

March 20, 2014

DMS NOTICE QC - 14 -01 DISCARD: RETAIN

# TO: WEIGHTS AND MEASURES OFFICIALS

SUBJECT: Settlement – Safeway Inc., a Delaware Corporation

Enclosed is a copy of the Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction issued against Safeway Inc., a Delaware Corporation. The case was filed on March 5, 2014, by the District Attorneys' Offices of Marin, Alameda, Fresno, Napa, Sacramento, Santa Cruz, Solano, Ventura, and Sonoma Counties for overcharging consumers and selling or advertising meat by the each, violations of California Business and Professions Code Sections 12024.2 and 12024.5, respectively.

The California Department of Food and Agriculture, Division of Measurement Standards worked with weights and measures investigators from over 21 counties on this case. The total settlement was for \$2,250,000. Civil penalties amounted to \$2,000,000, agency costs were \$200,000, and \$50,000 of cy pres restitution was placed in the Consumer Protection Trust Fund.

Marin County should be sure to report these penalties on the County Monthly Report. All participating counties should separately record their individual investigative cost reimbursements in the appropriate columns on the report.

We appreciate the fine work done by the District Attorney's Offices along with the state and county investigators that documented and caused to be prosecuted these violations. If you have any questions, please contact Kathy de Contreras, Supervising Special Investigator, Enforcement Branch at (916) 229-3047, or <u>katherine.decontreras@cdfa.ca.gov</u>.

Sincerely,

Krishing Many

Kristin J. Macey Director

Enclosure

cc: Gary Leslie, County/State Liaison, CDFA



	(						
1 EDWARD S. BERBERIAN District Attorney, County of Marin	MAR - 5 2014						
2 Andres H. Perez, Deputy District Attorney 3 State Bar No. 186219	KIM TURNLA, Court Executive Officer MARIN COUNTY SUPERIOR COURT By: C. Lucchesi, Deputy						
3501 Civic Center Dr., Rm. 130 San Rafael, CA 94903 Tel: (415) 473-6450							
					(For list of additional Plaintiff's counsel, See attached Exhibit 1)		
7 Attorneys for Plaintiff							
SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA, COUNTY OF MARIN							
9 0							
THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF CALI							
2 Plaint vs.	FINAL JUDGMENT AND           PERMANENT INJUNCTION						
3 SAFEWAY INC., a Delaware Corporation,							
4 Defen	idant.						
Plaintiff, the People of the State	Plaintiff, the People of the State of California ("the People"), appearing through its						
	Attorney for the County of Marin, by Andres H. Perez,						
Deputy District Attorney; Nancy E. O'Mall	ley, District Attorney for the County of Alameda, by						
Matthew Beltramo, Deputy District Attorne	y; Elizabeth A. Egan, District Attorney for the County						
of Fresno, by Michael Brummel, Deputy District Attorney; Gary Lieberstein, District Attorney for							
the County of Napa, by Catherine Borsetto, Deputy District Attorney; Jan Scully, District Attorney							
for the County of Sacramento, by Ruth Young, Deputy District Attorney; Bob Lee, District							
Attorney for the County of Santa Cruz, by William Atkinson, Assistant District Attorney; Donald							
A. du Bain, District Attorney for the County of Solano, by Criselda Gonzalez, Deputy District							
Attorney; Gregory D. Totten, District Attorney for the County of Ventura, by Mitchell F. Disney,							
Deputy District Attorney; Jill R. Ravitch, District Attorney for the County of Sonoma, by							
Mathew T. Cheever, Deputy District Attorney; and Defendant Safeway Inc., a Delaware							
Corporation, appearing through its attorneys, Robert A. Gordon, Esquire and Valerie D. Lewis Page 1 of 17							
PEOPLE V. SAFEWAY INC., FINAL JUDGMENT AND PERMANENT INJUNCTION							

,

.

