# CALIFRONIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM COMMITTEE MEETING

Meeting Minutes Wednesday, August 14, 2013

### **Opening**:

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on August 14, 2013 in Ontario, California by Committee Chair Nick Hill.

### **CPDPC Members Present**:

Richard Bennett Dan Dreyer Bob Felts, Jr. John Gless Jim Gorden Gus Gunderson*	Nick Hill Ken Keck Link Leavens* Mark McBroom George McEwen James McFarlane	Kevin Olsen Earl Rutz Kevin Severns Brian Specht
<b>CPDPC</b> Members Absent:		
Craig Armstrong	Steve Birdsall	Etienne Rabe
CDFA Staff:		
Courtney Albrecht* Tina Galindo Art Gilbert Adrian Gonzales Craig Hanes	Victoria Hornbaker Jason Leathers* Robert Leavitt * Magally Luque-Williams	David Morgan Mike Pitcairn Debby Tanouye Scosha Wright
Guests:		
Laura Arellano Joe Barcinas	Carlos Ortiz Greg Simmons	Alan Washburn Michael Wootton

Paul Story

Brian Taylor

# \* Participated via telephone

## **Opening Comments**:

John Gardner

Ken Gilliland

Chairman, Nick Hill, welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online.

Judy Zaninovich\*

### **Public Comment:**

There were no public comments.

# **COMMITTEE BUISNESS & UPDATES**

### a. Approval of minutes

Chairman Hill reviewed the minutes from the Committee meetings which took place on June 12, 2013 and July 25, 2013. Several edits were identified.

Motion: Approval of the minutes with grammatical and attendance edits from the June 12, 2013 and the July 25, 2013 CPDPC meetings, which were both held in Visalia, California. First: Jim Gorden Second: Kevin Severns Motion Passes: All in favor

### **b.** Reappointment of Committee Members

Chairman Hill notified the Committee that five members terms are due to expire in September 30, 2013; Mark McBroom, Steve Birdsall, Link Leavens, Richard Bennett, and Dan Dreyer. All five have expressed the desire to continue serving on the Committee.

Motion: To reappoint Mark McBroom, Steve Birdsall, Link Leavens, Richard Bennett, and Dan Dreyer for a new four year term, ending September 30, 2017. First: Kevin Olsen Second: John Gless Motion Passes: All in favor

## **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Chairman Hill provided a summary of the Executive Committee meetings held on June 24, 2013 and July 15, 2013 via conference call. The following topics were discussed:

#### a. Tulare Response

Chairman Hill reviewed maps of the Porterville Asian Citrus Psyllid (ACP) find sites. He reviewed the one mile delimitation and the eight mile buffer area. The traps in the delimitation were deployed at 100 traps per square mile in the core and 50 traps per square mile in the buffer. The Porterville finds are currently under a five mile quarantine. All urban properties within the 800 meter eradication areas have been treated, with the exception of one homeowner refusal from a homeowner, one commercial property and several 25 plus tree properties. Bob Wagner, Tulare County grower liaison has been working closely with growers to get them all on track to treat. CDFA is currently working on compliance agreements for nurseries and packing houses. The Executive Committee authorized CDFA to start work in the Porterville area at the July 15<sup>th</sup> meeting.

#### **b. Establish Finance Subcommittee**

Chairman Hill has asked Committee members James McFarlane and Bob Felts, Jr. to serve on the Finance Subcommittee, appointing James McFarlane as Subcommittee Chair. Jim Bates, CFO of Fowler Packing will be the last member of the finance subcommittee. The first meeting will be on August 28, 2013 if the Committee moves to form the finance subcommittee.

Motion: To form a Finance Subcommittee. First: Kevin Severns Second: Kevin Olsen Motion Passes: All in favor.

## c. San Diego Revised Treatment Plan

Chairman Hill expressed that the Executive Committee supports CDFA's efforts in San Diego to discontinue treatments in Fallbrook, Rainbow and any other area where treatment will not be successful, such as areas with a large amount of 25 plus tree properties, where properties are organic, or where treatment refusal rates are high. CDFA is going to continue to treat in areas where coordinated commercial treatments can be scheduled as well as along the border with Mexico. CDFA will be meeting with other Southern California counties to look at implementing similar treatment protocols. CDFA will work with the biocontrol program to see about releases in areas where treatment is suspended.

