob reported that 2022-23 FY revenue increased by approximately \$2,100,000 since the June 2023 meeting bringing the total to \$11,690,133, approximately \$1,000,000 ahead compared to this same time the previous year.

2023/2024 Budget Adjustment Review

Bob explained that Victoria and staff have reduced the CPDPC 2023/2024 Fiscal Year (FY) budget to \$43,700,000. There are also several proposed budget cuts that will help to further reduce the budget to achieve the \$41,500,000 target budget requested by the Committee. The budget for grove trapping, outreach, and data analysis are under review.

Victoria Hornbaker reported that changes to HLB delimitation survey and treatment operations in Southern California have been implemented, refocusing survey efforts from residential core areas around detections to detections on the leading edge and near commercial groves.

Victoria explained that grove trapping in Southern California was previously removed in favor of a bi-annual sentinel tree survey for ACP. David Phong gave a presentation covering a plan to reduce the redundancy of grove trapping operations in the Central Valley and Northern California, the program was able to show that using existing detection traps and GWSS traps would provide adequate coverage and the Cooperative Agricultural Support Services Authority (CASS) grove traps can be removed to reduce redundancy and cost.

Motion: To reduce the 2023/2024 Committee budget by \$2,000,000 with reductions to grove trapping, statewide survey, and outreach.

First: Jim Gorden

Second: John C. Gless

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

Set the 2023/2024 Assessment Rate

Bob presented the projected crop estimate for 2023/2024. The National Agricultural Statistics Service FY 2023/24 crop estimate comes to a projected total of 180,400,000 projected cartons of citrus fruit. Using a figure of \$0.09 would generate an estimated revenue of \$16,236,000.

Motion: To set the assessment rate at \$0.09, effective October 1, 2023.

First: John C. Gless

Second: Jim Gorden

Motion Carries: The motion passed with 10 yays (Kevin Ball, Franco Bernardi, Brad Carmen, Bob Felts Jr., John C. Gless, Jim Gorden, Mark McBroom, Rod Radtke, Roger Smith, and Keith Watkins) and 1 abstention (Aaron Dillon).

OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Laboratory Update

Lucita Kumagai presented the laboratory update for the huanglongbing (HLB) testing program from the Plant Pest Diagnostics Center. She reported that in 2023, the year began with an average of 5,000 plant samples and 2,000 ACP samples received in January, increasing to an average of 10,000 plant samples and decreasing to an

average of 400 ACP samples received in May and June. She estimates that with rising temperatures, ACP samples received are likely to increase in August. As of July 2023, a total of 53,625 combined plant and ACP samples were received. As of August 4, 2023, there are 4,087 total detected HLB positive sites, 6,009 total detected HLB positive trees, and 719 total detected *Candidatus Liberibacter asiaticus* (CLAs) positive ACP samples with 70 percent of all HLB positive trees having been detected in Orange County.

HLB Risk-based Survey

David Phong presented data for 2023 Risk Survey cycle 1. Cycle 1 2023 began in February 2023 and is 70 percent complete with 25 of the 41 allocated counties completed and 10,649 properties visited. 2,936 properties were sampled generating 943 entomology and 2,344 plant samples.

CDFA Operational Update

David Gutierrez presented the operational update including ACP and HLB delimitation survey and treatment areas for the Southern, Central, and Northern Districts.

Southern District

A total of 39 HLB positive trees have been detected in Rancho Bernardo, San Diego County. All trees have been removed and disposed in local landfills. Delimitation survey and treatments have been completed. Final abatement will be initiated soon for the 13 refusal properties. Results are still pending for 10 plant samples. Since January 2023, a total of 1,758 HLB positive trees were detected in all HLB find counties with the majority of detections found in Anaheim, Santa Ana, Westminster, Garden Grove, Whittier, and Pico Rivera. Eight public meetings were held to conduct delimitation treatments in counties. A total of 550 HLB positive trees were removed April through July 2023.

Central District

Since the last meeting in April, two ACP detections were confirmed in Kern County (one residential and one commercial). One commercial ACP detection was also confirmed on June 21st in Tulare County. ACP delimitation and detection trapping activities are still ongoing. With treatment completed for all residential ACP detections, *Tamarixia* releases are now only being conducted in Santa Barbara County. Multi-pest survey is still ongoing. Citrus commodity survey was conducted in the Spring with additional surveys scheduled for Santa Barbara County.