Esq., and it appearing to the Court that the parties hereto have stipulated and consented to the
 entry of this Final Judgment and Permanent Injunction ("Final Judgment") without the taking of
 proof, and without this Final Judgment being construed as an admission by Safeway of any fact,
 liability, issue of law, conclusion of law or violation of any statutory or regulatory law, and the
 Court having considered the matter and the pleadings, and good cause appearing therefore, IT IS
 HEREBY ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED:

JURISDICTION

8 1. This action is brought under California law, and this Court has jurisdiction of the
9 subject matter and the parties.

### APPLICABILITY

2. This Final Judgment is applicable to Safeway Inc., a Delaware corporation, its 11 12 officers, directors, representatives, successors, assignees, and all persons, partnerships, corporations, 13 and other entities acting under, by, through, on behalf of, or in concert with Safeway Inc. as it 14 relates to its business in California only, with actual or constructive notice or knowledge of this 15 Final Judgment. This Final Judgment is also applicable to any and all subsidiaries of Safeway Inc. 16 doing business in California, including but not limited to The Vons Companies, Inc., and to any 17 stores owned and/or operated by them, including but not limited to Pavilions, and their respective 18 officers, directors, representatives, successors, assignces and all persons, partnerships, corporations, 19 and other entities acting under, by, through, on behalf of, or in concert with any such subsidiary 20 with actual or constructive knowledge of this Final Judgment. All of these defendants, persons and 21 entities shall hereinafter be referred to collectively as "Safeway."

22

7

10

### **INJUNCTION**

3. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code §§ 17203 and 17535, Safeway is
permanently enjoined and restrained, with respect to any and all California stores it owns or
operates (hereinafter "California Stores"), from committing, directly or indirectly, any or all of the
following acts or omissions:

A. Violating Business and Professions Code § 17500 by, with the intent directly
 or indirectly to dispose of real or personal property or to perform services or to induce any member
 Page 2 of 17

of the public to enter into an obligation relating to such property or services, making or causing to be made any representation concerning that property or those services, or concerning any circumstance or matter of fact connected with the proposed performance thereof, which is untrue or misleading, and which is known to be, or which by the exercise of reasonable care should be known to be, untrue or misleading (as used herein, the term "misleading" includes statements which although true, are either actually misleading, or which have a capacity, likelihood or tendency to deceive or confuse the person to whom they are directed).

ſ

8

B. Violating any of the provisions of Business & Professions Code § 12024.5.

9 C. Charging, at the time of sale of a commodity, an amount greater than the
10 advertised, posted, marked, displayed or quoted price for that commodity, in violation of Business
11 and Professions Code § 12024.2, subdivision (a)(1).

D. Computing, at the time of sale of a commodity, an amount greater than a true extension of a price per unit, that is then advertised, posted, marked, displayed, or quoted for that commodity, in violation of Business and Professions Code § 12024.2, subdivision (a)(1).

E. Charging, at the time of sale of a commodity, an amount greater than the lowest price posted on the commodity itself or on a shelf tag that corresponds to the commodity, notwithstanding any limitation of the time period for which the posted price is in effect, in violation of Business and Professions Code § 12024.2, subdivision (a)(2).

F. Except where otherwise required by law, failing to honor any valid Safeway coupons, discounts or offers, whether disseminated to the public or individuals, including, but not limited to, any offers, coupons or discounts in the "Just for U", "Club Card" or other Safeway electronic discount or coupon programs, wherein any eligible customer is overcharged or does not receive the full amount of the valid offered or discounted price.

G. Failing to clearly and conspicuously disclose any inclusions, exceptions or
limitations to any Safeway offers, coupons or discounts, including but not limited to any Safeway
offers, coupons, or discounts in the "Just for U", "Club Card" or other Safeway electronic discount
or coupon programs.

28

111

Page 3 of 17

H. Making or disseminating any false or misleading statement with respect to
 the price of any item offered for sale.

4. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code §§ 17203 and 17535, Safeway is hereby
ordered and mandated to implement and adhere to the following Price-Accuracy Policy at
California Stores:

A. If the price charged for an item is higher than Safeway's lowest applicable
advertised price, Safeway shall, upon notice, immediately give the customer the item for free if the
lowest applicable advertised price is \$5.00 or less or, if the item's lowest applicable advertised price
is over \$5.00, immediately give the customer a \$5.00 Safeway gift card and refund any excess
amount collected for the item.

