

**CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION  
COMMITTEE (CPDPC) WEBINAR MEETING**

**Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, November 10, 2021**

**Committee Members Present:**

|                 |               |                  |
|-----------------|---------------|------------------|
| Craig Armstrong | John Gless    | Jared Plumlee    |
| Kevin Ball      | John C. Gless | Dr. Etienne Rabe |
| Brad Carmen     | Jim Gorden    | Gregorio Rundini |
| Aaron Dillon    | Nick Hill     | Roger Smith      |
| Bob Felts Jr.   | Mark McBroom  | Keith Watkins    |

**Committee Members Absent:**

**CDFA Staff:**

|                    |                   |                  |
|--------------------|-------------------|------------------|
| Kelley Aubushon    | Anmol Joshi       | Lydia Rodriguez  |
| Carl Baum          | Marina Kaiser     | Briana Russell   |
| Fernando Berber    | Sara Khalid       | Heather Scheck   |
| Karina Chu         | Sarah Kraft       | Claudia Vazquez  |
| Amelia Everett     | Lucita Kumagai    | Jennifer Willems |
| Alisha Garcia      | Zachary McCormack | Amelia Wright    |
| David Gutierrez    | Keith Okasaki     | Helene Wright    |
| Victoria Hornbaker | David Phong       |                  |
| Laura Irons        | Grace Radabaugh   |                  |

**Guests:**

|                |                        |                  |
|----------------|------------------------|------------------|
| Price Adams    | Jessica Leslie         | Sylvie Robillard |
| Teri Blaser    | Dylan Lomanto          | Cressida Silvers |
| Leah Cochran   | Magally Luque-Williams | Ned Thimmayya    |
| James Cranney  | Marcy Martin           | Greta Varien     |
| Lisa Finke     | Margaret O'Neill       | Judy Zaninovich  |
| Melinda Klein  | Sandra Olkowski        | Sandra Zwaal     |
| Melissa Cregan | Curtis Pate            |                  |

**Opening Comments**

The committee meeting was called to order at 9:01 a.m. via webinar. Jim Gorden welcomed the committee, staff, and members of the public participating online. There was a quorum for the meeting.

**Public Comments**

There were no public comments.

**APPROVAL OF CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS**

The Consent agenda contained minutes from September 22, 2021 Committee meeting.

**Motion:** To approve the consent agenda as presented.

**First:** Kevin Ball

**Second:** John C. Gless

**Motion Carries:** The motion passed unanimously.

## **FINANCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Review 2020/2021 Budget Expenditures and Revenue**

Bob reported a \$1,900,000 increase in budget expenditure since last month with a total of \$28,221,801 for Fiscal Year (FY) 2020-21. He explained that Fi\$Cal has projected a total expenditure of \$29,969,000 compared with the expected total expenditure of approximately \$32,000,000.

Bob reported that revenue for FY 2020-21 has increased by \$768,000 since the previous month to a total of \$15,502,635. He noted that there is only \$705,000 to meet the \$16,200,000 projected total revenue. He added that despite the large amount of fruit drop, the total projected revenue is still expected to be met.

### **Review 2021/2022 Budget Expenditures and Revenue**

Bob reported \$3,000 in total budget expenditure so far in FY 2021-22. He explained that there is no current revenue to report for FY 2021-22 due to harvesting just starting.

### **Macia's, Gini, & O'Connell Report**

Leah Cochran presented the Macia's, Gini, & O'Connell (MGO) scope of work which includes analysis of the current manual tracking system of expenditures and made recommendations for improved tracking for the California Department of Food and Agriculture's (CDFA) Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Division (CPDPD). The analysis included a review of funding sources and fund condition, a review of expenditures and expenditure tracking, an analysis of the current expenditure tracking process to determine if the existing protocol adequately captures expenditures for program activities, and advice on improving expenditure tracking and expenditure forecasting. Based on the review of the fund sources and condition report presented, MGO recommends that the fund condition statement report be presented to the Committee on a bi-annual basis and that the fiscal year be adjusted to align with the state fiscal year end of June 30<sup>th</sup>. Leah also noted that the use of manual tracking is redundant and unnecessary (apart from tracking of payroll, vehicle transactions, utilities and gas purchases) and results in errors, as the data was not reconcilable to Fi\$Cal. MGO recommends that expenditure tracking be based on Fi\$Cal data with preliminary results for July through September presented to the Committee with following adjustments presented by month (if material).

