

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, April 13, 2022

Committee Members Present:

Franco Bernardi	John C. Gless	Dr. Etienne Rabe
Brad Carmen	Nick Hill	Gregorio Rundini
Aaron Dillon	Mark McBroom	Roger Smith
Bob Felts Jr.	Jared Plumlee	Keith Watkins
John Gless		

Committee Members Absent:

Craig Armstrong	Jim Gorden
-----------------	------------

California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) Staff:

Kelley Aubushon	Mathew Jian	Dr. David Morgan
Carl Baum	Anmol Joshi	Alex Muñiz-Chavez
Fernando Berber	Marina Kaiser	Keith Okasaki
Karina Chu	Sara Khalid	Briana Russell
Kiana Dao	Sarah Kraft	Heather Scheck
Paul Figueroa	Luci Kumagai	Michael Soltero
Alisha Garcia	Betty Lee	ThuyVy Truong
David Gutierrez	Daniel Lee	Amelia Wright
Victoria Hornbaker	Zachary McCormack	Jason Wu
Laura Irons	Jana Miscevic	

Guests:

Teri Blaser	Maureen McGuire	Cressida Silvers
Ed Civerolo	Helen McGrath	Helene Wright
Natalie DeAngelo	Dr. Neil McRoberts	Qijun Xiang
Rick Dunn	Kevin Nye	Judy Zaninovich
Lisa Finke	Margaret O'Neill	Sandra Zwaal
Magally Luque-Williams	Curtis Pate	

Opening Comments

The committee meeting was called to order at 9:01 a.m. via webinar. Mark McBroom welcomed the committee, staff, and members of the public participating online. There was a quorum for the meeting.

Public Comments

Aaron Dillon commented that Bill AB-2146, which aims to limit all non-agricultural uses of neonicotinoid pesticides, is currently moving through the California State Legislature and if approved will take effect on January 1, 2024.

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

The Consent agenda contained minutes from January 12, 2022 Committee meeting.

Motion: To approve the consent agenda as presented.

First: John Gless

Second: Mark McBroom

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Review 2020/2021 Budget Expenditures and Revenue

Bob Felts Jr. reported a total year-to-date expenditure of \$29,512,516 for Fiscal Year (FY) 2020-21 after an adjustment which removed money expended towards sweet orange scab (SOS) operations. There are no post audits or further adjustments anticipated.

Bob reported that revenue received to date totaled \$15,547,655 for 194,345,687 total cartons compared with a projected total of \$16,208,000 for 202,600,000 total cartons at \$0.08 per carton.

Review 2021/2022 Budget Expenditures and Revenue

Bob reported that expenditures totaled approximately \$3,200,000 in February, approximately \$3,250,000 in March, and \$4,197,325 in April, yielding a total year-to-date expenditure of \$16,460,119 for FY 2021-22. He reported that the higher total of expenditures is due to expedient reporting of invoices in Fi\$Cal.

Bob reported that revenue totaled approximately \$1,640,000 in February, approximately \$2,260,000 in March, and \$1,795,114 in April, for a total year-to-date of \$5,696,645 in revenue for FY 2021-22. Projected revenue is approximately \$12,500,000 based on the projection of 179,000,000 cartons at \$0.07 per carton. This will be short of projected revenue due to a shortened crop season for mandarins and navels.

2022/2023 Budget Review and Approval

Bob presented the FY 2022-23 proposed budget. He reported a total estimated budget of \$44,362,316 with a \$1,000,000 estimated increase in contracts, \$650,000 increase in the operation and maintenance of equipment, \$250,000 increase in personnel services, and a \$2,200,000 decrease in total indirect compared with the prior year. Victoria Hornbaker reminded the Committee that the budget would span from July 1, 2022 through June 30, 2023 in order to align with the state FY.

Motion: To approve the FY 2022-23 proposed budget.

First: Bob Felts Jr.

Second: Nick Hill

Motion Carries: The motion passed unanimously.

Bob reported that he estimates, based on 17-18 percent of the budget being spent on expenditures in the final quarter of prior years and considering the shortened year, that total expenditures should come to approximately \$25,000,000 for the year. He also stated that the carry-forward surplus from the prior year is \$28,000,000 and that there are plans to revisit the fund condition statement.