B. Safeway's Price-Accuracy Policy shall be subject to the following terms and
conditions:

(i) Safeway's Price-Accuracy Policy shall exclude purchases of fuel,
alcoholic beverages, dairy, tobacco and non-OTC pharmacy products.

(ii) As used herein, "lowest applicable advertised price" means the lowest non-retracted advertised, posted, marked, displayed or quoted price offered to the public for an item at the store at which the item is scanned, and after any other coupons and discounts are applied. Personalized prices (e.g. Just for U program) offered to an individual are not "offered to the public" for purposes of this definition and shall constitute the lowest applicable advertised price only as to those individuals who have been offered the personalized price.

(iii) If the consumer is overcharged for two or more items in a single
store visit, the policy shall apply only to the higher priced item. Only one such free item or \$5.00
gift card shall be provided per transaction.

(iv) Except as set forth herein, Safeway's Price-Accuracy Policy to
provide the item free or give a \$5.00 gift card shall not be limited as to the number of times it may
apply to any individual customer.

27 ||///

28 ////

Page 4 of 17

(v) Gift cards issued pursuant to the Price Accuracy Policy shall be
 deemed to be distributed as part of a "promotional program" within the meaning of Civil Code
 section 1749.5(d)(1); however, the gift cards shall not contain an expiration date.

С, Any Safeway cashier, customer service agent or Safeway retail management 4 personnel who is aware or is made aware with reasonable certainty of an overcharge, shall take 5 immediate steps to comply with Safeway's Price-Accuracy Policy whether at the point of sale or at 6 7 a later time. If a cashier believes he or she is unable to resolve the issue immediately, the cashier shall immediately summon a customer service agent or Safeway retail management personnel to the 8 9 check stand to assist the customer. If the overcharge discrepancy involves an electronic coupon program, Safeway may at its discretion have the matter exclusively handled immediately by a 10 11 customer service agent or Safeway retail store management personnel. In all instances, Safeway 12 shall act without undue delay in confirming whether an overcharge has occurred.

D. Safeway shall not make any statements or take any actions which would directly or indirectly prevent or discourage Safeway's Price-Accuracy Policy from being followed, complied with, enforced by or adhered to by Safeway employees, nor shall they discourage customers from utilizing the policy.

E. Safeway fuel stations may only be required to adjudicate non-Just For You
electronic coupon price accuracy discrepancies for items actually purchased at the specific fuel
station.

F. Price accuracy discrepancies arising from purchases made at Safeway
pharmacies or wellness centers may at Safeway's discretion be handled exclusively by a customer
service agent or Safeway retail store management personnel.

23

5. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code §§ 17203 and 17535, and by no later
than forty-five (45) days after entry of this Final Judgment, Safeway shall post signs (hereinafter
"Price-Accuracy Notice") in the manner and locations described below at all California Stores in the
following words:

28

///

Page 5 of 17

	(		
. 1	PRICE-ACCURACY GUARANTEE		
2	.If we overcharge you for any item and the lowest applicable advertised price		
3	is \$5.00 or less, we will give you the item for free.		
4	•		
5	If the lowest applicable advertised price is over \$5.00, we will give you a		
6	\$5.00 gift card and charge the correct price.		
7			
8	If you are overcharged for more than one of the same item, the free item or		
9	gift card is limited to one of those items.		
10			
11	If you are overcharged for two or more different items, the free item or gift		
12	card policy applies to the highest priced item.		
13			
14	Excludes Tobacco, Alcoholic Beverages, Gas, Dairy & Pharmacy.		
15			
16	Questions, Comments or Complaints Call: 1-800-283-9535		
17			
18	A. The Price-Accuracy Notice shall include a toll-free telephone number for		
19	consumer complaints, questions or comments regarding overcharges, scanning errors and Safeway		
20	Price-Accuracy Notice. The toll-free number shall be exclusively dedicated to the taking of an		
21	creating records of complaints, questions, comments and resolution of alleged overcharge		
22	scanning errors and Safeway's Price-Accuracy Notice. With respect to such records, Safeway sha		
23	record and retain the number and nature of the consumer contacts received for a period of no les		
24	than three (3) years from date of the consumer contact, such information to include all availab		
25	identifying information for the consumer, along with the date, store number and identity of the		
26	item(s) in question.		
27	B. The Price-Accuracy Notice shall be printed on signs posted in a clear		
28	conspicuous and unobstructed location at each customer service desk and each place a point of sa Page 6 of 17		