### d. Science Advisory Panel

Jason Leathers gave an update on the Science Advisory Panel (SAP). Due to the detection of the six new ACP found in Tulare County, CDFA had called an emergency conference call held on July 13<sup>th</sup> to discuss the level of ACP detection that would substantiate an established population. The SAP decided that the six finds were indicative of an established population. Also, since the psyllid could potentially be spreading from poorly managed residential citrus trees from Porterville, into the groves, the panel members suggested that CDFA expand the surveying being done into the urban areas of Porterville. In response to that recommendation, CDFA staff surveyed 804 residential properties in the urban area, and fortunately did not find any psyllids.

## **OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Operations Subcommittee Chair Jim Gorden provided a summary of the Operations Subcommittee meetings held on July 3, 2013 and August 7, 2013.

## a. USDA Mexico Program Update

Jim Gorden presented a PowerPoint presentation on Nick Gutierrez's behalf. Nick presented the PowerPoint at the August 7th Operations Subcommittee, but was unavailable to present at the full Committee meeting. The presentation covered the HLB and ACP surveillance and suppression program in Baja California and in Sonora. Jim briefly went over the presentation with the Committee. He discussed program budgets, the program protocol, the detections the expanded program area, surveillance testing, personnel and equipment, and chemical control. Mark McBroom is concerned that HLB could potentially be spreading into California because the maps provided are not completely accurate due to issues in Mexico.

### **b.** Data Sharing Memorandum of Understanding

Victoria Hornbaker reported that the data sharing MOU by and between CDFA, Citrus Research Board (CRB), and USDA is complete and in place. All data from 2008 through August 9, 2013 has been provided to Rick Dunn and Dr. Beth Grafton-Cardwell. Casey Estep is now sending Rick Dunn weekly data for mapping purposes.

### c. Regional ACP Management

Craig Hanes gave an update on the grower outreach coordinator program. Craig reported that the Central Valley Gower Liaisons, Bob Wagner, Sylvie Robillard and Judy Zaninovich, have been working with growers in the Porterville eradication areas and have confirmed that over 90 percent of the first treatments in and 50 percent of second treatments have been completed. The CASS contract is complete and finalized and Victoria asked the Committee to come up with a list of candidates for the statewide position so CDFA can provide that information to CASS. The Committee was asked to make suggestions on advertising the positions. Nick Hill suggested advertising the positions though CRB and CCM media outlets.

### d. Treatment and Trapping Update

Tina Galindo went over the current treatment areas. CDFA has discontinued treatment in Escondido, Bonsall and Fallbrook. The only current pending areas in San Diego County are Pauma and Pala, in which CDFA has just received authorization to start treating. In Riverside County multiple treatments are ongoing, with 50 to 80 percent complete in Coachella, 75 to 90 percent complete in Mecca, 50 percent complete in North Shore and 25 percent complete in Thermal. There are two additional areas pending in Thermal. Tina reported that there were a few ACP finds in Imperial County, treatment crews are scheduled to go out this week.

Mark McBroom stated that there was a guest at the Imperial County Pest Control District (PCD) last week, a homeowner who had questions in regards to the treatment. She received a notice to treat, however she was out of town while the treatment was completed. She returned home to find her dog sick, the dog later passed away. She also mentioned finding dead birds in her back yard. Tina Galindo suggested having the homeowners call the hotline number when situations like this one arise. When treatment is completed, residents do receive a post treatment notice; the hotline number is on there as well. In cases like this, CDFA will collect any deceased animal, and test it. The Department of Pesticide Regulation also takes reports on matters like this, and helps CDFA with the investigation.

Debby Tanouye went over treatment strategies and planning meeting summaries. She set up several meetings to work toward a better trapping and treatment plan. San Diego was the first area that was looked at it was decided to continue current trapping and treatment protocol along the border with 15 traps per square mile in a 2 mile buffer zone. CDFA cut treatments in Fallbrook, Bonsall, Rainbow and Escondido mainly due to high ACP populations, organic growers, and residential properties with 25 or more trees that were not commercial. The next step is to transition to an area wide treatment program; replacing grove trapping with ACP collection and HLB survey.