### **Review National Agricultural Statistics Service Crop Report and Crop Estimate**

Victoria presented the FY 2021-22 projected crop estimate with National Agricultural Statistics Service (NASS) comparisons. Navel oranges were projected at 72,350,000 cartons compared to the NASS projection of 70,000,000. Lemons were projected at 46,600,000 cartons compared to the NASS projection of 42,000,000. Mandarins were projected at 38,000,000 cartons compared to the NASS projection of 42,000,000. Valencias were projected at 18,600,000 cartons compared to the NASS projection of 17,000,000. Grapefruits were projected at 8,600,000 cartons compared to the NASS projection of 7,800,000. The total cartons estimated were 184,450,000 compared to the NASS projection of 178,800,000. With the assessment rate of \$0.07 per carton, there is an approximate \$400,000 difference in between the Citrus Research Board (CRB) projected revenue and NASS projections.

## **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT**

### **CPDPC Bylaws Discussion**

Victoria stated that there is an ongoing discussion about making edits to the bylaws in the Executive Committee meetings, but there was no consensus on making edits.

## **CEQA Decision and Impacts to CDFA**

Ned Thimmayya reported that on November 15, 2021 the Third District Court of Appeals will issue a decision regarding CDFA's Program Environmental Impact Report (PEIR) litigation following pending appeals on whether the PEIR complies with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). CDFA did not prevail on all counts of the appeal, so on November 24, the case will be remanded back to the trial court where the court will issue the new judgement. Ned explained that when the decision becomes final, the stay will be lifted on the trial court injunction that prohibited the CDFA from relying on the PEIR for program activities directly taken by the Department. Victoria explained that current CPDPD activities may proceed under alternative CEQA compliance guidelines.

## **Establish Nominating Committee for January Elections**

Jim explained that a nominating committee was recommended and agreed upon by the CPDPC to ensure an adequate number of Committee Officer candidates for election. Roger Smith and John C. Gless have volunteered to tentatively lead the initial Nominating Committee.

**Motion:** To establish Roger Smith and John C. Gless as the Nominating Committee for the January Executive Committee elections.

**First:** Dr. Etienne Rabe

**Second:** Jared Plumlee

**Motion Carries:** The motion passed unanimously.

## **OPERATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Staffing Challenges (Seasonal/Permanent)**

Victoria explained the challenges of hiring seasonal staff include the low rate of pay, limitations of working only 189 days per year, and working without benefits. Permanent positions include higher pay, no limitation to working days, and do receive benefits. In addition to difficulty hiring into seasonal positions, approximately 30-50 percent of seasonal employees leave employment to take better paying and permanent positions in other CDFA divisions or state agencies. She also noted that CPDPD does not have the authority to hire additional permanent positions above the 168 already approved positions. Additional permanent positions would need to be requested via a budget change proposal to the Governor's office.