device or cash register is located. For signs located at each place a point of sale device or cash 1 register is located, Safeway shall place the sign in at least one of the three following locations: 1) on 2 the horizontal surface of all check writing pads (i.e. the flat surfaces where customers typically write 3 checks); 2) on the vertical surfaces in the customer's line of sight while waiting in the check stand 4 lane; or 3) on the surface fronting the check stand conveyer belt where the customer first enters the 5 check stand line. To ensure readability and comprehension by the consumer, these Price-Accuracy 6 Notice signs shall be no smaller than 5" x 8"; words shall be in a font size not less than 16-point; 7 against a contrasting background; and each sentence either bulleted or separated by a blank line. 8

C. The Price-Accuracy Notice shall also be printed on both sides of overhead
hanging sign(s), in readily legible type, in a font size not less than 96-point, against a contrasting
background and posted clearly and conspicuously so as to be easily read by customers immediately
before reaching each check stand, at each California Store and as set forth below:

(i) For stores having eight (8) or more check stands, Safeway shall have
one overhead hanging sign for every four (4) check stand lanes;

(ii) For stores having fewer than eight (8) check stands, Safeway shall
have no fewer than two overhead hanging signs spaced as evenly as possible among the check stand
lanes.

(iii) In addition to any overhead hanging signs required by (i) or (ii)
above, for stores with self-checkout lanes, Safeway shall be required to have only a single overhead
hanging sign above the self-checkout area, regardless of the number of self-checkout stations.

D. Safeway shall also display the Price-Accuracy Notice at additional or
different locations agreed to by the parties as designed to meet the compliance objectives described
in paragraph 9.

E. Fuel stations are only required to display the Price-Accuracy Notice at the 1) service glass window facing the customer or 2) the service counter. No overhead signage is required.

27 ||///

28 ///

Page 7 of 17

F. Should the Third-Party Auditor or an Inspector from any County Weights and Measures Department, State of California Department of Food and Agriculture, or any District Attorney's Office, find a violation regarding placement of signage, Safeway shall have seven (7) days from any oral or written notice of the violation to correct the violation without said violation constituting a violation of the this injunction.

6

1

2

3

4

5

6. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code §§ 17203 and 17535, and in an effort to 7 8 provide greater clarity to consumers regarding "local" fresh produce offered for sale in California 9 Stores, Safeway shall not make any statements, representations, or otherwise convey the impression through any advertising medium including, but not limited to, store signage, newspapers, circulars, 10 internet, or any other form of media, that an item of produce is "Locally Grown," "Local" or that the 11 purchase of the item would support local growers, unless, at a minimum: 12

The item of produce was grown in California, with the exception of produce 13 Α. grown in a U.S. state bordering California and grown within fifty (50) miles from the California 14 Safeway store at which the item of produce is offered and/or advertised to be offered, for sale; and 15

For items grown in California, the item is identified as "California Grown" Β. 16 or "Locally Grown in California," "CA" may be substituted for "California." 17

Should the State of California or the United States promulgate a law or regulation 7. 18 defining the use of the term "local" or "locally grown" or similar term for such purposes, Safeway 19 20will comply with the law, this Judgment notwithstanding.

- 21
- 22

### THIRD-PARTY AUDITOR

Within thirty (30) calendar days of the entry of this Final Judgment, Safeway shall 23 8. retain the services of a third-party auditor ("Auditor"), such Auditor to be identified to and 24 accepted by the People prior to entry of Judgment, who within a period of three (3) years will 25 conduct three annual compliance audits of California Stores as provided herein below. The 26 Auditor will submit annual reports of those audits to Safeway, with a copy to the People, within 27fifteen (15) calendar days of each anniversary date of the entry of this Final Judgment. However, 28 Page 8 of 17

during the first year, the Auditor will conduct two quarterly compliance audits prior to the
completion of the first annual audit. In preparation for the first quarterly compliance audit, the
Auditor, in conjunction with Safeway, will develop an audit protocol meeting the requirements
of this Final Judgment and shall provide it to the People for review and comment. In addition to
any other audit objectives deemed appropriate by Safeway, the compliance audits shall evaluate
Safeway's compliance with paragraphs 3, 4, 5, and 6 of this Final Judgment.