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) Update

Victoria reported that the Third District Court of Appeals has remanded the decision back to the trial court and that CDFA is awaiting a revised writ that will provide direction on which activities will need to cease operating under the PEIR. Victoria explained that current Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Division activities may proceed under alternative California Environmental

Quality Act compliance. She added that CDFA is hiring a consultant to revise the PEIR and is currently seeking funding alternatives for the contract.

Filling Committee Vacancies

David Gutierrez reported that one candidate has submitted his name for election to fill the Fresno area grower member vacancy. His resume was submitted to the Committee for review.

Motion: To elect Rod Radtke to fill the Fresno area grower member vacancy on the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee.

First: Jared Plumlee

Second: Roger Smith

Motion Carries: The motion passed with 11 yays (Franco Bernardi, Aaron Dillon, Bob Felts Jr., John Gless, John C. Gless, Nick Hill, Mark McBroom, Jared Plumlee, Gregorio Rundini, Roger Smith, and Keith Watkins) and 2 abstentions (Brad Carmen and Dr. Etienne Rabe).

Science Advisory Panel Update

Victoria reported that the first virtual meeting with the science advisory panelists went very well and that the upcoming in-person meeting will be starting on April 20, 2022. Harold Browning of Premier Citrus in Florida and Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell of University of California (UC) Riverside (retired) as the co-chairs have been preparing for the meeting and are working to synthesize the questions from the Committee into an agenda. The panelists include Dr. Mamadou Sétamou of Texas A&M University Kingsville, Dr. Bob Shatters from United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) Agricultural Research Service in Florida, Don Seaver from USDA Science and Technology, Dave Bartels of USDA Field Operations, Rodrigo Almeida from UC Berkeley, and Georgios Vidalakis from the California Citrus Clonal Protection Program.

Citrus Canker Update

Victoria reported that in February 2022, USDA determined that citrus canker (CC) was found at a nursery in South Carolina and had been selling nursery stock to multiple states including California. USDA issued a recall to citrus producing and adjacent states. Nursery stock was shipped to four locations in California. Keith Okasaki and staff from Southern and Central Districts verified that 3 of the 4 locations received nursery stock. The nursery stock was collected and destroyed and a 1-mile survey was implemented around each location to verify that CC is not present. While Nevada has been working through the recall, they have notified CDFA of two potential locations where nursery stock may have been diverted from Nevada into California. Staff verified that one of these did not occur, but one was sent to a California address. The nursery stock was collected and destroyed, and maps are being prepared to implement a 1-mile survey around this site. Staff are also working with neighboring states to fully implement the recall. Some neighboring states have received nursery stock at hundreds of locations, making the process slower for those states.

OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Laboratory Update

Lucita Kumagai presented the laboratory update for the huanglongbing (HLB) testing program from the Plant Pest Diagnostics Center. She reported that the monthly total of plant samples received for 2022 have averaged 6,000, which is a 54 percent increase for the same period from the prior year. Asian citrus psyllid (ACP) samples averaged at 2,400 samples per month. For 2022, the combined plant and ACP total samples received was 25,181 at an increase of 7000 samples compared to the same period from the prior year. The tally of positive detections reflected 3,184 residential trees, 2,227 sites, and 404 ACP positive samples. Most of the detections were from Orange County. 96 percent of the positive samples were detected during the HLB response survey. The tally of positive trees by city for 2022 showed 335 trees reported with 152 of the trees from Anaheim, 11 from Garden Grove, 21 from Santa Ana, 63 from

Westminster, 2 from Orange, 5 from San Gabriel, 7 from Duarte, 7 from Montebello, 13 from La Miranda, 13 from Paramount, 4 from Downey, 1 from Carson, 4 from Riverside, and 33 from Ontario.

