

# CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, November 9, 2022

## Committee Members Present:

Craig Armstrong*	Bob Felts Jr.	Dr. Etienne Rabe
Kevin Ball*	John J. Gless*	Rod Radtke
Franco Bernardi	John C. Gless	Gregorio Rundini*
Brad Carmen	Jim Gorden	Roger Smith
Aaron Dillon	Mark McBroom	Keith Watkins

## Committee Members Absent:

Nick Hill	Jared Plumlee
-----------	---------------

## California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) Staff:

Kelley Aubushon	Anmol Joshi*	Keith Okasaki*
Fernando Berber	Jason Kilian*	Briana Russell*
Dao, Kiana*	Sara Khalid*	Michael Soltero*
Kiana Dao*	Sarah Kraft*	Javier Tobar*
Samuel Ferris	Luci Kumagai*	Favian Tong*
Alisha Garcia*	Zach McCormack*	ThuyVy Truong*
David Gutierrez	Dr. David Morgan*	Jennifer Willems
Spencer Hom*	Alex Muñiz*	Jason Wu*
Victoria Hornbaker	Colleen Murphy	David Phong
Laura Irons*		

## Guests:

Price Adams	Alyssa Houtby	Cressida Silvers*
Casey Creamer	Jessica Leslie*	Katie Sutherland-Ashley*
Melissa Cregan*	Jasmine Lopez*	Georgios Vidalakis*
Natalie DeAngelo*	Marcy Martin	Jacob Villagomez*
Lisa Finke*	Joey Mayorquin*	Alan Washburn
Ariana Gehrig*	Mia Neunzig	Karen Westerman
Jacob Gomez	Margaret O'Neill*	Judy Zaninovich
Dr. Subhas Hajeri*	Curtis Pate*	Sandra Zwaal*

*\*Attended the meeting virtually.*

## **Opening Comments**

Mark McBroom called the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) meeting to order at 10:01 a.m. Mark McBroom welcomed the committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online. There was a quorum for the meeting.

## **Public Comments**

There were no public comments.

## **APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

The Consent agenda contained minutes from September 21, 2022 Committee meeting.

**Motion:** To approve the consent agenda as presented.

**First:** Keith Watkins

**Second:** Jim Gorden

**Motion Carries:** The motion passed unanimously.

## **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT**

Nothing to report.

## **FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Review 2021/2022 and 2022/23 Budget Expenditures and Revenue**

Bob Felts Jr. reported that fiscal year (FY) 2021-2022 expenditures increased by approximately \$800,000 due to late invoicing of expenses, bringing the year-to-date total to \$31,164,934.

Bob reported that 2021-22 FY revenue increased by \$918,198 since the September 2022 meeting bringing the total to \$11,905,476. The projected revenue total will be short by approximately \$600,000, due to the short crop year.

Bob reported that FY2022-2023 expenditures were \$1,503,811 in July 2022, \$2,356,987 in August 2022, and \$3,094,488 in September 2022, bringing the year-to-date total to \$6,955,286. All three months have been closed by Fi\$Cal. Victoria Hornbaker reported that some of these expenses are related to Citrus Yellow Vein Clearing Virus (CYVCV) operations, but that the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Division (CPDPD) received \$325,000 in a federal Citrus Health Response Program (CHRP) agreement for additional laboratory expenses as well as approximately \$500,000 in emergency funds from the California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) to offset CYVCV expenditures.

### **Review Crop Estimate**

Bob reported that projected production was estimated at roughly 188,000,000 cartons. Based on the forecast from the National Agricultural Statistics Service (NASS), there is 400,000 possible additional cartons, but the Finance Subcommittee deemed this not to be a significant enough factor to increase the estimate. At \$0.07 per 40-pound equivalent, the projected revenue remains at \$13,160,000.

## **Review Fund Condition Statement**

A Fund Condition Statement (FCS) was previously prepared by Carl Baum based on the previous year's FCS and manually calculated in active funding for an estimated total of \$27,500,000 carry in. Carl is disputing mathematical errors identified during his audit process with CDFA's Budget Office. Once a corrected FCS is obtained, it will be presented to the Finance Subcommittee for review.