7

A. The audit protocol shall include, but not be limited to:

8 (i) Scan Verification: The scan-verification protocol shall include a
9 recurring program not less than once per month involving the random selection of a statistically
10 significant number of items (regular, sale and specially priced), from a randomly selected,
11 statistically significant cross-section of stores throughout the State of California. The auditor
12 shall determine the items, the number of items and stores based on the criteria set forth herein.

13 (ii) Verification of Price-Accuracy Policy compliance: The audit shall 14 verify whether the correct Price-Accuracy Notices are displayed as required; confirm that all 15 Safeway cashiers, third-party vendor cashiers, Safeway customer care and Safeway retail store management personnel (applicable employees) are aware of the Price-Accuracy Policy and take 16 steps to comply. The audit shall verify that all employees and third-party vendors with the 17 ability to operate a point of sale device or register have been trained on the Price-Accuracy 18 Policy. For purposes of this Judgment, "third-party vendor" shall not include any vendor who 19 operates a point of sale device or cash register within a Safeway retail store only for the sale of 20 21 the yendor's own products or services (e.g., Wells Fargo Bank and Panda Express).

(iii) The audit reports, based on the parties' agreed upon protocol and as required above shall include, but not be limited to, a complete description and discussion of all audit objectives, scope, criteria, audit activities, audit findings and audit conclusions, recommendations, and shall identify and discuss all audit evidence considered or relied upon to support the audit conclusions. The audit reports shall contain a listing of any written advisements of violation, including formal Notices of Violation and inspection reports directed at and maintained at any Safeway retail store by any local or state agency that identifies any Page 9 of 17 violation and/or alleged violation of any consumer protection law relating to advertising, price
 accuracy or weighing accuracy, retained at the store.

ĺ

3 (iv) Such reports shall also include, but not be limited to, a brief
4 description of the disposition of any such noted violations and what corrective measures, if any,
5 were taken by Safeway.

6 (v) Within 30 days after receipt by the People of each audit report,
7 Safeway shall provide the People with a plan to correct any deficiencies raised in the audit
8 reports.

B. Pursuant to Business and Professions Code sections 17203 and 17535.
Safeway shall continue to maintain a program to minimize pricing discrepancies, which shall
include at least the following:

(i) Safeway shall designate an employee with responsibility to function as a
Price-Accuracy Coordinator ("PAC") at each store, who shall conduct pricing accuracy inspections
and audits as described herein. Safeway shall employ at least one employee in each store who is
specially trained to perform the PAC's job. Each store shall have a minimum of 40 hours per week
allocated to the duties of the PAC. Safeway may use existing personnel to execute the duties of the
PAC.

(ii) Starting no later than 30 days after the entry of this Final Judgment, and continuing thereafter, the PAC shall conduct price accuracy inspections/audits of the store to monitor the accuracy of pricing and removal of all expired sale and price tags. The PAC shall conduct price accuracy inspections/audits of no less than 500 items per week. The PAC shall record results of each inspection/audit and Safeway shall maintain records of such inspections/audits at its corporate headquarters for a period of three years from the date of creation.