Using San Diego as a template for other areas; Debby convened a meeting of County Agricultural Commissioners and growers from Orange, Riverside, Imperial, San Diego and San Bernardino Counties. Debby explained that the County representatives were tasked with identifying areas where growers will comply with area wide treatments, in those areas, CDFA will commit to two coordinated treatments per year. Debby explained that CDFA is looking for 100 percent compliance in areas where area wide treatments will occur.

Debby reported that Imperial County has formed their own PCD which is coordinated by the County and committee member Mark McBroom. CDFA will work with the PCD to treat urban areas around groves that cooperate with an area-wide treatment program.

Riverside County has identified several areas where they believe area wide treatments would be successful.

The plan for Orange County is to start the HLB survey.

San Bernardino County growers have expressed interest in participating in area wide treatments.

The Committee expressed concerns about green waste being dumped in commercial growing zones. The waste being dumped in areas that have been treated may have ACP which then creates an ongoing cycle. Victoria suggested that with the permit process we have in place, increase restrictions for haulers, so that they know they cannot take green waste from an untreated quarantine area to area wide treatment quarantine area.

Art Gilbert reviewed commercial grove trapping activities and ACP collection. ACP collection in Riverside went from 290 sites that CDFA was only running traps in to 470 psyllid collection sites. CDFA is trying to get up to 600 collection sites. There have been 1,123 adults collected, 711 nymphs collected. Art suggested the Committee expand actual collection of psyllids rather than continue the trapping in the Temecula area of Riverside County and northern San Diego County, not including the Escondido/Ramona areas.

Motion: To convert ACP trapping to surveying in the Temecula area of Riverside County and northern San Diego County, not including the Escondido/Ramona areas. First: Kevin Olsen Second: Mark McBroom Motion Passes: All in favor.

Art went on to explain that trapping is still needed in some areas of San Diego County. Some ACP numbers per trap are low, there is also the area wide treatment going on. Traps tell us where psyllids are popping up before we can go out and collect the psyllids. To conclude Art's presentation there are hardly any psyllids being found in the Escondido area, there have been no psyllids found in Santa Barbara, none in Ventura, none in San Luis Obispo.

## e. HLB Survey

Magally Luque-Williams gave an update on the ongoing risk based survey for Southern California, including Los Angeles, Riverside, San Bernardino, San Diego and Ventura. Imperial

County high risk survey is completed. In Los Angeles County 8,700 sites have been surveyed. In Riverside 2,910; San Bernardino 3,422; and San Diego 1,474 sites were completed. 2,560 total plant samples have been collected and submitted for analysis. All ACP samples have been tested and are negative for HLB. Debby explained that she has implemented efficiencies to help expedite the survey, which includes a maximum time per property of 30 minutes, limiting the number of psyllids collected per property of 25 adult psyllids per tree, and only collecting symptomatic plant material.

# f. Biocontrol Program Update

Mike Pitcairn gave an update on the biocontrol program. This is a cooperative project with CDFA, USDA, CRB and UC Riverside. CDFA is the lead on the insectary production and field release efforts of Tamarixia. USDA is the lead for field rearing of Tamarixia. There have been 15 cages started and there is a plan for 11 more. There is an estimated Tamarixia production of 20,000 to 80,000 parasitoids per cage, the cages are relatively inexpensive. UC Riverside maintains the Tamarixia colonies and is examining additional parasitoids. Two locations are in the process of being upgraded to serve in mass production of Tamarixia. Mt. Rubidoux is the main production facility. Inoculation with the Tamarixia will begin the week of August 26<sup>th</sup>. The facility at Arvin is being upgraded to serve in plant production for the ACP colonies. The facility at California State University in Pomona is on hold due to issues with facilities management; however the University has offered to rent space to the program while the construction issues are worked out. Mike explained that releases have been expanded into San Diego County. Overall total release sites in Southern California for 2013 are 448. The first goal of the task force is to release across a wide spread area in Southern California to establish new species with increased production. The plan is to target urban areas close to commercial areas, high risk areas, and organic production areas.