### **Laboratory Update**

Lucita Kumagai presented the laboratory update for the huanglongbing (HLB) testing program from the Plant Pest Diagnostics Center. 7,007 plant samples and 3,786 Asian citrus psyllid (ACP) samples were received in October, averaging 6,400 plant samples and 2,600 ACP samples per month. A total of 26,000 ACP samples were received this year with 29.47 percent from Los Angeles County, 27.02 percent from San Diego County, 18.85 percent from Riverside County, 9.47 percent from San Bernardino County, 7.22 percent from Orange County, and 7.09 percent from Ventura County. A total of 54,000 plant samples have been received this year with 19.07 percent from Los Angeles County, 18.83 percent from Orange County, 10.95 percent from San Bernardino County, 10.94 percent from Riverside County, 6.01 percent from Fresno County, 3.07 percent from Tulare County, 2.83 percent from Kern County, 2.80 percent from Imperial County, and 1.73 percent from Santa Clara County. Combined ACP and plant samples for this year equal a total of 79,392 samples at a 48 percent laboratory operating capacity. A total of 2,619 trees were found positive for HLB from 2012-2021 with the majority of HLB positive trees located in Los Angeles and Orange County areas.

### **HLB Risk Survey**

David Phong presented data for 2020 risk survey cycle 2 and 2021 cycle 1. A total of 37 counties and 1,597 survey grids will be surveyed from November 2021 through April 2022. He explained that 2021 risk survey cycle 1 is 93 percent complete after beginning in mid-March

2021 with 32 of 36 allocated counties having been surveyed, 50,086 properties visited, and 24,901 properties sampled. Cycle 1 should be completed by the end of November 2021, at that time staff will begin working on 2021 risk cycle 2.

### **CDFA Operational Update**

David Gutierrez presented the operational update including HLB delimitation survey and treatment areas for the Southern, Central, and Northern Districts. Riverside County has completed all re-treatments. San Diego County has also completed re-treatments with no new positive finds in that area, however 9 properties have refused treatment. Outreach letters are being sent out to the refusal properties while work begins on the abatement process. He explained that from August to October, a total of 118 trees were removed and 53 trees are scheduled and pending removal. Areawide treatments have been completed for the 2021 Summer and Fall cycle within the time frame and the 2022 Winter cycle will take place from mid-December through March 2022. Commodity survey will begin this month in the Southern District. Detection trapping is ongoing in Fresno and Madera Counties. Delimitation trapping is ongoing in Kern, Madera, and San Luis Obispo Counties with delimitation traps removed from Kings County in September. A total of 14 50-meter treatment areas have been completed in Kern County since July 2021. In Northern District, delimitation survey ended on October 15 in Contra Costa County with delimitation trapping continuing in Santa Clara County at 24 total grids, 549 total delimitation traps, and ongoing monthly *Tamarixia* releases. HLB risk survey is beginning in Sacramento, San Francisco, Santa Clara, Sonoma, Stanislaus, Tehama, and Yolo counties with winter trapping in 23 counties starting November 1. Year-round county trapping continues in three counties.

### **CDFA Regulatory and County Agreement Update**

Keith Okasaki presented the county monthly activity report from July 2020 through June 2021. Keith reported FY 2020-21 has closed out and that overall inspections of growers, packers, and fruit sellers have increased in recent years. He says that only a few invoices have been received so far for FY 2021-22, but totals for the current year along with violation information will be reported at the next Committee meeting. He added that several counties have approached CPDPD for additional training for their inspectors. He explained the majority of violations are issued to haulers failing to properly safeguard fruit when hauling as well as violations issued to growers and packers for not meeting cleanliness standards or failure to notify offices of incoming and outgoing shipments.

### **Grower Liaison Update**

Sara Khalid reported that there were no ACP finds for Fresno, Madera, or Northern and Southern Tulare Counties and that both grower liaisons have been continuing to update the Psyllid Management Area lists. In Kern County, there have been 4 ACP detections as of October 5 and all citrus growers within 800-meters of finds have made the requested treatments. In Ventura County growers continue with fall ACP area-wide treatments through mid-November while winter ACP area-wide treatment is scheduled to begin January 3, 2022. In San Bernardino County growers are also applying all ACP area-wide treatments with winter ACP area-wide treatments to begin mid-November. Sandra Zwaal met with the new San Bernardino County Agricultural Commissioner (CAC) and Deputies and was requested by the Redlands Citrus Preservation Committee to provide the committee with an ACP/HLB presentation to update newer committee members. In San Diego County, winter ACP area-wide treatments will begin in early January 2022. In Santa Barbara County, fall area-wide treatments have ended and winter area-wide treatments are scheduled for January 2022. There are no new ACP detections in San Luis Obispo County. In Imperial County, area-wide treatments completed in September for conventional groves and in mid-October for organic groves. Curtis Pate also presented an ACP/HLB update at the recent Desert Valleys California Association of Pest Control Advisers meeting.