(iii) If Safeway is aware or on notice that there is any discrepancy between
an advertised price (e.g. an advertisement, display sign, shelf price tag, label or any other expression
of price) and the scan price, which discrepancy can be corrected at the store, Safeway shall institute
corrective action no later than four (4) hours after discovery of such discrepancy. If there is a
discrepancy requiring action by Safeway corporate headquarters, Safeway shall institute corrective
Page 10 of 17

1 action within twenty-four (24) hours, if noticed Monday through Friday, or within thirty-six (36) 2 hours, if noticed Saturday or Sunday, and after a determination that the discrepancy has resulted 3 from a system-wide problem. Safeway corporate headquarters shall create a log of errors and corrective actions, which shall be maintained for a period of three years after their creation. The 4 5 time to correct discrepancies provided in this paragraph shall in no way effect Safeway's 6 requirements to immediately comply with the Price Accuracy Policy provisions of this Judgment. Safeway shall not be required to log errors discovered by the PAC in the course of scope of their 7 8 duties listed herein. Safeway shall also not be required to log errors due to unsubstantiated 9 consumer complaints.

ĺ

15

16

28

///

C. Safeway shall make all records required to be maintained by this Judgment
 available for inspection and copying to any District Attorney, District Attorney Investigator, City
 Attorney, any authorized representative of the State of California Department of Agriculture,
 Division of Measurement Standards, or any representative of the County Sealer or Director of a
 County Agricultural Commissioner at a reasonable time and place upon reasonable notice.

### **COMPLIANCE**

9. For the purpose of securing compliance with the terms of this Final Judgment,
Safeway shall do the following:

A. Within thirty (30) days from the date of entry of this Final Judgment, provide all present officers, directors and managers directly responsible for California retail pricing offers with a copy of this Final Judgment. Future officers, directors and managers in these designated areas of responsibility shall be served within thirty (30) days of their appointment by Safeway. Safeway shall also provide a copy of this Final Judgment or a summary of its terms to all California retail advertising personnel, retail cashier supervisors, customer service personnel and customer care representatives.

26 (i) Safeway shall require persons listed in this section to sign an
27 acknowledgement that they have received and read a copy of this Final Judgment or summary.

Page 11 of 17

1(ii)Safeway shall retain the signed acknowledgements of the persons2listed in this section for no less than three years from the date of signature.

3 (iii) Upon request by any party, Safeway shall produce copies of the
4 signed acknowledgements within two weeks of the request as long as this Final Judgment remains
5 in effect.

6 (iv) Persons who assume such positions in the future shall be given this
7 Final Judgment within 30 days of assuming the covered position.

B. Within thirty (30) days from the date of entry of this Final Judgment,
Safeway shall serve all present employees, persons or entities responsible for advertising,
marketing, or development or design of California packaging for Safeway products with a copy
of this Final Judgment. Future employees in these designated areas of responsibility shall be
served within thirty (30) days of their hire date with Safeway.

13 (i) Safeway shall require persons listed in this section to sign an
14 acknowledgement that they have received and read a copy of this Final Judgment.

(ii) Safeway shall retain the signed acknowledgements of the persons
listed in this section for no less than three years from the date of signature.

17 (iii) Upon request by any party but not more than twice per year, Safeway
18 shall produce copies of the signed acknowledgements within two weeks of the request as long as
19 this Final Judgment remains in effect.

20 (iv) Persons who assume such positions in the future shall be given the
21 Final Judgment within 30 days of assuming the covered position.

C. Within thirty (30) days from the date of entry of this Final Judgment, Safeway shall provide all current employees of Safeway, and any applicable third- party vendors who operate Safeway point of sale registers or devices, or assist customers at customer service inside a Safeway store, with a copy or summary of the Price-Accuracy Policy. Safeway employees and applicable third-party vendors hired after the entry of this Final Judgment shall be provided with a copy or summary of the Price Accuracy Policy within thirty (30) days of their hire date with Safeway.

Page 12 of 17

(i) Safeway shall provide training on complying with the Price
 Accuracy Policy to current employees and third-party vendors within (30) days of the date of
 entry of this Final Judgment or for future employees or third-party vendors, within thirty (30)
 days of their hire date or beginning of service, respectively. Each employee and third-party vendor
 shall sign an acknowledgment that they have received training on and understand the Price
 Accuracy Policy.

(ii) Safeway shall keep records of training sessions given to those
persons listed in this section for a period of three (3) years from date of training. The records
shall include, but are not limited to, attendance or completion records identifying the Safeway or
applicable third-party vendor employee, training materials, presentations or any other
instructional material. Upon request by any party, Safeway shall produce copies of training records
within two weeks of the request as long as this Final Judgment remains in effect.