HLB Risk Survey

Daniel Lee presented data for 2021 risk survey cycle 2. Cycle 2 2021 began in November 2021 and is 58 percent complete in 15 of the 37 allocated counties with 30,917 properties visited. 13,716 properties were sampled generating 5,417 entomology and 10,174 plant samples. In Northern California, 5 staff members from 2 offices have completed risk survey for 46 percent of 147 assigned grids with risk survey completed in 8 counties. In Central California, 19 staff members from 4 offices have completed risk survey for 90 percent of the 460 assigned grids with risk survey completed in 6 counties. In Southern California, 25 staff members from 7 offices have completed risk survey for 45 percent of 995 assigned grids with risk survey completed in Imperial County. Risk survey including properties surveyed, ACP samples collected, and plant samples collected for the first 3 months of 2022 are in line with trends from the prior year. Risk survey activities are highest in January, but slowdown in February and March due to staff redirecting toward area-wide treatment and other pest survey activities.

CDFA Operational Update

David Gutierrez presented the operational update including HLB delimitation survey and treatment areas for the Southern, Central, and Northern Districts. In Orange County, delimitation survey was conducted in Westminster, Anaheim, Orange, and Santa Ana. Treatments were conducted in Westminster, Anaheim, Santa Ana, Orange, and Garden Grove. In Los Angeles County, delimitation survey was conducted in La Mirada, Paramount, Duarte, San Gabriel, and Montebello and treatments were conducted in La Miranda, Paramount, Duarte, and Montebello. The first HLB positive tree was detected in Carson on March 18, 2022. In San Bernardino County, survey and treatments were conducted in Ontario and Rancho Cucamonga. In Riverside County, delimitation survey and treatments were conducted in Riverside and Jurupa Valley. In Southern District, 321 HLB positive trees were removed from January through March with 109 additional trees pending removal. Residential buffer treatments have been completed in Santa Barbara, Ventura, San Diego border buffer, Imperial border buffer, San Bernardino, Hemet, UC Riverside, Coachella, and Imperial. In Central District, as of April 4, 2022, there have been no new ACP detections. ACP detection trapping is ongoing in Fresno and Madera Counties with ACP delimitation trapping ongoing in Kern, San Luis Obispo, and Tulare Counties. ACP treatment for Santa Barbara County began in Santa Maria on February 9 and completed on February 25. In Monterey County, a 50-meter ACP treatment was completed on February 28 with no new detections. Staff are transitioning to the commodity survey for the Spring 2022 survey period as risk survey is completed. In Northern District, Winter ACP trapping activities will conclude in April with quality control inspections of the county trappers now complete. Trapping is still ongoing in Placer, San Joaquin, and Stanislaus Counties. ACP delimitation trapping is ongoing in Alameda County with no subsequent detections and 127 traps serviced monthly. Delimitation trapping is also ongoing in Santa Clara County with detections ongoing and traps serviced monthly. A new San Jose delimitation area was established in 4 square miles. Biocontrol releases are continuing in San Jose, Santa Clara County, with an average of 7,000 *Tamarixia* released monthly.

CDFA Regulatory and County Agreement Update

Keith Okasaki presented the county monthly activity report for July 2021 through February 2022. He reported that county regulatory contracts have been invoiced at 55 percent of the budget at 8 months into the 15-month agreement. While some county invoices have yet to be submitted, spending activity tends to slow down during the summer months. He is also speaking with the counties that are trending toward overspending their budget.

Grate Cleaning & Fruit Seller Working Group

Keith reported that after the previous meeting, a grate cleaning and fruit seller working group was formed. That working group has met twice and consists of John C. Gless, Keith Watkins, and a few County Agricultural Commissioner Deputies. An informational document is being created for distribution by the packing houses to fruit peddlers, outlining safeguarding requirements. Grate cleaning inspections will focus on stem and leaf counts as well as ensuring fruit is shipped free of ACP. After meeting with the counties who have grate cleaners or who receive grate-cleaned fruit, it was agreed that enforcement should be increased with quicker adverse action and a lower tolerance level for non-compliance. Proposed rule changes for HLB “fruit sellers” applies to those growing within an HLB quarantine who have 1 acre or more of trees (100 trees per acre) grown with the intent of harvesting the fruit for sale. The proposition is to provide performance standard options to mitigate the pest risk similar to growers moving to packing houses.

