

**CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION
COMMITTEE MEETING**

Meeting Minutes
Wednesday, May 12, 2021

Committee Members Present:

Kevin Ball	John C. Gless	Jared Plumlee
Brad Carmen	Jim Gorden	Dr. Etienne Rabe
Ed Civerolo	Nick Hill	Gregorio Rundini
Aaron Dillon	Mark McBroom	Roger Smith
Bob Felts, Jr.	James McFarlane	Keith Watkins
John Gless		

Committee Members Absent:

Craig Armstrong

CDFA Staff:

Kelley Aubushon	Alisha Garcia	Amelia Hicks
Karina Chu	David Gutierrez	Victoria Hornbaker
Amelia Everett	Daren Harris	Laura Irons
Mathew Jian	Zachary McCormack	Grace Radabaugh
Anmol Joshi	David Morgan	Briana Russell
Marina Kaiser	Alex Muniz	Heather Scheck
Daniel Lee	Colleen Murphy	ThuyVy Truong
Magally Luque-Williams	Keith Okasaki	Claudia Vazquez
Amy McClung	David Phong	Jennifer Willems

CRB Staff:

Holly Deniston-Sheets	Melinda Klein	Qijun Xiang
Rick Dunn	Marcy Martin	

Guests:

Price Adams	Subhas Hajeri	Drew Posny
Bob Atkins	Alyssa Houtby	Zach Rissel
Marjie Bartels	Jonathan Kaplan	Sylvie Robillard
Teri Blaser	Deborah Larmon	Cressida Silvers
James Cranney	Jessica Leslie	Karen Westerman
Casey Creamer	John Loyd	David Wirta
Melissa Cregan	Neil McRoberts	Helene Wright
Natalie DeAngelo	Margaret O'Neill	Judy Zaninovich
Lisa Finke	Curtis Pate	Sandra Zwaal
Sara Garcia-Figuera		

Opening Comments:

The committee meeting was called to order at 9:04 am via webinar. Jim Gorden welcomed the committee, staff, and members of the public participating online. Mr. Gorden stated that there was a quorum for the meeting.

Public Comments:

No public comments.

APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

Motion: To recommend approving the February 17, 2021 Consent Agenda as presented.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Mark McBroom

Motion Carries: Motion passed unanimously.

FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**Review 2019/2020 Budget Expenditures and Revenue:**

Bob Felts, Jr. stated that the program expended \$25,793,698 through September 2020. The increase in expenditures is primarily related to late invoices. Total revenue for fiscal year (FY) 19/20 was \$18,491,480.

Review 2020/2021 Budget Expenditures and Revenue:

Mr. Felts, Jr. stated as of May 2021, expenditures increased by \$3,934,466 to a total of over \$10,000,000. The low expenditures may be due to late or slow invoicing. FY 20/21 revenue increased to \$5,007,600, which includes credits to packing houses due to overpayment, some packing houses were still paying the assessment at the \$0.09 per carton rate, rather than the \$0.08 per carton rate. Mr. Felt's, Jr. noted that an audit was done of the fund condition statement (FCS) and inaccuracies were found, so the Financial Services Branch is working on a new FCS. Carl Baum stated that the financial consultant contract was awarded to Macias, Gini, & O'Connell LLP on May 1.

EXECUTIVE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**CPDPC Bylaws Discussion:**

Victoria Hornbaker stated officers are elected every two years and can serve two consecutive terms in the same office. Once their term is completed the officers can serve in other offices. A discussion will be held to determine if the bylaw should be maintained or if there should be a change for future elections.

Sweet Orange Scab Detection:

Ms. Hornbaker stated that in the last year and a half there have been Sweet Orange Scab (SOS) disease detections in the cities of North Tustin, Blythe, and Riverside. Prior to these discoveries, the last detections were in 2013. A standard operating procedure (SOP) is being created for SOS delimitation survey and regulatory program staff are revising the compliance agreement and exhibits for SOS.