(iii) Safeway shall not permit any employee or third-party vendor to
operate any point of sale register(s) or device(s) without proof of the employee's or third-party
vendor's compliance with the training provisions in this section.

16 10. Nothing in this Final Judgment shall in any way prevent Safeway from developing, 17 testing or implementing new or different systems or measures regarding the subjects covered by this 18 Final Judgment. At Safeway's request, prior to implementation or proposed implementation of any 19 such new or different system or measure, the parties agree to meet and confer regarding the viability 20 or continued application of any particular affected provision of this Final Judgment and whether the 21 Final Judgment should be modified, upon consent of the court, to include the implementation of any 22 such new or different system or measure.

11. If there have been no violations of any injunctive provisions of this Final Judgment within five (5) years from the date of its entry, Safeway may make, and the People shall not oppose, a motion to modify this Final Judgment by vacating Paragraphs 5, 6, and 7. Nothing in this Paragraph shall in any way limit Safeway's right to seek modification or dissolution of the injunction pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure §533. Except as otherwise stated in the first sentence of this Paragraph, nothing shall in any way limit the People's right to oppose such an application.

Page 13 of 17

1 2 3	MONETARY RELIEF					
	12. Pursuant to California Business and Professions Code 88 172					
3	12. Pursuant to California Business and Professions Code §§ 17203, 17206, 17207,					
	17356.5 and 17535, Safeway shall pay the People at the time of filing of this Judgment, civil					
4	penalties, costs and restitution in the sum of Two Million Two Hundred and Fifty Thousand Dollars					
5	(\$2,250,000.00) by a single check made payable to the "Marin County District Attorney" and					
6	divided as set forth below:					
· 7	A. The total amount of \$200,000.00 shall be paid as investigative costs and					
8	shall be distributed to the agencies listed below in the following amounts:					
9	Agency Costs	Amount				
10	CA Department of Agriculture, Div. of Measurement Standards	\$40,861.80				
11	Alameda County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 1,669.15				
12	Contra Costa County Department of Weights & Measures	\$16,150.00				
13	Fresno County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 867.91				
14	Imperial County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 202.26				
15	Los Angeles County Department of Weights and Measures	\$ 2,918.65				
16	Marin County Department of Weights & Measures	\$17,960.33				
17	Napa County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 2,574.00				
18	Orange County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 3,024.00				
19	Riverside County Department of Weights and Measures	\$ 516.32				
20	Sacramento County Department of Weights & Measures	\$54,000.00				
21	San Benito County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 735.52				
22	San Bernardino County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 3,322.23				
23	San Diego County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 922.13				
24	San Joaquin County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 2,606.19				
25	Santa Barbara County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 1,136.00				
26	Santa Clara County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 1,339.68				
27	Santa Cruz County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 2,132.00				
28	Shasta County Department of Weights & Measures Page 14 of 17	\$ 299.31				

í

ĺ

•

•

	Solano County Department of Weights & Measures	\$ 3	,027.60
•	Tuolumne County Department of Weights & Measures	\$	214.92
	Ventura County Department of Weights & Measures	\$43	,520.00

The total amount of Two Million Dollars (\$2,000,000.00) shall be paid as 5 Β. civil penalties and distributed equally among the following District Attorneys' Offices: Alameda 6 7 County, Fresno County, Marin County, Napa County, Sacramento County, Santa Cruz County, Solano County, Sonoma County and Ventura County.

9 The parties having stipulated, and the Court hereby finds, that it is C. impractical and impossible to identify or to provide direct restitution to consumers who may 10 have unknowingly been overcharged by Safeway or misled by Safeway advertising such that 11 12 other forms of direct restitution are too impractical, costly, and would far exceed any benefit to 13 individual consumers. Thus, Safeway shall pay restitution under the doctrine of cy pres pursuant 14 to Business and Professions Code §§ 17203 and 17535 to the Consumer Protection Trust Fund, established in the case of People v. ITT Consumer Financial Corporation (Alameda Superior 15 16 Court case no. 656038-0), in the amount of Fifty Thousand Dollars (\$50,000.00).