Discuss Clean Nursery Stock Program

Keith reported that the Citrus Nursery Stock Pest Cleanliness Program (CNSPCP) is currently administered by Plant Health Division’s Nursery Services Program. It was agreed that it would be best for the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Division (CPDPD) to take over administration of this program. The CNSPCP is established in Title 3 California Code of Regulations § 3701 and is mandatory for all California citrus nursery stock producers. All source trees for citrus propagative materials must meet the testing and maintenance requirements for this program. The program includes 26 current participating nurseries in Butte, Fresno, Kern, Madera, Riverside, San Diego, San Luis Obispo, Santa Cruz, Stanislaus, Tulare, Ventura, and Yuba Counties. The nurseries in this program pay an annual assessment fee to CDFA to have their mother, increase, and seed trees to be registered and tested. There is a testing schedule for each type of tree based on the number of years in the program which tests for several citrus diseases. Mother and increase trees are maintained within an approved insect-resistant structure and tested annually for the first 3 years and then every 3 years. Seed trees are tested every 6 years. The program is funded by annual assessment fees and should have minimal to no financial impact on CPDPD. CPDPD staff are already conducting monthly inspections for several participants. Working with nurseries and USDA, the trapping component inside screen houses was also eliminated. Program field activities occur once annually and can be administered in Sacramento.

Grower Liaison Update

Sara Khalid presented the Grower Liaison updates. In the Central District, there have been no new ACP finds in Fresno, Madera, and Northern Tulare Counties. Teri Blaser and Jessica Leslie are continuing to update and reach out to Psyllid Management Area team leaders. The last residential trap find was in the City of Tulare. There have been no new trap finds in the area and all treatments have been completed. In Kern County, there are no new ACP detections to date for 2022. Judy Zaninovich continues to urge growers and pest control advisers to remain vigilant, consider adding an ACP-effective material in their Spring foliar treatments, and highlight the importance of their participation in keeping ACP numbers low. In Santa Barbara County, Winter and Fall treatments have been concluded and the next area-wide treatment window is September 2022. Cressida Silvers is continuing to update 2022 permit data from the county. In Ventura County, Cressida and Sandra Zwaal are scheduled to meet the new Farm Bureau CEO and new ACP Task Force leadership to assist with the transition and are in the process of following up and collecting pesticide use reports through mid-April before the uncoordinated ACP treatment period begins. The Ventura County Winter ACP area-wide treatments have concluded. For San Luis Obispo County, there have been no new ACP detections in the county. Grower treatment for the most recent detection was completed on January 13, 2022. In the Southern District, HLB positive residential finds continue in Ontario, San Bernardino County. Growers in the Redlands are encouraged to be diligent with their ACP area-wide treatments. The new 2022 ACP area-wide treatment schedule has been finalized and distributed to the

growers in the monthly Grower Liaison update eblast. A grower meeting with seven presentations from the local citrus community was held in early March to encourage grower participation and engagement. The San Bernardino ACP Task Force is scheduled to resume in April to continue grower discussions. The San Bernardino Master Gardeners presented in Ontario. Both Sandra and Tom Mullen are collaborating and coordinating a field day for growers, which is expected to occur in May. In San Diego County, Sandra is coordinating a grower meeting in Valley Center and Fallbrook to take place in April, a field day event for May, and will also be presenting an ACP/HLB presentation to the San Diego Farm Bureau members in May. The San Diego citrus layer continues to be updated by Sandra. ACP detection dogs, traps, and CDFA scouting crews have not detected any activity in Imperial County this past month. Non-coordinated treatment for non-ACP pests has been ongoing. Growers have been encouraged to spray perimeters and use materials that are also effective against ACP

Biocontrol Update

Dr. David Morgan presented the ACP biocontrol update for April 2022. He reported that plant production for citrus and curry leaf plants used in rearing *Tamarixia* is going well. Citrus Research Board (CRB) has taken over maintenance of the *Tamarixia* iso-lines. CRB and CDFA will be producing *Tamarixia* for release going forward. 660,000 insects have been released this year, which is at an increase compared to the prior year and is on track to exceed the projected 4,000,000 releases for 2022. 73 percent of insects have been released around HLB-find areas with additional releases around trade routes and spot-releases around Kern. Insects are continuing to be provided for releases in Arizona. Citrus flushed earlier this year in comparison to prior years with peak flushing in February rather than March. This does not seem to have affected ACP numbers in area-wide treatment areas.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Ethyl Formate Registration Update