Ms. Hornbaker noted that SOS detections are regulated in 5 square mile areas, because there is no quarantine for SOS. She noted that the California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) is using its delegated authority from United States Department of Agriculture's (USDA) to implement and enforce the SOS regulated areas. Ms. Hornbaker stated that without a state interior quarantine, the USDA could potentially quarantine the entire state. A statewide quarantine could affect the productivity of nurseries and growers who are not currently in SOS regulated areas, hindering fruit and nursery stock movement. It was noted that SOS is a cosmetic disease and does not cause the tree to die, however, California citrus is primarily sold into the fresh fruit market and blemished fruit cannot be sold. The Committee discussed the need to proceed with a formal regulatory rulemaking process to set a state interior quarantine and prevent a quarantine of the entire state. A white paper will be drafted, with support from the Science subcommittee, to understand the biology and regulatory impacts of SOS.

Motion: For the CDFA to begin the rule making process on the Sweet Orange Scab to avoid a potential statewide quarantine by USDA.

First: Roger Smith

Second: Mark McBroom

Motion Carries: 14 Yeas (Kevin Ball, Brad Carmen, Ed Civerolo, Aaron Dillon, Bob Felts, Jr., John Gless, John C. Gless, Jim Gordon, Nick Hill, James McFarlane, Dr. Etienne Rabe, Gregorio Rundini, Roger Smith, Keith Watkins), and 1 abstention (Mark McBroom).

OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

Unofficial Lime Swallowtail Detections:

Ms. Hornbaker stated that there was one unofficial lime swallowtail butterfly sample submitted by a citizen scientist through Los Angeles County to the CDFA. Two additional sightings from citizen scientists, one in Los Angeles and another in San Luis Obispo, were reported on the web application "iNaturalist." However, since the sample was not found by a regulatory official, it is not considered an official sample. CDFA staff surveyed the find site where the sample was collected, and no life stages were detected. A research proposal was submitted by Mark Hoddle at University of California (UC), Riverside to the Citrus Research Board (CRB) to survey and collect suspect lime swallowtail life stages in the field and send to the Quarantine facility at UC Riverside. Lydia Rodriguez created a survey SOP for the lime swallowtail.

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 1 – Find and Eradicate HLB

CDFA Operational Update:

Southern District:

David Gutierrez stated that HLB delimitation surveys and treatment are ongoing in Los Angeles, Orange, San Bernardino, and Riverside Counties. Retreatments are being conducted in specific areas within the four counties. The winter areawide treatment cycle has been completed in all areas and will resume in the Summer/Fall of 2021. A total of 73 HLB positive trees were removed during the months of February, March, and April. Most of the trees were in Orange County. A new tree removal contract for Los

Angeles and Orange counties began May 1, 2021. HLB risk-based survey Cycle 1 2021 began in mid-March and is progressing. The two-mile border buffer risk survey cycle started in March 2021 is at 25 percent completion in San Diego and 42 percent completion in Imperial County.

Central District:

Mr. Gutierrez stated the detection trapping in Fresno and Madera counties is ongoing. Delimitation trapping in Kern County is ongoing and treatment has been completed. No new ACP detections were reported. HLB risk-based survey Cycle 2 2020 in Fresno, Kern, and Tulare counties will be completed by the end of May 2021. Commodity survey will be conducted by at least two staff from each county.

Northern District:

Mr. Gutierrez stated delimitation trapping is ongoing in Contra Costa County and reported no additional detections. In San Jose, Santa Clara County, 14 confirmed adults were reported in March 2021 in four traps and 15 confirmed adults in three traps were reported in April 2021. Nine properties were treated on April 20, 2021 and a new four-square mile delimitation survey area was created. No additional detections have been reported since the expansion. *Tamarixia radiata* releases are being conducted monthly with over 4,400 released in San Jose. HLB risk-based survey for Cycle 2 2020 is now complete. HLB risk-based survey Cycle 1 2021 is occurring in seven counties in the Northern district. Residential ACP detection trapping for the winter season concluded in April. Year-round county trapping continues in three counties. Currently, no ACP treatments are being conducted. An update will be provided at the next Operations subcommittee meeting on what actions are being taken in Santa Clara due to the additional detections.