17

18

19

1

2

3

4

8

D. All checks required under the terms of this Final Judgment shall be delivered to Deputy District Attorney Andres Perez, Marin County District Attorney's Office, 3501 Civid Center Drive, Room 130, San Rafael, California 94903, at the time of entry of this Final Judgment.

20

## NOTICE AND RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

21 13. The failure of the People to enforce any provision of this Final Judgment shall neither be deemed a waiver of such provision or its enforceability, nor shall it in any way affect the 22 23 validity of this Final Judgment. The failure of the People to enforce any provision shall not preclude the People from later enforcing the same or other provisions of this Final Judgment. 24

25 14. Except as otherwise expressly provided herein, each party shall bear its own 26 attorney's fees and costs.

27

///

28 ///

Page 15 of 17

1 15. The language used for the obligations set forth in this Final Judgment is the result of
 settlement and compromise and for the purposes described herein; nothing in this Final Judgment
 constitutes an alteration of, nor does it supersede, any applicable law or regulation.

4 16. Jurisdiction is retained for the purpose of enabling any party to this Final Judgment 5 to apply to the Court for such further orders and directions as may be necessary and appropriate for 6 the construction and carrying out of this Final Judgment, for the modification or dissolution of any 7 injunctive provisions hereof, for enforcement of compliance herewith, or for the punishment of 8 violations hereof.

9 17. This Final Judgment has been reviewed by the Court, and based upon the 10 representations of the parties, the Court finds that it has been entered in good faith and is, in all 11 respects, fair, just, and equitable to protect the public and the individuals who may have been 12 affected by the issues alleged in the Complaint.

The clerk is directed to enter this Final Judgment forthwith.

13

14

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

18.

MAR - 5 2014

15

DATED: 16

ROY O. CHERNUS

JUDGE OI	( THF	, SUPEI	KIUK (	COOR

ĺ

PEOPLE V. SAFEWAY INC., FINAL JUDGMENT AND PERMANENT INJUNCTION

Page 16 of 17

### EXHIBIT 1

1

2 BOB LEE NANCY O'MALLEY 3 District Attorney, County of Santa Cruz District Attorney, County of Alameda William R. Atkinson, SBN 88933 Matthew Beltramo, SBN 184796 4 Assistant District Attorney Deputy District Attorney 701 Ocean St., Suite 200 7677 Oakport Street, Suite 650 5 Santa Cruz CA 95060 Oakland, CA 94621 (831) 454-2000 6 (510) 383-8600 7 DONALD A. DU BAIN ELIZABETH A. EGAN District Attorney, County of Solano District Attorney, County of Fresno 8 Criselda Gonzalez, SBN 146493 Michael Brummel, SBN 236116 Deputy District Attorney Deputy District Attorney 9 675 Texas Street, 4<sup>th</sup> Floor, #4500 2220 Tulare St., Suite 1000 Fairfield, CA 94533 10 Fresno CA 93721 (707) 784-6800 (559) 488-3156 11 JILL RAVITCH GARY LIEBERSTEIN 12 District Attorney, County of Sonoma District Attorney, County of Napa Matthew T. Cheever, SBN 191783 Catherine Borsetto, SBN 176337 13 Deputy District Attorney Deputy District Attorney 2300 County Center Dr., Suite B-170 14 931 Parkway Mall Santa Rosa, CA 95403 Napa, CA 94559 15 (707) 565-3161 (707) 253-4211 16 GREGORY D. TOTTEN JAN SCULLY District Attorney, County of Ventura District Attorney, County of Sacramento 17 Mitchell F. Disney, SBN 138114 Ruth M. Young, SBN 133606 18 Deputy District Attorney Deputy District Attorney 5720 Ralston St, No. 300 906 G St., Suite 700 19 Ventura, CA 93003 Sacramento CA 95814 (805) 662-1750 (916) 874-6174 20 21 .22 23 24 25 26 27 28 Page 17 of 17 PEOPLE V. SAFEWAY INC., FINAL JUDGMENT AND PERMANENT INJUNCTION