Dr. Etienne Rabe explained the three potential uses of ethyl formate: to move fruit from HLB quarantine areas and especially commercial orchards, as a spray and move alternative to fumigate bins on trucks, and as a fumigation for exports. He reported that Jim Cranney advised the Science Subcommittee regarding administrative issues with the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) review of ethyl formate. The registrant received a deficiency letter from EPA regarding a positive cancer result in an in vitro and inhalation study. Jim believes the registrant and Spencer Walsh will be able to suitably respond to the letter. If EPA does not accept the response, there are likely to be more studies required, which will further delay registration. In the meantime, Jim is organizing industry meetings to gauge interest.

Neonicotinoid Risk Mitigation Update

Etienne reported that progress is being made with a revised draft released that includes an exemption for use on any quarantine pests. The rate at which neonicotinoids may be used has been raised to the levels where bees would not be affected, but not to the maximum levels.

Sweet Orange Scab (SOS) Biology and Regulation Update

Amelia Wright reported that SOS regulatory staff have assembled a regulatory packet and are awaiting a meeting with the Cross-Functional Working Group regarding the quarantine area that will need to be observed.

Data Analysis Tactical Operations Center (DATOC) Update

Etienne reported that the DATOC team has been assembling data for the upcoming Science Advisory Panel meeting.

OUTREACH SUBCOMITTEE REPORT

Natalie DeAngelo reported that to connect with homeowners during National Garden Month, Nuffer Smith Tucker (NST) has developed an integrated outreach campaign encouraging California residents to implement gardening best practices through targeted media outreach, advertising strategies, social media influencer partnerships, and elected official content distribution. NST has also developed a statewide paid and earned outreach strategy focusing on these techniques, similar to the Don't Move Citrus campaign. A press release was drafted for National Garden Month and distributed over the California state newswire which has secured a pickup of 323 publications. An English and Spanish audio news release is also being coordinated. NST also attended the Highland Citrus Festival and will have a booth at the National Orange Show. Regarding recent media coverage and outreach, NST's Asian American outreach partner drafted a Lunar New Year social media campaign to increase awareness of ACP and HLB among Chinese and Vietnamese audiences which garnered over 16,000 engagements. Additional outreach included press work in the Imperial Valley, targeted social media ads about citrus canker survey, door hangers, and Instagram outreach. Industry outreach activities included California Citrus Mutual's Citrus Showcase, highlighting program partnerships in the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Program (CPDPP) annual report, development of in-language field crew training material, Train-the-Trainer activities, and California Association of Pest Control Advisers' Annual Conference. NST also recently worked a booth at the California Ag Day at the Capitol and will also be present for the Southern Association of Governments and the California Contract Cities Association Annual Municipal Seminar in May. For elected officials, there was a deskside briefing with the San Bernardino County Agricultural Commissioner as well as communications with city officials in Downey and Carson on first HLB detections. NST has also developed a new logo for the CPDPP in a readable and Google-friendly font.

USDA REPORT

Helene Wright reported that USDA is working closely with CDFA on Citrus Yellow Vein Clearing Virus (CYVCV). In a call initiated by California Citrus Quality Council and CDFA, Dr. Jim Adaskaveg, James Cranney, and representatives from CDFA met with a cross-functional SOS working group to discuss possible changes to the federal order. The working group agreed to eliminate the need to clean out stems and leaves from fruit that would move from inside an SOS quarantine area to a packing house for processing outside of an SOS quarantine area. The working group also discussed reducing the quarantine area from the current 5-mile area and decided to discuss the matter further at a follow up meeting.

CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT

CDFA is working closely with USDA on CYVCV survey and a potential path forward. All work is contingent upon completing the 1-mile delimitation survey in Tulare to assess the extent of the infection. 15 trees from 8 properties have been confirmed as positive for the virus. Each property in the 1-mile area has been visited, however many of the properties will need to be revisited as residents were not home. The lab is currently working through the samples collected during survey.

The meeting adjourned at 11:28 a.m.