**STRATEGIC PRIORITY 2 – Control ACP Movement and Enforce Regulations
CDFA Regulatory and County Agreement Update:**

Keith Okasaki stated that seven of the 14 counties with regulatory agreements have fully expended their budgets. When reviewing the number of inspections completed, counties such as Monterey, San Luis Obispo, Santa Barbara, and Orange are considered origin counties, they have no packers to inspect and follow up with grower inspections as necessary. The counties that did not fully expend their previous agreement either reduced their funding requests and/or are committing to a larger work commitment. Mr. Okasaki stated that fewer Notice of Violations were issued this year, but more Notice of Proposed Actions were given.

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 3 – ACP Control/Suppression

Status of Request for Proposal (RFP) for Rapid ACP Screening:

Ms. Hornbaker stated that the RFP was withdrawn because the CDFA Contracts Office listed the proposal as an Invitation for Bid (IFB). It was re-written as an RFP, allowing the proposal to be scored on its scientific merit, whereas an IFB is awarded based on lowest bid without scientific review. The new RFP will be submitted to the CDFA Contracts Office.

Biocontrol Discussion:

Dr. David Morgan stated that *Tamarixia radiata* production was low due to COVID. As of 2011, there have been 21 million *Tamarixia* released. Biocontrol releases are primarily focused on border areas, HLB find areas, new ACP find locations and trade routes, with 72 percent of the releases focused on HLB find areas. Dr. Morgan stated that in the last four years, ACP populations have decreased by 75 percent in urban areas. This information will be studied to determine the cause of ACP population decline and the role biocontrol has played.

SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 4 – Improve Data Technology, Analysis and Sharing Effectiveness of Southern California HLB program

Dr. Etienne Rabe stated that the Science Subcommittee had no updates on the effectiveness of the HLB program in Southern California.

Ethyl Formate Registration Update

Jim Cranney stated that he is working with the registrant to continue monitoring the progress on the ethyl formate registration. The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) is reviewing the registration package. EPA is concerned that the formulation contains carbon dioxide, which can be considered an active ingredient and they are asking if it contributes to the efficacy of ethyl formate. Another concern is potential off-target exposure in groves when tarps are removed. The EPA has expressed positive reviews of the application and will work with the Department of Pesticide Regulation (DPR) on a concurrent review.

Neonicotinoid Risk Mitigation Update

Casey Creamer stated that DPR is reviewing and updating timelines on the release of the neonicotinoid risk mitigation document.

Data Analysis Tactical Operations Center (DATOC) Update:

ACP trapping technologies:

Holly Deniston-Sheets stated that DATOC did a review of ACP trapping technologies and found that there are no new technologies that are ready for field deployment. Studies in Texas showed that ACP can be successfully tested for CLAs on yellow panel traps using a different adhesive, compared to the traps used in California. Dr. Neil McRoberts commented that an experiment will be coordinated with Texas to test the traps with the different adhesives.

A Social-Ecological Systems Perspective of HLB:

Sara Garcia Figuera presented her dissertation on the Social-Ecological Systems of HLB within California. Sara stated that since the end of March 2021, a total of 2,290 HLB positive trees have been detected in residential locations. An area-wide management program (AWM) was established to slow the spread of HLB. The AWM recommended that insecticide treatments should be done twice a year. Sara stated that between the fall seasons of 2016 and 2020, the levels of public participation have been fluctuating. Based on results from a Florida study, California could benefit by creating

clearly defined boundaries for both Psyllid Management Areas (PMA) and Pest Control Districts (PCD) and coordinating with grower liaisons and CDFA. Over time, AWM participation for PMAs have steadily decreased while the PCD participation levels have steadily increased, in part due to grower liaison engagement. Results shows that AWM is beneficial at slowing the spread of HLB. If growers coordinate treatments within a 21-day period, then the counties can effectively control ACP and the spread of HLB.