## **OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Laboratory Update**

Lucita Kumagai presented the laboratory update for the huanglongbing (HLB) testing program from the Plant Pest Diagnostics Center. She reported that 5,108 plant samples and 3,195 Asian citrus psyllid (ACP) samples were received in October. The monthly total of plant samples received by CDFA for 2022 have averaged at 6,000 and at 3,000 per month received by Citrus Research Board (CRB). For 2022, the combined plant and ACP samples received by CDFA was 90,335 with a projected total of 108,000 samples by the end of the year. The tally of positive detections reflected 3,952 residential trees, 2,729 sites, and 5092 ACP positive samples. 72 percent of positive trees, 69 percent of positive sites, and 58 percent of ACP positive samples were found in Orange County. Luci also stated that the lab is testing more peduncle and root tissues due to higher titer of the bacteria found than in only petiole testing.

### **HLB Risk-based Survey**

David Phong presented data for 2022 Risk Survey cycle 1. Cycle 1 2022 began in June 2022 and is 52 percent complete with 16 of the 42 allocated counties completed with 19,584 properties visited. 6,629 properties were sampled generating 3,219 entomology and 4,282 plant samples. In Northern California, 5 staff members from 2 offices have completed risk survey for 67 percent of 178 assigned grids with risk survey completed in 10 counties. Staffing for HLB risk survey in Central California was reduced due to staff members being redirected to ACP treatment and CYVCV survey with 9 remaining staff members from 4 offices completing HLB risk survey for 63 percent of the 566 assigned grids with risk survey completed in 6 counties. In Southern California, 27 staff members from 6 offices have completed risk survey for 44 percent of 502 assigned with risk survey completed in Imperial County.

### **CDFA Operational Update**

David Gutierrez presented the operational update including ACP and HLB delimitation survey and treatment areas for the Southern, Central, and Northern Districts.

### **Southern District**

Delimitation survey and treatments were conducted in Orange, Los Angeles, San Bernardino, and Riverside Counties. A total of 205 HLB positive trees were removed in September and October with 129 trees pending removal. A total of 2,511 quadrant samples were taken and sent to the lab. Treatments in San Diego along the 2-mile US/MEXICO border were completed in October. Treatments around commercial citrus

groves (TACCG) in response to ACP detections were completed in San Bernardino, University of California Riverside (UCR), Hemet, and San Pasqual.

### **Central District**

In Kern County, 66 total ACP were detected. ACP detection and trapping is ongoing in Fresno and Madera Counties with ACP delimitation trapping ongoing in Fresno, Kern, Madera, Tulare, and San Luis Obispo Counties. ACP delimitation trapping is ongoing for all residential detections. TACCG in response to ACP detections were completed in Ventura and Santa Barbara Counties. Releases of *Tamarixia radiata* were conducted in Fresno, Kern, San Luis Obispo, Santa Barbara, and Tulare Counties. Citrus commodity survey began in September. CYVCV survey resumed on September 27<sup>th</sup> focusing on the 7-mile arc radius from the initial detection.

### **Northern District**

ACP detection trapping is ongoing in Placer, San Joaquin, and Stanislaus Counties. Winter trapping started early November 2022 and will continue through April 2023. There have been no subsequent ACP detections in the Alameda County delimitation and if this holds true, the monthly servicing of all 127 traps will conclude in December 2022. ACP delimitation in Santa Clara County is ongoing with traps serviced monthly and the delimitation area being expanded by 3 square miles to the southeast of the previous area. Biocontrol releases are ongoing in San Jose, Santa Clara County, with an average of 5,500 *Tamarixia* released monthly.

### **Santa Clara County Update**

Laura Irons presented the Santa Clara County update and stated there are two active areas, Clayton and Los Arboles. In Area 1: Clayton North, a possible epicenter was identified on Fleming Avenue with 12 of the 18 PDRs being detected on this street. Previous treatments were conducted in April and May 2022. A possible option is for Area 1 is to continue monitoring and releasing *Tamarixia* and treat find sites and adjacent properties for an estimated cost of \$3,000, or treat the 400 meters surrounding each detection for an estimated cost of \$61,000. In Area 2: Los Arboles, 203 ACP detections were confirmed with 42 ACP detected since September. Previous treatment ceased in December 2020 and from September through December 2022, 19 ACP were detected. A possible option for Area 2 is to continue monitoring and releasing *Tamarixia* and treat the find sites and adjacent properties at a cost of \$52,000, or treat the 400 meters surrounding each detection for an estimated cost of \$376,000. Laura noted that this area has a high refusal rate.

**Motion:** To treat ACP find and adjacent sites where ACP life stages and/or breeding populations are detected in Santa Clara County if costs remain within the current budget.