## **Biocontrol Update**

Grace Radabaugh presented the ACP biocontrol update for October 2021. She reported that biocontrol releases have been impacted due to staffing issues, challenges regarding COVID-19 as well as supply-chain issues. Other problems encountered included an unusually high infestation of thrips, several power outages at both facilities, and an ant infestation in collaborator field cages. Despite challenges, staff have released approximately 3,000,000 *Tamarixia* this year with 1,800,000 released in Los Angeles and Orange Counties around HLB find areas and along major highways. Additionally, over 700,000 were released in Riverside, San Bernardino, San Diego, and Imperial Counties around border areas and highways. She reported that the Santa Maria ACP finds have been noted and that staff is working with Michael Soltero to conduct biocontrol releases in that area. Monitoring continues to be carried out at all 28 sites with almost no ACP detected. Research shows a 75 percent reduction of ACP at the 28 monitoring sites over the four-year monitoring study with the use of *Tamarixia* as a significant factor.

## **SCIENCE SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Effectiveness of Southern California HLB Program**

Etienne reported that the Science Subcommittee is working on redefining the documentation for presentation to the CPDPC and will be worked into the Science Advisory Panel meeting.

### **Ethyl Formate Registration Update**

Etienne explained that James Cranney advised the Science Subcommittee regarding administrative issues with the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency review of ethyl formate, however registration is still expected in Summer of 2022. James will be organizing a webinar with growers on November 19 to review the potential uses of ethyl formate.

### **Neonicotinoid Risk Mitigation Update**

Etienne reported that Casey Creamer at California Citrus Mutual indicated that there is no movement or anything new to report.

### **DATOC Update**

Etienne reported that Dr. Neil McRoberts had no new information to report. Holly Deniston-Sheets has taken another position and Rick Dunn will cover in her absence until a replacement is hired. Sandra Olkowski will also be working with DATOC and assisting Dr. Neil McRoberts at the laboratory as well.

### **Sweet Orange Scab (SOS) Biology and Regulatory Discussion**

Keith Okasaki explained that the SOS Working Group was formed and tasked with evaluating the biology of SOS and the regulatory impacts of either a state interior quarantine or a state-wide quarantine. After presenting both scenarios, the Science Subcommittee recommends continuing the path of pursuing a state interior quarantine where the existing regulated areas would be transitioned to quarantines through regular rulemaking, with the caveat that the working group will reduce the size of the quarantine area from the current 5-mile radius to 1 or 1.5 miles based on SOS biology. Additionally, the working group will continue to pursue altering the triggering event that causes a quarantine or quarantine expansion by petitioning the United States Department of Agriculture (USDA) to consider the trigger to be detecting reproductive spores rather than a positive polymerase chain reaction test, petition USDA to lessen quarantine requirements to allow tarping in place of stem and leaf removal for growers, continue research to minimize packinghouse procedures, and begin working with USDA on an exit strategy to remove areas from SOS regulation through survey.

**Motion:** To pursue regular rulemaking for a state Sweet Orange Scab (SOS) interior quarantine to transition existing SOS regulated areas to quarantine areas, with the caveat that the working

group will reduce the size of the quarantine area from the current 5-mile regulated area radius to 1-mile radius based on SOS biology.