## g. VOC Update

Brian Taylor reported on the efforts to remove the VOC positive trees in Hacienda Heights. All homeowners have agreed to let CRB remove the trees for scientific analysis at the Riverside lab. The trees will be replaced with non-citrus trees of their choice. Brian stated that the first tree was removed yesterday, and additional trees will be removed over the next several weeks. CDFA staff treated the trees and collect official tissue samples before the trees are removed.

## h. Regulatory Program Update

Courtney Albrecht gave an update on the regulatory program. In Tulare a five mile quarantine was established. Host material has been placed on hold and staff is working on getting all nurseries, packinghouses, haulers and growers under compliance. Staff is working with both production and retail nurseries to allow movement of nursery stock under specific conditions. Options for the movement of bulk fruit include movement to a packing house inside of the quarantine area or remove stems and leaves and move under permit. The Committee expressed interest in the progress of the spray and move option for bulk citrus; Courtney mentioned that USDA is still reviewing the request.

## i. Laboratory Update

The lab reported analyzing 30,000 ACP samples and 28,000 plant tissue samples, so far all have been negative for HLB.

# **OUTREACH COMMITTEE REPORT & DISCUSSION**

Outreach Subcommittee Chair Kevin Olsen provided a summary of the Outreach Subcommittee meetings held on July 3, 2013 and August 7, 2013.

#### a. Messaging

Kevin Olsen Gave an update of the CRB & NST's progress on developing a grower outreach plan and crisis communication plan which will include primary and secondary messaging for use in various situations. They are also developing specialized messaging for pollinator issues, nutritional programs for trees, farm laborer messaging/training, and proactive messaging/plans in anticipation of the Organic Trade Association gearing up against conventional treatments.

#### b. Focused Media Outreach

Kevin reported on the 2013 Media Tour, in July the English and Spanish media tours each added six new media exposures from radio, print or television. That makes the total exposures for the English media tour 15, with 8exposures for the Spanish media tour in June and July. He summarized the final report for the LAX media event that reached out to Asian media. This event resulted in 23 placements, including print and television and reached Chinese, Korean, English and Spanish markets and resulted in 751,300 impressions. Kevin also reported that intensive outreach activities will begin in in Northern San Diego County to remind residents and small growers of the importance of treating for ACP, including information on the newly initiated Tamarixia releases in Northern San Diego. In addition, a focused Print and Radio campaign in Ventura County will take place the week of either August 19th or 26th.

#### c. Website

The grower website has been active for two months; the contractor presented a report (included) summarizing the website and newsletter statistics. The website was visited 434 times in June and 254 times in July for a total of 688 visits in the 2 month time frame. The top website/newsletter articles viewed per month were also discussed. The newsletter eblasts sent with teasers directing readers back to the website generated the more interest than the newsletters that included the full story. There were 124 unsolicited sign ups to the website which is very encouraging.

#### d. Citrus Hearing Outcome

Victoria discussed the outcome of the Public Hearings that were conducted in June. There were three hearings held and all were well received. All comments were positive. The Secretary has signed the determination and has issued a press release stating that the Committee was reauthorized for four years.

#### e. Update on Outreach Contract Process

Victoria gave an update on the request for proposal. It closed on August 13, 2013 and there are five proposals that will be reviewed next week. The proposals will be scored and the one that receives the highest score we will be the one we start a contract with.

#### FISCAL MATTERS

#### a. Budget and Assessments:

Victoria reviewed the budget documents. The assessment revenues to date for this fiscal year total \$13,162,248.40 for the period of October 2012 through July 2013, with a remaining estimated assessment for August and September of \$3,586,751,60. The funding sources display was reviewed with the Committee and it was explained that the Assessment funding source projections on the 2012/2013 column would be updated after the fiscal year closed, but that all

other numbers on all of the funding sources were current through June 2013. The CHRP budget was reviewed, the agreement was less than anticipated due to the federal sequestration, but USDA allocated \$490,000 from enhanced trapping to offset the reduction, leaving a net reduction of \$324,000 less than anticipated. No charges have been made to the TASC grant of \$475,000 as it did not start until July 15<sup>th</sup> and July expenditures will not close until the end of the month. The Citrus Commodity Survey has incurred \$34,000 in expenditures in the month of June against the budget of \$405,224. The \$200,000 commitment from CDFA for Tulare has not in place yet, so there are no expenditures in that funding source. Victoria reviewed the current year Assessment budget, noting that some areas do not show expenditures, but it is anticipated that the full budgeted amount will be expended, such as for biocontrol and commercial grove trapping.