CalTrap and Citrus Surveyor Update:

CalTrap:

Colleen Murphy-Vierra stated that she will test the desktop and administration applications that are being developed. CalTrap testing is currently behind schedule due to COVID. Ms. Murphy noted that training is being conducted with counties.

Citrus Surveyor:

Ms. Murphy stated the mobile application and a field manual is being developed. 75 percent of the mobile application is ready to be deployed onto the desktop application. The tentative release date for the application is June.

OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT

STRATEGIC PRIORITY 5 – Outreach and Education

Grower Liaison Working Group Update

Mr. Gutierrez stated that the two expectations documents for the grower liaisons (GLs) and the statewide coordinator are ready for approval. Additionally, Bob Atkins stated that there is still a candidate pending for a GL position in Riverside County while the position in Imperial County has been filled. Mr. Atkins also noted that the Division is working with Cal Fire to address and remove neglected and abandoned orchards in San Diego County.

Motion: To approve the grower liaison and statewide coordinator expectations documents.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: John Gless

Motion Carries: 14 Yeas (Kevin Ball, Ed Civerolo, Aaron Dillon, Bob Felts, Jr., John Gless, John C. Gless, Jim Gorden, Nick Hill, Mark McBroom, James McFarlane, Dr. Etienne Rabe, Gregorio Rundini, Roger Smith, Keith Watkins), and 1 abstention (Brad Carmen).

Outreach Update:

Price Adams stated that the homeowner outreach in Moreno Valley secured eight stories on HLB both online and in print. In the city of Long Beach, Nuffer, Smith, Tucker (NST) secured four stories online and in print. Ms. Adams worked with Dr. Morgan and Karla Huerta to distribute audio news about the release of *Tamarixia radiata* throughout the state. Multicultural outreach was conducted with Spanish and Asian language audiences. An article was published in “La Opinion”, one of the largest Spanish newspapers in the U.S. In the Asian community, a media campaign resulted in 20 media stories in Cantonese, Chinese, Mandarin, and Vietnamese. Ms. Adams stated

that NST used Facebook ads encouraging homeowners to contact their local County Agricultural Commissioner's office for citrus tree inspections. Industry outreach included circulating the 2020 Accomplishment Report including highlights and statistics from the past fiscal year. Ms. Adams stated some upcoming events include content distribution to officials in HLB quarantine cities that include social media and blog content. As COVID restrictions are being lifted, NST is being proactive and alerting residents to not transport citrus fruit or plant material across county lines

Review/Update Strategic Plan:

Ms. Adams stated that the strategic plan's priorities and framework will still be aligned with the division's resources to best meet industry's needs. NST has been conducting some in depth interviews with the Executive Committee and members of the USDA and CDFA to gain more information on what is and isn't working. Ms. Adams will report their findings when interviews are completed.

United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) Update:

Helene Wright stated that USDA and CDFA will establish an ACP/HLB cooperative agreement to include detection of other citrus pests.

California Citrus Mutual (CCM) Report:

Casey Creamer stated that the citrus bee regulations are being updated by DPR. The CCM Resources Committee met with representatives from Fresno, Ventura, Tulare, and Kern County Agricultural Commissioner's offices and answered their questions regarding citrus bee regulatory proposal changes and how they would be enforced in each county.

Citrus Research Board (CRB) Report:

Marcy Martin stated that the USDA has moved away from funding single projects under the HLB Multi-Agency Coordination (MAC) Group. A proposal has been submitted for a project to join growers and researchers on ACP control methods and address the spread of HLB.

Recap of Action Items from this Meeting:

ACTION ITEM: Ms. Hornbaker will distribute the motions relating to member election bylaws to Committee members.

ACTION ITEM: A CDFA working group will draft a white paper on SOS biology and regulatory impacts, including impacts to nurseries. The white paper will be vetted through the Science Subcommittee prior to being presented to the Full Committee

Closing Comments and Adjournment:

There were no closing comments and the meeting adjourned at 12:27pm.