**First:** Mark McBroom

**Second:** Keith Watkins

**Motion Carries:** The motion passed unanimously.

### **Program Review / Science Advisory Panel (SAP)**

Etienne reported that a list of potential panel members was identified and will be presented to Secretary Ross for selection and approval. Each candidate must be contacted to ascertain willingness to serve if selected. The program will include subject matter experts to advise the SAP and present pertinent program information to the SAP. A funding total of \$20,000 will be required for travel, accommodation, and honoraria. The panel will likely meet between early February and the end of March 2022 in Sacramento, CA. While the details of the program still need to be agreed upon, details will be discussed at a 2-day in-person meeting followed by a virtual meeting to complete a report. The tentative itinerary and scheduling were discussed by the Committee.

**Motion:** To approve a \$20,000 budget for travel, accommodation, and honoraria for Science Advisory Panel members with invoices to be reviewed by the Executive Committee.

**First:** Aaron Dillon

**Second:** Mark McBroom

**Motion Carries:** The motion passed unanimously.

### **OUTREACH SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT**

#### **Outreach and Education**

Price Adams reported that in-person outreach opportunities are back for the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Program (CPDPP), including booths at the Crop Consultant Conference, Oceanside Harbor Days, California Contract Cities Association, League of California Cities, and San Diego Farm Bureau Farm and Nursery Expo. Based on the recent HLB detection and quarantine expansion in San Diego County, Nuffer Smith Tucker (NST) coordinated outreach efforts directed toward homeowners, industry members, and elected officials. NST also worked very closely with the CAC's office for 48 additional earned media coverage outlets. NST also coordinated a hybrid in-person and virtual San Diego County Grower Meeting with presentations by Grower Liaison Sandra Zwaal, CDFA, San Diego CAC, University of California (UC) and San Diego Pest Control District. In ongoing media outreach, interviews were secured in San Luis Obispo regarding *Tamarixia* releases as well as with KEYT, featuring CDFA and a local Santa Barbara grower, and Kern Valley Sun. NST also held several deskside briefings with city officials in Oceanside, Vista, and Carlsbad. The City of Oceanside and Imperial County Deputy CAC Nelson Perez were also honored as the recipients of the recent Citrus Hero Awards. NST is currently working toward developing social media influencer plans, a refresh of CaliforniaCitrusThreat.org, including improved user experience and search engine optimization, homeowner outreach plan development with multicultural outreach and education, and retail nursery education.

#### **USDA UPDATE**

Helene Wright reported that USDA is still under a continuing resolution.

#### **CRB REPORT**

Marcy Martin introduced Melinda Klein to review the Citrus Research and Field Trial project rollout. Melinda announced that a position for a project manager has been advertised to help with this project. She stated that they had calls with USDA regarding data management with assistance from CPDPD. Marcy also announced that Dr. Monique Rivera will be leaving her position with the UC and that an advertisement to fill her current position will be posted in early 2022.

## **CITRUS PEST DETECTION PROGRAM REPORT**

Dr. Subhas Hajeri presented the San Joaquin Valley Pest Control District updates for the Citrus Pest Detection Program by Central California Tristeza Eradication Agency. He explained the primary focus of the program is on ACP and HLB survey. Since starting survey using 3D traps, 2,244 traps have been deployed to all districts with 20,761 trees visually inspected. He added that a decrease in the number of visits to districts and visual inspections in the month of July was due to restrictions and concerns regarding COVID-19.

## **RECAP OF ACTION ITEMS FROM THIS MEETING**

**ACTION ITEM:** Victoria will review the process of moving to state Fi\$Cal reporting at the Finance Subcommittee Meeting on December 7, 2021.

**ACTION ITEM:** The use of spray and move treatment material will be discussed at the Interim Science Subcommittee Meeting on December 7, 2021.

**ACTION ITEM:** Committee members interested in elected positions will be discussed at the Committee Meeting on January 12, 2022.

## **CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT**

There were no closing comments. The meeting adjourned at 11:57 a.m.