**First:** Keith Watkins

**Second:** Bob Felts Jr.

**Motion Carries:** The motion passed with 14 yays (Craig Armstrong, Kevin Ball, Franco Bernardi, Brad Carmen, Aaron Dillon, Bob Felts, Jr., John J. Gless, John C. Gless, Jim Gorden, Dr. Etienne Rabe, Gregorio Rundini, Roger Smith, Keith Watkins, and Rod

Radtke) and 1 abstention (Mark McBroom).

### **CDFA Regulatory and County Agreement Update**

Keith Okasaki reported that to more accurately capture the activities performed under county contracts, he has asked the counties currently under agreement with CDFA to report their activity differently on future invoices. The counties are only under agreement for bulk citrus enforcement with CDFA staff supplementing those activities and focusing on nursery activities and regulatory violations. Among the issues currently under investigation are the illegal shipment of plants from the HLB quarantine in Orange County to San Jose and Sonoma Counties. There have also been reports of citrus trees being shipped in the cargo areas of passenger buses from Westminster in Orange County, up to the Bay Area. Compliance agreements are also in development for farm labor contractors.

### **Trace Back at Packing House Detections**

Keith Okasaki reported that there have been a number of ACP detections at packing houses in the last couple of months with the majority of the detections being found in the Central Valley. With no detections being found along the highways, tarping is proving effective. CDFA staff are also performing record checks for incoming fruit, including points of origin, for all fruit entering the Central Valley from other ACP Regional Quarantine Zones. Staff work with the County Agricultural Commissioners (CAC) office, and examine the mitigations used and verified through pesticide use reports. Contact is then often made with the grove owner or manager and confirmed with their pest control advisors. Violations and notices of pending action are distributed accordingly. Keith noted that even with all procedures being followed correctly, there is always potential for ACP to hitchhike to new locations.

### **Biocontrol Update**

Dr. David Morgan reported that in addition to releases in Southern California, *Tamarixia* are now being released in Tulare, Fresno, Kern, and Santa Clara Counties. 78 percent of releases are being conducted in Los Angeles, Orange, Riverside, and San Bernardino Counties where HLB has previously been found. Good parasitism rate recoveries have been observed, especially around the HLB find areas in Los Angeles County.

## **SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Ethyl Formate Registration Update**

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that Jim Cranney expects delays in the approval of the use of ethyl formate, which was expected to be registered by the end of 2022.

### **Neonicotinoid Risk Mitigation Update**

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that there have been no new updates to Casey Creamer's report regarding neonicotinoid risk mitigation.

### **Sweet Orange Scab (SOS) Regulation Update**

Dr. Etienne Rabe reported that CDFA continues to work on establishing an SOS

quarantine regulation.

### **Science Advisory Panel (SAP) Update**

Victoria Hornbaker reported that the CPDPC approved the SAP report and was signed by Secretary Karen Ross. Each item of the report will be reviewed at an in-person meeting in December to determine prioritization of the report's recommendations. CDFA staff is already conducting the recommended comparison of the "no-mess" traps and will report the findings when the six-month trial is complete.

### **OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

Price Adams presented the recent outreach activities. A "what to expect" video targeted towards homeowners to educate them on CPDPC activities (surveying, sampling, treatment, and public meetings) was updated. NST supported several community events including the Goleta Lemon Festival, the Historic Citrus Park Celebration in Riverside, and the Mountain Mandarin Festival. NST coordinated with grower liaisons on homeowner outreach activities around the recent ACP detections and population spikes. Social media ads have been deployed to targeted zip codes to reach residents with survey or treatment refusals. Radio ads have been run in both English and Spanish to raise awareness about ACP and HLB. NST attended the League of California Cities Conference, the California State Associations of Counties Conference, and the Arroyo Grande Festival where they coordinated with the San Luis Obispo CAC's office on outreach materials. NST also conducted deskside briefings with local elected officials from Monrovia, Arcadia, and Duarte. NST met with the grower liaisons and the CPDPC to develop standard operating procedures. NST supported Victoria Hornbaker as she presented to the California Association of Pest Control Advisors Conference. They also partnered with the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) regarding CYVCV inquiries. NST will help facilitate the SAP meeting in December. Current and upcoming outreach activities include the California State Association of Counties Conference, a refresh of CaliforniaCitrusThreat.org, the San Diego County Farm Bureau 8<sup>th</sup> annual Farm & Nursery Expo, and the Latino Farmer Conference.