The treatment expenditures for the months of May and June were reviewed with the Committee.

San Bernardino, Orange, Los Angeles, San Luis Obispo, Kern, Fresno and Tulare Counties - No Expenditures San Diego - \$618,197 Imperial – \$238,999 Ventura - \$88,745 Riverside - \$369,921 Santa Barbara - \$58,524

To date, treatment expenditures total to \$6,464,760 leaving the Committee with a balance of \$1,209,049

Robert Leavitt gave an update on the CHRP budget noting that as surveys have expanded across the state, there is a shortfall of funds to continue the High-Risk HLB Survey. HLB survey is very expensive and labor intensive, the Committee may decide to cut the survey for the next 6 weeks and lay off staff to bring the expenditure in line with the budget, or they can backfill the CHRP activities with Assessment funds. Concern was expressed about the staff being laid off and the Program's ability to rehire them. Victoria suggested focusing only on high risk areas, and maintaining a core of trained survey staff.

Motion: To use \$600,000 of the placeholder line item funds to continue the High-Risk HLB Survey through September 30, 2013. First: Jim Gorden Second: Kevin Severns Motion Passes: passed with a vote of 9 Yeas, 6 Nays and 1 member abstaining.

Victoria and Robert Leavitt discussed the motion made by the Committee at the June 12<sup>th</sup> meeting to rescind the 2.5 million budget change proposal (BCP). The Committee was informed that the motion as submitted infringes on Secretary Ross's executive authority. The BCP was presented to the governor, and was published in his May revise budget, it cannot be taken back. The Secretary acknowledges that the Committee has concerns and recommends revising the motion. Victoria recommended that the motion say something along the lines of "please work more closely with CPDPC in the future." Victoria stressed that she will keep the Committee apprised of any future budget actions.

## b. Proposed Budget and Assessments for FY 2013/2014:

Victoria discussed the proposed budget and assessments for fiscal year 2013/2014. She stated that the intent is to have a detailed budget for each item on the citrus funding source.

### c. Imperial County Citrus Pest and Control District:

Mark McBroom gave an update the newly formed Imperial County Citrus Pest Control District (PCD). He further explained that because the PCD was formed after April  $30^{\text{th}}$ , they will have to wait to be funded until July 1, 2014. Since the deadline was missed, the PCD is operational, but not funded. They are hoping to secure \$50,000 in seed money from the CPDPC. Seed money will allow the PCD to begin working to establish 5 mile buffers around all commercial citrus in the county and treat 25 + tree properties. Victoria suggested possibly working with Imperial County to fund such activities.

Motion: To grant \$50,000 in seed money to the Imperial County Citrus PCD. First: Kevin Olsen Second: James McFarlane Motion Passes: All in favor.

# **REPORT FROM CHRP COUNCIL**

Paul Story presented the CHRP report on Joel Nelsen's behalf. There was a meeting August 1<sup>st</sup>; all reps were in attendance as well as senior USDA APHIS management. The purpose of meeting was to review the program and identify where shortages may exist as well as determine future direction. APHIS has taken multiple budget cuts over the last four years. Florida reported major losses in gross income over the last four years, for every three trees they plant; they lose two trees to HLB. There was also an extensive discussion on the use of genetically modified organisms (GMO) as a possible solution to HLB; consumer education will be key in the success of a GMO program.

## **CRB REPORT**

Ken Keck conducted a "mini audit" of CRB to see where efficiencies could be identified. The data management program is a 3 person operation, but by automating data fields, less human data entry will be required. This will reduce the operation from a 3 person operation to 2 or  $2\frac{1}{2}$  person operation. Ken also stated that the CRB intends to hire a person with GIS mapping background and skills. Rick Dunn will be reassigned to a position responsible for analyzing and collecting statewide treatment efficacy data.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:00pm. The next meeting will be held in Riverside, California on September 26, 2013 at 10:00am.