Northern District

There have been no new treatments in Northern California since December 2022. *Tamarixia* releases are still ongoing in San Jose, Santa Clara County, at an average of 6,000 biocontrol agents per month. HLB risk survey 2023 Cycle 1 completed in June 2023 for 19 counties. Supplementary grids were added to 10 of the 19 counties.

CDFA Regulatory and County Agreement Update

Keith Okasaki presented the regulatory county monthly activity report for October 2022 through June 2023. He noted that total inspections have increased by 550 with 111

notices of violation down from 214 and 20 notices of proposed action down from 25 for this same time period the previous year. New county regulatory agreements are set to begin in October 2023.

HLB Retail Nursery Proposal

Aaron Dillon reported that the recommendations from the Science Advisory Panel included concerns regarding the distribution of illicit citrus nursery stock within quarantine areas. It was recommended that the program should establish a retail nursery working group and develop a protocol that supports the availability of disease-free, pesticide-protected citrus nursery stock within quarantine areas for sale to the public. The Nursery Working Group was formed and met on March 24, 2023 and May 2, 2023 where clean nursery stock protocols were discussed and recommended, including random inspections performed by Citrus Division staff to insure compliance. Concerns include the shelf life of citrus trees and the likelihood of participation by retail nurseries. The Nursery Working Group felt that it is important to develop a reasonable and actionable plan for the sale of clean citrus now as HLB quarantines continue to expand in California.

Biocontrol Update

Dr. David Morgan reported that a total of approximately 1,300,000 *Tamarixia* have been released to date this year with 78 percent of releases occurring in HLB detection areas. LED lights have been installed at the California Polytechnic State University *Tamarixia* production center, which will aid in the increased production of *Tamarixia* during the darker winter months. Trees monitored by Biocontrol staff in Southern California experienced zero percent flushing with very few ACP present on the trees.

ACP Trap Comparison Update

Daniel Lee presented an efficacy comparison between 3D traps versus yellow panel (YP) traps for ACP trapping. Many ACP samples found on yellow panel traps are not viable for HLB analysis, leading to the development of 3D traps by University of California, Riverside researchers. A comparison was observed in 34 study locations with one of each trap placed on opposite sides of the same trees for 12 30-day cycles from mid-July 2021 to late July 2022. The results of this study revealed that YP traps were more effective than 3D traps at catching ACP. Another study compared YP traps to No-Mess YP traps, which uses a histo-clear, orange oil based clearing agent that facilitates easier removal of trapped ACP for CLAs testing. A comparison was observed in 4 counties for 5 to 6, 30-day cycles from mid-September 2022 to late March 2023. The results of this study revealed that no-mess traps have a similar efficacy as YP traps, however no-mess traps are approximately 5 times more expensive than YP traps at a 2020 cost of \$1.39 per YP no-mess trap compared to \$0.28 per YP trap.

ACP Canine Detection Update

Lisa Finke stated that, based on recommendation by Greg Parra, she has submitted a proposal to the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) for Plant Protection Act (PPA) Section 7721 Funding for funding for the pest detection dogs. This will allow for ACP detection dogs to be available to the program at no cost.

Motion: To write a letter of support for the ACP Canine Detection Team's proposal to PPA7721.

First: Jim Gorden

Second: Roger Smith

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Ethyl Formate Registration Update

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that the ethyl formate registrant responded to the Environmental Protection Agency's deficiency letter, and ethyl formate was submitted for science review in early July 2023. Jim Cranney has continued to inquire about the status of the pending registration and should receive a status update within the next few days.

Neonicotinoid Risk Mitigation Update

Casey Creamer reported that the regulations for neonicotinoid risk mitigation have been finalized. There are restrictions to use on half rate on citrus, but that there is also an exemption for use for quarantine pests such as ACP. Citrus growers, under the recommendation of a pest control advisor (PCA) may use neonicotinoids at the full rate on quarantine pests. The grower must retain the PCA recommendation on file for two years. Regulation is scheduled to begin in 2024.