### **California Citrus Mutual (CCM) Report**

Casey Creamer reported that the California Department of Pesticide Regulation (DPR) is currently investigating a statewide pesticide notification system and will be holding hearings this week. CCM will continue to work with DPR to address procedural concerns and ensure that a notification system is put in place while advocating for the protection of growers, including privacy issues. CCM is also advocating to keep the current system in place and for any burden to be placed on the county and the State rather than the growers. Casey also stated the Governor's Office is focusing on a sustainable pest management report and 90 percent reduction in pesticide use. The draft report will emphasize pest exclusion, resources, UC cooperative extension, education, and outreach. The report will be released in January 2023. On a positive note, Casey stated that CHRP allocations and federal budgets may increase due to inflation. The Governor has vetoed the neonicotinoids bill, a victory for the citrus program.

### **Citrus Research Board (CRB) Report**

Marcy Martin reported that the recruitment period for hiring an integrated pest management entomologist closed on October 31<sup>st</sup>. Marcy also reported that funding was received through the Huanglongbing Multiagency Coordination Group (HLB MAC) who have directed funds to state and regional programs in Florida, Texas, and California. Funding should last for two years with a likely commitment to provide funds that will help compensate for information sharing and data collection.

### **Citrus Pest Detection Program (CPDP) Report**

Dr. Subhas Hajeri presented the pest control district updates for San Joaquin Valley from September through October 2022. He explained that the CPDP has conducted trapping and inspections with a total of 1,002 traps deployed on approximately 1,000 properties and 6,004 trees inspected. No ACP have been found on the traps. This is the second season that cylindrical traps have been utilized, which have shown to be less efficient than the sticky traps. CPDP is also assisting Dr. Ray Yokomi, who is in the process of hiring a researcher and technicians to work on CYVCV. Dr. Yokomi is working to study the transmission and the host range of the virus and will need to catch and maintain a white fly colony before transmission studies can be conducted. In the meantime, CPDP is working to graft and maintain the various host plants before a full-time researcher is hired for the project.

### **OTHER ITEMS, CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT**

#### **Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) Update**

Victoria stated that CDFA continues to work with the contractor to recertify the PEIR.

#### **Regulatory Enforcement**

Victoria reported that she received feedback from the Committee seeking to improve regulatory enforcement and working with the counties, growers, packers, haulers, and the farm labor contractors. Victoria prepared a preliminary spring finance letter to hire staff that would be 100 percent dedicated to regulatory operations. Additional regulatory work may also be required once CYVCV rulemaking and protocols are put into place. General funding will be requested to support these positions. Several committee members objected to additional vacancies and expressed frustrations with support the program receives from counties and would like to consider removing some county functions in favor of the State.

#### **CYVCV Update**

Kelley Aubushon reported that in March 2022, the first CYVCV suspect sample was sent to USDA. In response to this detection, CDFA initiated a 400-meter survey of the core area. In April 2022, USDA confirmed CYVCV and CDFA expanded the core to a 1-mile delimitation. CDFA also began satellite and 3-mile buffer surveys. In May 2022, travel census surveys were conducted in Fresno, Kings, and Tulare Counties with commercial grove surveys starting in Fresno and Tulare Counties. CYVCV was detected in the 3-mile buffer survey, triggering core 2. CDFA staff located and collected samples from properties at each of the core 1-mile survey, 3-mile buffer survey, and 4.5

to 6-mile satellite survey points. For core 1 and 2, every citrus host is sampled in the 1-mile delimitation areas with the goal to contact 100 percent of all properties in the areas. In core 1, samples were collected from non-citrus hosts, such as mustard, mallow, grape, and bean, to be tested for the presence of CYVCV. All samples were negative. The 3-mile buffer areas were separated into 1-mile square grids where samples were collected from symptomatic citrus hosts, if vectors are present, or asymptomatic species. The census survey was based on USDA census data and predicts areas of high risk for CYVCV. Surveys were conducted in Visalia, Tulare, Hanford, Corcoran, Delano, Fresno, and Clovis with samples collected from symptomatic citrus hosts, if vectors are present, or asymptomatic species. All CYVCV surveys were paused in August 2022 due to high temperatures. Survey resumed on September 27<sup>th</sup> with a 7-mile arc centered on a merged core. A positive detection will trigger an expansion to an 8-mile arc, if no detections, then the arc will decrease to 6-miles. All 229 total samples collected have come back negative. There are 60 total samples pending at the lab.

The meeting adjourned at 12:36 p.m. The next meeting will be on December 1, 2022 and December 2, 2022 in Valencia, California.