Sweet Orange Scab (SOS) Regulation Update

Keith Okasaki reported that regulation for SOS interior quarantine was approved by the Office of Administrative Law and the Secretary of the State and will be effective on October 1, 2023.

Pest Control Districts

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that CDFA staff are still working on a report from the Pest Control District (PCD) meeting. Etienne noted that the budget may need to be adjusted to accommodate using the infrastructure available in the Central Valley at the Tristeza Agency. He would like to see some activities devolved to the PCDs where growers have more input as he feels that this will keep growers engaged and involved.

Science Advisory Panel (SAP) Update

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that there will be Science Subcommittee meeting on August 29th to further discuss the recommendations made by the Risk-Based Survey (RBS) Working Group. Keith Okasaki reported that the RBS Working Group met on July 31st, where the group further discussed recommendations made by the Science Advisory Panel. The RBS Working Group agreed to immediately shift southern California survey efforts to residential properties in proximity to commercial citrus, as well as in areas within the quarantine but outside of the delimitation areas. Northern California survey would focus on areas with ACP detections and where immature life stages are observed. The formal recommendation will be available at the next CPDPC meeting.

OUTREACH SUBCOMITTEE REPORT

Price Adams reported that Nuffer Smith Tucker (NST) coordinated several media interview opportunities over the past several months in both consumer and industry publications, including the Public Broadcasting Service program “Hungry Planet,” Telemundo San Diego, Modern Farmer, Western Press, and targeted media outreach in both Kern County and the city of Los Angeles. NST will also be helping to coordinate program appearances at the upcoming Ventura County Fair’s Citrus Day, a Mid-Autumn Festival with IW Group, and National Hispanic Heritage Month with subcontractor The MRKT. NST also facilitated a visit to the Citrus Clonal Protection Program (CCPP) with gardening influencer Coastal Homestead and is working to complete the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Program (CPDPP) year in review annual report. Train-the-trainer workshops in Escondido, Santa Paula, and Exeter are also being coordinated. A video regarding what groves should expect when dealing with HLB is in development as NST works to consider the SAP recommendations regarding continued media outreach and information distribution for CLAs positive detections in commercial orchards. NST staff also created and distributed a new quarterly blog to elected officials in the Southern California HLB detection cities, to be shared on social media channels for encouraging resident cooperation with agricultural efforts. Preparations are underway for the League of Cities Annual Conference as well as a dedicated media outreach campaign to city planners.

USDA Report

On behalf of Helene Wright, Victoria Hornbaker reported that the CPDPP received an additional \$1,300,000 in funding as well as \$325,000 in CHRP funding for operations involving Citrus Yellow Vein Clearing Virus (CYVCV). Victoria also submitted project proposals to the PPA7721 for Citrus Commodity Survey for \$441,000 and a grower outreach proposal for \$226,000.

Citrus Research Board (CRB) Report

Marcy Martin reported that CRB has been in search of a person to oversee and takeover the Data Analysis and Tactical Operations Center (DATOC) project. A citrus integrated pest management entomologist has been hired to assist in developing a program for ACP control management of Districts 2 and 3. Dr. Melinda Klein has initiated a project for citrus research and field trials. CRB is also currently in the budget planning stages for the 2023/24 FY.

Citrus Pest Detection Program (CPDP) Report

Dr. Subhas Hajeri reported that the CPDP plans to deploy a total of 4,800 traps throughout 2,400 locations in the Central Valley, Tulare County, Southern Tulare, and Kern County. He will be working with David Phong to review data and reduce redundancy of trap deployments. As part of the Joint Powers Agreement for the Central California Tristeza Eradication Agency (CCTEA) and the CPDP, the agency has been rebranded as the Alliance of Pest Control Districts (APCD) to better align with the

implementation of multi-pest survey and regional cooperation and coordination efforts.

OTHER ITEMS, CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT

Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) Update

Victoria reported that there was a meeting on August 7, 2023 to review items requiring correction on the PEIR per the Appellate Court's decision in 2021.

CYVCV Update

Victoria Hornbaker reported that the California CYVCV working group has been meeting and working with USDA officials to develop and refine a regulatory proposal. USDA has requested a finalized proposal by next week, but Victoria has requested additional time to refine the proposal.

The meeting adjourned at 2:22 p.m. The next meeting will be on November 8, 2023 in Riverside, California.